

FILE

PUCO EXHIBIT FILING

Date of Hearing: February 7, 2020

Case No. 18-1419-GA-Exm

PUCO Case Caption: IMO: The motion to modify
the Exemption Granted to
THE East Ohio Gas Company,
d/b/a Dominion Energy Ohio,

List of exhibits being filed:

Joint Exhibit 1

State Exhibit 1

Reporter's Signature: _____

Date Submitted: _____

2020 FEB 11 PM 2:06

PUCO

NOTED FOR FILING
The following exhibits are being filed for the hearing on February 7, 2020 at 2:00 PM. The exhibits are being filed in accordance with the rules of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio. The exhibits are being filed in accordance with the rules of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio. The exhibits are being filed in accordance with the rules of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio.

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

- - -

In the Matter of the :
Motion to Modify the :
Exemption Granted to : Case No. 18-1419-GA-EXM
The East Ohio Gas Company, :
d/b/a Dominion Energy :
Ohio. :

- - -

PROCEEDINGS

before Ms. Sarah Parrot and Ms. Lauren L. Augostini,
Attorney Examiners, at the Public Utilities
Commission of Ohio, 180 East Broad Street, Room 11-A,
Columbus, Ohio, called at 10:00 a.m. on Friday,
February 7, 2020.

- - -

ARMSTRONG & OKEY, INC.
222 East Town Street, Second Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4620
(614) 224-9481 - (800) 223-9481

- - -

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Motion to Modify the	:	
Exemption Granted to The East Ohio Gas	:	Case No. 18-1419-GA-EXM
Company d/b/a Dominion Energy Ohio	:	

**PREFILED TESTIMONY
Of
Barbara Bossart**

**RELIABILITY AND SERVICE ANALYSIS DIVISION WITHIN THE
SERVICE MONITORING AND ENFORCEMENT DEPARTMENT
ON BEHALF OF THE STAFF OF THE
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

STAFF EX. 1

February 6, 2020

1 1. Q. Please state your name and your business address.

2 A. My name is Barbara Bossart. My business address is 180 East Broad
3 Street, Columbus, Ohio 43215.

4

5 2. Q. By whom are you employed?

6 A. I am employed by the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("PUCO" or
7 "Commission").

8

9 3. Q. What is your current position with the Commission and what are your
10 duties?

11 A. I am Chief of the Reliability and Service Analysis Division ("RSAD")
12 within the Service Monitoring and Enforcement Department ("SMED").
13 My current duties include oversight of the development, investigation and
14 enforcement of service reliability and consumer protection policies and
15 rules for gas, water, electric, telephone, and competitive retail gas and
16 electric services. I am also responsible for overseeing the review of
17 competitive retail natural gas and retail electric service applications.

18

19 4. Q. Briefly state your educational background and work experience.

20 A. I have a Bachelor of Arts degree from Marshall University and I have also
21 completed additional classes at Ohio Dominican University toward a
22 Master of Business Administration degree. I have been employed by the

1 PUCO since 1999. For six years I worked as an Investigator in the
2 Investigation and Audits Division of the SMED. As an Investigator my
3 duties included interacting with the consumer to investigate their concerns
4 about utility companies and practices. In May 2005, I was promoted to
5 Utility Specialist 2 in the RSAD of the SMED where I was responsible for
6 analyzing service quality performance as well as for recommending and
7 enforcing service quality and consumer protection policies and rules. In
8 January 2013, I was promoted to Chief of the RSAD.

9
10 5 Q. What is the purpose of your testimony?

11 A. The purpose of my testimony is to support the Stipulation and
12 Recommendation ("Stipulation") filed in this case on February 5, 2020 by
13 showing that it meets the Commission's three-part test for determining a
14 Stipulation's reasonableness.

15
16 6. Q. Please identify the signatory parties to the Stipulation.

17 A. The Stipulation reflects a unanimous settlement. The Signatory Parties to
18 the Stipulation include the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
19 ("OCC"), Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy ("OPAE"), the Staff of the
20 Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("Staff"), Retail Energy Supply
21 Association ("RESA"), Direct Energy Business Marketing, LLC, Direct
22 Energy Services, LLC (collectively, "Direct"), Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.

1 (“IGS”), Dominion Energy Solutions, Inc. (“DES”), and tThe East Ohio
2 Gas Company d/b/a Dominion Energy Ohio (“Dominion”) (collectively,
3 the “Signatory Parties”).
4

5 7. Q. What is the Commission’s three-part test for determining the
6 reasonableness of a Stipulation?

7 A. A Stipulation before the Commission must: (1) be the product of serious
8 bargaining among capable, knowledgeable parties; (2) as a package, benefit
9 ratepayers and the public interest; and (3) not violate any important
10 regulatory principle or practice.
11

12 8. Q. Is the Stipulation the product of serious bargaining among capable,
13 knowledgeable parties?

14 A. Yes. The agreement is the product of an open process in which all parties
15 were given an opportunity to participate and were represented by able
16 counsel experienced in matters before the Commission. The Stipulation
17 also represents a compromise of the issues raised by parties with diverse
18 interests. Overall, the Stipulation presents a reasonable result.
19

20 9. Q. Does the Stipulation, as a package, benefit consumers and the public
21 interest?

