### **BEFORE** THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

:

In the Matter of the Application of

Case No. 16-0395-EL-SSO

The Dayton Power and Light Company for

Approval of Its Electric Security Plan

Case No. 16-0396-EL-ATA

In the Matter of the Application of

The Dayton Power and Light Company for

Approval of Revised Tariffs

In the Matter of the Application of

The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority

Pursuant to Ohio Rev. Code § 4905.13

Case No. 16-0397-EL-AAM

### MOTION OF THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY TO ADOPT STIPULATION AND RECOMMENDATION AND FOR CONTINUANCE

Pursuant to Ohio Admin. Code § 4901-1-30, The Dayton Power and Light Company ("DP&L") asks the Commission to adopt the January 30, 2017 Stipulation and Recommendation ("Stipulation") submitted by DP&L, DPL Inc., seven additional Signatory Parties, and two Non-Opposing Parties. As will be shown at a hearing in support of the Stipulation, the Stipulation is the product of serious negotiations among knowledgeable parties, benefits customers and the public interest, and does not violate any important regulatory principle or practice. Office of Ohio Consumers' Counsel v. Pub. Util. Comm., 64 Ohio St.3d 123, 126, 592 N.E.2d 1370 (1992).

In addition, pursuant to Ohio Admin. Code § 4901-1-13(A), DP&L moves to continue the evidentiary hearing currently scheduled to begin on February 1, 2017. Jan. 24, 2017 Entry. DP&L requests that the Commission, instead, hold a scheduling conference on February 1, 2017 to establish a schedule. DP&L proposes that the hearing begin on February 8, 2017.

## Respectfully submitted,

# /s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey

Charles J. Faruki (0010417) (Counsel of Record) D. Jeffrey Ireland (0010443) Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892) FARUKI IRELAND & COX P.L.L. 110 North Main Street, Suite 1600 Dayton, OH 45402

Telephone: (937) 227-3705 Telecopier: (937) 227-3717 Email: cfaruki@ficlaw.com djireland@ficlaw.com

djireland@ficlaw.com jsharkey@ficlaw.com

Attorneys for The Dayton Power and Light Company

# MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF THE MOTION OF THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY TO ADOPT STIPULATION AND RECOMMENDATION AND FOR CONTINUANCE

The Commission should adopt the January 30, 2017 Stipulation and Recommendation ("Stipulation") submitted by DP&L, DPL Inc., seven additional Signatory Parties, and two signing Non-Opposing Parties. If adopted, the Stipulation – which is the result of months of lengthy negotiations among 27 parties – would allow DP&L to continue to provide safe and reliable service and maintain its financial integrity.

The ultimate issue for the Commission's review is whether the Stipulation, "which embodies considerable time and effort by the parties, is <u>reasonable and should be adopted</u>." Mar. 31, 2016 Opinion and Order, Case No. 14-1693-EL-RDR, p. 39 (emphasis added).

"In considering the reasonableness of a stipulation, the Commission has used the following criteria: (1) Is the settlement a product of serious bargaining among capable, knowledgeable parties? (2) Does the settlement, as a package, benefit ratepayers and the public interest? (3) Does the settlement package violate any important regulatory principle or practice?"

Id. Accord: Office of Ohio Consumers' Counsel v. Pub. Util. Comm., 64 Ohio St.3d 123, 126, 592 N.E.2d 1370 (1992) (endorsing that test).

At the hearing, the evidence will show that the Stipulation satisfies the Commission's three-prong test and, therefore, is reasonable and should be adopted. Moreover, as the Supreme Court of Ohio has long held, the terms of a stipulation "are properly accorded substantial weight," and its findings are "entitled to careful consideration." Akron v. Pub. Util. Comm., 55 Ohio St.2d 155, 157, 378 N.E.2d 480 (emphasis added).

