

BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Its Electric Security Plan	:	Case No. 16-0395-EL-SSO
	:	
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Revised Tariffs	:	Case No. 16-0396-EL-ATA
	:	
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority Pursuant to Ohio Rev. Code § 4905.13	:	Case No. 16-0397-EL-AAM
	:	

**THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY'S
REPLY IN SUPPORT OF ITS MOTION TO STRIKE
NOTICE OF WITHDRAWAL FROM THE AMENDED STIPULATION**

Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.'s ("IGS") response to The Dayton Power and Light Company's ("DP&L") Motion to Strike the Notice of Withdrawal demonstrates that IGS is taking inconsistent positions. On the one hand, IGS tells the Commission that footnote 6 (p. 13) of the Amended Stipulation and Recommendation ("Stipulation") was included to "insulate[] against the risk that another party cites to an isolated stipulation provision in another case." IGS Opposition, p. 9. On the other hand, IGS asserts that it supported Sections VI.1.a.ii and that the alteration of that provision had a materially adverse effect on IGS. *Id.* at 8-12. The Commission should not allow IGS to use footnote 6 so that IGS can claim that it did not support Section VI.1.a.ii in other cases, but claim that it did support that provision in this case.

As DP&L has shown,¹ IGS's Notice of Withdrawal should be struck for two separate and independent reasons.² First, IGS is not a Signatory Party with respect to Section VI.1.a.ii of the Stipulation, given the express term in the Stipulation that, "RESA and IGS do not support but agree not to oppose Section VI.1.a.i and ii of the Stipulation." Stipulation, p. 13, n. 6 (emphasis added). Meaning must be given to that footnote, which excepts IGS as a Signatory Party for purposes of the Reconciliation Rider. Thus, IGS has no right to withdrawal from the Stipulation based on a modification of that provision. Stipulation, § XI.5 (granting Signatory Parties, but not Non-Opposing Parties, the right to withdraw, subject to certain conditions).

IGS offers various extraneous reasons (pp. 8-9) why it opted out of Section VI.1.a.ii, first explaining why it inserted the footnote. IGS appears to want to have its cake and eat it too – arguing that it is a Signatory Party, while in the same paragraph explaining that IGS wants to be able to argue in other cases that it did not support Section VI.1.a.ii. IGS further argues that it is a Signatory Party by citing to the testimony submitted by Matthew White. However, as IGS stated earlier this week in another DP&L case, "[i]n interpreting a stipulation, the Commission 'must focus on the meanings of the Stipulation's provisions,'"³ and "[w]hen the language of a written contract is clear, a court may look no further than the writing itself to find the intent of the parties."⁴ Accord: In re Ohio Power Co., Case No. 14-1693-EL-RDR, et al., Fifth Entry on Rehearing (Apr. 5, 2017) ("the intentions of any particular signatory party do not

¹ Oct. 26, 2018 The Dayton Power and Light Company's Motion to Strike Notice of Withdrawal from the Amended Stipulation ("Motion to Strike").

² DP&L had argued that IGS' notice was premature in light of OCC's Application for Rehearing. The Commission denied that application, rendering that argument moot.

³ In re DP&L, Case No. 15-1830-EL-AIR, et al., Interstate Gas Supply, Inc. and Retail Energy Supply Association's Memorandum Contra Application for Rehearing of The Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel (Nov. 5, 2018), p. 3 (quoting Monongahela Power Co. v. Pub. Util. Comm., 104 Ohio St.3d 571, 2004-Ohio-6896, 820 N.E.2d 921, ¶ 6).

