

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

- - -

In the Matter of the :  
Application of Vectren :  
Energy Delivery of Ohio, : Case No. 18-298-GA-AIR  
Inc. for Approval of an :  
Increase in Gas Rates. :

In the Matter of the :  
Application of Vectren :  
Energy Delivery of Ohio, : Case No. 18-299-GA-ALT  
Inc. for Approval of an :  
Alternative Rate Plan. :

In the Matter of the :  
Application of Vectren :  
Energy Delivery of Ohio, : Case No. 18-49-GA-ALT  
Inc. for Approval of an :  
Alternative Rate Plan. :

- - -

PROCEEDINGS

before Patricia Schabo, Attorney Examiner, and  
Commissioner M. Beth Trombold, at the Dayton  
Municipal Building, Council Chambers, 101 West Ludlow  
Street, Third & Ludlow, Second Floor, Dayton, Ohio,  
called at 6:02 p.m. on Thursday, November 15, 2018.

- - -

ARMSTRONG & OKEY, INC.  
222 East Town Street, 2nd Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-5201  
(614) 224-9481 - (800) 223-9481

- - -

APPEARANCES:

Whitt Sturtevant, LLP  
By Mr. Andrew J. Campbell  
88 East Broad Street, Suite 1590  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

On behalf of Vectren Energy Delivery of  
Ohio, Inc.

Bruce J. Weston, Consumers' Counsel  
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel  
By Mr. Bryce McKenney  
Assistant Consumers' Counsel  
65 East State Street, 7th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

On behalf of the Residential Consumers of  
Vectren Energy Delivery of Ohio, Inc.

- - -

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

INDEX		
- - -		
WITNESSES		PAGE
Melissa English		9
Therese Schoch		11
Bill Marvin		13
Phil Parker		15
Cherish Cronmiller		18
Carl Moser		23
Hugh McGuire		27
Jill Johnson		28
Sue Pfeiffer		29

- - -

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Thursday Evening Session,  
November 15, 2018.

- - -

EXAMINER SCHABO: Good evening and welcome. The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio has assigned for public hearing, at this time and place, Case Nos. 18-298-GA-AIR, 18-299-GA-ALT, and 18-49-GA-ALT, being In the Matter of the Application of Vectren Energy Delivery of Ohio, Inc. for Approval of an Increase in Gas Rates, which has been combined with two applications for approval of an alternative rate plan.

My name is Trish Schabo. I'm one of the Attorney Examiners assigned by the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio to preside over this hearing. With me, this evening, is Commissioner Beth Trombold.

Commissioner, would you like to make any statements?

COMMISSIONER TROMBOLD: Sure.

Welcome, everyone. Thanks for coming out on a snowy day. I'm really glad to see a lot of people interested in this.

My role as Commissioner, I'm one of the five Commissioners that will be reviewing and making the final decision on this case, and this is our

1 chance to listen to the public and really hear what  
2 you have to say about the case before us. And I am  
3 going to be here in listening mode, and I certainly  
4 will be taking into account what you say, in addition  
5 to everything else that's going to be put on the  
6 record throughout the entire proceeding.

7 So Trish is the one that leads us through  
8 the process and compiles all the information, but the  
9 Commissioners review all of that and we're the ones  
10 that make the final decision when it comes time for  
11 that. So thanks for coming today. I look forward to  
12 hearing from you.

13 EXAMINER SCHABO: Thank you.

14 Along with myself and the Commissioner,  
15 there are several members of the Commission Staff  
16 here tonight. Sarah Huffman is here with  
17 Commissioner Trombold; Matt Schilling is here with  
18 the Commission's Public Affairs Department; and Lee  
19 Gary is here with the Service Monitoring and  
20 Enforcement Department. PUCO Staff members are  
21 available if you have a question about general  
22 utility matters.

23 Let's see here. Let's go ahead and start  
24 with appearances on behalf of the parties.

25 MR. CAMPBELL: Sure. Thank you, Your

1 Honor. My name is Andrew Campbell. I'm an attorney  
2 for Vectren. I'm with the law office of Whitt  
3 Sturtevant, LLP; 88 East Broad Street, Columbus, Ohio  
4 43215.

