جو

18-1606-RR-RCP 18-1902-RR-RCP In The Matter of: 19 - 1488 - RR - Rep 19-1891-RR-RCP

In the Matter of a request by the mahoning County Engineer, et al.

Transcript of Proceedings

November 15, 2019

PUCO Hearing

2020 JAN 28 AM 10: 54



1660 West 2nd Street, Suite 780 | 50 South Main Street, Suite 720 Cleveland, Ohio 44113 | Akron, Ohio 44308 216.241.9000 | 330.535.7300

216.621.0050 Fax

www.MandH.com

Schedule@MandH.com

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business. Technician Date Processed, original fulename: 191115 - (11-15-19) puco hearing

1	IN THE MATTER OF A REQUEST BY
2	THE MAHONING COUNTY ENGINEER
	FROM STOPPING FOR SCHOOL BUSES CASE NO.
3	AND HAZARDOUS MATERIALS 18-1606-RR-RCP
	VEHICLES AT COUNTY ROAD
4	CROSSINGS 84, 22, 23, 28, 25,
	AND 32, AND TOWNSHIP ROAD
5	CROSSINGS 29 AND 30 IN MAHONING
·	COUNTY.
6	THE WARRED OF A DECISION DV
7	IN THE MATTER OF A REQUEST BY THE MAHONING COUNTY ENGINEER
7	FOR AN EXEMPTION FROM STOPPING CASE NO.
8	FOR SCHOOL BUSES AND HAZARDOUS 18-1902-RR-RCP
0	MATERIALS VEHICLES AT THE
9	COUNTY ROAD 49 CROSSING IN
	MAHONING COUNTY.
0	
:	IN THE MATTER OF A REQUEST BY
.1	THE VILLAGE OF SEBRING FOR AN
	EXEMPTION FROM STOPPING FOR CASE NO.
.2	SCHOOL BUSES AND HAZARDOUS 19-1488-RR-RCP
_	MATERIALS VEHICLES AT THE
.3	NORTH JOHNSON ROAD CROSSING IN MAHONING COUNTY.
4	IN MAHONING COUNTY.
	IN THE MATTER OF A REQUEST BY
L5	THE MAHONING COUNTY ENGINEER
-	FOR AN EXEMPTION FROM STOPPING CASE NO.
16	FOR SCHOOL BUSES AND HAZARDOUS 19-1891-RR-RCP
	MATERIALS VEHICLES AT THE
7	COUNTY ROAD 11 AND 26
	CROSSINGS IN MAHONING COUNTY.
.8	
_	HEARING HELD BEFORE
.9	ATTORNEY EXAMINER JAMES M. LYNN,
20	AT WEST BRANCH HIGH SCHOOL, 14277 SOUTH MAIN STREET, BELOIT, OHIO,
. 0	ON FRIDAY, NOVEMBER 15, 2019,
21	COMMENCING AT 12:30
_	
22	MEHLER & HAGESTROM
	Court Reporters
23	CLEVELAND AKRON
	1660 West 2nd Street 720 Akron Centre
24	780 Skylight Office Tower 50 South Main Street
. –	Cleveland, Ohio 44113 Akron, Ohio 44308
25	216.241.9000 330.535.7300

FAX 216.621.0050

1	APPEARANCES:
2	James M. Lynn, Attorney Examiner Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
3	180 East Broad Street Columbus, Ohio 43215-3793
4	614.466.0451 Jim.Lynn@puc.state.oh.us
5	ALSO PRESENT:
6	Ms. Sherri Malloy, West Branch School District
7	Mr. Robert Durbin, Mahoning County Engineer's
8	Office
9	Mr. Douglas McGlynn, Western Reserve Local School District
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16 17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

