



155 East Broad Street  
20<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, Ohio, 43215  
o: 614-222-1330  
f: 614-222-1337

July 29, 2019

Ms. Tanowa Troupe, Secretary  
Ohio Power Siting Board  
Docketing Division  
180 East Broad Street, 11<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

Re: OPSB Case No. 19-1384-EL-BNR / Duke Energy Ohio Construction Notice for the Duke Energy Ohio St. Annes Avenue Tower Replacement Project

Dear Ms. Troupe:

Please see the attached letter from the Ohio Department of Natural Resources with comments from the Natural Heritage Database, Division of Wildlife, Division of Natural Areas and Preserves, and Division of Water Resources regarding the above-referenced project.

Should you have any questions please feel free to contact me.

Sincerely,

/s/ Emily A. Olive, CP

Emily A. Olive  
Certified Paralegal

Cc: Tamara Turkenton



# Ohio Department of Natural Resources

MIKE DeWINE, GOVERNOR

MARY MERTZ, DIRECTOR

## Office of Real Estate

Paul R. Baldrige, Chief  
2045 Morse Road – Bldg. E-2  
Columbus, OH 43229  
Phone: (614) 265-6649  
Fax: (614) 267-4764

July 29, 2019

Cori Jansing  
Cardno  
11121 Canal Road  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45241

**Re:** 19-532; C10-X2-129 Emergent Tower Replacement

**Project:** The proposed project involves the removal and replacement of Structure C10-X2-129 with an engineered monopole due to structural damage incurred by a recent fallen tree and install an approximately 0.5-mile temporary access road.

**Location:** The proposed project is located in Miami Township, Hamilton County, Ohio.

The Ohio Department of Natural Resources (ODNR) has completed a review of the above referenced project. These comments were generated by an inter-disciplinary review within the Department. These comments have been prepared under the authority of the Fish and Wildlife Coordination Act (48 Stat. 401, as amended; 16 U.S.C. 661 et seq.), the National Environmental Policy Act, the Coastal Zone Management Act, Ohio Revised Code and other applicable laws and regulations. These comments are also based on ODNR's experience as the state natural resource management agency and do not supersede or replace the regulatory authority of any local, state or federal agency nor relieve the applicant of the obligation to comply with any local, state or federal laws or regulations.

**Natural Heritage Database:** The Natural Heritage Database has the following records at or within a one-mile radius of the project area:

Running buffalo clover (*Trifolium stoloniferum*), E, FE  
River darter (*Percina shumardi*), T  
Warder-Perkins State Nature Preserve – Audubon Society of Ohio  
Mitchell Memorial Forest – Hamilton Co. Park District

The review was performed on the project area you specified in your request as well as an additional one-mile radius. Records searched date from 1980. This information is provided to inform you of features present within your project area and vicinity.

Please note that Ohio has not been completely surveyed and we rely on receiving information from many sources. Therefore, a lack of records for any particular area is not a statement that rare species or unique features are absent from that area. Although all types of plant communities have been surveyed, we only maintain records on the highest quality areas. Statuses are defined as: E = state endangered; T = state threatened; P = state potentially threatened; SC = state species of concern; SI = state special interest; A = species recently added to state inventory, status not yet

determined; X = presumed extirpated in Ohio; FE = federal endangered, FT = federal threatened, FSC = federal species of concern, FC = federal candidate species.

**Fish and Wildlife:** The Division of Wildlife (DOW) has the following comments.

The DOW recommends that impacts to streams, wetlands and other water resources be avoided and minimized to the fullest extent possible, and that best management practices be utilized to minimize erosion and sedimentation.

**The project is within the vicinity of records for the Indiana bat (*Myotis sodalis*), a state endangered and federally endangered species. Presence of the Indiana bat has been established in the area, and therefore additional summer surveys would not constitute presence/absence in the area.** The following species of trees have relatively high value as potential Indiana bat roost trees to include: shagbark hickory (*Carya ovata*), shellbark hickory (*Carya laciniosa*), bitternut hickory (*Carya cordiformis*), black ash (*Fraxinus nigra*), green ash (*Fraxinus pennsylvanica*), white ash (*Fraxinus americana*), shingle oak (*Quercus imbricaria*), northern red oak (*Quercus rubra*), slippery elm (*Ulmus rubra*), American elm (*Ulmus americana*), eastern cottonwood (*Populus deltoides*), silver maple (*Acer saccharinum*), sassafras (*Sassafras albidum*), post oak (*Quercus stellata*), and white oak (*Quercus alba*). Indiana bat roost trees consists of trees that include dead and dying trees with exfoliating bark, crevices, or cavities in upland areas or riparian corridors and living trees with exfoliating bark, cavities, or hollow areas formed from broken branches or tops. However, Indiana bats are also dependent on the forest structure surrounding roost trees. If suitable habitat occurs within the project area, the DOW recommends trees be conserved. If suitable habitat occurs within the project area and trees must be cut, the DOW recommends cutting occur between October 1 and March 31. If no tree removal is proposed, this project is not likely to impact this species.

