

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Annual Application    )  
of Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc. for an Ad-    )       Case No. 18-1701-GA-RDR  
justment to Rider IRP and Rider DSM    )  
Rates.    )

---

**STIPULATION AND RECOMMENDATION**

---

Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-30 provides that any two or more parties to a proceeding may enter into a written stipulation covering some or all of the issues presented in the proceeding. The purpose of this document is to set forth the understanding and agreement of Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc. ("Columbia"); the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("Staff");<sup>1</sup> and Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy ("OPAЕ") (collectively, the "Signatory Parties" or "Parties"),<sup>2</sup> and to recommend that the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("Commission") approve and adopt this Joint Stipulation and Recommendation ("Stipulation"), resolving the issues in this proceeding.

The Signatory Parties agree that this Stipulation is supported by adequate data and information; represents a just and reasonable resolution of the legal and policy issues raised in this proceeding; violates no regulatory principle or precedent; as a package, benefits customers and the public interest; and is the product of serious bargaining among knowledgeable and capable parties to resolve the issues. While this Stipulation is not binding on the Commission, the Parties submit that it is entitled to careful consideration by the Commission.

The Signatory Parties urge the Commission to accept and approve the following terms:

1. The Signatory Parties recommend the Commission approve the Rider IRP and Rider DSM Rates as supported by the Application filed in this docket on February 28, 2019, as attached hereto as Attachment A. The Signatory

---

<sup>1</sup> Pursuant to Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-10(C) and 4901-1-30, Staff is deemed a party for purposes of entering into this Stipulation.

<sup>2</sup> The Environmental Law & Policy Center has raised issues that are not addressed by this Stipulation.

Parties further agree, in accordance with the Comments filed by Staff on March 22, 2019, that Staff reserves the right to review the October, November, and December 2018 expenses for both Riders IRP and DSM during the review of the calendar year 2019 expenses. The Signatory Parties further agree that, as noted in the Attorney Examiner's March 8, 2019 Entry, Columbia filed an application in this proceeding to adjust Rider IRP and Rider DSM to recover costs for 2018. As such, the Signatory Parties agree this case should be limited to a review of the calendar year 2018 IRP and DSM investments.

2. The Parties agree that Columbia's pre-filed testimony and supplemental testimony of witnesses, Notice of Intent, Application, and all supplemental testimony, any testimony filed by any party in support of the Stipulation, and Staff's comments should be admitted into evidence on the condition that the Commission approves this Joint Stipulation and Recommendation. Based on the same condition, the Signatory Parties agree to waive cross-examination of witnesses of other Signatory Parties. With respect to the issues resolved by the Joint Stipulation and Recommendation, the Signatory Parties agree that Columbia has met its burden of proof in these proceedings.

3. This Stipulation is expressly conditioned upon the Commission's adoption and approval of the Stipulation in its entirety, without material modification. Each party has the right, in its sole discretion, to determine whether the Commission's approval of this Settlement contains a "material modification."

4. Should the Commission reject or materially modify all or any part of this Stipulation, the Signatory Parties shall have the right, within 30 days of issuance of the Commission's order, to file an application for rehearing or to terminate and withdraw from the Stipulation by filing a notice with the Commission in this proceeding and serving all the Parties. The Signatory Parties agree that they will not oppose or argue against any application for rehearing that seeks to uphold the original, unmodified Stipulation.

5. Upon the Commission's issuance of any entry on rehearing that does not adopt the Stipulation without material modification, any Signatory Party may terminate and withdraw from the Stipulation by filing a notice with the Commission within 30 days of the Commission's entry on rehearing.

6. Upon notice of termination or withdrawal by any party, pursuant to the above provisions, the Stipulation shall immediately become null and void.

7. If the Stipulation becomes null and void and the Commission determines that a hearing is necessary, the Signatory Parties urge the Commission to give all Parties an opportunity to present direct and rebuttal testimony, cross-examine witnesses, and brief issues. The Signatory Parties further urge the Commission to decide Columbia's Application based upon the record and briefs as if this Stipulation had never been executed.

8. This Stipulation is entered into as an overall compromise and resolution of all of the issues presented in this proceeding. This Stipulation does not necessarily represent the position any Signatory Party would have taken absent the execution of this Stipulation. This Stipulation shall not be cited as precedent in any future proceeding for or against any Signatory Party, if the Commission approves the Stipulation without material modification.