1	ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: Let's go
2	on the record at this time. And Public
3	Utility Commission of Ohio has assigned for
4	a hearing at this time and place four cases
5	actually. And they all involve requests
6	for exemptions from school buses for
7	school buses from stopping at certain grade
8	crossings. And I'll go down the list.
9	First is Case Number
10	18-1606-RR-RCP. And that's a request by
11	the Mahoning County Engineer on behalf of
12	West Branch Schools. And it concerns the
13	exemption of County Roads the grade
14	crossings at County Roads 84, 22, 23, 28,
15	25 and 32, also Township Roads 29 and 30.
16	We also have an exemption in Case
17	exemption request in Case
18	18-1902-RR-RCP. And that involves, again,
19	the school buses at County Road 49 in
20	Mahoning County. And that was done on
21	behalf of the Western Reserve Schools and
22	Doug McGlynn.
23	MR. MCGLYNN: Mm-hmm.
24	ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: And we
25	also had two other cases, Case

19-1488-RR-RCP. That request was made by the Village of Sebring and actually was by the -- I guess it was by the Village of Sebring because they're the local highway authority. And that involved the crossing on North Johnson Road.

And then finally we have Case
19-1891-RR-RCP. And that's also made by
the Mahoning County Engineer on behalf of
West Branch Schools. And that involves
County Roads 11 and 26.

I'm Jim Lynn. I'm the Attorney
Examiner assigned to hear this case. And
our hearing today is a request for public
comments concerning the exemption -exemption applications that were submitted.
Your testimony will be considered part of
the official record of the case and will be
reviewed by our Commissioners before they
make their final decision.

And we obviously don't have a very large group here, but I appreciate everyone showing up. And I'll ask when you start speaking, mention your name and what school district or in the case of Mr. Durbin, you

	ļ
1	know, what county engineer's office and so
2	forth. And just spell your name, state the
3	address, who you work for and then your
4	thoughts on these different crossing
5	requests.
6	I think I'll first start with
7	Sherri Malloy here of West Branch Schools.
8	Let's go through the first bunch that I
9	listed, Sherri. It was County Roads 84,
10	22, 23, 28, 25, 32 and Township Roads 29
11	and 30. Any comments on those crossings?
12	If there is a, you know,
13	particular one you want to single out,
14	fine, but I would imagine you have some
15	comments that really apply to all the
16	crossings.
17	MS. MALLOY: That's correct. My
18	name is Sherri Malloy, S-h-e-r-r-i, last
19	name is Malloy, M-a-l-l-o-y. I'm the
20	transportation supervisor at West Branch
21	Local Schools at 14277 South Main Street,
22	in Beloit, Ohio.
23	The crossings that are being
24	discussed are unused crossings. And by
25	state law, all school buses and any

trucks that are carrying hazardous materials are included in this, but I'm most concerned with school buses especially with children.

These tracks have been unused.

Most of them are either paved over, have trees growing in the middle of them or at best just grassy covered. You can tell that they haven't been used and it has been confirmed that they are not used. But under state law, all school buses have to stop completely, activate lights, open doors, listen.

What we find are cars, trucks, semis that know for a fact that these are unused crossings that do not have to stop are either impatient or don't understand why we have to stop, and we are trying to prevent rear-end collisions at best.

Especially with winter approaching, that is a big concern.

They panic. They don't -- you know, and to be honest with you, we drive eight ton school buses. But if you're a person in a car behind us, that you're

going to take the brunt of that. And it could be fatal for that person. And I -- you know, we don't want to see anyone get hurt.

But if we could get exempt crossings and with the law saying that they're exempt, that will allow us just to cross these in traffic flow and not have to stop completely. And we feel that it is a very, very -- it's -- it's a hazard. And we feel like for the public safety that this is the right thing to do.

ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: And have there been any collisions?

MS. MALLOY: Not reportable collisions. We have had close calls. And what I mean close calls, people seem to see the rear end of a stopped school bus or any other car and veer to the right.

But again, one of these crossings

-- we'll get to the next one. I'm grouping
all of mine in together -- is going into -on Johnson Road. This one's going into an
industrial park. It has Tru Cut. It has
Precious Cargo Daycare.