⁴ Id. (quoting Sunoco, Inc. (R&M) v. Toledo Edison Co., 129 Ohio St.3d 397, 2011-Ohio-2720, 953 N.E.2d 285, ¶ 37 (emphasis added)).

change the settlement agreement set forth by all of the signatory parties in the stipulation, which speaks for itself, and . . . the parties' motives in deciding whether to sign a stipulation do not affect the Commission's determination of whether the stipulation is reasonable") (emphasis added). The fact remains that based on the words in the Stipulation, IGS withheld support from Section VI.1.a.ii of the Stipulation. Because IGS declined to join Section VI.1.a.ii, it cannot withdraw from the Stipulation under Section XI.5 based on the Commission's modification of that provision. Oct. 20, 2017 Opinion and Order, ¶ 63; Sept. 19, 2018 Third Entry on Rehearing, ¶ 46, 51-52, 55, 64, 66.

Second, IGS cannot credibly argue that the Commission's modification of Section VI.1.a.ii is material, i.e., "of such a nature that knowledge of the item would affect a person's decision-making; significant; essential." Black's Law Dictionary 998 (8th ed. 2004).⁵ While IGS maintains (p. 11) that the bypassability of the Reconciliation Rider was "one of the most important provisions in the Amended Stipulation," IGS expressly did not support that provision. As previously mentioned, IGS stated one business day after it filed its Opposition to DP&L's Motion to Strike that "[w]hen the language of a written contract is clear, a court may look no further than the writing itself to find the intent of the parties."⁶ Footnote 6 is very clear, and IGS's reliance on external matters (e.g., its own subsequent filings, the filings of other parties) is irrelevant. Moreover, IGS cannot cite other parties' applications for rehearing to show materiality, particularly parties who (a) actually joined that provision as a Signatory Party, and/or (b) did not seek to withdraw from the Stipulation. Section VI.1.a.ii cannot be material to IGS because it expressly did not support that provision.

⁵ IGS apparently disputes DP&L's reliance on Black's Law Dictionary (p. 11), yet goes on to cite only <https://thelawdictionary.org>.

⁶ Id. (quoting Sunoco, 129 Ohio St.3d 397, 2011-Ohio-2720, 953 N.E.2d 285, ¶ 37).

For each of these separate and independent reasons, the Commission should grant DP&L's Motion to Strike IGS' Notice of Withdrawal.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey

Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892)

(Counsel of Record)

D. Jeffrey Ireland (0010443)

Christopher C. Hollon (0086480)

FARUKI IRELAND COX

RHINEHART & DUSING PLL

110 North Main Street, Suite 1600

Dayton, OH 45402

Telephone: (937) 227-3747

Telecopier: (937) 227-3717

Email: jsharkey@ficlaw.com

djireland@ficlaw.com

chollon@ficlaw.com

Attorneys for The Dayton Power
and Light Company

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that a copy of the foregoing The Dayton Power and Light Company's Reply in Support of Its Motion to Strike Notice of Withdrawal from the Amended Stipulation has been served via electronic mail upon the following counsel of record, this 7th day of November, 2018.

Thomas McNamee
Natalia Messenger
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
30 East Broad Street, 16th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3793
Email:
thomas.mcnamee@ohioattorneygeneral.gov
natalia.messenger@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

Attorneys for PUCO Staff

William J. Michael (Counsel of Record)
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
65 East State Street, 7th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-4203
Email: william.michael@occ.ohio.gov
zachary.woltz@occ.ohio.gov

Attorneys for the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

Kimberly W. Bojko
Brian W. Dressel
Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP
280 North High Street, Suite 1300
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: bojko@carpenterlipps.com
dressel@carpenterlipps.com

Attorneys for The Ohio Manufacturers'
Association Energy Group

Frank P. Darr (Counsel of Record)
Matthew R. Pritchard
McNees Wallace & Nurick
21 East State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: fdarr@mwncmh.com
mpritchard@mwncmh.com

Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users – Ohio

David F. Boehm
Michael L. Kurtz
Kurt J. Boehm
Jody Kyler Cohn
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, OH 45202
Email: dboehm@BKLawfirm.com
mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com
kboehm@BKLawfirm.com
jkylercohn@BKLawfirm.com

Attorneys for The Ohio Energy Group

Joseph Olikier (Counsel of Record)
Matthew White
Evan Betterton
IGS Energy
6100 Emerald Parkway
Dublin, OH 43016
Email: joliker@igsenergy.com
mswhite@igsenergy.com
Ebetterton@igsenergy.com