1 A. Yes. The Stipulation, as a package, benefits consumers and the public
2 interest, and represents a reasonable resolution of the issues in this
3 proceeding. The Monthly Variable Rate Commodity Service (“MVR
4 program”) has been subject to a wide range of posted prices, some of
5 which have been considerably above the competitive retail natural gas
6 offers available to customers and has been the subject of customer
7 confusion and complaints. To address those issues, the Stipulation
8 recommends that the Commission adopt certain changes to the MVR
9 program tariff and the Standard Choice Offer Commodity Service (“SCO”)
10 tariff for residential and nonresidential customers that include eligibility
11 and pricing requirements. Under the Stipulation, the MVR program will be
12 replaced by the Monthly Retail Rate Commodity Service (“MRR
13 program”) tariff. Moreover, there will be certain modifications to both
14 tariffs. The summary below illustrates those modifications that, when
15 considering the Stipulation as a package, are in the public interest. Note
16 that all customers are placed on the Standard Service Offer (“SSO”) for one
17 to two billing cycles when starting new service or transitioning from one
18 type of service to another.

- 19 1. Dominion’s SCO Commodity Service tariff will be the default
20 commodity service for Dominion’ Choice-eligible residential
21 customers, and for Dominion’s Choice-eligible non-residential
22 customers whose annual consumption is less than or equal to 200

1 Mcf once their competitive retail natural gas service or governmental
2 aggregation contract has terminated or when initiating service as
3 new customers.

4 2. Dominion will transfer to SCO service all of the residential
5 customers currently assigned to an MVR Supplier no later than 60
6 days after a Commission order approving the Stipulation without
7 material modification. Dominion's transfer to SCO service of small
8 non-residential customers currently assigned to an MVR Supplier
9 shall commence not later than 120 days after a Commission order
10 approving the Stipulation without material modification.

11 3. Non-residential customers with annual usage between 201 Mcf and
12 500 Mcf will default to the MRR, but those customers will have the
13 option to select a competitive retail natural gas service supplier, join
14 a governmental aggregation (if eligible), or select the SCO.

15 4. In addition to the replacement and eligibility changes noted above,
16 the MRR program includes the following changes:

17 a. New requirements for suppliers who choose to participate in
18 the MRR program.

19 b. New requirements for MRR Suppliers to post a monthly
20 variable rate on the PUCO's Apples to Apples chart, and to
21 provide service at or below the median monthly variable rate
22 of the participating MRR Suppliers (MRR price).

- 1 c. The monthly median MRR price will be determined by the
2 median price of the lowest posted monthly variable rates of
3 each qualifying MRR Supplier.
- 4 d. The MRR price charged to customers will be the lower of the
5 MRR monthly median price or the MRR Supplier's lowest
6 posted monthly variable rate.
- 7 e. Disqualification of participating MRR Suppliers that are
8 unwilling to serve customers at or below the MRR price and a
9 "stay out" period for those that request to leave the program
10 early after having committed to serve customers at that price.
- 11 5. Funding for an education program designed to help Choice-eligible
12 customers, including those who are participating in the MRR
13 program, compare options for natural gas service and understand
14 how those options can affect the information on their natural gas
15 bills in Dominion's service territory, as well as focus groups and
16 surveys shall be conducted regarding the former MVR program, and
17 the formation of a stakeholder collaborative to develop the above
18 education programs.

19
20 10. Q. Does the Stipulation violate any regulatory principle or practice?

21 A. No. Under R.C. 4929.08(A), the Commission may abrogate or modify an
22 order granting a natural gas company an exemption under R.C. 4909.04

1 only if it meets two conditions: “(1) The commission determines that the
2 findings upon which the order was based are no longer valid and that the
3 abrogation or modification is in the public interest; [and] (2) The
4 abrogation or modification is not made more than eight years after the
5 effective date of the order, unless the affected natural gas company
6 consents.” As I noted previously, the current MVR program is subject to a
7 wide range of posted prices, some of which have been considerably above
8 the competitive retail natural gas offers available to customers. The
9 program also has been the subject of customer confusion and complaints.
10 To address these concerns, the Stipulation proposes changes that include
11 the establishment of the SCO as the default commodity service for
12 residential customers and non-residential customers whose annual
13 consumption is less than or equal to 200 Mcf, additional pricing
14 requirements for the MRR program and a new customer education fund and
15 collaborative. In addition, the parties recognize that Dominion’s agreement
16 to the Stipulation eliminates any questions whether the second criterion has
17 been met.

PROOF OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing Testimony of Barbara Bossart was submitted on behalf of the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio via electronic mail upon the following parties of record this 6th day of February, 2020.