5 EXAMINER SCHABO: Thank you.

6 MR. McKENNEY: Your Honor, on behalf of  
7 the Ohio Consumers' Counsel, Bryce McKenney,  
8 Assistant Consumers' Counsel; 65 East State Street,  
9 7th Floor, Columbus, Ohio 43215.

10 EXAMINER SCHABO: Thank you.

11 There have been several other parties  
12 that have made appearances in the case, but I don't  
13 see any counsel that I recognize if you're back  
14 there. No. Okay.

15 The subject of tonight's public hearing  
16 is Vectren Energy Delivery of Ohio's -- I will also  
17 say "Vectren" sometimes -- application to increase  
18 its natural gas distribution rates.

19 Vectren filed its application to increase  
20 its rates on March 30th, 2018. The Company is  
21 requesting to increase its distribution rates by  
22 \$30 million.

23 Staff of the Commission filed its Report  
24 and Recommendation on October 1, 2018. In its  
25 Report, Staff has recommended limiting the increase

1 to a range of between 12 and 16 million dollars. At  
2 this point, I think it's important to note that  
3 Staff's Report is a recommendation only and, as  
4 Commissioner Trombold indicated, the final decision  
5 does lie with the Commission.

6 The local public hearings scheduled in  
7 this case are only one aspect of the process. In  
8 addition to this evening, there will be one in  
9 Washington Court House on November the 26th, and one  
10 in Sidney, Ohio on November the 28th. An evidentiary  
11 hearing is scheduled to occur at the Commission's  
12 offices in Columbus on December the 4th.

13 Our purpose tonight is to receive  
14 comments from the public regarding Vectren's  
15 applications. This evening is not a Question and  
16 Answer Session. All the representatives from the  
17 Company, from Ohio's Consumers' Counsel, and Staff  
18 may be able to speak to any concerns after the  
19 hearing ends.

20 To my left is our evening's court  
21 reporter. Any testimony given will be incorporated  
22 into the official record of the case and reviewed and  
23 considered by the Commission in making its final  
24 decision. If you do plan to testify, please speak  
25 clearly so the court reporter can accurately reflect

1 your comments. Also, if you have a prepared written  
2 statement of your testimony, it would be helpful if  
3 you could present a copy to the court reporter, and  
4 it will just help with accuracy, spelling, et cetera.  
5 It's hard to take down everything that is being said.

6 If you do not wish to testify, you may  
7 submit written comments under Case No. 18-298-GA-AIR  
8 on the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio's website  
9 or by mail.

10 When you arrived, you were given the  
11 opportunity to sign up. After I finish, I will begin  
12 calling the witnesses forward that have signed up.  
13 Once we're through this, I will open it up to the  
14 floor if anybody else, at that point in time, would  
15 like to offer their testimony. Before you give any  
16 comments, I will ask you to state your name and your  
17 address and I'll swear you in and, after that, the  
18 parties and I will be permitted to ask you any  
19 clarifying questions about your testimony; although,  
20 that rarely happens. Should you decide that you do  
21 not want to testify when I call your name, you can  
22 just merely pass to the next witness and then you are  
23 free to leave at any time.

24 The Commission appreciates your  
25 participation, and we shall get going. So, Melisa



English.

Raise your right hand.

(Witness sworn.)

EXAMINER SCHABO: Thank you.

Please state your name and address for the record, and then proceed with your testimony.

- - -

MELISSA ENGLISH

presented herself as a public witness, and being first duly sworn, testified as follows:

DIRECT TESTIMONY

MS. ENGLISH: My name is Melissa English. My address is 2330 Victory Parkway, Suite 401, Cincinnati, Ohio 45206.

As I mentioned, my name is Melissa English, and I'm the Executive Director of Ohio Citizen Action Education Fund, a public education and research advocate on environmental and consumer issues.

Vectren's proposed rates increase -- fixed rate increase ill-serves the citizens of West Central Ohio and unduly burdens them beyond what customers of other natural gas suppliers pay.