9. Except as otherwise specified in this Stipulation, the Signatory Parties urge the Commission not to construe or apply any specific element or item contained in or supporting the Stipulation as the results that any Signatory Party might support or seek had the Signatory Parties not reached this Stipulation.

**WHEREFORE**, the undersigned respectfully request that the Commission issue its Opinion and Order approving and adopting this Joint Stipulation and Recommendation in accordance with the terms set forth above.

**AGREED TO THIS 2nd DAY OF APRIL, 2019.**

**COLUMBIA GAS OF OHIO, INC.**

By: /s/ Joseph M. Clark  
Joseph M. Clark

Stephen B. Seiple, Asst. General Counsel  
(0003809)  
Joseph M. Clark, Sr. Counsel (0080711)  
P.O. Box 117  
290 W. Nationwide Blvd.  
Columbus, Ohio 43216-0117  
Telephone: 614-460-6988  
E-mail: sseiple@nisource.com  
josephclark@nisource.com

**THE STAFF OF THE PUBLIC UTILITIES  
COMMISSION OF OHIO**

By: /s/ Thomas G. Lindgren (per email authority)  
Thomas Lindgren

Thomas G. Lindgren (0039210)  
Robert A. Eubanks (0073386)  
Assistant Attorney Generals  
30 East Broad Street, 16<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Telephone: 614-466-2766  
Email: Thomas.Lindgren@ohioattorneygeneral.gov  
Robert.eubanks@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

**OHIO PARTNERS FOR AFFORDABLE  
ENERGY**

By: /s/ Colleen L. Mooney (per email authority)  
Colleen L. Mooney

Colleen L. Mooney (0015668)  
P.O. Box 12451  
Columbus, Ohio 43212-2451  
Telephone: 614-488-5739  
E-mail: cmooney@ohiopartners.org

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio's e-filing system will electronically serve notice of the filing of this document on the parties referenced on the service list of the docket card who have electronically subscribed to the case. In addition, the undersigned hereby certifies that a copy of the foregoing document is also being served via electronic mail on the 2nd day of April, 2019, upon the parties listed below:

**Ohio Attorney General's Office**      thomas.lindgren@ohioattorneygeneral.gov  
robert.eubanks@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

**The Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel**      Christopher.Healey@occ.ohio.gov

**Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy**      cmooney@ohiopartners.org

**Environmental Law and Policy Center**      RKelter@elpc.org  
MFleisher@elpc.org

/s/ Joseph M. Clark

Joseph M. Clark

Attorney for  
**COLUMBIA GAS OF OHIO, INC.**

## **STIPULATION ATTACHMENT A**

**RULES AND REGULATIONS GOVERNING THE DISTRIBUTION  
AND SALE OF GAS**

---

**RIDER IRP –**  
**INFRASTRUCTURE REPLACEMENT PROGRAM RIDER**

**APPLICABILITY**

Applicable to all customer accounts served under rate schedules SGS, GS and LGS.

**DESCRIPTION**

An additional charge per account per month, regardless of gas consumed, to recover costs associated with:

- a) **Riser and Hazardous Customer Service Line Replacement Program** - The replacement of customer-owned Natural Gas Risers identified in the November 24, 2006 Report by the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio in Case No. 05-463-GA-COI as prone to failure and the maintenance, repair and replacement of hazardous customer-owned service lines.
- b) **Accelerated Mains Replacement Program** – The replacement of bare steel and cast iron or wrought iron main lines, and associated company and customer-owned metallic service lines.
- c) **Automated Meter Read** - The installation of automated meter reading devices on meters located inside customer's premises.

This Rider shall be calculated annually pursuant to a Notice filed no later than November 30 of each year based on nine months of actual data and three months of estimated data for the calendar year. The filing shall be updated by no later than February 28 of the following year to reflect the use of actual calendar year data. Such adjustments to the Rider will become effective with bills rendered on and after the first billing unit of May of each year.

**RATE**

|                                 |                 |
|---------------------------------|-----------------|
| Rate SGS, Small General Service | \$9.38/Month    |
| Rate GS, General Service        | \$80.67/Month   |
| Rate LGS, Large General Service | \$2441.62/Month |

**RECONCILIATION ADJUSTMENTS**

This rider is subject to reconciliation or adjustment, including but not limited to, increases or refunds. Such reconciliation or adjustment shall be limited to: (1) the twelve-month period of expenditures upon which the rates were calculated, if determined to be unlawful, unreasonable, or imprudent by the Commission in the docket those rates were approved or the Supreme Court of Ohio; (2) the Commission's orders in Case No. 18-47-AU-COI or any case ordered by the Commission to address tax reform changes in Case No. 18-47-AU-COI.

