

**BEFORE  
THE OHIO POWER SITING BOARD**

In the Matter of the Application of Firelands Wind, )  
LLC for a Certificate of Environmental Compatibility )  
and Public Need to Construct a Wind-Powered ) Case No: 18-1607-EL-BGN  
Electric Generation Facility in Huron and Erie )  
Counties, Ohio. )

---

**MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER REGARDING FIRELANDS WIND, LLC'S  
RESPONSES TO THE THIRD DATA REQUEST  
FROM THE STAFF OF THE OHIO POWER SITING BOARD  
AND MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT**

---

Pursuant to Rule 4906-2-21(D) of the Ohio Administrative Code (“O.A.C.”), Firelands Wind, LLC (“Applicant”) respectfully moves the Ohio Power Siting Board (“Board”) for a protective order to keep certain portions of its response to the OPSB Staff’s Third Data Request (“Data Request”) confidential and not part of the public record. Attachment1 to the Data Request contains the Technical Documentation Wind Turbine Generator Systems 3MW and 5 MW Platform 50/60 Hz – Safety Manual (“Manual”). This Manual contain highly sensitive information that is not publicly available. As such, the Manual has been submitted under seal to preserve its confidentiality.

An explanation of the reasons supporting this motion is detailed in the attached Memorandum in Support. Consistent with the practice of the Board, an unredacted copy of the confidential Manual of the Applicant’s Data Request response have been submitted to the Docketing Division under seal.

Accordingly, the Applicant respectfully moves for a protective order to keep confidential information contained in this Manual, which were provided in response to the OPSB Staff's Third Set Data Request.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Christine M.T. Pirik  
Christine M.T. Pirik (0029759)  
(Counsel of Record)  
Terrence O'Donnell (0074213)  
William Vorys (0093479)  
DICKINSON WRIGHT PLLC  
150 East Gay Street, Suite 2400  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
(614) 591-5461  
[cpirik@dickinsonwright.com](mailto:cpirik@dickinsonwright.com)  
[todonnell@dickinsonwright.com](mailto:todonnell@dickinsonwright.com)  
[wvorys@dickinsonwright.com](mailto:wvorys@dickinsonwright.com)  
(Counsel is willing to accept service via email.)

***Attorneys for Firelands Wind, LLC***

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF  
MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER**

---

**I. INTRODUCTION**

In accordance with Chapter 4906 of the Ohio Revised Code (“R.C.”) and O.A.C. Chapter 4906-4, the Applicant filed an application for a certificate to construct a wind-powered electric generation facility (“Project” or “Facility”) in Huron and Erie Counties, Ohio (the “Application”) on January 31, 2019, which was supplemented on March 18, 2019, and April 11, 2019, July 10, 2019, and September 12, 2019, as revised on October 4, 2019. The Applicant filed, this same day, a Response to OPSB Staff’s Third Data Request, which included, as Attachment 1, a Manual that is considered trade secret and confidential. O.A.C. Rule 4906-2-21 provides that the Applicant may file a motion for protective order to protect such information. Accordingly, the Applicant requests a protective order covering Attachment 1 of the Third Data Request, which is a safety manual for one of the wind turbine models that is being proposed for consideration in this Application. In light of the highly sensitive, trade secret information contained in the attachments, the Applicant submits that the information must be kept confidential and not be made part of the public record. Therefore, the Applicant has submitted this attachment under seal to maintain its confidentiality.

**II. PROJECT BACKGROUND**

The Applicant is proposing to construct a wind-powered electric generation Facility of up to 297.66 MW, located in Erie and Huron Counties, Ohio. The general purpose of the Facility is to produce wind-powered electricity that will maximize energy production from wind resources

in the Project area in order to deliver clean, renewable electricity to the Ohio bulk power transmission system—serving the needs of electric utilities and their customers.

### **III. LEGAL AUTHORITY**

The O.A.C. expressly permits the Board or the administrative law judge (“ALJ”) assigned to the case to protect the confidentiality of certain information filed with the Board’s Docketing Division. See O.A.C. Rule 4906-2-21. In particular, O.A.C. Rule 4906-2-21(D) provides that:

“[u]pon motion of any party or person filing a document with the board’s docketing division relative to a case before the board, the board or the [ALJ] assigned to the case may issue any order which is necessary to protect the confidentiality of information contained in the document, to the extent that state or federal law prohibits release of the information, including where it is determined that both of the following criteria are met: The information is deemed by the board or [ALJ] assigned to the case to constitute a trade secret under Ohio law, and where non-disclosure of the information is not inconsistent with the purpose of Title 49 of the Revised Code.”