Vectren competitors, Dominion and Columbia Gas, charge \$17.58 and \$17.81 per month,

1       respectively. Even Duke Energy, which charges \$33.03  
2       per month, charges less than the \$35 monthly  
3       Vectren's asking. What's more, the way the request  
4       is structured, the rate could rise to \$50 by 2024.

5               Our concerns here are similar to our  
6       objections to other proposed fixed rate hikes before  
7       the Commission. First, that a dramatic increase in  
8       the fixed rate charge disincentives energy  
9       conservation and efficiency; second, that such an  
10      increase erodes customers' control over their energy  
11      bills; and third and most critical, that low-income  
12      families are disproportionately hurt by fixed rate  
13      hikes.

14             I also wonder how many of these Vectren  
15      customers will already be paying more once the Dayton  
16      Power & Light electric fixed rate increase is  
17      implemented.

18             For these reasons, we urge the Commission  
19      to reject Vectren's rate hike request. Thank you.

20             EXAMINER SCHABO: Okay. Thank you.

21             Therese Schoch.

22             MS. SCHOCH: Very good.

23             EXAMINER SCHABO: Raise your right hand.

24             MS. SCHOCH: Sorry.

25             EXAMINER SCHABO: That's okay.

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

(Witness sworn.)

- - -

THERESE SCHOCH

presented herself as a public witness, and being  
first duly sworn, testified as follows:

DIRECT TESTIMONY

MS. SCHOCH: My name is Therese Schoch,  
T-h-e-r-e-s-e, and the last name is spelled  
S-c-h-o-c-h.

I'm representing the people who can't be  
here tonight because they're probably on a bus, after  
having picked up their children, on the way home from  
work, and they probably also don't even know about  
this. It was kind of obscure finding out about it.

It's a problem because people like me,  
unemployed for the past four years and not quite  
ready for retirement funds and Social Security, are  
really uncertain about what our costs of living are  
going to be. We're literally not certain, at this  
point in the month, where our next meal is coming  
from. We have SNAP cards that probably won't last  
through the month; they just are supplemental to the  
money that we make at our roughly 12-dollar-an-hour  
jobs. That 12-dollar-an-hour job qualifies us for a  
SNAP card, but no other benefits whatsoever. It is

1 still on us to pay our utilities which are already  
2 high, very high. This increase is just too much and  
3 it's just beyond unacceptable.

4 It's a rhetorical question, but what  
5 happened to that promise, in the merger with  
6 CenterPoint, that this merger would not impact the  
7 customers. So here we are, just a month or two out  
8 from finalizing that merger in the first quarter of  
9 2019, and we're asking for a fixed rate hike that is  
10 nearly double what it is. That is also unacceptable.

11 And I'm asking that you deny this rate  
12 increase. It is unrealistic that the poor, in the  
13 State of Ohio, carry the burden of millions of  
14 dollars that the corporate executives of Vectren are  
15 expecting to make in this merger that's coming up  
16 soon, and we really are not going to be very happy  
17 about that. Thank you.

18 EXAMINER SCHABO: Thank you.

19 Bill Marvin.

20 MR. MARVIN: I didn't expect to talk this  
21 soon, but what the heck.

22 EXAMINER SCHABO: Better late than never,  
23 right? Sooner than later?

24 MR. MARVIN: Yes.

25 EXAMINER SCHABO: Raise your right hand.

1 (Witness sworn.)

2 EXAMINER SCHABO: You may begin.

3 - - -

4 BILL MARVIN

5 presented himself as a public witness, and being

6 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

7 DIRECT TESTIMONY

8 MR. MARVIN: Okay. So you need my name?

9 My name is Bill Marvin and my address is 319 Rockwood  
10 Avenue, Dayton, Ohio.

11 I'm a philosopher by profession and an  
12 ethicist. I'm also the President of my neighborhood  
13 association. My neighborhood association is the Five  
14 Oaks neighborhood here in Dayton. We're a diverse  
15 neighborhood economically, age-wise, ethnic-wise,  
16 probably no matter how you cut it, you know,  
17 religious-wise, we're really diverse.