/s/Werner L. Margard III

Werner L. Margard III
Assistant Attorney General

Parties of Record:

Kimberly W. Bojko
Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP
280 North High Street, Suite 1300
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Angela O'Brien
65 East State Street, 7th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4213
Telephone [O'Brien]: (614) 466-9531
angela.obrien@occ.ohio.gov

*Attorneys for Office of the Ohio
Consumers' Counsel*

Christopher T. Kennedy
Whitt Sturtevant LLP
The KeyBank Building, Suite 1590
88 East Broad Street
Columbus, OH 43215
kennedy@whitt-sturtevant.com

Andrew J. Campbell
Dominion Energy, Inc.
21 East State Street, Suite 911
Columbus, OH 43215
Andrew.j.campbell@dominionen

*Attorneys for The East Ohio Gas
Company d/b/a Dominion Energy Ohio*

Robert Dove
Kegler Brown Hill and Ritter L.P.A.
65 East State Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, Ohio 43215
rdove@keglerbrown.com

Attorney for Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy

Michael J. Settineri
Gretchen L. Petrucci
MacDonald W. Taylor
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 E. Gay Street / P.O. Box 1008
Columbus, OH 43216-1008
mjsettineri@vorys.com
glpetrucci@vorys.com
mwtaylor@vorys.com

Attorneys for the Retail Energy Supply Association

Joseph Olikier
Michael Nugent
Bethany Allen
Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.
6100 Emerald Parkway
Dublin, Ohio 43016
Joe.Olikier@igs.com
Michael.Nugent@igs.com
Bethany.Allen@igs.com

Frank Darr
6800 Lindbrook Blvd.
Columbus, Ohio 43235
fdarr2019@gmail.com

Attorneys for Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.

Madeline Fleisher
Christine M.T. Pirik
Dickinson Wright PLLC
150 East Gay Street, Suite 2400
Columbus, OH 43215
mfleisher@dickinsonwright.com
cpirik@dickinsonwright.com

Attorneys for Direct Energy Business Marketing, LLC, Direct Energy Services, LLC, and Dominion Energy Solutions, Inc.

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Motion to Modify)	
the Exemption Granted to the East)	Case No. 18-1419-GA-EXM
Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion)	
Energy Ohio.)	

JOINT STIPULATION AND RECOMMENDATION

Ohio Administrative Code (“Ohio Adm. Code”) Rule 4901-1-30 provides that any two or more parties to a proceeding may enter into a written stipulation covering some or all of the issues presented in the proceeding. The purpose of this document is to set forth the understanding and agreement of the Office of the Ohio Consumers’ Counsel (“OCC”), Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy (“OPAE”), the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“Staff”),¹ Retail Energy Supply Association (“RESA”), Direct Energy Business Marketing, LLC, Direct Energy Services, LLC (collectively, “Direct”), Interstate Gas Supply, Inc. (“IGS”), Dominion Energy Solutions, Inc. (“DES”), and The East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion Energy Ohio (“Dominion”) (collectively, the “Signatory Parties”), and to recommend that the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“Commission”) approve and adopt the Joint Stipulation and Recommendation (“Stipulation”), resolving all of the issues in this proceeding.

The Signatory Parties agree that this Stipulation, which shall be designated as Joint Exhibit 1.0, is supported by adequate data and information; represents a just and reasonable resolution of the issues raised in this proceeding; violates no regulatory principle or precedent; as

¹ Pursuant to Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-1-(C) and 4901-1-30, Staff is deemed a party for purposes of entering into this Stipulation.

a package, benefits customers and the public interest; and is the product of serious bargaining among knowledgeable and capable parties with diverse interests. While the Stipulation is not binding on the Commission, the Signatory Parties submit that it is entitled to careful consideration by the Commission.

Recitals

WHEREAS, on May 26, 2006, in Case No. 05-474-GA-ATA, the Commission approved phase one of Dominion's plan to exit the merchant function. The Commission stated, "The objective of Phase 1 [was] to change the way [Dominion] procure[d] and price[d] its natural gas commodity service by changing from the current [gas cost recovery] mechanism to a competitively bid mechanism (the [Standard Service Offer] SSO)."² Subsequently, on June 18, 2008 in Case No. 07-1224-GA-EXM, the Commission approved a stipulation ("2008 Stipulation") to implement phase two of Dominion's plan to exit the merchant function with approval of the standard choice offer ("SCO") that was procured in the same manner as the SSO. The 2008 Stipulation further provided that customers whose Energy Choice or governmental aggregation contract expires without renewal and who did not enroll with a Competitive Retail Natural Gas Supplier ("Supplier"), could participate in a governmental aggregation program, elect to be assigned to a Supplier at the price of the established SCO auction, or be assigned to an Energy Choice Supplier at the Supplier's posted monthly variable rate under the standard terms and conditions for monthly variable rate commodity service ("MVR program");

WHEREAS, on January 9, 2013, in Case No. 12-1842-GA-EXM, the Commission

² *In the Matter of the Application of The East Ohio Gas Co. d/b/a Dominion East Ohio for Approval of a Plan to Restructure its Commodity Service Function*, Case No. 05-474-GA-ATA, Opin. and Order (May 26, 2006) at 4.

approved a joint stipulation and recommendation regarding the MVR program for customers of Dominion;