1	These people are trying to get to
2	work. These semis are trying to get there.
3	And again, they don't have to stop. They
4	know they're not going to stop. There's
5	there's not even a chance of a train being
6	there. And it's it's just it's
7	something that needs done for public safety
8	as a whole.
9	ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: And your
10	comments would apply to the County Roads 11
11	and 26 also?
12	MS. MALLOY: Absolutely. Oyster
13	Road and South Range Road also, yes.
14	ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: Okay.
15	All right. And the issues that are
16	concerning you, is it not just when the
17	students are being brought to school or
18	taken home from school, but also would it
19	involve, for example, if they're on a
20	school bus going to sporting events or
21	something like that
22	MS. MALLOY: Absolutely.
23	ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: after
24	hours?
25	MS. MALLOY: Absolutely. Yes.

1	Anywhere we go, we have to stop, whether	9
2	it's out of town or out of out of the	
3	county, yes.	
4	ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: Okay.	
5	Thank you.	
6	MS. MALLOY: And it really the	:
7	drivers have noticed, when we met before	
8	and they have exempted 534, 224 and State	
9	all were state routes including State	
10	Route 14, what a difference. And, yeah,	
11	they have commented that it's just they	
12	feel so much better about the situation.	
13	ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: Thank	
14	you.	
15	Okay. Mr. McGlynn, concerning	
16	County Road 49, I believe that's also	
17	Weaver Road?	
18	MR. MCGLYNN: Mm-hmm.	
19	ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: And what	
20	comments would you have as far as the	
21	request made for the exemption there?	
22	MR. MCGLYNN: My name is Doug	
23	McGlynn, D-o-u-g, M-c, capital G-l-y-n-n.	
24	And I am the superintendent at Western	
25	Reserve Local Schools, 13850 West	

	10
1	Akron-Canfield Road, Berlin Center, Ohio
2	44401.
3	The Weaver Road crossing is on an
4	incline coming both ways. And what we've
5	run into is when our buses are coming down
6	Weaver Road, because there are a number of
7	kids who live on that road, and they're
8	having to stop, people are not stopping
9	either behind them or they're going around
10	them or they're coming up the other way.
11	And it's becoming a problem for
12	us. We had a number of car accidents
13	there. No buses yet on that on that
14	particular one. But the concern is every
15	time we're stopping, they're not stopping
16	coming the other way.
17	ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: So what
18	you're saying is that when one of your
19	buses is stopped on this incline
20	MR. MCGLYNN: On the incline.
21	ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: then
22	cars will say go to the left of the bus,
23	try to go around it
24	MR. MCGLYNN: Some will try to go
25	around.

PUCO Hearing	
ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: But	11
somebody could be coming the other dir	
opposite direction?	
MR. MCGLYNN: And there could be a	
collision, head-on collision.	
ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: Okay.	
And it actually has happened or we've had	
some close calls?	
MR. MCGLYNN: We have had some	
close calls with that. It has happened	
with just two cars that have just	
ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: Okay.	
MR. MCGLYNN: come up over that	
incline. Because the way it's set up, and	
I think you've probably seen it, it's kind	
of a hill on both sides. And when you come	
up over top, it's partially paved.	
And it's not been used in the	
seven years I've been there as an active	
track. Like the other ones that were made	
exempt in our district, it's one that has	
grass growing up through it, trees, as	
Sherri stated.	
But it would make it a lot easier	
for us not to have to make that stop and	
	somebody could be coming the other dir opposite direction? MR. MCGLYNN: And there could be a collision, head-on collision. ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: Okay. And it actually has happened or we've had some close calls? MR. MCGLYNN: We have had some close calls with that. It has happened with just two cars that have just ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: Okay. MR. MCGLYNN: come up over that incline. Because the way it's set up, and I think you've probably seen it, it's kind of a hill on both sides. And when you come up over top, it's partially paved. And it's not been used in the seven years I've been there as an active track. Like the other ones that were made exempt in our district, it's one that has grass growing up through it, trees, as Sherri stated. But it would make it a lot easier

