

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

- - -

In the Matter of the :
Application of Ohio Power :
Company for Authority to :
Establish a Standard : Case No. 16-1852-EL-SSO
Service Offer Pursuant to :
R.C. 4928.143, in the :
Form of an Electric :
Security Plan. :

In the Matter of the :
Application of Ohio Power :
Company for Approval of : Case No. 16-1853-EL-AAM
Certain Accounting :
Authority. :

- - -

PUBLIC HEARING

Before Greta See, Attorney Examiner, at the
Washington State Community College, Arts & Science
Building, Harvey Graham Auditorium, 710 Colgate
Drive, Marietta, Ohio, called at 6:00 p.m. on
Thursday, April 13, 2017.

- - -

ARMSTRONG & OKEY, INC.
222 East Town Street, Second Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4620
(614) 224-9481 - (800) 223-9481

- - -

APPEARANCES:

Ice Miller
By Christopher L. Miller, Esq.
Arena District
250 West Street, Ste. 700
Columbus, Ohio 43215-7509

On behalf of American Electric Power.

Bruce J. Weston, Ohio Consumers' Counsel
By Kevin F. Moore, Esq.
Assistant Consumers' Counsel
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215

On behalf of the Residential Energy
Consumers of AEP Ohio.

- - -

1 Thursday Evening Session,
2 April 13, 2017.

3 - - -

4 EXAMINER SEE: The Public Utilities
5 Commission of Ohio has assigned for public hearing at
6 this time and place Case No. 16-1852-EL-SSO, et al.,
7 which is entitled In the Matter of the Application of
8 Ohio Power Company for Authority to Establish a
9 Standard Service Offer Pursuant to RC 4928.143, in
10 the Form of an Electric Security Plan, and Case
11 No. 16-1853-EL-AAM entitled In the Matter of the
12 Application of Ohio Power for Approval of Certain
13 Accounting Authority.

14 My name is Greta See. I'm an
15 Attorney-Examiner in the Legal Department of the
16 Commission, and I've been assigned to this case. In
17 addition, there are -- there is another individual
18 named Sarah Parrot, who is also assigned to the case.
19 When you came to the hearing this evening, there was
20 an individual at the table and also there is an
21 individual from the Commission at the back of the
22 room, Mr. Luka -- and I'm about to really butcher his
23 last name -- Papalko --

24 MR. PAPALKO: We'll go with that.

25 EXAMINER SEE: -- at the back of the

1 room. And outside of the theater is Lawrence
2 Hampton, and if you have some questions about the
3 Commission's process or other services that the
4 Public Utilities Commission offers, feel free to
5 approach them as you leave or in a minute if you have
6 a question about the process. Okay. If you have a
7 question about your service or some service issues
8 with Ohio Power, once I ask their counsel to stand up
9 and be -- and make an appearance, he will also
10 indicate to you if there is somebody in the room that
11 can address those questions for you.

12 Okay. At this time, I'd like to take
13 appearances on behalf of the parties that have
14 intervened in this case starting off with Ohio Power
15 Company.

16 MR. MILLER: Thank you, Your Honor.
17 Christopher L. Miller of the law firm of Ice Miller
18 for American Electric Power, and my address is 250
19 West Street, Columbus, Ohio 43215.

20 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. And on behalf of
21 Ohio's Consumers' Counsel.

22 MR. MOORE: Thank you, Your Honor. On
23 behalf of the residential energy consumers of AEP
24 Ohio, the office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel,
25 Bruce J. Weston, Ohio Consumers' Counsel, by Kevin

Moore, 10 West Broad Street, Columbus, Ohio 43215.

EXAMINER SEE: Is there counsel for any of the other intervening parties present?

(No response.)

EXAMINER SEE: As I indicated, there are a number of parties who have intervened in the case. As of today, there are 28 intervenors representing residential customers, including low-income residential customers, as well as commercial and industrial customers and other consumer advocates. Each of these parties represents its various constituents' interests in the case before the Commission.

On November 23rd, 2016, Ohio Power filed an application with the Commission to extend its current standard offer -- standard service offer in the form of an electric security plan, or as we refer to it at the Commission, an ESP, to be effective from June 1, 2018, through May 31st, 2024. In addition to tonight's hearing, there are three other public hearings in this case throughout AEP's service territory. An evidentiary hearing is also scheduled to commence at the Commission's offices on June 6, 2017.

The purpose of this evening's hearing is

1 to receive comments from the public regarding AEP
2 Ohio's application to extend its current ESP. If you
3 have questions, I would encourage you to try to get
4 those questions answered, and then come forward to
5 present your testimony this evening.

6 As you can tell, tonight's hearing is
7 being transcribed by a court reporter. If you plan
8 to testify, please speak clearly so that the court
9 reporter can accurately record your testimony. If
10 you have a written statement, it would help if you
11 could provide a copy of that statement after you've
12 given your testimony to the court reporter.

13 When you arrived this evening, the
14 gentleman at the table outside most likely asked you
15 if you wanted to offer testimony, and that
16 information was put in a list. I will follow the
17 list in the order that you came in this evening to
18 call witnesses forward. After I finish the
19 introduction and start with testimony, as you step
20 forward, I'll ask you to take an affirmation that the
21 information you're about to give is true, and I will
22 ask each witness to state their name and provide
23 their address. Your testimony will become part of
24 the record in this case. Additionally, counsel for
25 the intervenors -- I'm sorry, for the company and the

1 intervenors, as well as myself, may ask you some
2 questions to clarify your testimony.

3 The Commission appreciates your
4 participation and you giving up your evening to come
5 here and give us your comments. And if there are no
6 questions about the process, we'll get started.

7 Okay. The first -- let me also
8 apologize now, I don't always pronounce the last
9 names correctly. So the first witness to sign to
10 offer testimony is Margaret Brewer.

11 MS. BREWER: Can I do it from here?

12 EXAMINER SEE: If you can speak loud
13 enough so the court reporter can get it, you
14 certainly can, Ms. Brewer. First state and spell
15 your name for the --

16 MS. BREWER: It's Margaret Brewer, my
17 last name is B-r-e-w-e-r.

18 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Ms. Brewer, please
19 raise your right hand. Do you affirm that the
20 information you're about to give is true?

21 MS. BREWER: I do.

22 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. State your name
23 and your address for the record.

24 MS. BREWER: Again, it's Margaret
25 Brewer, I live at 105 Wilson Avenue here in Marietta.

1 EXAMINER SEE: Okay.

2 MS. BREWER: I appreciate you coming out
3 and giving us a chance to speak with you. I don't
4 really have any questions, but from what I've read
5 and seen, this is going to be a pretty big hit to a
6 lot of people that are small users such as myself.

7 You know, I don't have anybody else to
8 pass that cost onto like a business would. It cannot
9 be job costed. You know, I can't make it a part of a
10 doing business charge and just up my prices, because
11 I am the end-result user.

12 EXAMINER SEE: Okay.

13 MS. BREWER: So this \$10 a month that's
14 going in effect is really going to hit a lot of
15 people in this area pretty hard. You know, just like
16 it says, it's about another electric bill a year for
17 people, and you only have so much money and that's
18 all you can use from. So in order to pay your bills,
19 you're going to cut down on other things and take
20 away from disposable income.

21 You know, I understand we need upgrades
22 to the system, and I truly believe that that is
23 the -- what we need to do with all our
24 infrastructure, not just electric, but everything.
25 So I don't mind paying a little bit more, but this is

1 going to impact a lot of people. I know that that's
2 something that for manufacturers and things they can
3 do away with costs. Poor little individuals,
4 homeowners, people that live -- you know,
5 individuals, you're going to bear everything.
6 There's nobody else to give it to. So I would really
7 like to be able to lower that cost if there's any way
8 that we can and still make progress to upgrade our
9 infrastructure.

10 EXAMINER SEE: Okay.

11 MS. BREWER: That's all I have to say.

12 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Thank you. Any
13 cross-examination for this witness?

14 MR. MILLER: No, ma'am.

15 EXAMINER SEE: Mr. Moore?

16 MR. MOORE: No, Your Honor.

17 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you.

18 MS. BREWER: Thank you.

19 EXAMINER SEE: The next person I have on
20 the list is Richard Wittberg.

21 MR. WITTBERG: Very close.

22 EXAMINER SEE: Wittberg.

23 MR. WITTBERG: Wittberg.

24 EXAMINER SEE: Wittberg.

25 MR. WITTBERG: No e-n.

1 EXAMINER SEE: Mr. Wittberg, if you'd
2 please raise your right hand. Do you affirm that the
3 information you're about to give is true?

4 MR. WITTBURG: I do.

5 EXAMINER SEE: State and spell your name
6 for the record, and give us your address.

7 MR. WITTBURG: Richard, R-i-c-h-a-r-d,
8 Wittberg, W-i-t-t-b-e-r-g. I live at 209 Wyoming
9 Road here in Marietta.

10 My job is Health Commissioner of
11 Washington County, that means that I pay very close
12 attention to things like health disparities and
13 things like health in all policies. Appalachians are
14 every bit as much of a health disparities population
15 as any racial subgroup. We have every bit as high a
16 rate of diabetes, every bit as high a rate of
17 poverty. This is the sort of policy that will impact
18 health.

19 We already have people that have to make
20 choices between medication and food, and an extra \$10
21 a month is going to be that much less medication or
22 that much less food. This is a tax on the poor,
23 because they're the ones that are going to suffer the
24 most from this. This is not something that you can
25 save by using less electricity.

1 You know, it might be a little different
2 if this was something that was per kilowatt-hour,
3 this is not. This is something that's a flat charge.
4 You cannot reduce this extra charge by consuming
5 less.

6 This is the sort of policy that is going
7 to hurt a lot of residents in Appalachian Ohio, and
8 there has to be a better way to do this than putting
9 a tax like this that's going to hit the poorest
10 people the hardest. That's all I have to say.

11 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Any
12 cross-examination for Mr. Wittberg?

13 MR. MOORE: No, Your Honor.

14 MR. MILLER: No.

15 MR. WITTBURG: Thank you.

16 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you.

17 Michael J. Marla.

18 MR. MARKS: Marks, hello.

19 EXAMINER SEE: Marks.

20 MR. MARKS: Hello, Your Honor.

21 EXAMINER SEE: Is that M-a-r-k?

22 MR. MARKS: M-a-r-k-s.

23 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Could you -- sir,
24 could you step forward? Sometimes it's difficult if
25 there's some rustling in the audience for me to catch

1 all the words.

2 MR. MARKS: Certainly.

3 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Raise your right
4 hand, please. Do you affirm that the information
5 you're about to give is true?

6 MR. MARKS: I do.

7 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you. Please state
8 and spell your name for the record, and give us your
9 address.

10 MR. MARKS: It's Michael J. Marks,
11 M-i-c-h-a-e-l, initial J., M-a-r-k-s, 2474 Robinson
12 Hill Road.

13 All right. Well, anyway, first off, I'd
14 like to say that I'm not against reasonable and
15 fairly structured rate changes, and I believe that
16 the value and the convenience and the comfort I get
17 for every dollar I spend on electricity is well worth
18 it.

19 I am, however, against regressive and
20 unfair increases that have small users subsidizing
21 big users. Every time we have a fixed-rate charge --
22 change or increase, the effective kilowatt volume
23 costs more per kilowatt for that low user and the
24 higher users pay less of an effective rate overall.
25 So just based on fairness, I know we have a lot of

1 kind people here, but, you know, below-volume users
 2 shouldn't be subsidizing the big-volume user, the
 3 person who's running their jacuzzi, who's keeping
 4 their air conditioner at 65 degrees in the summer and
 5 their heat at 80 in the winter, it's just not fair.
 6 We've got people that are trying to save, and
 7 ironically, and conversely and inversely, they are
 8 subsidizing large users with every time these fixed
 9 rate charges go up. So just based on the principle
 10 of fairness, I'm against that.

11 Why not change the volumetric structure?
 12 Why not have a tiered structure where everybody pays
 13 the same rate per kilowatt-hour until they reach a
 14 certain tier, then heavy users pay a little bit
 15 higher? This would incentivize conservation. This
 16 rate change does not incentivize conservation at all,
 17 it incentivizes use, and that's more wear and tear on
 18 infrastructure. That's -- I think that could be
 19 avoided with a -- the appropriate economic incentives
 20 and these are not those incentives. I just think
 21 it's an immoral charge.

22 We know that a company needs to make
 23 money. I'm all for AEP making a profit. I'm all for
 24 reliable infrastructure, but not the little person
 25 subsidizing the big user.

I've got a lot more here, but that's the basics of it. So that's just it in a nutshell. I just think it's immoral, I think it's counter-productive, it does not offer the appropriate incentives to anybody out there.

EXAMINER SEE: Okay.

MR. MARKS: That's all I've got.

EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Are you willing to give us your statement for the court reporter's reference and mine?

MR. MARKS: Yeah, such as it is.

EXAMINER SEE: Oh, long reach, okay.

MR. MARKS: Okay. Thank you.

EXAMINER SEE: Hold on just a second. Is there any cross-examination for this witness, Mr. Miller?

MR. MILLER: No cross.

EXAMINER SEE: Mr. Moore?

MR. MOORE: No questions, Your Honor.

EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Out of curiosity, Mr. Marks --

MR. MARKS: Yes.

EXAMINER SEE: -- are you a residential customer as well as a commercial or a business owner?

MR. MARKS: I am a residential customer,

1 I'm not a business owner.

2 EXAMINER SEE: Okay.

3 MR. MARKS: Thank you.

4 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you.

5 The next witness is Flo Beidler.

6 Ms. Beidler, was I even close?

7 MS. BEIDLER: Beidler.

8 EXAMINER SEE: Beidler, okay.

9 MS. BEIDLER: Close enough.

10 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you. Please raise
11 your right hand. Do you affirm that the information
12 you're about to give is true?

13 MS. BEIDLER: Yes.

14 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you.

15 Please state and spell your name for the
16 record, and give us your address.

17 MS. BEIDLER: Okay. Florence
18 F-l-o-r-e-n-c-e, Beidler, B-e-i-d-l-e-r. Got it.

19 EXAMINER SEE: Yes.

20 MS. BEIDLER: Okay. I agree with
21 everything everybody has said here. I can tell you
22 that -- you know, you ask where do I live? We live
23 in Appalachia, okay, and people here are not all
24 wealthy. In fact, most people are pulling real hard
25 just to make it, and this is a really, really big

1 increase.

2 I don't mind paying my fair share. If I
3 use it, I'll pay for it. You make a little bit of
4 profit, fine, but I really think that this increase
5 is just too much for the people in this particular
6 area. I love electricity. I love having lights on,
7 you know, I'm one of the first ones, but I also
8 conserve. I had to agree with you on that, this
9 isn't encouraging conserving, and we do need to
10 conserve, all of us. We have an environment that's
11 in real trouble.

12 But anyway, that's all I have to say,
13 but it is too much. Thank you.

14 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Any
15 cross-examination?

16 MR. MILLER: No, Your Honor.

17 MR. MOORE: No questions, Your Honor.

18 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you. Tom Vi- --

19 MR. VUKOVIC: Vukovic.

20 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you for saving me.

21 MR. VUKOVIC: It's all right. My
22 brother pronounces it "Vukovic," and other people
23 pronounce it "Vukovic," but my mother chose
24 "Vukovic," so that's how we pronounce it.

25 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Please raise your

1 right hand. Do you affirm that the information
2 you're about to give is true?

3 MR. VUKOVIC: I do.

4 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Please state and
5 spell your name.

6 MR. VUKOVIC: Sure. My name's Tom,
7 V-u-k-o-v-i-c, 115 Flint Wood Drive, Marietta.

8 EXAMINER SEE: Okay.

9 MR. VUKOVIC: I'm also ward councilman,
10 and have been for the last 15 years in the city of
11 Marietta.

12 First of all, speaking for the number
13 one constituent in my ward, which is my wife, I would
14 say that we are extreme conservers in our house. In
15 our household, we pay minimal bills, and a -- I truly
16 do believe on her behalf that an additional \$10 per
17 month for monthly fixed charges is outrageous.

18 I can tell you that as a city
19 councilman, I couldn't get away with that kind of
20 rate increase for our two enterprise funds, which are
21 water and sewer, just based on the fact that for
22 whatever the reason we need that. We run our city
23 based on the fact -- or our enterprise funds based on
24 the fact that the user pays and we meet our expenses.

25 Now, I understand that AEP has

1 stockholders that are out there that need to be --
 2 receive a return on their investment. I can say that
 3 based on my -- the little research that I have done,
 4 they're looking at a 4 to 6 percent rate growth over
 5 the next year. That says to me that they are
 6 anticipating that additional \$10 not only from me,
 7 but from all of my constituents.

8 Prior to -- we are -- we also aggregate
 9 electricity and gas in this community. We do that --
 10 we have done that to save our constituents those
 11 dollars where we could. Prior to that, I was the
 12 apples-to-apples person, because I was the special
 13 utilities chair. And I would get the calls from
 14 those people, senior citizens, people of low income
 15 who were looking for a way to save money.

16 Based on that fact, it doesn't matter.
 17 I mean, there will be -- there will be some savings,
 18 but this \$10 increase per month is going to hurt many
 19 of my constituents and also other -- and the other
 20 people that all of us council people represent in our
 21 city.

22 AEP's earnings for the fourth quarter of
 23 last year increased over 2015 from \$3.65 to \$3.94.
 24 That says to me that they're doing really well. Why
 25 they need to do well on the backs of -- of my

1 constituents and other customers in AE- -- or in Ohio
2 is beyond me. I think reasonable increases are fine,
3 I think justifiable increases are fine, but I think
4 for the PUCO to just allow an increase because AEP
5 wants it is -- is wrong.

6 We are also dealing with an issue with
7 AEP right now, we had a constituent who actually
8 contacted all of us because AEP came in and clear-cut
9 the trees on her street because they were putting
10 transmission lines in. And while I don't agree with
11 that, they have put out a pamphlet, and in that
12 pamphlet it says at their discretion they can come in
13 and wipe out a -- take out any trees or prune any
14 trees that they want.

15 Of course, we in Marietta are a tree
16 city USA. What they did on 8th Street in the city of
17 Marietta is embarrassing to say the least, difficult
18 for us as council people to explain to constituents
19 who don't understand that issue. And seems to me on
20 the part of AEP when you're talking about a level of
21 service that if they are going to do those things in
22 a community, they have -- they have an extreme
23 responsibility to explain or communicate with
24 constituents about those kind of things.

25 So we've got the same issue here, why do

1 they need an additional \$10 from us per month?
 2 What's that all about? What's the justification? I
 3 haven't seen that. As a council person who has
 4 served for 19 years, I think that this is an
 5 outrageous increase and the PUCO should deny it.
 6 Thank you.

7 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Just a minute.
 8 Just a moment.

9 MR. VUKOVIC: Oh.

10 EXAMINER SEE: Any cross-examination for
 11 the witness?

12 MR. MILLER: No cross-examination, Your
 13 Honor.

14 MR. MOORE: No questions, Your Honor.

15 EXAMINER SEE: Okay.

16 MR. VUKOVIC: Thank you.

17 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you.

18 Next witness is Luke Sulfridge.

19 MR. SULFRIDGE: Got it. Very good.

20 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you. Please raise
 21 your right hand. Do you affirm that the information
 22 you're about to give is true?

23 MR. SULFRIDGE: I do.

24 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you.

25 State and spell your name for the

1 record, and then provide us your address.

2 MR. SULFRIDGE: Sure. Luke Sulfridge,
3 last name's spelled S-u-l-f-r-i-d-g-e.

4 EXAMINER SEE: Okay.

5 MR. SULFRIDGE: Address is 445 Timber
6 Line Drive in Vincent, Ohio.

7 EXAMINER SEE: Go ahead with your
8 testimony.

9 MR. SULFRIDGE: Right here in Washington
10 County.

11 I speak today both as a residential
12 customer and also as the director of a nonprofit
13 called Ohio's Son. We're a statewide advocacy
14 organization helping to scale up the distributed
15 solar market statewide in Ohio and happen to reside
16 here in Washington County.

17 Fixed charges are very problematic for
18 folks wanting to go solar. One of the primary
19 reasons folks go solar is to control their energy
20 costs. So by allowing fixed charges to increase
21 exponentially puts that much more of the bill that
22 the customer has no longer the ability to control.
23 You have the same problem with efficiency the folks
24 spoke on earlier.

25 Specific to this region, the more money

1 we can keep here locally the better. That's long
2 been an issue in Appalachia, that not enough of
3 resources stay close and local and can be recycled to
4 our fine local businesses. So it really is an
5 outrage that the proposal at the table is to double
6 fixed charges.

7 In my prior life, I worked in social
8 services and saw firsthand how little folks had to
9 work with. Some communities I worked in, the average
10 SNAP benefit was \$8 a month.

11 EXAMINER SEE: I'm sorry to interrupt
12 you, but you used the term SNAP. Could you define
13 that?

14 MR. SULFRIDGE: Is your the Supplemental
15 Nutrition Assistance Program, or what's commonly
16 known as food stamps. So when you talk about a \$10
17 increase, that may impact some households very
18 severely for their average budget.

19 I would urge strongly that the
20 Commission oppose this rate increase and allow the
21 consumers to make their own choice of how they can
22 reduce their energy costs.

23 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you. Any
24 cross-examination for this witness?

25 MR. MILLER: No cross-examination.

1 MR. MOORE: No questions, Your Honor.

2 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Thank you.

3 Mr. Hampton, is there another? Thank
4 you.

5 James Cunningham.

6 MR. CUNNINGHAM: (Inaudible.)

7 THE COURT REPORTER: I'm sorry?

8 EXAMINER SEE: You wish to pass, sir?

9 MR. CUNNINGHAM: (Nods head.)

10 EXAMINER SEE: I need you to answer.

11 MR. CUNNINGHAM: Huh?

12 EXAMINER SEE: You wish to pass?

13 MR. CUNNINGHAM: Yeah.

14 EXAMINER SEE: John Trautner.

15 MR. TRAUTNER: Yes, I wish to pass.

16 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Lynn Wise. Ma'am,
17 could you raise your right hand, please? Do you
18 affirm that the information you're about to give is
19 true?

20 MS. WISE: Yes, I do.

21 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Please state and
22 spell your name for the record, and provide us your
23 address.

24 MS. WISE: My name is Lynn Wise,
25 L-y-n-n, Wise, W-i-s-e is my last name. I live at

1 270 Ridgewood Drive, Apartment B, Marietta, Ohio.

2 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Go ahead with your
3 testimony.

4 MS. WISE: I am one of those low-income,
5 retired on fixed-income persons who are going to be
6 affected by this increase because it's not going to
7 be able to be controlled by us, and I'm living in a
8 HUD subsidized apartment complex with a lot of other
9 low-income people.

10 I don't work because I -- I like -- I
11 would rather give a young person a job instead of
12 taking it and having a subsidy on my income. And
13 it's just going to be hard on me to keep up with the
14 rest of the uncontrollable standards of living.
15 That's all I have to say.

16 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Any
17 cross-examination?

18 MR. MILLER: No cross-examination, Your
19 Honor.

20 MR. MOORE: No questions, Your Honor.

21 MS. WISE: Thank you.

22 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you, Ms. Wise.

23 Dawn Wittberg. Ms. Wittberg, raise your
24 right hand. Do you affirm that the information
25 you're about to give is true?

1 MS. WITTBERG: I do.

2 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. State and spell
3 your name for the record, and provide us your
4 address.

5 MS. WITTBERG: Dawn Wittberg, D-a-w-n,
6 W-i-t-t-b-e-r-g, 1020 Hadley Lane.

7 EXAMINER SEE: Any relation to the other
8 gentleman?

9 MS. WITTBERG: Married to him once upon
10 a time, but no more.

11 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Go ahead with your
12 testimony.

13 MS. WITTBERG: I would invite you to
14 leave by going down Hadley Lane, it's just down the
15 hill. I think what you will see is that you would
16 see a lot of houses with not a lot of lights on
17 already. It's cheaper for a lot of us to stay in our
18 own homes. There's no way to live more cheaply
19 unless we're subsidized, go into subsidized housing,
20 which there isn't enough of in our county at all.

21 I have a gas furnace, I have a gas hot
22 water tank, I have a gas stove, I do not have central
23 air, and I try to avoid using the drier as much as
24 possible; so I'm using just about the minimum I can.
25 From the looks of the dark houses on my street, I

1 think most people are already kind of tapped out on
2 electricity. It is my largest bill, and it is a
3 utility bill. My electric bill, even though I really
4 minimize, is higher than my property taxes, it is
5 higher than my income taxes. It's my highest bill,
6 and yet there will be no reward to me by paying more.

7 I know the people on my street who are
8 largely retired, semi-retired, that's called can't
9 make it on retirement, or underemployed. And it's a
10 nice little street where, you know, people are proud
11 to get by, but I don't think we're going to get by
12 if -- if rates keep rising this way. What's
13 Washington County supposed to do?

14 EXAMINER SEE: Any cross-examination for
15 Ms. Wittberg?

16 MR. MILLER: No cross-examination, Your
17 Honor.

18 MR. MOORE: No questions, Your Honor.

19 EXAMINER SEE: Thank you.

20 Is there anybody present that did not
21 sign up to offer testimony that wishes to do so?

22 (No response.)

23 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. If that's the
24 case, I thank you very much for taking time out of
25 your evening to come forward and give the Commission

1 your opinion on the application that is before us.
 2 Like I said before, there will be other public
 3 hearings being held throughout AEP's service
 4 territory, and this becomes part of the Commission's
 5 docket about this case.

6 Thank you again, and the hearing is
 7 adjourned.

8 (Thereupon, the hearing was
 9 concluded at 6:36 p.m.)

10 - - -

11
 12
 13
 14
 15
 16
 17
 18
 19
 20
 21
 22
 23
 24
 25

CERTIFICATE

I do hereby certify that the foregoing
is a true and correct transcript of the proceedings
taken by me in this matter on Thursday, April 13,
2017, and carefully compared with my original
stenographic notes.

Carolyn D. Ross,
Registered Professional
Reporter and Notary
Public in and for the
State of Ohio.

My commission expires April 3, 2019.

(CDR-83660)

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

4/19/2017 12:29:24 PM

in

Case No(s). 16-1852-EL-SSO, 16-1853-EL-AAM

Summary: Transcript In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to R.C. 4928.143, in the Form of an Electric Security Plan and In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority, hearing held on April 13, 2017. electronically filed by Mr. Ken Spencer on behalf of Armstrong & Okey, Inc. and Ross, Carolyn D.