18 And a lot of people I represent from my  
19 neighborhood are on fixed incomes and they're having  
20 a hard time figuring out, you know, whether they can  
21 paint the house or pay their medical bills or, you  
22 know, get food. I mean, there are some, you know,  
23 serious choices to make, and increasing costs like  
24 this presents a serious burden to these people.

25 Ethically, and this is something, you

1 know, I live with, I think about all the time,  
2 ethically it is defying one of the basic principles  
3 of ethics that you call upon the least-advantaged  
4 people to subsidize some of the most-advantaged  
5 people.

6 And here, with the recent heavy tax cut  
7 to major corporations that the people in my  
8 neighborhood didn't experience, they didn't see any  
9 of that. The people down at the bottom here, you  
10 know, didn't get that. None of it trickled on us.  
11 The bills trickle on us, the debts keep trickling on  
12 us, but none of that trickles on us that they're  
13 called upon to subsidize this.

14 And yeah, you know, I was looking over,  
15 you know, some of the information, you know, stock  
16 prices and everything, it seems like Vectren is not  
17 hurting. You know, I don't see any real reason to  
18 ask for, you know, this drastic increase with the  
19 possibility of greater increases later on. In fact,  
20 at a time like this, when they're making good money  
21 like this, when they're looking forward to this  
22 merger, you know, we shouldn't be called upon to, you  
23 know, subsidize the profits to this. It's kind of  
24 irrational and, like I said, unethical.

25 And it seems to me that, you know, if the

1 Company is a well-functioning company, they ought to  
2 be able to provide a service and not call upon  
3 us, you know, to go ahead and give them this subsidy.  
4 I mean, subsidizing the well-off is not -- is not the  
5 way to go.

6 So I'm here to strongly object on behalf  
7 of myself, my friends, my neighbors, and I think  
8 ethics-wise this pay rate is just not right, it's  
9 just not right. Thanks.

10 EXAMINER SCHABO: Thank you.

11 Phil Parker.

12 (Witness sworn.)

13 - - -

14 PHIL PARKER

15 presented himself as a public witness, and being  
16 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

17 DIRECT TESTIMONY

18 MR. PARKER: Good evening, Commissioners  
19 and PUCO representative. My name is Phil Parker.  
20 I'm the President and CEO of the Dayton Area Chamber  
21 of Commerce.

22 Our Chamber of Commerce is a business  
23 association, representing over 2,500 businesses  
24 throughout the Greater Dayton region and employ over  
25 200,000 individuals. We are the 25th-largest Chamber

1 of Commerce in the nation, and we believe it's a true  
2 testimony to the integrity and health of our region's  
3 business community that we are one of those largest  
4 organizations in the country.

5 I'm here today to testify in support of  
6 Vectren's impact on the regional business community.  
7 Vectren's partnership with the business community as  
8 a workforce development and economic development  
9 partner has allowed Ohio and the Dayton region to  
10 realize significant investments and economic growth.

11 Vectren is committed to advancing the  
12 economic health of the region for the betterment of  
13 employers, employees, customers, businesses, and our  
14 citizens. It is with this vision in mind that  
15 Vectren has invested \$700 million in capital  
16 expenditure investments over the past 10 years. A  
17 significant amount of this investment was directly  
18 dedicated to modernization of physical infrastructure  
19 and new infrastructure to support businesses and new  
20 residential growth in Ohio.

21 Vectren's support and strategic  
22 infrastructure investment over the years has  
23 highlighted their commitment to making Ohio and the  
24 Dayton region economically prosperous. The Dayton  
25 area is currently experiencing a strong economic



1 resurgence as new jobs, downtown investments, and  
2 industry growth are thriving in the economy. Vectren  
3 has played a vital role in supporting this economic  
4 stimulus and they truly understand that a strong  
5 business community equals a strong region. Their  
6 commitment to the region continues to make Dayton a  
7 place where people would want to live, work, and  
8 play.

9 And I appreciate you having me, giving me  
10 the opportunity to speak, and if there's any  
11 questions, I'll be more than happy to take those in  
12 clarification. Thank you.