WHEREAS, the January 9, 2013 Order eliminated the use of the SCO by non-residential customers and replaced the non-residential SCO default service with the MVR program, which randomly assigns customers to the MVR Supplier's monthly variable rate that is no greater than any of the MVR Supplier's monthly variable rates posted on the PUCO's Apples to Apples chart;

WHEREAS, the MVR program has been subject to a wide range of posted prices, some of which have been considerably above the competitive retail natural gas offers available to customers, and has been the subject of customer confusion and complaints;

WHEREAS, OCC filed motions asking the Commission to eliminate the MVR Program for residential customers and to reinstate the SCO as the default service offer for residential customers in Dominion's service territory and OPAE filed a motion supporting the OCC pleading regarding residential customers and asking the Commission to eliminate the MVR Program for residential and non-residential customers and to reinstate the SCO as the default service offer for customers in Dominion's service territory; and

WHEREAS, the Signatory Parties acknowledge that certain findings upon which the January 9, 2013 Order was based are no longer valid and that a modification of that order is necessary and in the public interest.

NOW, THEREFORE, the Signatory Parties stipulate, agree, and recommend that the Commission should promptly issue its decision in these proceedings accepting and adopting this Stipulation and relying upon its provisions as the basis for resolving all issues raised by parties in this proceeding.

Joint Recommendations of the Signatory Parties

The Signatory Parties recommend that the Commission adopt without modification the following terms and conditions of the Stipulation to fully resolve these proceedings:

1. Dominion's SCO Commodity Service tariff shall be the default commodity service for Dominion's Choice-eligible residential customers ("residential customers") who have not selected and enrolled with an Energy Choice Supplier or do not participate in a governmental aggregation program, including but not limited to new residential customers³ after up to two consecutive billing periods on the SSO and those residential customers returning to the SSO for up to two consecutive billing periods after termination of their Energy Choice contract or participation in a governmental aggregation program. Not later than 60 days after a Commission order approving the Stipulation without material modification, Dominion shall transfer to the SCO the residential customers currently assigned to an MVR Supplier. If the transfer of such customers is not implemented in conjunction with the SCO/SSO auction process, Dominion's transfer of the MVR-assigned residential customers to the SCO shall be in accordance with the current SCO assignment mechanism utilized by Dominion for assigning new residential customers to the SCO.
2. Dominion's SCO shall be the default commodity service for Dominion's Choice eligible non-residential customers whose annual consumption is less than or equal to 200 Mcf⁴ ("small non-residential customers") and who have not selected and enrolled with an

³ New residential customers include customers (i) establishing service with Dominion for the first time, (ii) relocating within Dominion's service territory and whose Energy Choice or government aggregation is not portable, and (iii) restoring service more than ten days after being disconnected for non-payment.

⁴ Annual consumption shall be based on the customer's usage in the prior calendar year, or if a calendar year of historical consumption information is not available for that customer, through an alternative mechanism.

Energy Choice Supplier or do not participate in a governmental aggregation program, including those non-residential customers returning to the SSO for up to two consecutive billing periods after termination of their Energy Choice contract or participation in a governmental aggregation program. Dominion's transfer to SCO service of small non-residential customers currently assigned to an MVR Supplier shall commence not later than 120 days after a Commission order approving the Stipulation without material modification. Dominion's transfer of the MVR-assigned small non-residential customers to the SCO shall be in accordance with the current SCO assignment mechanism utilized by Dominion for assigning new customers to the SCO. New small non-residential customers will receive at least one SSO bill and may select and enroll with an Energy Choice Supplier or participate in a governmental aggregation program. If they do not do so, such customers will, after their second SSO bill, be assigned to a participating SCO Energy Choice Supplier at the price established in the retail SCO auction under the standard terms and conditions of SCO Commodity Service included in Dominion's tariff. Customers that continue to qualify annually as small non-residential customers shall continue to default to the SCO Commodity Service unless they select and enroll with an Energy Choice Supplier or participate in a governmental aggregation.⁵

3. Dominion shall provide a notice to residential and small non-residential customers currently in the MVR program that they are being transferred to the SCO, that they have commodity service options, and that they may contact the PUCO, OCC (for residential customers), or Dominion for information about the transfer. Notices shall be provided by

⁵ As the statutory representative of residential customers, OCC does not represent non-residential customers and thus does not take a position with regard to paragraphs 2 and 4-11, but agrees not to oppose paragraphs 2 and 4-11 for purposes of this settlement.

Dominion beginning no later than thirty-one (31) days after an order approving this Stipulation without material modification and completed thereafter as soon as reasonably practicable and prior to the customer's transfer to the SCO. Such notice to residential and non-residential customers shall be provided to Signatory Parties for review and input before transmittal to customers.