Filed in accordance with Public Utilities Commission of Ohio Opinion and Order issued

Issued:

Effective: With meter readings on or after

Issued By  
Daniel A. Creekmur, President

**RULES AND REGULATIONS GOVERNING THE DISTRIBUTION  
AND SALE OF GAS**

---

**DEMAND SIDE MANAGEMENT RIDER**

**APPLICABILITY**

Applicable to all volumes delivered under the Company's SGS rate schedule.

**DESCRIPTION**

An additional charge, for all gas consumed, to recover costs associated with the implementation of comprehensive, cost-effective energy efficiency programs made available to residential and commercial customers.

**RATE**

All gas consumed per account per month                      \$0.1957/Mcf

**RECONCILIATION ADJUSTMENTS**

This Rider is subject to reconciliation or adjustment, including but not limited to, increases or refunds. Such reconciliation or adjustment shall be limited to the twelve-month period of expenditures upon which the rates were calculated, if determined to be unlawful, unreasonable, or imprudent by the Commission in the docket those rates were approved or the Supreme Court of Ohio.

Filed in accordance with Public Utilities Commission of Ohio Opinion and Order issued on

Issued:

Effective: With meter readings on or after

Issued By  
Daniel A. Creekmur, President



**RULES AND REGULATIONS GOVERNING THE DISTRIBUTION  
AND SALE OF GAS**

---

**RIDER IRP –**  
**INFRASTRUCTURE REPLACEMENT PROGRAM RIDER**

**APPLICABILITY**

Applicable to all customer accounts served under rate schedules SGTS, GTS and LGTS.

**DESCRIPTION**

An additional charge per account per month, regardless of gas consumed, to recover costs associated with:

- a) **Riser and Hazardous Customer Service Line Replacement Program** - The replacement of customer-owned Natural Gas Risers identified in the November 24, 2006 Report by the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio in Case No. 05-463-GA-COI as prone to failure and the maintenance, repair and replacement of hazardous customer-owned service lines.
- b) **Accelerated Mains Replacement Program** – The replacement of bare steel and cast iron or wrought iron main lines, and associated company and customer-owned metallic service lines.
- c) **Automated Meter Reading Devices Program** – The installation of automated meter reading devices on meters located inside customer's premises.

This Rider shall be calculated annually pursuant to a Notice filed no later than November 30 of each year based on nine months of actual data and three months of estimated data for the calendar year. The filing shall be updated by no later than February 28 of the following year to reflect the use of actual calendar year data. Such adjustments to the Rider will become effective with bills rendered on and after the first billing unit of May of each year.

**RATE**

|   |                 |
|---|-----------------|
| Rate SGTS, Small General Transportation Service | \$9.38/Month    |
| Rate GTS, General Transportation Service        | \$80.67/Month   |
| Rate LGTS, Large General Transportation Service | \$2441.62/Month |

**RECONCILIATION ADJUSTMENTS**

This rider is subject to reconciliation or adjustment, including but not limited to, increases or refunds. Such reconciliation or adjustment shall be limited to: (1) the twelve-month period of expenditures upon which the rates were calculated, if determined to be unlawful, unreasonable, or imprudent by the Commission in the docket those rates were approved or the Supreme Court of Ohio; (2) the Commission's orders in Case No. 18-47-AU-COI or any case ordered by the Commission to address tax reform changes in Case No. 18-47-AU-COI.

Filed in accordance with Public Utilities Commission of Ohio Opinion and Order issued

Issued:

Effective: With meter readings on or after

Issued By  
Daniel A. Creekmur, President

COLUMBIA GAS OF OHIO, INC.

Tenth Revised Sheet No. 73

**RULES AND REGULATIONS GOVERNING THE DISTRIBUTION  
AND SALE OF GAS**

---

**DEMAND SIDE MANAGEMENT RIDER****APPLICABILITY**

Applicable to all volumes delivered under the Company's SGTS rate schedule.