13 EXAMINER SCHABO: Thank you.

14 MR. PARKER: I -- I didn't state my  
15 address. Would you like that on --

16 EXAMINER SCHABO: That's okay.

17 MR. PARKER: -- the record? Okay.

18 EXAMINER SCHABO: Thank you.

19 Cherish Cronmiller.

20 MS. CRONMILLER: Good evening.

21 EXAMINER SCHABO: Good evening.

22 (Witness sworn.)

23 EXAMINER SCHABO: Thank you. You may  
24 begin.

25 - - -

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

CHERISH CRONMILLER

presented herself as a public witness, and being  
first duly sworn, testified as follows:

DIRECT TESTIMONY

MS. CRONMILLER: My name is Cherish  
Cronmiller. Business address is 719 South Main  
Street, Dayton, Ohio 45402.

Good evening. Again, my name is Cherish  
Cronmiller, and I'm the President and CEO of the  
Miami Valley Community Action Partnership. Our  
agency has offices in Montgomery, Greene, Darke and  
Preble counties.

We provide weatherization services in  
more than 10 counties in southwest Ohio. We serve  
upwards of 25,000 customers annually through our  
various programs, including the low-income Home  
Energy Assistance Program, most people know as  
"utility assistance" or "PIPP."

I'm here to discuss the support our  
agency receives from Vectren. Our agency has worked  
in partnership with Vectren to provide weatherization  
services since 2004. Since 2012, our agency has been  
able to weatherize 2,486 homes with assistance from  
Vectren's Project TEEM, which stands for Teaching  
Energy Efficiency Measures, and "Share the Warmth."

1           The financial support we receive from  
2 Vectren allows us to fully service the customer and  
3 ensure all weatherization measures are completed.  
4 Weatherization services help to maintain housing  
5 stock in our communities. When we're able to do work  
6 in multifamily dwellings, it brings down operating  
7 costs, which stabilizes rent and reduces housing  
8 instability, especially in our senior communities.  
9 Work ensures a reduction in utility usage in the home  
10 and an overall healthier home through better air  
11 quality. It is calculated that every weatherization  
12 dollar spent, returns \$2.78 in health and safety  
13 benefits.

14           Yet, the impact of Vectren's financial  
15 support extends beyond our customers. Our agency  
16 employs over 50 full-time people in our  
17 weatherization department in jobs that pay twice as  
18 much as minimum wage, offer benefits and career  
19 advancement opportunities. Additionally, our agency  
20 contracts out our HVAC, electrical and plumbing work,  
21 since that work requires special licensures and  
22 permits. The agency uses sole proprietorships,  
23 minority-owned, and small businesses. Vectren's  
24 programs help to support the businesses in our  
25 community including local suppliers.

Beyond the Weatherization Program, Vectren supports the Miami Valley community through the Dayton Air Show, to Clothes that Work, and various scholarship programs.

And though I can supply facts and figures, I think the words of our customers are far more important than my own. Our agency receives letters every week from thankful people, and I just want to share this one from Sharon -- from Rachel B.:

"Dear Weatherization Program Staff,

"This letter is written to express our heartfelt gratitude for all the irreplaceable assistance that our family has received from the Weatherization Program at Community Action Partnership.

"Our first encounters with you were generous from the start as you answered my many phone questions and placed us on a list for quicker action due to our serious situation of being without a furnace in our newly-purchased home, and two little girls, ages 3 and 6 months. When even the 'quick list' was lengthy, we were offered the opportunity to participate in the particular programs partially funded by Vectren and DP&L that would speed the process up even further.

1                    "We gratefully accepted the special  
2                    consideration as we were bitterly cold in our home,  
3                    all sleeping in one room so that we could be warm at  
4                    night with the space heater we had borrowed from a  
5                    friend.