4. The current Monthly Variable Rate Commodity Service tariff shall be replaced with the Monthly Retail Rate Commodity Service tariff, also known as the MRR program, which shall only be applicable to non-residential consumers whose annual consumption is greater than 200 Mcf.
5. The MRR program shall be the default commodity service for all non-residential Dominion consumers whose annual consumption is greater than 200 Mcf and less than or equal to 500 Mcf⁶ ("medium non-residential customers"). Medium non-residential customers shall also have the option of receiving natural gas supply through the SCO, participating in an applicable governmental aggregation program, or selecting and enrolling with an Energy Choice Supplier. A medium non-residential customer that currently receives natural gas commodity service under the MVR program shall continue to receive natural gas commodity service through the MRR program until the customer elects to receive natural gas commodity service through the SCO, to participate in an applicable governmental aggregation program, or to select and enroll with an Energy Choice Supplier. New medium non-residential customers and medium non-residential customers returning to the SSO after termination of their Energy Choice contract or

⁶ Annual consumption shall be based on the customer's usage in the prior calendar year, or if a calendar year of historical consumption information is not available for that customer, through an alternative mechanism.

participation in a governmental aggregation program will receive at least one SSO bill, after which they may elect to receive natural gas supply through the SCO, to participate in an applicable governmental aggregation program, or to select and enroll with an Energy Choice Supplier. If they do not make one of the foregoing elections, such customers will, after their second SSO bill, be assigned to a Supplier participating in the MRR program. This paragraph shall be effective upon certification by Dominion that it has completed the necessary system changes for the assignment of medium non-residential customers.

6. The MRR program shall be the default service for non-residential customers whose estimated annual consumption is greater than 500 Mcf ("large non-residential customers").⁷ Large non-residential customers shall not be eligible to receive natural gas commodity service under the SCO; such customers shall also have the option of participating in an applicable governmental aggregation program (if eligible) or selecting and enrolling with an Energy Choice Supplier. New large non-residential customers and large non-residential customers returning to the SSO after termination of their Energy Choice contract or participation in a governmental aggregation program will receive at least one SSO bill, after which they may elect to participate in an applicable governmental aggregation program or to select and enroll with an Energy Choice Supplier. If they do not make one of the foregoing elections, such customers will, after their second SSO bill, be assigned to a Supplier participating in the MRR program. This

⁷ Annual consumption shall be based on the customer's usage in the prior calendar year, or if a calendar year of historical consumption information is not available for that customer, through an alternative mechanism.

paragraph shall be effective upon certification by Dominion that it has completed the necessary system changes for the assignment of medium non-residential customers.

7. To participate in the MRR program for medium and large non-residential customers, an Energy Choice Supplier must meet the qualifications set forth in paragraph 8.
8. Dominion shall file new tariffs or modify existing tariffs to provide for Monthly Retail Rate Commodity Service, which shall include the following terms: (a) beginning one year from the date that an order approving the Stipulation without material modification, all Energy Choice Suppliers serving customers under the MRR program (“MRR Suppliers”) must have at least 100 non-MRR, non-SCO Energy Choice customers under contract for competitive retail natural gas service or must be serving at least 10,000 MCF of non-MRR, non-SCO Energy Choice annual load; (b) an MRR Supplier having assigned customers must serve its assigned customers each month until at least the end of the following March billing cycle subject to disqualification as described in division (d) of this paragraph; (c) the MRR Supplier must post on the Commission’s Energy Choice Ohio website⁸ or its then-current equivalent a monthly variable rate offer each month during the period of its participation in the MRR program; (d) without limitation to other remedies that may be warranted as a result of non-MRR tariff violations, an MRR Supplier that fails to serve its existing customers at a price at or below the applicable monthly median price as established under paragraph 9 or notifies Dominion of its intent to no longer serve under the MRR program prior to the March billing cycle shall be disqualified from participating in the MRR program. The disqualification period shall begin with the month that the MRR Supplier notifies Dominion that it will not

⁸ Currently located at <http://www.energychoice.ohio.gov/ApplesToApples.aspx>.

provide natural gas commodity service to its existing MRR program customers at a price at or below the monthly median price and continue through the next March billing cycle and then an additional 12-month period;⁹ (e) MRR Suppliers with a posted monthly variable rate equal to or below the monthly median MRR price shall be eligible to be assigned and provide supply to those assigned customers at the lower of the Supplier's lowest posted monthly variable rate price or the MRR price in the next service month as determined by DEO billing cycles; and (f) to avoid disqualification, an MRR Supplier that is not assigned customers for a service month because it did not offer a price equal to or below the monthly median MRR price must charge its previously assigned customers a rate that is no more than the monthly median MRR price.

9. The monthly median MRR price, to be determined each month from the lowest submitted monthly variable rate from each qualifying MRR Supplier, shall be disclosed on the PUCO's Apples to Apples website. The median monthly MRR price shall be calculated per the example attached as Exhibit A to this Stipulation, which is provided for example purposes only. In the event the median monthly MRR price is based on an even number of Suppliers, the average of the middle two prices shall constitute the median. Dominion shall provide each MRR Supplier's lowest posted monthly variable rate along with the median MRR price to all MRR Suppliers and Staff each month.
10. The tariff described in paragraph 8 shall require Dominion to reassign, once every 12 months, each MRR customer who has been assigned to the same MRR Supplier for the 12 prior consecutive months. The identification of customers shall take place annually

⁹ For example, if an MRR Supplier was disqualified beginning in December 2021, the disqualification would continue through the March 2023 billing cycle.

and reassignment shall be effective with the April billing cycle. Any MRR Supplier can be eligible to receive assignment of these customers. The Signatory Parties acknowledge and accept that, through this stipulated random reassignment process, it is possible that an MRR customer could be reassigned to the same MRR Supplier.