The Commission also should continue the evidentiary hearing scheduled to begin on February 1, 2017. The Commission has granted prior continuances in order for the parties to engage in settlement negotiations.<sup>1</sup> At this point, any evidentiary hearing on DP&L's as-filed case not only would be unnecessary, but also would disregard the hard work and many hours spent by the parties to negotiate the Stipulation. Thus, there are good grounds for a continuance. Ohio Admin. Code § 4901-1-13(A).

Accordingly, DP&L asks that Commission to (a) schedule a hearing on the reasonableness of the Stipulation starting on February 8, 2017; and (b) convert the first day of the currently scheduled hearing (February 1, 2017) to a pre-hearing scheduling conference.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey

Charles J. Faruki (0010417) (Counsel of Record)

D. Jeffrey Ireland (0010443)

Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892)

FARUKI IRELAND & COX P.L.L.

110 North Main Street, Suite 1600

Dayton, OH 45402

Telephone: (937) 227-3705

Telecopier: (937) 227-3717 Email: cfaruki@ficlaw.com

djireland@ficlaw.com jsharkey@ficlaw.com

Attorneys for The Dayton Power and Light Company

<sup>1</sup> Jan. 10, 2017 Entry (extending the evidentiary hearing by two weeks for the parties to engage in settlement negotiations); Jan. 24 2017 Entry (extending the evidentiary hearing by one week for the same reason).

2

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that a copy of the foregoing Motion of The Dayton Power and Light

Company to Adopt Stipulation and Recommendation and for Continuance has been served via

electronic mail upon the following counsel of record, this 30th day of January, 2017:

Thomas McNamee Natalia Messenger Public Utilities Commission of Ohio 30 East Broad Street, 16th Floor Columbus, OH 43215-3793 Email:

thomas.mcnamee@ohioattorneygeneral.gov natalia.messenger@ohioattorneygeneral.gov

Attorneys for PUCO Staff

Kimberly W. Bojko
James D. Perko, Jr.
Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP
280 North High Street, Suite 1300
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: bojko@carpenterlipps.com
perko@carpenterlipps.com

Attorneys for The Ohio Manufacturers' Association Energy Group

Kevin R. Schmidt 88 East Broad Street, Suite 1770 Columbus, OH 43215 Email: schmidt@sppgrp.com

Attorney for The Energy Professionals of Ohio

Frank P. Darr (Counsel of Record)
Matthew R. Pritchard
McNees Wallace & Nurick
21 East State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: fdarr@mwncmh.com
mpritchard@mwncmh.com

Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users – Ohio

David F. Boehm Michael L. Kurtz Kurt J. Boehm Jody Kyler Cohn Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry 36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510 Cincinnati, OH 45202

Email: dboehm@BKLlawfirm.com mkurtz@BKLlawfirm.com kboehm@BKLlawfirm.com jkylercohn@BKLlawfirm.com

Attorneys for The Ohio Energy Group

Joseph Oliker (Counsel of Record) Matthew White Evan Betterton IGS Energy 6100 Emerald Parkway Dublin, OH 43016

Email: joliker@igsenergy.com mswhite@igsenergy.com Ebetterton@igsenergy.com

Attorney for IGS Energy

Jeffrey W. Mayes
Monitoring Analytics, LLC
2621 Van Buren Avenue, Suite 160
Valley Forge Corporate Center
Eagleville, PA 19403
Email: jeffrey.mayes@monitoringanalytics.com

Attorneys for Monitoring Analytics, LLC as The Independent Market Monitor for PJM

Trent Dougherty (Counsel of Record)
Miranda Leppla
Ohio Environmental Council
1145 Chesapeake Ave., Suite 1
Columbus, OH 43212-3449
Email: tdougherty@theoec.org
mleppla@theoec.org

Attorney for the Ohio Environmental Council and Environmental Defense Fund

William J. Michael (Counsel of Record)
Kevin F. Moore
Ajay Kumar
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, OH 43215-3485
Email: william michael@occ.ohio.gov