6                    "The first item to come was a brand new  
7                    furnace in a particularly frigid week of February.  
8                    It was installed quickly and the old defunct furnace  
9                    removed. We were overjoyed to walk comfortably  
10                   through the entire house. My husband and I kept  
11                   exclaiming to each other afterwards, 'It's warm in  
12                   here!' I could set my baby down to crawl on the  
13                   kitchen floor without fear that she would bump into  
14                   the space heater, and on other floors without  
15                   freezing her little hands.

16                   "Next to arrive was our beautiful new  
17                   refrigerator, and not a moment too soon since the one  
18                   that came with the house was so old that no one had  
19                   ever seen one like it and its freezer was beginning  
20                   to fail. I love that I can give my children filtered  
21                   water to drink and shop economically with all the  
22                   freezer space for storage.

23                   "The third gift we received was the  
24                   insulation aspects of the Weatherization Program. We  
25                   were disappointed to learn that it was no longer

1 permitted to insulate walls like ours with  
 2 knob-and-tube electrical wiring, but grateful that  
 3 your team was willing to investigate whatever air  
 4 leaks could be found and seal them. The best part of  
 5 the resulting fixes for me is the two new windows we  
 6 have in our kitchen and downstairs bathroom through  
 7 which the cold wind used to come in so freely, it  
 8 would move the curtains.

9 "Thank you very much for all these gifts  
 10 and their timely arrival! There is no way we can  
 11 begin to repay you, but please know that you have  
 12 made a difference in the life of this little family,  
 13 and given us a warm, energy-efficient home in which  
 14 to raise healthy, loving, and generous children.

15 "Gratefully,

16 "Rachel B."

17 Miami Valley CAP is a proud partner with  
 18 Vectren and we appreciate their commitment to our  
 19 mission and our communities.

20 And I'm happy to take any questions or  
 21 make any clarifications.

22 EXAMINER SCHABO: I think we're good.  
 23 Thank you.

24 FROM THE AUDIENCE: Can I ask her a  
 25 question or does she mean just you guys?

1 EXAMINER SCHABO: I would think that it  
2 would be better if you asked her a question off the  
3 record.

4 MS. CRONMILLER: I'll stick around.

5 EXAMINER SCHABO: Carl Moser.

6 MR. MOSER: Hi. My name is Carl Moser.  
7 I live in Kettering. The address is --

8 EXAMINER SCHABO: Go ahead.

9 MR. MOSER: -- 2536 East Aragon.

10 EXAMINER SCHABO: Raise your right hand.  
11 (Witness sworn.)

12 EXAMINER SCHABO: Thank you. Proceed.

13 MR. MOSER: I'm sorry, I missed the  
14 beginning. Are one of you on the Board?

15 EXAMINER SCHABO: Commissioner Trombold.

16 COMMISSIONER TROMBOLD: I'm a  
17 Commissioner.

18 MR. MOSER: Hello, Commissioner.

19 COMMISSIONER TROMBOLD: Nice to meet you.

20 - - -

21 CARL MOSER  
22 presented himself as a public witness, and being  
23 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

24 DIRECT TESTIMONY

25 MR. MOSER: I'm a senior citizen on a

1 fixed income. I'm concerned about environmental  
2 issues and I do my best to not impact the  
3 environment. I do my best to conserve my resources  
4 so that I can make it in the world of rising prices.

5 And the biggest part on my Vectren bill  
6 is this charge that we're discussing. I don't know  
7 if you take exhibits, but here's my last three  
8 Vectren bills. I used 3 CCFs, 3 CCFs, and 4 CCFs.  
9 So I'm paying, like, less than \$2 for my gas, but  
10 29-1/2, 28-1/2, and 30 dollars for the  
11 infrastructure.

12 I don't mind paying for infrastructure,  
13 it's important for all of us, but I would like to pay  
14 my fair share. If we think about roads and bridges,  
15 a lot of that is paid by gasoline taxes. And the  
16 people that drive more, buy more gas, therefore they  
17 pay more in those taxes that support the  
18 infrastructure. I think the same idea should be  
19 applied to the utilities; gas and electric.