11. At least one billing cycle before an assignment or a reassignment, Dominion shall provide notice, which may be completed by bill insert, bill message, or other reasonable method, to the non-residential customer who is subject to random assignment to an MRR Supplier through the MRR program that the customer will be randomly assigned or reassigned to an MRR Supplier if the customer does not choose to receive natural gas commodity supply service through the SCO (subject to customer eligibility), an Energy Choice Supplier, or a governmental aggregation program.
12. Within 60 days after an order approving the Stipulation without material modification or other time period mutually agreed upon by the Signatory Parties, the PUCO Staff shall convene a collaborative meeting of interested stakeholders to discuss the development of a consumer education program designed to help Choice-eligible customers, including customers who are participating in the MRR program, compare options for natural gas service and understand how those options can affect the information on their natural gas bills in Dominion's service territory. Focus groups and surveys shall be conducted to assess why customers who were in the former MVR program for over 12 months did not affirmatively make a supply choice. The content and approach of any focus groups and surveys will be developed through the collaborative group, which will have access to the results of any focus groups and surveys. Collaborative group members, including

Signatory Parties, may seek a resolution from the PUCO regarding customer education issues, including notices to customers.

13. Dominion shall use existing education funds to provide (a) notices to customers that are to be assigned or reassigned as a result of the implementation of this Stipulation and (b) consumer education and other activities as described in paragraph 12. Additional funding for customer notices, consumer education, and the activities described in paragraph 12 shall be funded through a new fee. Beginning December 1, 2021, and subject to Commission approval of any necessary changes in its tariff, Dominion shall assess the fee in the amount of \$0.01/Mcf to all Suppliers participating in Dominion's Energy Choice program, to all Suppliers of governmental aggregations in Dominion service territory, participating in the MRR program, and to the Suppliers awarded tranches through the SCO or SSO auctions. The fee will continue to be assessed to Suppliers for all such volumes billed prior to the first billing cycle in December 1, 2025. Dominion shall hold the collected fees in a segregated account. The collection and use of the fees shall be subject to Commission audit. At least once per year, Dominion shall provide Commission Staff and the Signatory Parties an accounting of the amounts received from the fee charged under this provision and a brief report describing its consumer education funding expenditures. Dominion shall make reasonable efforts to expend funding collected under this paragraph as it becomes available for use, subject to all of the following conditions: (x) that Dominion determines there is adequate support from the collaborative for such expenditures; (y) that Dominion shall be under no obligation to make such expenditures to the extent their intended use is being contested

by any collaborative member; and (z) for the avoidance of doubt, that Dominion shall be under no obligation to make such expenditures in excess of available funding.

14. Not later than three years after an order approving the Stipulation without material modification, the Signatory Parties shall meet to discuss the results of the changes *implemented by this Stipulation and whether any further enhancements or changes should be made to the MRR program.*
15. After an order approving the Stipulation without material modification, Dominion shall provide the Signatory Parties with readily available, aggregated non-Supplier-specific switching statistics and data regarding the various commodity service options, including usage and customer count information, in a format similar to that set out in Exhibit B.
16. Dominion shall retain aggregated non-Supplier-specific rate, usage, and customer count information consistent with the data and information previously provided to the signatory parties of the settlement agreement adopted in Case No. 12-1842-GA-EXM. The information retained by Dominion under this paragraph shall not be available or used in any proceeding except one that relates to a modification of the MRR Program or Dominion's exit from the merchant function (including any material modification of the process, terms, and conditions applicable to, or any limitation or modification of the availability of, SCO and/or SSO commodity service). However, the restriction on use of information pursuant to this paragraph shall not prohibit a Signatory Party from making requests in future proceedings to seek information which has independent relevance in such future proceeding. To the extent there is a dispute concerning whether information previously provided to the Signatory Parties is independently

relevant in a future proceeding, such dispute shall be addressed in the future proceeding. Dominion will work with Staff to determine what information needs to be provided, and to provide such information, to Staff. Dominion shall designate any such information provided to Staff that may be confidential or proprietary as such, and Staff shall take appropriate actions to protect information that is so marked.