12 1 start, to be able to go over that, including after school when we go that way 2 3 to go to activities at other parts of the 4 area towards the southeast way. 5 ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: Okay. Thank you. 6 And, Mr. Durbin, you're with the 8 Mahoning County Engineer. If you could, 9 you know, state your name, the address of 10 the Engineer's Office, any thoughts you 11 would have as far as these requests that 1.2 were made. 13 MR. DURBIN: My name is Bob 14 Durbin, B-o-b D-u-r-b-i-n. I am the deputy 15 engineer for the Mahoning County Engineer. 16 Our address is 940 Bears Den Road, 17 Youngstown, Ohio. 18 I have four county roads that are 19 under our jurisdiction -- I'm sorry, nine 20 county roads under our jurisdiction in 21 these four cases as well as two township 22 Under Ohio law, we are the roads. 23 engineering advisors for all townships. 24 So when Miss Malloy contacted us 25 about these various roads and crossings, I

went out and viewed all of them to -- so that I would have an opinion on each and every crossing whether or not it should be exempt.

I believe every one of them should be exempt for the reasons that have been stated here. It's very obvious that there could be some hazardous situations created by buses having to stop at these crossings due to other traffic not wanting to stop or not needing to stop.

I had some conversation with the two townships that were involved on the crossing on the Township Road 29 and 30 and gave them my opinion of the crossing, asked them to take it to their township meeting and provide a letter of support, which they did, which was included in my letter.

And we are fully in support of both school districts and their request for these exemptions.

ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: Thank

you. I'll note for the record here there
is -- we don't have a representative of the

Village of Sebring. However, we do have a

	14
1	letter that was filed by them in this case.
2	And thanks to Sherri Malloy for helping get
3	that letter too.
4	I also mention here, sometimes
5	when I'm not in my home office things
6	aren't as formal as they typically are.
7	And I needed to actually swear you all in.
8	So I just ask that for all three
9	of you do you swear the statements you all
10	made were true?
11	Miss Malloy?
12	MS. MALLOY: Yes, they were true.
13	ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: Okay.
14	And Mr. McGlynn?
15	MR. MCGLYNN: Yes, true.
16	ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: And Mr.
17	Durbin?
18	MR. DURBIN: Yes, all true.
19	ATTORNEY EXAMINER LYNN: Thank you
20	very much. Get me off my bench and I'm
21	totally out of sync here.
22	All right. I believe that really
23	is about it. Again, I want to thank
24	everyone for coming and all the
25	coordination with the emails going back and

1	forth and so on. And I believe that will
2	wrap things up. Thanks for our court
3	reporter for coming too.
4	And that will close the
5	proceedings for today.
6	
7	(Hearing concluded.)
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	·
20	·
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

PUCO Hearing CERTIFICATE I, Dawn L. Wiebrecht, a Notary Public within and for the State of Ohio, do hereby certify that I attended the foregoing hearing in its entirety, that I wrote the same in stenotypy, and that this is a true and correct transcript of my stenotype notes. IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my hand and seal of office, at Cleveland, Ohio, this 27th day of November, 2019. Dawn L. Wiebrecht Notary Public, State of Ohio My commission expires April 30, 2022