Attorney for IGS Energy

Kevin R. Schmidt
88 East Broad Street, Suite 1770
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: schmidt@sppgrp.com

Attorney for The Energy Professionals of Ohio

Jeffrey W. Mayes
Monitoring Analytics, LLC
2621 Van Buren Avenue, Suite 160
Valley Forge Corporate Center
Eagleville, PA 19403
Email: jeffrey.mayes@monitoringanalytics.com

Attorneys for Monitoring Analytics, LLC as
The Independent Market Monitor for PJM

Trent Dougherty
1145 Chesapeake Ave., Suite 1
Columbus, OH 43212-3449
Email: tdougherty@the OEC.org

Attorney for Ohio Environmental
Council

Miranda Leppla
Ohio Environmental Council
1145 Chesapeake Ave., Suite 1
Columbus, OH 43212-3449
Email: mleppa@the OEC.org

Attorney for the Environmental Defense Fund

Michael D. Dortch
Richard R. Parsons
Kravitz, Brown & Dortch, LLC
65 East State Street, Suite 200
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: mdortch@kravitzllc.com
rparsons@kravitzllc.com

Attorneys for Calpine Energy Solutions LLC

Evelyn R. Robinson
2750 Monroe Boulevard
Audubon, PA 19403
Email: evelyn.robinson@pjm.com

Attorney for PJM Interconnection, L.L.C.

Joel E. Sechler (Counsel of Record)
Carpenter Lipps & Leland
280 N. High St., Suite 1300
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: sechler@carpenterlipps.com

Attorneys for EnerNOC, Inc.

Angela Paul Whitfield
Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP
280 Plaza, Suite 1300
280 North High Street
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: paul@carpenterlipps.com

Attorney for The Kroger Co.

Colleen Mooney
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
P.O. Box 1793
Findlay, OH 45839-1793
Email: cmooney@ohiopartners.org

Attorney for Ohio Partners for Affordable
Energy

Madeline Fleisher
Kristin Field
Environmental Law & Policy Center
21 West Broad Street, Suite 500
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: mfleisher@elpc.org
kfield@elpc.org

Attorneys for The Environmental Law &
Policy Center

Richard C. Sahli
Richard C. Sahli Law Office, LLC
981 Pinewood Lane
Columbus, OH 43230-3662
Email: rsahli@columbus.rr.com

Tony G. Mendoza, Staff Attorney (pro hac vice)
Kristin Henry, Senior Staff Attorney (pro hac vice)
Gregory E. Wannier, Staff Attorney (pro hac vice)
Sierra Club Environmental Law Program
2101 Webster Street, 13th Floor
Oakland, CA 94612
Email: tony.mendoza@sierraclub.org
kristin.henry@sierraclub.org
greg.wannier@sierraclub.org

Attorneys for Sierra Club

Michelle Grant
Dynergy Inc.
601 Travis Street, Suite 1400
Houston, TX 77002
Email: michelle.d.grant@dynergy.com

Attorneys for Dynergy Inc.

Michael J. Settineri
Gretchen L. Petrucci
Ilya Batikov
William A. Sieck
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 E. Gay Street
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: mjsettineri@vorys.com
glpetrucci@vorys.com
ibatikov@vorys.com
wasieck@vorys.com

Attorneys for Dynergy Inc.,
PJM Power Providers Group, and
Retail Energy Supply Association

Lisa M. Hawrot
Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC
Century Centre Building
1233 Main Street, Suite 4000
Wheeling, WV 26003
Email: lhawrot@spilmanlaw.com

Derrick Price Williamson
Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC
1100 Bent Creek Blvd., Suite 101
Mechanicsburg, PA 17050
Email: dwilliamson@spilmanlaw.com

Carrie M. Harris
Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC
310 First Street, Suite 1100
P.O. Box 90
Roanoke, VA 24002-0090
Email: charris@spilmanlaw.com

Steve W. Chriss
Senior Manager, Energy Regulatory Analysis
Greg Tillman
Senior Manager, Energy Regulatory Analysis
Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.
2001 SE 10th Street
Bentonville, AR 72716-0550
Email: Stephen.Chriss@walmart.com
Greg.Tillman@walmart.com

Attorneys for Wal-Mart Stores East, LP
and Sam's East, Inc.