17. The Signatory Parties agree that they shall not individually or jointly request Commission approval for Dominion to exit the merchant function or to modify the MRR program structure for any of Dominion's consumers prior to July 1, 2023. The Signatory Parties reserve their rights to challenge any application or request filed with the Commission by a Signatory Party or non-signatory party seeking approval for Dominion to exit the merchant function or to modify the structure of the MRR program.
18. Notwithstanding anything to the contrary in paragraph 17 of this Stipulation, Dominion may request a limited modification to the Energy Choice or MRR programs to the extent necessary (a) to address issues concerning operation of the distribution system or program administration; or (b) to implement new or changed state or federal laws or regulations affecting its operations or the Energy Choice or MRR programs. The Signatory Parties reserve all rights to support or oppose any such request by Dominion.
19. Subject to the conditions set forth in this paragraph, Dominion's signature on this Stipulation constitutes its consent under R.C. 4929.08(A)(2) to any modification of any prior exemption order that is necessary to approve or implement this Stipulation. This consent is expressly conditioned on the Commission's approval of the Stipulation without material modification. For purposes of this paragraph, Dominion has the right, in its sole discretion, to determine whether the Commission's approval of this Stipulation contains a

material modification. If Dominion chooses to revoke or withdraw its consent, it may do so under any and all of the circumstances in which withdrawal is permitted, and it shall do so in accordance with the procedures for withdrawal set forth, in the “Additional Terms and Conditions” that follow. For the avoidance of doubt, revocation or withdrawal of consent under this paragraph shall not operate to bar or limit Dominion from consenting to any future modification proposed or requested under R.C. 4929.08.

ADDITIONAL TERMS AND CONDITIONS

This Stipulation is expressly conditioned upon the Commission’s adoption and approval of the Stipulation in its entirety, without material modification. Each Signatory Party has the right, in its sole discretion, to determine whether the Commission’s approval of this Settlement contains a material modification.

If the Commission rejects or materially modifies all or any part of the Stipulation, any Signatory Party shall have the right, within 30 days of issuance of the Commission’s Order, to apply for rehearing or to withdraw from the Stipulation by filing a notice (“Notice of Withdrawal”) with the Commission in this proceeding and serving the Notice of Withdrawal on all Signatory Parties. If the Commission does not adopt the Stipulation without material modification upon rehearing, or if the Commission makes a material modification to any Order adopting the Stipulation pursuant to any reversal, vacation, and/or remand by the Supreme Court of Ohio, then within thirty (30) days of the Commission’s Entry on Rehearing or Order on Remand any Signatory Party may withdraw from the Stipulation by filing a Notice of Withdrawal with the Commission. The filing of a Notice of Withdrawal within 30 days of the issuance of the initial Opinion and Order addressing this Stipulation shall stay the effective date of the implementation of the terms of the Stipulation until such time as the Commission issues a

subsequent Opinion and Order following a hearing in which the withdrawing party is given an opportunity to contest the Stipulation.

No Signatory Party shall file a Notice of Withdrawal without first negotiating in good faith with the other Signatory Parties to achieve an outcome that substantially satisfies the intent of the Stipulation. If a new agreement achieves such an outcome, the Signatory Parties will file the new agreement for Commission review and approval. If the discussions to achieve an outcome that substantially satisfies the intent of the Stipulation are unsuccessful, and a Signatory Party files a Notice of Withdrawal, then the Commission will convene an evidentiary hearing to afford that Signatory Party the opportunity to contest the Stipulation by presenting evidence through witnesses, to cross-examine witnesses, to present rebuttal testimony, and to brief all issues that the Commission shall decide based upon the record and briefs as if the party had never executed the Stipulation. If the discussions to achieve an outcome that substantially satisfies the intent of the Stipulation are successful, then some or all of the Signatory Parties shall submit the amended Stipulation to the Commission for approval after a hearing.

This Stipulation is entered into as an overall compromise and resolution of all of the issues presented in this proceeding. This Stipulation does not necessarily represent the position any Signatory Party would have taken absent the execution of this Stipulation as a package. This Stipulation shall not be cited as precedent in any future proceeding for or against any Signatory Party, except to enforce the terms of the Stipulation.

Except as otherwise specified in this Stipulation, the Signatory Parties urge the Commission not to construe or apply any specific element or item contained in or supporting the Stipulation as the results that any Signatory Party might support or seek had the Signatory Parties not reached this Stipulation.

The Signatory Parties urge the Commission to accept and approve the terms hereof as promptly as possible to enable timely implementation of the program changes set forth in this Stipulation.

CONCLUSION

The Signatory Parties stipulate, agree, and recommend that the Commission promptly issue a final Opinion and Order in this proceeding adopting this Stipulation without modification.

AGREED TO THIS 5th DAY OF FEBRUARY, 2020.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Madeline Fleisher (per e-mail auth.)

Madeline Fleisher (0091862) (Counsel of Record)

Christine M.T. Pirik (0029759)

Dickinson Wright PLLC

150 East Gay Street, Suite 2400

Columbus, Ohio 43215

(614) 591-5474 (Fleisher)

(614) 591-5461 (Pirik)

mfleisher@dickinsonwright.com

cpirik@dickinsonwright.com

Attorneys for Direct Energy Business Marketing, LLC and Direct Energy Services, LLC

/s/ Michael J. Settineri (per e-mail auth.)

Michael J. Settineri (0073369) (Counsel of Record)

Gretchen L. Petrucci (0046608)

MacDonald W. Taylor (0086959)

Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP

52 E. Gay Street / P.O. Box 1008

Columbus, OH 43216-1008

(614) 464-5462

mjsettineri@vorys.com

glpetrucci@vorys.com

mwtaylor@vorys.com

Attorneys for the Retail Energy Supply Association

/s/ Joseph Olikier (per e-mail auth.)