	19	created 13:8	find 6:14	left 10:22
1	authority 4:5	cross 7:8	fine 5:14	letter 13:17,18 14:
		crossing 4:5 5:4	flow 7:8	3
i1 4:11 8:10		10:3 13:3,14,15	formal 14:6	lights 6:12
1 3850 9:25	В			
14 9:10	B-O-B 12:14	crossings 5:11,16,	fully 13:19	listed 5:9
		23,24 6:16 7:6,20		listen 6:13
14277 5:21	back 14:25	12:25 13:9		live 10:7
19-1488-RR-RCP	Bears 12:16	Cut 7:24		local 4:4 5:21 9:25
4:1	behalf 4:9	Out 1.24	G-L-Y-N-N 9:23	lot 11:24
19-1891-RR-RCP	Beloit 5:22		gave 13:15	
4:8	bench 14:20	D	1 •	Lynn 4:12 7:13 8:9
4.0		20110000	grass 11:22	14,23 9:4,13,19
	Berlin 10:1	D-O-U-G 9:23	grassy 6:8	10:17,21 11:1,6,12
2	big 6:21	D-U-R-B-I-N 12:14	group 4:22	12:5 13:22 14:13,10
	Bob 12:13	Daycare 7:25	grouping 7:21	1
22 5:10	Branch 4:10 5:7,20	decision 4:20	growing 6:7 11:22	19
224 9:8				
23 5:10	brought 8:17	Den 12:16	guess 4:3	M
	brunt 7:1	deputy 12:14		IVI
25 5:10	bunch 5:8	difference 9:10	Н	M-A-L-L-O-Y 5:1
26 4:11 8:11	1	dir 11:2	n	M-C 9:23
28 5:10	bus 7:18 8:20 10:22		happened 11:7,10	
29 5:10 13:14	buses 5:25 6:3,11,24	direction 11:3	hazard 7:10	made 4:1,8 9:21
E⊎ 0.10 10.14	10:5,13,19 13:9	discussed 5:24		11:20 12:12 14:10
		district 4:25 11:21	hazardous 6:1 13:8	Mahoning 4:9 12
3		districts 13:20	head-on 11:5	15
	C		hear 4:13	
30 5:11 13:14	calls 7:16,17 11:8,10	doors 6:13	hearing 4:14 15:7	Main 5:21
32 5:10		Doug 9:22		make 4:20 11:24,2
_ 31.10	capital 9:23	drive 6:23	helping 14:2	Malloy 5:7,17,18,
	car 6:25 7:19 10:12	drivers 9:7	highway 4:4	7:15 8:12,22,25 9:6
4	Cargo 7:25	1	hill 11:16	
14104 45 5		due 13:10	home 8:18 14:5	12:24 14:2,11,12
14401 10:2	carrying 6:1	Durbin 4:25 12:7,13,	1	materials 6:2
19 9:16	cars 6:14 10:22	14 14:17,18	honest 6:23	Mcglynn 9:15,18,
	11:11		hours 8:24	23 10:20,24 11:4,9
	case 4:7,13,18,25		hurt 7:4	
5	14:1	E		14:14,15
534 9:8	1		i	meeting 13:16
134 A'Q	cases 12:21	easier 11:24	I	mention 4:24 14:
	Center 10:1	emails 14:25	lm - mln - C d :	met 9:7
8	chance 8:5	end 7:18	imagine 5:14	1
	children 6:4	engineer 4:9 12:8,	impatient 6:17	middle 6:7
34 5:9			incline 10:4,19,20	mine 7:22
	close 7:16,17 11:8,	15	11:14	Mm-hmm 9:18
	10 15:4	engineer's 5:1		
9	collision 11:5	12:10	included 6:2 13:18	
940 12:16	collisions 6:19 7:14,	engineering 12:23	including 9:9 12:2	N
140 12:10			industrial 7:24	
	16	events 8:20	involve 8:19	needed 14:7
Α	commented 9:11	Examiner 4:13 7:13	1	needing 13:11
	comments 4:15	8:9,14,23 9:4,13,19	involved 4:5 13:13	North 4:6
Absolutely 8:12,22,	5:11,15 8:10 9:20	10:17,21 11:1,6,12	involves 4:10	note 13:23
25	Commissioners	12:5 13:22 14:13,16,	issues 8:15	noticed 9:7
accidents 10:12		1	1	
	4:19	19		number 10:6,12
ictivate 6:12	completely 6:12 7:9	exempt 7:5,7 11:21	J	
active 11:19	concern 6:21 10:14	13:4.6	Jim 4:12	0
activities 12:3		1		
address 5:3 12:9,16	concerned 6:3	exempted 9:8	Johnson 4:6 7:23	obvious 13:7
	concluded 15:7	exemption 4:15,16	jurisdiction 12:19,	office 5:1 12:10 1
advisors 12:23	confirmed 6:10	9:21	20	
Akron-canfield	considered 4:17	exemptions 13:21		official 4:18
10:1	contacted 12:24			Ohio 5:22 10:1
applications 4:16			K	12:17,22
	conversation 13:12	F	Lide 40.7	one's 7:23
apply 5:15 8:10	coordination 14:25	F4 0.15	kids 10:7	
approaching 6:20	correct 5:17	fact 6:15	kind 11:15	open 6:12
area 12:4	1	fatal 7:2	-	opinion 13:2,15
assigned 4:13	county 4:9,11 5:1,9	feel 7:9,11 9:12		opposite 11:3
	8:10 9:3,16 12:8,15,		L	
	18,20	filed 14:1	large 4:00	Oyster 8:12
Attorney 4:12 7:13		final 4:20	large 4:22	
•		1	Lave 5.05 0.44 7.0	1
8:9,14,23 9:4,13,19	court 15:2	finally 4:7	law 5:25 6:11 7:6	
•	covered 6:8	finally 4:7	12:22	

