



**DELIVERED BY EMAIL**

CRA No. D20048 / D20049

January 28, 2020

Robert M. Endris  
FirstEnergy Corp.  
76 South Main Street  
Akron, OH 44308

Re: Notification of CBP Auction Results

Dear Bob:

This is to inform you that we have confirmed the results of the FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities' Competitive Bidding Process Auction ("Auction") to procure supply for Standard Service Offer (SSO) customers for the FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities. The Auction began on Tuesday January 28, 2020 and concluded the same day.

There are three tables attached to this letter.

- Table 1 summarizes the results of the Auction.
- Table 2 shows, for each winning bidder, the number of tranches won for each contract in the Auction.
- Table 3 provides the Auction Manager's assessment of the conduct of the Auction.

In accordance with the Bidding Rules, winning bidders will be contacted directly by the FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities to execute the Master SSO Supply Agreement no later than three (3) business days following the close of the Auction.

Sincerely yours,

CRA INTERNATIONAL, INC.



Bradley A. Miller  
Vice President

cc:

Sam Randazzo, Chairman, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
M. Beth Trombold, Commissioner, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
Lawrence Friedeman, Commissioner, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
Dennis Deters, Commissioner, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
Daniel Conway, Commissioner, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
Ray Strom, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
Timothy Benedict, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
Tamara Turkenton, Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
Steven E. Strah, Senior Vice President and President, FirstEnergy Utilities  
Jon Taylor, Vice President, Utility Operations  
Mark Jones, Regional President, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company  
Edward Shuttleworth, Regional President, Ohio Edison Company  
Richard S. Sweeney, Regional President, The Toledo Edison Company  
Sonny Fanelli, Director of Ohio Rates  
Frank Mossburg, Bates White

**Table 1. Summary of SSO Auction Results**

|  |    | Delivery Period                 |                                 |
|--|----|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|
|  |    | June 1, 2020 to<br>May 31, 2021 | June 1, 2020 to<br>May 31, 2022 |
| Number of Registered Bidders                                 | 13 |                                 |                                 |
| Total initial eligibility of Registered Bidders (# tranches) |    |                                 |                                 |
| Total initial eligibility divided by tranche target          |    |                                 |                                 |
| Number of bidders that submitted bids in round 1             |    |                                 |                                 |
| Number of tranches bid in round 1                            |    |                                 |                                 |
| Number of tranches bid in round 1 divided by tranche target  |    |                                 |                                 |
| Number of tranches to procure in auction (tranche target)    | 33 | 16                              | 17                              |
| Number of tranches procured in auction                       | 33 | 16                              | 17                              |
| Number of rounds in the auction                              | 17 |                                 |                                 |
| Number of winning bidders                                    | 6  | 6                               | 5                               |
| Starting price range (\$/MWh)                                |    | \$60.00-\$80.00                 | \$60.00-\$80.00                 |
| Starting price (\$/MWh)                                      |    |                                 |                                 |
| Clearing price (\$/MWh)                                      |    | \$38.65                         | \$42.95                         |

**Table 2. Winning Bidders and Tranches Won**

| Winning Bidder | Number of Winning Tranches |                                 |                                 |
|----------------|----------------------------|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|
|                | Total                      | Delivery Period                 |                                 |
|                |                            | June 1, 2020 to<br>May 31, 2021 | June 1, 2020 to<br>May 31, 2022 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |
|                |                            |                                 |                                 |

**Table 3. Auction Manager's Assessment of the Conduct of the Auction**

|    | Question  |  |
|----|---|--|
| 1  | Were the competitive bidding rules violated?  |  |
| 2  | Does the Auction Manager believe the auction was open, fair, transparent, and competitive?  |  |
| 3  | Did bidders have sufficient information to prepare for the auction?   |  |
| 4  | Was the information generally provided to bidders in accordance with the published timetable? Was the timetable updated appropriately as needed?  |  |
| 5  | Were there any issues and questions left unresolved prior to the auction that created material uncertainty for bidders?   |  |
| 6  | Were there any procedural problems or errors with the auction, including the electronic bidding process, the back-up bidding process, and communications between bidders and the Auction Manager? |  |
| 7  | Were protocols for communication between bidders and the Auction Manager adhered to?  |  |
| 8  | Were there any hardware or software problems or errors, either with the auction system or with its associated communications systems?   |  |
| 9  | Were there any unanticipated delays during the auction?   |  |
| 10 | Did unanticipated delays appear to adversely affect bidding in the auction?   |  |
| 11 | Were appropriate data back-up procedures planned and carried out?   |  |
| 12 | Were any security breaches observed with the auction process?   |  |

|    | Question  |  |
|----|---|--|
| 13 | Were protocols followed for communications among FirstEnergy Ohio Utilities, the Auction Manager, the PUCO, and the PUCO's consultant during the auction?               |  |
| 14 | Were the protocols followed for decisions regarding changes in auction parameters (e.g., volume adjustments and price decrements)?                                      |  |
| 15 | Were the calculations (e.g., for price decrements or bidder eligibility) produced by the auction software double-checked or reproduced off-line by the Auction Manager? |  |
| 16 | Was there evidence of confusion or misunderstanding on the part of bidders that delayed or impaired the auction?  |  |
| 17 | Were the communications between the Auction Manager and bidders timely and effective?   |  |
| 18 | Was there evidence that bidders felt unduly rushed during the process?  |  |
| 19 | Was there any evidence of collusion or improper coordination among bidders?   |  |
| 20 | Was there any evidence of anti-competitive behavior in the auction?   |  |
| 21 | Was information made public appropriately? Was confidential and sensitive information treated appropriately?  |  |
| 22 | Were there factors exogenous to the auction (e.g., changes in market environment) that materially affected the auction in unanticipated ways?                           |  |

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**1/29/2020 10:42:45 AM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 16-0776-EL-UNC**

Summary: Report Notification of CBP Auction Results - Redacted electronically filed by Mr. Matthew D Snider on behalf of PUCO Staff