Joseph Olikier (0086088) (Counsel of Record)

Michael Nugent (0090408)

Bethany Allen (0093732)

Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.

6100 Emerald Parkway

Dublin, Ohio 43016

(614) 659-5069

Joe.Olikier@igs.com

Michael.Nugent@igs.com

Bethany.Allen@igs.com

Frank Darr (0025469)

6800 Linbrook Blvd.

Columbus, Ohio 43235

(614) 390-6750

fdarr2019@gmail.com

Attorneys for Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.

/s/ Christine M.T. Pirik (per e-mail auth.)

Christine M.T. Pirik (0029759) (Counsel of Record)

Madeline Fleisher (0091862)

Dickinson Wright PLLC

150 East Gay Street, Suite 2400

Columbus, Ohio 43215

(614) 591-5461 (Pirik)

(614) 591-5474 (Fleisher)

cpirik@dickinsonwright.com

mfleisher@dickinsonwright.com

Counsel for Dominion Energy Solutions, Inc.

/s/ Christopher T. Kennedy (per e-mail auth.)

Christopher T. Kennedy (0075228) (Counsel of Record)

Lucas A. Fykes (0098471)

Whitt Sturtevant LLP

The KeyBank Building, Suite 1590

88 East Broad Street

Columbus, OH 43215

(614) 224-3912

kennedy@whitt-sturtevant.com

fykes@whitt-sturtevant.com

Andrew J. Campbell (0081485)

Dominion Energy, Inc.

88 East Broad Street, Suite 1303

Columbus, OH 43215

(614) 601-1777

andrew.j.campbell@dominionenergy.com

Attorneys for The East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a

Dominion Energy Ohio

/s/ Robert Dove (per e-mail auth.)

Robert Dove (0092019)

Kegler Brown Hill + Ritter Co., L.P.A.

65 E State St., Ste. 1800

Columbus, OH 43215-4295

(614) 462-5443

rdove@keglerbrown.com

Attorney for Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy

/s/ Werner L. Margard (per e-mail auth.)

Werner L. Margard III (0024858) (Counsel of Record)

Assistant Attorney General

30 East Broad Street, 16th Floor

Columbus, Ohio 43215

(614) 995-5532

werner.margard@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

Attorney for the Staff of the Public

Utilities Commission of Ohio

/s/ Kimberly W. Bojko (per e-mail auth.)

Kimberly W. Bojko (0069402) (Counsel of Record)

Angela Paul Whitfield (0068774)

Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP

280 North High Street, Suite 1300

Columbus, Ohio 43215

(614) 365-4100

bojko@carpenterlipps.com

paul@carpenterlipps.com

Special Counsel for the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing document was served by electronic mail to the following recipients on this 5th day of February, 2020:

werner.margard@ohioattorneygeneral.gov
mjsettineri@vorys.com
glpetrucci@vorys.com
mwtaylor@vorys.com
mfleisher@dickinsonwright.com
cpirik@dickinsonwright.com
Joe.Oliker@igs.com
Michael.Nugent@igs.com
Bethany.Allen@igs.com
fdarr2019@gmail.com
kennedy@whitt-sturtevant.com
fykes@whitt-sturtevant.com
andrew.j.campbell@dominionenergy.com
rdove@keglerbrown.com

Attorney Examiners:

sarah.parrot@puco.ohio.gov
lauren.augostini@puco.ohio.gov

/s/ Kimberly W. Bojko
Special Counsel for the Office of the Ohio
Consumers' Counsel

**EXHIBIT A TO JOINT STIPULATION AND RECOMMENDATION
CASE NO. 18-1419-GA-EXM**

**EXAMPLE MONTHLY MEDIAN MRR PRICE CALCULATION
SUPPLIER WITH MEDIAN PRICE SHOWN IN RED**

Eligible MRR Supplier	Supplier Lowest Posted MVR Rate
Supplier A	\$9.25
Supplier B	\$7.99
Supplier C	\$6.50
Supplier D	\$6.39
Supplier E	\$5.89
Supplier F	\$4.89
Supplier G	\$4.77
Supplier H	\$4.56
Supplier I	\$4.50
Supplier J	\$4.19
Supplier K	\$4.15
Supplier L	\$3.79
Supplier M	\$3.79
Supplier N	\$3.70
Supplier O	\$3.63
Supplier P	\$3.55
Supplier Q	\$3.39
Supplier R	\$3.13
Supplier S	\$2.90
Supplier T	\$2.70
Supplier U	\$2.36
Monthly Median MRR Price	\$4.15

Aggregated non-Supplier-specific switching statistics and data

Confidential

Customer Count and Usage Information for [Month] [Year] Cycle [X] through [Month] [Year] Cycle [Y]

Rate Type	Residential		Non-Residential		Total	
	Count	Mcf	Count	Mcf	Count	Mcf
EC						
Gov Agg						
SCO						
MRR						
Total						