**DESCRIPTION**

An additional charge, for all gas consumed, to recover costs associated with the implementation of comprehensive, cost-effective energy efficiency programs made available to residential and commercial customers.

**RATE**

All gas consumed per account per month                      \$0.1957/Mcf

**RECONCILIATION ADJUSTMENTS**

This Rider is subject to reconciliation or adjustment, including but not limited to, increases or refunds. Such reconciliation or adjustment shall be limited to the twelve-month period of expenditures upon which the rates were calculated, if determined to be unlawful, unreasonable, or imprudent by the Commission in the docket those rates were approved or the Supreme Court of Ohio.

Filed in accordance with Public Utilities Commission of Ohio Opinion and Order issued on

Issued:

Effective: With meter readings on or after

Issued By  
Daniel A. Creekmur, President

SECTION VII  
 PART 29 - BILLING ADJUSTMENTS

RIDER IRP –  
 INFRASTRUCTURE REPLACEMENT PROGRAM RIDER

29.3 **APPLICABILITY**

Applicable to all customer accounts served under rate schedules FRSGTS, FRGTS and FRLGTS.

29.4 **DESCRIPTION**

An additional charge per account per month, regardless of gas consumed, to recover costs associated with:

- a) **Riser and Hazardous Customer Service Line Replacement Program** - The replacement of customer-owned Natural Gas Risers identified in the November 24, 2006 Report by the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio in Case No. 05-463-GA-COI as prone to failure and the maintenance, repair and replacement of hazardous customer-owned service lines.
- b) **Accelerated Mains Replacement Program** – The replacement of bare steel and cast iron or wrought iron main lines, and associated company and customer-owned metallic service lines.
- c) **Automated Meter Reading Devices Program** – The installation of automated meter reading devices on meters located inside customer's premises.

This Rider shall be calculated annually pursuant to a Notice filed no later than November 30 of each year based on nine months of actual data and three months of estimated data for the calendar year. The filing shall be updated by no later than February 28 of the following year to reflect the use of actual calendar year data. Such adjustments to the Rider will become effective with bills rendered on and after the first billing unit of May of each year.

29.5 **RATE**

|   |                 |
|---|-----------------|
| Rate FRSGTS, Full Requirements Small General Transportation Service | \$9.38/Month    |
| Rate FRGTS Full Requirements General Transportation Service         | \$80.67/Month   |
| Rate FRLGTS, Full Requirements Large General Transportation Service | \$2441.62/Month |

**RECONCILIATION ADJUSTMENTS**

This rider is subject to reconciliation or adjustment, including but not limited to, increases or refunds. Such reconciliation or adjustment shall be limited to: (1) the twelve-month period of expenditures upon which the rates were calculated, if determined to be unlawful, unreasonable, or imprudent by the Commission in the docket those rates were approved or the Supreme Court of Ohio; (2) the Commission's orders in Case No. 18-47-AU-COI or any case ordered by the Commission to address tax reform changes in Case No. 18-47-AU-COI.

Filed in accordance with Public Utilities Commission of Ohio Opinion and Order issued

Issued:

Effective: With meter readings on or after

Issued By  
 Daniel A. Creekmur, President

SECTION VII  
PART 29 - BILLING ADJUSTMENTS

## DEMAND SIDE MANAGEMENT RIDER

**29.6 APPLICABILITY**

Applicable to all volumes delivered under the Company's Full Requirements Small General Transportation Service schedule.

**29.7 DESCRIPTION**

An additional charge, for all gas consumed, to recover costs associated with the implementation of comprehensive, cost-effective energy efficiency programs made available to residential and commercial customers.

**29.8 RATE**

All gas consumed per account per month                      0.1957/Mcf

**RECONCILIATION ADJUSTMENTS**

This Rider is subject to reconciliation or adjustment, including but not limited to, increases or refunds. Such reconciliation or adjustment shall be limited to the twelve-month period of expenditures upon which the rates were calculated, if determined to be unlawful, unreasonable, or imprudent by the Commission in the docket those rates were approved or the Supreme Court of Ohio.

Filed in accordance with Public Utilities Commission of Ohio Opinion and Order issued on

Issued:

Effective: With meter readings on or after

Issued By  
Daniel A. Creekmur, President

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**4/2/2019 8:34:32 AM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 18-1701-GA-RDR**

Summary: Stipulation and Recommendation electronically filed by Cheryl A MacDonald on behalf of Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc.