

In The Matter of:  
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio

Transcript of Proceedings

January 03, 2018

Hearing

BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the       ) Case No. 17-1139-GA-AIR  
Application of Ohio Gas    )  
Company for an Increase   )  
in Gas Distribution       )  
Rates,                     )

In the Matter of the       ) Case No. 17-1140-GA-ATA  
Application of Ohio Gas    )  
Company for Tariff        )  
Approval,                 )

In the Matter of the       ) Case No. 17-1141-GA-AAM  
Application of Ohio Gas    )  
Company for Approval of   )  
Certain Accounting        )  
Authority.                 )

PUBLIC HEARING

DATE: January 3, 2018

TIME: 6:00 p.m.

PLACE: City of Defiance City Hall Building  
631 Perry Street  
Defiance, Ohio 43512

Before Tonya J. Kaiser, RPR, CMRS, and Notary Public.

**Transcript of Proceedings - January 03, 2018  
Hearing**

2

1 APPEARANCES:

2 Patricia A. Schabo, Esq.  
PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO  
3 180 East Broad Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3793  
4 614.466.2395  
patricia.schabo@puco.ohio.gov

5 Attorney Examiners;

6  
7 Frank P. Darr, Esq.  
McNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC  
8 21 East State Street, 17th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
9 614.719.2855  
fdarr@mcneeslaw.com

10 On behalf of the Ohio Gas Company;

11  
12 Kevin F. Moore, Esq., Assistant Consumers' Counsel  
OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL  
13 65 East State Street, 7th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4213  
14 614.387.2965  
kevin.moore@occ.ohio.gov

15 On behalf of the Office of the Ohio  
16 Consumers' Counsel.

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1           P R O C E E D I N G S

2           MS. SCHABO: The Public Utilities Commission  
3           of Ohio has assigned for a public hearing at  
4           this time and place Case Number  
5           17-1139-GA-AIR, 17-1140-GA-ATA, and  
6           17-1141-GA-AAM, being in the matter of the  
7           application of Ohio Gas Company for an  
8           increase in gas distribution rates, for  
9           tariff approval, and for approval of certain  
10          accounting authority.

11          My name is Patricia Schabo. I'm one of  
12          the attorney examiners assigned by the  
13          Public Utilities Commission to preside over  
14          this hearing.

15          With me this evening are Luka Papalko  
16          with the Commission of Public Affairs  
17          Department and Lee Garry with the Commission  
18          Service Monitoring and Enforcement Division.  
19          The PUCO staff members are available to help  
20          you if you have any questions concerning  
21          utility matters other than the application  
22          that is the focus of this evening's hearing.

23          At this time I would like to take the  
24          appearances on behalf of the parties,  
25          beginning with the company.

**Transcript of Proceedings - January 03, 2018  
Hearing**

4

1 MR. DARR: On behalf of Ohio Gas Company,  
2 Frank Darr of the law firm of McNeese  
3 Wallace & Nurick, 21 East State Street,  
4 Columbus, Ohio 43215.

5 MS. SCHABO: Okay. Is there anyone on  
6 behalf of Ohio Consumers' Counsel?

7 MR. MOORE: Yes. Good evening, your Honor.  
8 On behalf of Ohio Consumers' Counsel Bruce  
9 J. Weston, Ohio Consumers' Counsel by Kevin  
10 Moore, 65 East State Street, 7th Floor  
11 Columbus, Ohio 43210.

12 MS. SCHABO: Thank you.

13 MR. DARR: May I also point out for the  
14 record that we have representatives of the  
15 company here: the president Richard Hallet,  
16 senior vice president of operations Doug  
17 Saul, the vice president and controller  
18 Chuck Turnwald, vice president of gas supply  
19 Bob Eyre, and vice president for personnel  
20 and IT Cindy Reed. And those folks would be  
21 available for discussion after the hearing  
22 as well.

23 MS. SCHABO: Thank you.

24 Is there anyone else here on behalf of a  
25 party to this proceeding?

**Transcript of Proceedings - January 03, 2018  
Hearing**

5

1 (No response.)

2 All right. The subject of this evening's  
3 public hearing is Ohio Gas Company's  
4 application for an increase in distribution  
5 rates, which is accompanied by an  
6 application for tariff approval and for  
7 approval of certain accounting authority.  
8 Ohio Gas Company filed this application on  
9 May 31st, 2017. With this application, Ohio  
10 Gas Company is requesting a rate increase  
11 that, if approved, would generate additional  
12 base revenue of \$3,237,346, which represents  
13 a 24.52 percent increase over current  
14 revenue.

15 The staff of the Public Utilities  
16 Commission issued a report on November  
17 the 22nd, 2017. Given its review, staff  
18 recommends a revenue increase between  
19 \$2,441,967 and \$2,873,410 or between  
20 18.22 percent and 21.44 percent over current  
21 revenue.

22 I would point out that the staff report  
23 is a recommendation only, and the commission  
24 may implement some of staff's suggestions  
25 and reject others.

**Transcript of Proceedings - January 03, 2018  
Hearing**

6

1           The local public hearing scheduled in  
2           this case is only one aspect of the process.  
3           An evidentiary hearing is also scheduled to  
4           commence on Thursday, January the 18th,  
5           2018, at the commission's office in  
6           Columbus.

7           Tonight is not a question-and-answer  
8           session, although representatives from the  
9           company, Ohio Consumers' Counsel, and staff  
10          may be able to address concerns after the  
11          hearing ends.

12          Tonight we are here to receive comments  
13          from the public regarding Ohio Gas Company's  
14          application for an increase in rates. This  
15          is your opportunity to let the commission  
16          know what you think about the application.

17          Tonight's hearing is being transcribed by  
18          a court reporter. Any testimony given  
19          tonight will be incorporated into the  
20          official record in this case. If you plan  
21          to testify, please speak clearly so that the  
22          court reporter can accurately reflect your  
23          comments to the record.

24          Also, if you have a prepared written  
25          statement, it would be helpful if you

**Transcript of Proceedings - January 03, 2018  
Hearing**

7

1 provide a copy of that to the court  
2 reporter.

3 If you decide you do not wish to testify,  
4 you may submit written comments under Case  
5 Number 17-1139-GA-AIR on the PUCO website or  
6 by mail.

7 At this time I will note that there are  
8 no members of the public present. It is  
9 6:10. We will go ahead and go off the  
10 record for at least the next 20 minutes, and  
11 we'll reassess at that time. Thank you.

12 (A brief recess was held.)

13 MS. SCHABO: We're back on the record for  
14 Case 17-1139-GA-AIR, et al., in the matter  
15 of the application of Ohio Gas Company for  
16 an increase in gas distribution rates. We  
17 went off the record at 6:10 as there were no  
18 members of the public present. It is now  
19 6:43. We've had one gentleman join us.

20 Sir, would you like to offer any  
21 testimony this morning -- or this evening?

22 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: No. Thank you.

23 MS. SCHABO: All right. Let the record  
24 reflect that there is no one present who  
25 wishes to testify in this proceeding.



**Transcript of Proceedings - January 03, 2018  
Hearing**

8

1       Therefore, this public hear is concluded,  
2       and we are adjourned.

3       MR. DARR: Thank you, your Honor.

4       (The hearing concluded at 6:44 p.m.)

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

**Transcript of Proceedings - January 03, 2018  
Hearing**

9

C E R T I F I C A T E

I, Tonya J. Kaiser, a Notary Public, do hereby  
certify that the hearing above-set forth was reduced to  
writing by me by means of machine shorthand and was  
later transcribed from my original shorthand notes; that  
this is a true record of the proceedings; and that said  
hearing was taken at the aforementioned time, date, and  
place.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have set my hand and seal  
this 8th day of January, 2018.

---

# **Transcript of Proceedings - January 03, 2018 Hearing**

<hr/> <p align="center"><b>\$</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>\$2,441,967</b> 5:19  <b>\$2,873,410</b> 5:19  <b>\$3,237,346</b> 5:12</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>1</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>17-1139-GA-AIR</b>  3:5 7:5,14  <b>17-1140-GA-ATA</b>  3:5  <b>17-1141-GA-AAM</b>  3:6  <b>18.22</b> 5:20  <b>18th</b> 6:4</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>2</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>20</b> 7:10  <b>2017</b> 5:9,17  <b>2018</b> 6:5 9:12  <b>21</b> 4:3  <b>21.44</b> 5:20  <b>22nd</b> 5:17  <b>24.52</b> 5:13</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>3</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>31st</b> 5:9</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>4</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>43210</b> 4:11  <b>43215</b> 4:4</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>6</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>65</b> 4:10  <b>6:10</b> 7:9,17  <b>6:43</b> 7:19  <b>6:44</b> 8:4</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>7</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>7th</b> 4:10</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>8</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>8th</b> 9:12</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>A</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>above-set</b> 9:4  <b>accompanied</b> 5:5  <b>accounting</b> 3:10 5:7  <b>accurately</b> 6:22  <b>additional</b> 5:11  <b>address</b> 6:10  <b>adjourned</b> 8:2  <b>Affairs</b> 3:16  <b>aforementioned</b>  9:8  <b>ahead</b> 7:9</p>	<p><b>appearances</b> 3:24  <b>application</b> 3:7,21  5:4,6,8,9 6:14,16 7:15  <b>approval</b> 3:9 5:6,7  <b>approved</b> 5:11  <b>aspect</b> 6:2  <b>assigned</b> 3:3,12  <b>attorney</b> 3:12  <b>authority</b> 3:10 5:7</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>B</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>back</b> 7:13  <b>base</b> 5:12  <b>beginning</b> 3:25  <b>behalf</b> 3:24 4:1,6,8,  24  <b>Bob</b> 4:19  <b>Bruce</b> 4:8</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>C</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>case</b> 3:4 6:2,20 7:4,  14  <b>certify</b> 9:4  <b>Chuck</b> 4:18  <b>Cindy</b> 4:20  <b>Columbus</b> 4:4,11  6:6  <b>commence</b> 6:4  <b>comments</b> 6:12,23  7:4  <b>commission</b> 3:2,13,  16,17 5:16,23 6:15  <b>commission's</b> 6:5  <b>company</b> 3:7,25 4:1,  15 5:8,10 6:9 7:15  <b>Company's</b> 5:3  6:13  <b>concerns</b> 6:10  <b>concluded</b> 8:1,4  <b>Consumers'</b> 4:6,8,9  6:9  <b>controller</b> 4:17  <b>copy</b> 7:1  <b>Counsel</b> 4:6,8,9 6:9  <b>court</b> 6:18,22 7:1  <b>current</b> 5:13,20</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>D</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>Darr</b> 4:1,2,13 8:3  <b>date</b> 9:8  <b>day</b> 9:12  <b>decide</b> 7:3  <b>Department</b> 3:17  <b>discussion</b> 4:21  <b>distribution</b> 3:8 5:4  7:16  <b>Division</b> 3:18  <b>Doug</b> 4:16</p>	<hr/> <p align="center"><b>E</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>East</b> 4:3,10  <b>ends</b> 6:11  <b>Enforcement</b> 3:18  <b>et al</b> 7:14  <b>evening</b> 3:15 4:7  7:21  <b>evening's</b> 3:22 5:2  <b>evidentiary</b> 6:3  <b>examiners</b> 3:12  <b>Eyre</b> 4:19</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>F</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>filed</b> 5:8  <b>firm</b> 4:2  <b>Floor</b> 4:10  <b>focus</b> 3:22  <b>folks</b> 4:20  <b>Frank</b> 4:2</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>G</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>Garry</b> 3:17  <b>gas</b> 3:7,8 4:1,18 5:3,  8,10 6:13 7:15,16  <b>generate</b> 5:11  <b>gentleman</b> 7:19  <b>Good</b> 4:7</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>H</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>Hallet</b> 4:15  <b>hand</b> 9:11  <b>hear</b> 8:1  <b>hearing</b> 3:3,14,22  4:21 5:3 6:1,3,11,17  8:4 9:4,8  <b>held</b> 7:12  <b>helpful</b> 6:25  <b>Honor</b> 4:7 8:3</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>I</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>implement</b> 5:24  <b>incorporated</b> 6:19  <b>increase</b> 3:8 5:4,10,  13,18 6:14 7:16  <b>issued</b> 5:16</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>J</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>January</b> 6:4 9:12  <b>join</b> 7:19</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>K</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>Kaiser</b> 9:3  <b>Kevin</b> 4:9</p>	<hr/> <p align="center"><b>L</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>law</b> 4:2  <b>Lee</b> 3:17  <b>local</b> 6:1  <b>Luka</b> 3:15</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>M</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>machine</b> 9:5  <b>mail</b> 7:6  <b>matter</b> 3:6 7:14  <b>matters</b> 3:21  <b>Mcnees</b> 4:2  <b>means</b> 9:5  <b>members</b> 3:19 7:8,  18  <b>minutes</b> 7:10  <b>Monitoring</b> 3:18  <b>Moore</b> 4:7,10  <b>morning</b> 7:21</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>N</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>Notary</b> 9:3  <b>note</b> 7:7  <b>notes</b> 9:6  <b>November</b> 5:16  <b>Number</b> 3:4 7:5  <b>Nurick</b> 4:3</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>O</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>offer</b> 7:20  <b>office</b> 6:5  <b>official</b> 6:20  <b>Ohio</b> 3:3,7 4:1,4,6,8,  9,11 5:3,8,9 6:9,13  7:15  <b>operations</b> 4:16  <b>opportunity</b> 6:15  <b>original</b> 9:6</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>P</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>p.m.</b> 8:4  <b>Papalko</b> 3:15  <b>parties</b> 3:24  <b>party</b> 4:25  <b>Patricia</b> 3:11  <b>percent</b> 5:13,20  <b>personnel</b> 4:19  <b>place</b> 3:4 9:9  <b>plan</b> 6:20  <b>point</b> 4:13 5:22  <b>prepared</b> 6:24  <b>present</b> 7:8,18,24  <b>preside</b> 3:13  <b>president</b> 4:15,16,  17,18,19  <b>proceeding</b> 4:25  7:25</p>	<p><b>proceedings</b> 9:7  <b>process</b> 6:2  <b>provide</b> 7:1  <b>public</b> 3:2,3,13,16  5:3,15 6:1,13 7:8,18  8:1 9:3  <b>PUCO</b> 3:19 7:5</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>Q</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>question-and- answer</b> 6:7  <b>questions</b> 3:20</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>R</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>rate</b> 5:10  <b>rates</b> 3:8 5:5 6:14  7:16  <b>reassess</b> 7:11  <b>receive</b> 6:12  <b>recess</b> 7:12  <b>recommendation</b>  5:23  <b>recommends</b> 5:18  <b>record</b> 4:14 6:20,23  7:10,13,17,23 9:7  <b>reduced</b> 9:4  <b>Reed</b> 4:20  <b>reflect</b> 6:22 7:24  <b>reject</b> 5:25  <b>report</b> 5:16,22  <b>reporter</b> 6:18,22 7:2  <b>representatives</b>  4:14 6:8  <b>represents</b> 5:12  <b>requesting</b> 5:10  <b>response</b> 5:1  <b>revenue</b> 5:12,14,18,  21  <b>review</b> 5:17  <b>Richard</b> 4:15</p> <hr/> <p align="center"><b>S</b></p> <hr/> <p><b>Saul</b> 4:17  <b>Schabo</b> 3:2,11 4:5,  12,23 7:13,23  <b>scheduled</b> 6:1,3  <b>seal</b> 9:11  <b>senior</b> 4:16  <b>Service</b> 3:18  <b>session</b> 6:8  <b>set</b> 9:11  <b>shorthand</b> 9:5,6  <b>Sir</b> 7:20  <b>speak</b> 6:21  <b>SPEAKER</b> 7:22  <b>staff</b> 3:19 5:15,17,22  6:9  <b>staff's</b> 5:24  <b>State</b> 4:3,10</p>
---	--	---	---	--

**Transcript of Proceedings - January 03, 2018  
Hearing**

**statement** 6:25  
**Street** 4:3,10  
**subject** 5:2  
**submit** 7:4  
**suggestions** 5:24  
**supply** 4:18

---

**T**

---

**tariff** 3:9 5:6  
**testify** 6:21 7:3,25  
**testimony** 6:18 7:21  
**Thursday** 6:4  
**time** 3:4,23 7:7,11  
9:8  
**tonight** 6:7,12,19  
**Tonight's** 6:17  
**Tonya** 9:3  
**transcribed** 6:17  
9:6  
**true** 9:7  
**Turnwald** 4:18

---

**U**

---

**UNIDENTIFIED**  
7:22  
**Utilities** 3:2,13 5:15  
**utility** 3:21

---

**V**

---

**vice** 4:16,17,18,19

---

**W**

---

**Wallace** 4:3  
**website** 7:5  
**Weston** 4:9  
**WHEREOF** 9:11  
**wishes** 7:25  
**writing** 9:5  
**written** 6:24 7:4

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**1/9/2018 10:46:12 AM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 17-1139-GA-AIR, 17-1140-GA-ATA, 17-1141-GA-AAM**

Summary: Transcript In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Gas Company for an Increase in Gas Distribution Rates; In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Gas Company for Tariff Approval; In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Gas Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority electronically filed by Ms. Barbara Marinelli on behalf of Mehler & Hagestrom