The project is within the range of the sheepnose (*Plethobasus cyphus*), a state endangered and federally endangered mussel, the fanshell (*Cyprogenia stegaria*), a state endangered and federally endangered mussel, the pink mucket (*Lampsilis orbiculata*), a state endangered and federally endangered mussel, the rayed bean (*Villosa fabalis*), a state endangered and federally endangered mussel, the snuffbox (*Epioblasma triquetra*), a state endangered and federally endangered mussel, the ebonyshell (*Fusconaia ebena*), a state endangered mussel, the long-solid (*Fusconaia maculata maculata*), a state endangered mussel, the butterfly (*Ellipsaria lineolata*), a state endangered mussel, the washboard (*Megaloniais nervosa*), a state endangered mussel, the elephant-ear (*Elliptio crassidens crassidens*), a state endangered mussel, the Ohio pigtoe (*Pleurobema cordatum*), a state endangered mussel, the monkeyface (*Quadrula metanevra*), a state endangered mussel, the wartyback (*Quadrula nodulata*), a state endangered mussel, the black sandshell (*Ligumia recta*), a state threatened mussel, the fawnsfoot (*Truncilla donaciformis*), a state threatened mussel, and the threehorn wartyback (*Obliquaria reflexa*), a state threatened mussel. Due to the location, and that there is no in-water work proposed in a perennial stream of sufficient size, this project is not likely to impact these species.

The project is within the range of the shortnose gar (*Lepisosteus platostomus*), a state endangered fish, the shoal chub (*Macrhybopsis hyostoma*), a state endangered fish, the shovelnose sturgeon (*Scaphirhynchus platyrhynchus*), a state endangered fish, the lake sturgeon (*Acipenser fulvescens*), a state endangered fish, the northern madtom (*Noturus stigmosus*), a state endangered fish, the bigeye shiner (*Notropis boops*) a state threatened fish, the mountain madtom (*Noturus eleutherus*), a state threatened fish, the river darter (*Percina shumardi*) a state threatened fish, the channel darter (*Percina copelandi*), a state threatened fish, the blue sucker (*Cycleptus elongatus*), a state threatened fish, and the paddlefish (*Polyodon spathula*) a state threatened fish. The DOW recommends no in-water work in perennial streams from April 15 through June 30 to reduce

impacts to indigenous aquatic species and their habitat. If no in-water work is proposed, this project is not likely to impact this species.

The project is within the range of the Kirtland's snake (*Clonophis kirtlandii*), a state threatened species. This secretive species prefers wet meadows and other wetlands. Due to the location, the type of habitat present at the project site and within the vicinity of the project area, and the type of work proposed, this project is not likely to impact this species.

The project is within the range of the cave salamander (*Eurycea lucifuga*), a state endangered species. Due to the location, the type of habitat present at the project site and within the vicinity of the project area, and the type of work proposed, this project is not likely to impact this species.

The project is within the range of the American bittern (*Botaurus lentiginosus*), a state endangered bird. Nesting bitterns prefer large undisturbed wetlands that have scattered small pools amongst dense vegetation. They occasionally occupy bogs, large wet meadows, and dense shrubby swamps. If this type of habitat will be impacted, construction should be avoided in this habitat during the species' nesting period of May 1 to July 31. If this type of habitat will not be impacted, this project is not likely to impact this species.

The project is within the range of the lark sparrow (*Chondestes grammacus*), a state endangered bird. This sparrow nests in grassland habitats with scattered shrub layers, disturbed open areas, as well as patches of bare soil. In the Oak Openings area west of Toledo, lark sparrows occupy open grass and shrubby fields along sandy beach ridges. These summer residents normally migrate out of Ohio shortly after their young fledge or leave the nest. If this type of habitat will be impacted, construction should be avoided in this habitat during the species' nesting period of May 1 to June 30. If this habitat will not be impacted, this project is not likely to impact this species.

Due to the potential of impacts to federally listed species, as well as to state listed species, we recommend that this project be coordinated with the U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service.

**Natural Areas:** The Division of Natural Areas and Preserves has the following comment.

The proposed emergent tower replacement in Hamilton County extends through a state dedicated nature preserve, the Wardner-Perkins State Nature Preserve, run by the Audubon Society of Cincinnati. Please contact the Audubon Society for further coordination and communication regarding the project at 513-741-7926

**Water Resources:** The Division of Water Resources has the following comment.

The local floodplain administrator should be contacted concerning the possible need for any floodplain permits or approvals for this project. Your local floodplain administrator contact information can be found at the website below.

[http://water.ohiodnr.gov/portals/soilwater/pdf/floodplain/Floodplain%20Manager%20Community%20Contact%20List\\_8\\_16.pdf](http://water.ohiodnr.gov/portals/soilwater/pdf/floodplain/Floodplain%20Manager%20Community%20Contact%20List_8_16.pdf)

ODNR appreciates the opportunity to provide these comments. Please contact Sarah Tebbe, Environmental Specialist, at (614) 265-6397 or [Sarah.Tebbe@dnr.state.oh.us](mailto:Sarah.Tebbe@dnr.state.oh.us) if you have questions about these comments or need additional information.

John Kessler  
Environmental Services Administrator

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**7/29/2019 3:45:49 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 19-1384-EL-BNR**

Summary: Correspondence of Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. Submitting ODNR Letter electronically filed by Carys Cochern on behalf of Duke Energy