1Index: 11..Oyster

	South 5:21 8:13		
	southeast 12:4		
panic 6:22	speaking 4:24	wanting 13:10	
park 7:24	spell 5:2	wanting 15.10	
part 4:17	sporting 8:20	Weaver 9:17 10:3,6	
partially 11:17	start 4:23 5:6 12:1	West 4:10 5:7,20	
parts 12:3	state 5:2,25 6:11 9:8,	9:25	
paved 6:6 11:17	9 12:9	Western 9:24	
people 7:17 8:1 10:8	stated 11:23 13:7	winter 6:20	
person 6:25 7:2	statements 14:9	work 5:3 8:2	
Precious 7:25	stop 6:12,16,18 7:9	wrap 15:2	
prevent 6:19	8:3,4 9:1 10:8 11:25	<u>-</u>	
problem 10:11	13:9,10,11 stopped 7:18 10:19	Υ	
proceedings 15:5	stopped 7.16 10.19 stopping 10:8,15		
provide 13:17	Street 5:21	years 11:19	
oublic 4:14 7:11 8:7	students 8:17	Youngstown 12:17	
	submitted 4:16		
R	superintendent		
	9:24		
Range 8:13	supervisor 5:20	•	
rear 7:18 rear-end 6:19	support 13:17,19		
rear-end 6:19	swear 14:7,9		
record 4:18 13:23	sync 14:21		
reportable 7:15	- J		
reporter 15:3	Т		
representative	<u> </u>		
13:24	testimony 4:17		
request 4:1,14 9:21	thing 7:12		
13:20	things 14:5 15:2		
requests 5:5 12:11	thoughts 5:4 12:10		
Reserve 9:25	time 10:15		
reviewed 4:19	today 4:14 15:5		
road 4:6 7:23 8:13	ton 6:24 top 11:17		
9:16,17 10:1,3,6,7	totally 14:21		
12:16 13:14	town 9:2		
roads 4:11 5:9,10	township 5:10 12:21		
8:10 12:18,20,22,25	13:14,16		
Route 9:10	townships 12:23		
routes 9:9	13:13		
run 10:5	track 11:20		
	tracks 6:5		
S	traffic 7:8 13:10		
S-H-E-R-R-I 5:18	train 8:5		
safety 7:11 8:7	transportation 5:20		
school 4:24 5:25	trees 6:7 11:22		
6:3,11,24 7:18 8:17,	Tru 7:24		
18,20 12:2 13:20	trucks 6:1,14		
Schools 4:10 5:7,21	true 14:10,12,15,18		
9:25	typically 14:6		
Sebring 4:2,4 13:25			
semis 6:15 8:2	U		
set 11:14	understand 6:17		
Sherri 5:7,9,18 11:23	unused 5:24 6:5,16		
14:2			
showing 4:23	V		
sides 11:16		1	
sides 11:16 single 5:13	veer 7:19		
sides 11:16 single 5:13 situation 9:12	viewed 13:1		
sides 11:16 single 5:13			