Here, nondisclosure of the information requested to be kept confidential will in no way impair the purposes of R.C. Title 49. The Board and its staff already have full access to the information in order to fulfill the Board’s statutory obligations. Thus, the question becomes whether the confidential information may be considered a “trade secret” under Ohio law.

The definition of a “trade secret” is set forth in Ohio’s Uniform Trade Secrets Act, which states:

“Trade secret” means information, including the whole or any portion or phase of any scientific or technical information, design, process, procedure, formula, pattern, compilation, program, device, method, technique, or improvement, or any business information or plans, financial information or listing of names, addresses, or telephone numbers, that satisfies both of the following:

(1) It derives independent economic value, actual or potential, from not being generally known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper means by, other persons who can obtain economic value from its disclosure or use.

(2) It is the subject of efforts that are reasonable under the circumstances to maintain its secrecy.

R.C. Section 1333.61(D).

Courts of other jurisdictions have held that a public utilities commission has the authority to protect trade secrets of companies subject to its jurisdiction. *New York Tel. Co. v. Pub. Serv. Comm.*, 56 N.Y. 2d 213 (1982). In fact, the existence of a state trade secret statute creates a duty of the public utilities commission to protect them. *Id.* Recognizing this duty, the Board has issued orders protecting trade secrets in numerous proceedings. See, e.g., *Buckeye Wind*, Case No. 08-666-EL-BGN, Entry (July 31, 2009); *Paulding Wind Farm LLC*, Case No. 09-980-EL-BGN, Entry (Feb. 23, 2010); *Carroll Co. Energy, LLC*, Case No. 13-1752-EL-BGN, Entry (Jan. 6, 2014); *North Coast Gas Transmission, LLC*, Case No. 14-1754-GA-BLN, Entry (Dec. 30, 2014).

In *State ex rel. The Plain Dealer v. Ohio Dept. of Ins.*, 80 Ohio St.3d 513, 687 N.E.2d 661 (1997), the Ohio Supreme Court adopted the six factor test set forth in *Pyromatics, Inc. v. Petruziello*, 7 Ohio App.3d 131, 134-135, 454 N.E.2d. 588, 592 (1983), which served to further define “trade secrets” under Ohio law. The six factors to be considered in recognizing a trade secret are:

(1) The extent to which the information is known outside the business, (2) the extent to which it is known to those inside the business, i.e., by the employees, (3) the precautions taken by the holder of the trade secret to guard the secrecy of the information, (4) the savings effected and the value to the holder in having the information as against competitors, (5) the amount of effort or money expended in obtaining and developing the information, and

(6) the amount of time and expense it would take for others to acquire and duplicate the information.

Note that the Board is not necessarily limited to protecting information meeting the precise definition of “trade secret.” The Board may issue a protective order providing that a “trade secret *or other confidential research, development, commercial, or other information* not be disclosed or be disclosed only in a designated way.” O.A.C. Rule 4906-2-21(A)(7) (*emphasis added*). As will be discussed in the next section, the information the Applicant seeks to protect should be considered trade secret. In addition, all of the confidential and sensitive information contained in the Manual and described in this motion and memorandum in support would be considered “confidential research, development, commercial, or other” information warranting protection from the public record, pursuant to the O.A.C.

#### **IV. APPLICATION OF “TRADE SECRET” FACTORS**

The information the Applicant seeks to keep confidential and not part of the public record meets each of the six factors that determine the existence of a trade secret under Ohio law. As detailed in the preceding section, the information would rise to the level of a trade secret if it is not generally known outside (or inside) the Applicant’s business, if sufficient precautions were taken to guard the secrecy of the information, if the information has competitive value, if the Applicant spent significant time and resources developing the information, and if it would take significant time and resources to duplicate the information. *State ex rel. The Plain Dealer v. Ohio Dept. of Ins.*, 80 Ohio St.3d 513, 687 N.E.2d 661 (1997).

The GE140 and GE158 turbine models represent brand new technology developed by these wind turbine manufacturers. To date, the manufacturer has not released any public information / data pertaining to these new technologies. The Manual is, therefore, unique, not

having been produced by any other business in the industry. The very nature of the Manual demonstrates the undue competitive disadvantage that would result from public disclosure of such highly coveted and confidential information.