Steven D. Lesser
James F. Lang
N. Trevor Alexander
Mark T. Keaney
Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP
41 South High Street
1200 Huntington Center
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: slessor@calfee.com
jlang@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com
mkeaney@calfee.com

Attorneys for The City of Dayton and
Honda of America Mfg., Inc.

Glen Thomas
1060 First Avenue, Suite 400
King of Prussia, PA 19406
Email: gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

Sharon Theodore
Electric Power Supply Association
1401 New York Ave. NW 11th Floor
Washington, DC
Email: stheodore@epsa.org

Laura Chappelle
201 North Washington Square, Suite 910
Lansing, MI 48933
Email: laurac@chappelleconsulting.net

Attorneys for PJM Power Providers Group

Ellis Jacobs
Advocates for Basic Legal Equality, Inc.
130 West Second Street, Suite 700 East
Dayton, OH 45402
Email: ejacobs@ablelaw.org

Attorney for Edgemont Neighborhood Coalition

Jeanne W. Kingery
Elizabeth H. Watts
Duke-Energy Ohio, Inc.
139 East Fourth Street
1303-Main
Cincinnati, OH 45202
Email: jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com
elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com

Attorneys for Duke-Energy Ohio, Inc.

Carl Tamm, President
Classic Connectors, Inc. 382 Park Avenue East
Mansfield, OH 44905
Email: crtamm@classicconnectors.com

John R. Doll
Doll, Jansen & Ford
111 West First Street, Suite 1100
Dayton, OH 45402-1156
Email: jdoll@djflawfirm.com

Attorneys for Utility Workers of
America Local 175

Matthew W. Warnock
Dylan F. Borchers
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215-4291
Email: mwarnock@bricker.com
dborchers@bricker.com

Attorneys for The Ohio Hospital Association

Christine M.T. Pirik
Terrence N. O'Donnell
William V. Vorys
Jonathan R. Secrest
Dickinson Wright PLLC
150 East Gay Street, Suite 2400
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: cpirik@dickinsonwright.com
todonnell@dickinsonwright.com
wvorys@dickinsonwright.com
jsecrest@dickinsonwright.com

Attorneys for Mid-Atlantic Renewable
Energy Coalition

John F. Stock
Orla E. Collier
Benesch, Friedlander, Coplan & Aronoff LLP
41 South High Street, 26th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: jstock@beneschlaw.com
ocollier@beneschlaw.com

Attorneys for Murray Energy Corporation and
Citizens to Protect DP&L Jobs

Mark Landes
Brian M. Zets
Isaac Wiles Burkholder & Teetor, LLC
Two Miranova Place
Suite 700
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: mlandes@isaacwiles.com
bzets@isaacwiles.com

Attorneys for Adams County Commissioners

C. David Kelley, Prosecutor
Dana N. Whalen
110 West Main Street
West Union, OH 45693
Email: prosecutorkelley@usa.com
dana.whalen@adamscountyoh.gov

Attorneys for Monroe Township, Ohio, Sprigg
Township, Manchester Local School District,
and Adams County Ohio Valley School
District

Devin D. Parram
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215-4291
Email: dparram@bricker.com

Attorney for People Working
Cooperatively, Inc.

/s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey
Jeffrey S. Sharkey

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

11/7/2018 3:14:53 PM

in

Case No(s). 16-0395-EL-SSO, 16-0396-EL-ATA, 16-0397-EL-AAM

Summary: Reply The Dayton Power and Light Company's Reply in Support of Its Motion to Strike Notice of Withdrawal From the Amended Stipulation electronically filed by Mr. Jeffrey S Sharkey on behalf of The Dayton Power and Light Company