20 So I think things aren't fair right now  
21 and I would urge the Commission to look into making  
22 things fair. I picked up one of the sheets of paper  
23 in the hallway there and it says a household using an  
24 average of 100 CCFs would have an increase of about  
25 7.25 a month or almost 10 percent, but if you only



1 use 60 CCFs, your increase is 13 percent. You've got  
2 it backwards. If you use more, you pay more; not the  
3 other way around.

4 So please, please look at how Vectren  
5 gets the money for their infrastructure. Make the  
6 people that use more, damage the environment more,  
7 pay more for the infrastructure to deliver the gas to  
8 them. So that's my fairness concern.

9 The other thing, that nice letter by  
10 Rachel B. sounded real good, but it was just one  
11 family, and this rate increase is going to affect a  
12 lot of families, a lot of poorer families, a lot of  
13 people on a fixed income like me.

14 And if Vectren can be held accountable  
15 and somebody can oversee their expenses, to see that  
16 they return the money that they get for these  
17 increases to people like Rachel B. and many, many,  
18 many others, then, you know, maybe I could go for it,  
19 but I don't think that's in the plan that we can look  
20 at their expenses for that.

21 So I don't think that the nice programs,  
22 that were talked about, compensate for the millions  
23 of dollars they'll get with this rate increase. It's  
24 nice to hear, but I don't think it balances things  
25 out.

1           And the third -- or, the last thing I  
2     want to talk about is the big tax cut that the  
3     Federal Government passed. Vectren was one of the --  
4     one of the organizations that benefited greatly from  
5     that, and I don't know what they're doing with the  
6     extra money they have, but it seems to me that they  
7     could take that tax cut and apply it to the  
8     infrastructure and not make people on fixed incomes  
9     and poor incomes pay for it.

10           Also, people on fixed incomes and poor  
11    incomes are unable to well-insulate their homes, buy  
12    new replacement windows and lower their gas cost. In  
13    fact, many are in rental properties and landlords  
14    don't do that. So they use a lot more gas and adding  
15    more to their bill is just not right; it's not fair.

16           And I would like to disconnect from the  
17    gas company, but I need the gas, and paying \$30 a  
18    month just so I can get my necessary 4, 5, and 6 CCFs  
19    is unfair to me. Thank you.

20           EXAMINER SCHABO: Thank you.

21           Hugh McGuire.

22           MR. MCGUIRE: Good evening. My name is  
23    Hugh McGuire. I reside at 329 Marathon Avenue. And  
24    I object to this rate increase, number 1 --

25           EXAMINER SCHABO: If I could -- I'm sorry

1 to interrupt your train of thought, but I need to  
2 swear you in before we proceed.

3 MR. McGUIRE: Oh, I'm sorry.

4 EXAMINER SCHABO: It's okay.

5 (Witness sworn.)

6 EXAMINER SCHABO: Wonderful. Thank you.

7 MR. McGUIRE: You're welcome.

8 - - -

9 HUGH McGUIRE

10 presented himself as a public witness, and being  
11 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

12 DIRECT TESTIMONY

13 MR. McGUIRE: I don't have that much  
14 information. I just got an e-mail about this  
15 meeting, yesterday. So the only thing that I know is  
16 that there's -- excuse me -- a company called  
17 Dominion and another one called Columbia. They're  
18 selling their gas, it was about 17 -- well, less than  
19 \$18 a month for both of them. I don't see why  
20 Vectren has to double that amount practically.

21 There's a lot of people on fixed income  
22 and a lot of working people here and, as you know, a  
23 lot of people cannot afford a hit of \$500 to their  
24 situation. And you're talking about adding \$300,  
25 over a span of a year, to their budget? I don't

1 think it's justified.

2 Also, some of the things, the positive  
3 things that were announced about Vectren, I think  
4 that they could do it with the current rate right  
5 now. That's all I have to say.

6 EXAMINER SCHABO: Okay. Thank you.

7 Jill Johnson.

8 EXAMINER SCHABO: Good evening.

9 MS. JOHNSON: Good evening.

10 EXAMINER SCHABO: Would you raise your  
11 right hand.

12 (Witness sworn.)