Further, the manufacturer provided this Manual to the Applicant on a confidential basis. This Manual is, therefore, being submitted under seal to maintain its confidentiality. The Manual is not publicly available and the Applicant has agreed with the manufacturer to protect it from public disclosure. The manufacturer has devoted great time and expense to develop the Manual—public disclosure would give its competitors an undue competitive advantage.

Moreover, disclosure of the Manual is also not likely to assist the Board in carrying out its duties, considering the Board staff can view unredacted version placed under seal. Disclosure would similarly not serve any other public policy.

The Board, in addressing the issue of confidential wind turbine manuals, has contemplated that applicants may need to submit manuals from wind turbine manufacturers under seal, consistent with the Board's rules. See *Power Siting Board Requirements for Elec. Generating Wind Facilities*, Case No. 08-1024-EL-ORD, Order (Oct. 28, 2008) at 31-32. Thus, the Applicant requests that this information be kept confidential and not part of the public record.

## **V. ADDITIONAL SUPPORT**

As previously stated, the information the Applicant seeks to protect should be considered trade secrets. But the Board should also note that, at a minimum, the confidential and sensitive information contained in the Manual, and described in this motion and memorandum in support, would be considered “confidential research, development, commercial, or other information” warranting protection from the public record consistent with O.A.C. Rule 4906-2-21(A)(7). The

manufacturer developed its unique Manual, which contains information regarding this new technology, and provided it to the Applicant on a confidential basis.

## **VI. CONCLUSION**

For the foregoing reasons, the Applicant requests that the Board or the ALJ grant its motion for a protective order to maintain the information contained the Manual requested in the OPSB Staff's Third Data Request as confidential and not subject to public disclosure.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Christine M.T. Pirik

Christine M.T. Pirik (0029759)

Terrence O'Donnell (0074213)

William Vorys (0093479)

Dickinson Wright PLLC

150 East Gay Street, Suite 2400

Columbus, Ohio 43215

(614) 591-5461

[cpirik@dickinsonwright.com](mailto:cpirik@dickinsonwright.com)

[todonnell@dickinsonwright.com](mailto:todonnell@dickinsonwright.com)

[wvorys@dickinsonwright.com](mailto:wvorys@dickinsonwright.com)

*Attorneys for Firelands Wind, LLC*



### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The Ohio Power Siting Board's e-filing system will electronically serve notice of the filing of this document on the parties referenced in the service list of the docket card who have electronically subscribed to these cases. In addition, the undersigned certifies that a copy of the foregoing document is also being served upon the persons below this 26<sup>th</sup> day of November, 2019.

/s/ Christine M.T. Pirik

Christine M.T. Pirik (0029759)

Counsel/Intervenors:

[werner.margard@ohioattorneygeneral.gov](mailto:werner.margard@ohioattorneygeneral.gov)  
[jstock@beneschlaw.com](mailto:jstock@beneschlaw.com)  
[mgurbach@beneschlaw.com](mailto:mgurbach@beneschlaw.com)  
[norwichtwp1339@gmail.com](mailto:norwichtwp1339@gmail.com)  
[richardwiles@willard-oh.com](mailto:richardwiles@willard-oh.com)  
[rstrickler@huroncountyohprosecutor.com](mailto:rstrickler@huroncountyohprosecutor.com)  
[jstephens@huroncountyohprosecutor.com](mailto:jstephens@huroncountyohprosecutor.com)  
[ggross@eriecounty.oh.gov](mailto:ggross@eriecounty.oh.gov)  
[heather@hnattys.com](mailto:heather@hnattys.com)

Administrative Law Judge:

[jay.agranoff@puco.ohio.gov](mailto:jay.agranoff@puco.ohio.gov)  
[michael.williams@puco.ohio.gov](mailto:michael.williams@puco.ohio.gov)

COLUMBUS 59714-18 127008v1

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**11/26/2019 3:36:47 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 18-1607-EL-BGN**

Summary: Motion for Protective Order regarding Firelands Wind, LLC's Responses to the Third Data Request from the Staff of the Ohio Power Siting Board and Memorandum in Support electronically filed by Christine M.T. Pirik on behalf of Firelands Wind, LLC