13 EXAMINER SCHABO: Thank you.

14 - - -

15 JILL JOHNSON

16 presented herself as a public witness, and being  
17 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

18 DIRECT TESTIMONY

19 MS. JOHNSON: My name is Jill Johnson. I  
20 live at 307 Tanglewood Drive, Beavercreek, Ohio  
21 45440.

22 And I, too, heard of this meeting and  
23 about the rate hike of gas, and I would just go on  
24 record saying it's a high rate of increase, and it's  
25 not clear to me of how they're using the increased

1 revenue, for what purpose. And to target or focus  
2 the increased rate on residential and small business,  
3 I think is unfair and I object to it, and I just  
4 wanted to go on record as saying that.

5 EXAMINER SCHABO: Okay. Thank you.

6 That completes the list of those that  
7 signed up to testify. Is there anyone here that did  
8 not sign up, but would like to stand and tell us  
9 their thoughts? No?

10 MS. PFEIFFER: I would.

11 EXAMINER SCHABO: Okay. I saw some elbow  
12 prodding, so I thought --

13 MS. PFEIFFER: I just had to stand up.  
14 My name is Sue Pfeiffer.

15 EXAMINER SCHABO: Okay.

16 (Witness sworn.)

17 - - -

18 SUE PFEIFFER

19 presented herself as a public witness, and being  
20 first duly sworn, testified as follows:

21 DIRECT TESTIMONY

22 MS. PFEIFFER: I live at 209 East Herman  
23 Street, Yellow Springs, Ohio. I drove here tonight  
24 from Yellow Springs, 20 or 25 miles, just to be here  
25 because I thought it was important. I'm on a fixed

1 income. And I, too, would like to know -- it would  
2 be great if corporations gave you a breakdown of what  
3 -- how they use their increases when they put rate  
4 increases out there.

5 I also think the federal tax to  
6 corporations, of reducing their rate, should help --  
7 be trickled down to help pay for this kind of stuff.

8 I guess that's about all. It's a cold  
9 night out there. Thank you.

10 EXAMINER SCHABO: Open floor again.

11 One more time. Anybody?

12 All right. Seeing no one, I would like  
13 -- oh, Mr. Moser.

14 MR. MOSER: May I have a question for the  
15 Board member?

16 EXAMINER SCHABO: It's really not a  
17 Question and Answer Session, so -- would you prefer  
18 to handle that?

19 COMMISSIONER TROMBOLD: I would be happy  
20 to talk to you after, off the record.

21 MR. MOSER: All right.

22 COMMISSIONER TROMBOLD: Okay?

23 EXAMINER SCHABO: Thank you, everybody,  
24 for coming out tonight, especially considering our  
25 first bout of winter weather.

The Commission will consider everything that was said this evening. If you wish to submit further comments, please be sure to take advantage of the ability to submit public comments to the record through the Public Utilities Commission's website. Again, our case number is 18-298-GA-AIR. If you have any questions, our Docketing Department are fantastic and they'll help you through that process.

For this evening, we are adjourned.  
Thank you.

(Thereupon, the proceedings concluded at 6:39 p.m.)

- - -

CERTIFICATE

I do hereby certify that the foregoing is a true and correct transcript of the proceedings taken by me in this matter on Thursday, November 15, 2018, and carefully compared with my original stenographic notes.

Carolyn M. Burke  
Carolyn M. Burke, Registered  
Professional Reporter, and  
Notary Public in and for the  
State of Ohio.

My commission expires July 17, 2023.

- - -





**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**11/30/2018 12:07:25 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 18-0298-GA-AIR, 18-0299-GA-ALT, 18-0049-GA-ALT**

Summary: Transcript In the Matter of the Application of Vectren Energy Delivery of Ohio, Inc. for Approval of an Increase in Gas Rates; In the Matter of the Application of Vectren Energy Delivery of Ohio, Inc. for Approval of an Alternative Rate Plan and In the Matter of the Application of Vectren Energy Delivery of Ohio, Inc. for Approval of an Alternative Rate Plan, hearing held on November 15, 2018. electronically filed by Mr. Ken Spencer on behalf of Armstrong & Okey, Inc. and Burke, Carolyn