Email: william.michael@occ.ohio.gov kevin.moore@occ.ohio.gov ajay.kumar@occ.ohio.gov

Attorneys for the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

Michael D. Dortch Richard R. Parsons Kravitz, Brown & Dortch, LLC 65 East State Street, Suite 200 Columbus, OH 43215 Email: mdortch@kravitzllc.com rparsons@kravitzllc.com

Attorneys for Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC

Joel E. Sechler (Counsel of Record) Carpenter Lipps & Leland 280 N. High St., Suite 1300 Columbus, OH 43215 Email: sechler@carpenterlipps.com

Gregory J. Poulos
EnerNOC, Inc.
P.O. Box 29492
Columbus, OH 43229
Email: gpoulos@enernoc.com

Attorneys for EnerNOC, Inc.

Angela Paul Whitfield Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP 280 Plaza, Suite 1300 280 North High Street Columbus, OH 43215 Email: paul@carpenterlipps.com

Attorney for The Kroger Co.

Colleen Mooney
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
P.O. Box 1793
Findlay, OH 45839-1793
Email: cmooney@ohiopartners.org

Attorney for Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy

Madeline Fleisher
Kristin Field
Environmental Law & Policy Center
21 West Broad Street, Suite 500
Columbus, OH 43215
Email: mfleisher@elpc.org
kfield@elpc.org

Attorneys for The Environmental Law & Policy Center

Richard C. Sahli Richard C. Sahli Law Office, LLC 981 Pinewood Lane Columbus, OH 43230-3662 Email: rsahli@columbus.rr.com

Christopher M. Bzdok (pro hac vice) Olson Bzdok & Howard, P.C. 420 East Front Street Traverse City, MI 49686 chris@envlaw.com

Tony G. Mendoza, Staff Attorney (pro hac vice)
Kristin Henry, Senior Staff Attorney (pro hac vice)
Sierra Club Environmental Law Program
2101 Webster Street, 13<sup>th</sup> Floor
Oakland, CA 94612
Email: tony.mendoza@sierraclub.org
kristin.henry@sierraclub.org

Attorneys for Sierra Club

Attorneys for Dynegy Inc., PJM Power Providers Group, and Retail Energy Supply Association

wasieck@vorys.com

Michelle Grant
Dynegy Inc.
601 Travis Street, Suite 1400
Houston, TX 77002
Email: michelle.d.grant@dynegy.com

Attorneys for Dynegy Inc.

Attorneys for The City of Dayton and Honda of America Mfg., Inc.

Lisa M. Hawrot Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC Century Centre Building 1233 Main Street, Suite 4000 Wheeling, WV 26003 Email: lhawrot@spilmanlaw.com

Derrick Price Williamson Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC 1100 Bent Creek Blvd., Suite 101 Mechanicsburg, PA 17050 Email: dwilliamson@spilmanlaw.com

Carrie M. Harris Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC 310 First Street, Suite 1100 P.O. Box 90 Roanoke, VA 24002-0090 Email: charris@spilmanlaw.com

Steve W. Chriss
Senior Manager, Energy Regulatory Analysis
Greg Tillman
Senior Manager, Energy Regulatory Analysis
Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.
2001 SE 10th Street
Bentonville, AR 72716-0550
Email: Stephen.Chriss@walmart.com
Greg.Tillman@walmart.com

Attorneys for Wal-Mart Stores East, LP and Sam's East, Inc.

Glen Thomas

1060 First Avenue, Suite 400 King of Prussia, PA 19406

Email: gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

Sharon Theodore

Electric Power Supply Association 1401 New York Ave. NW 11th Floor

Washington, DC

Email: stheodore@epsa.org

Laura Chappelle

201 North Washington Square, Suite 910

Lansing, MI 48933

Email: laurac@chappelleconsulting.net

Attorneys for PJM Power Providers Group

Ellis Jacobs

Advocates for Basic Legal Equality, Inc. 130 West Second Street, Suite 700 East

Dayton, OH 45402

Email: ejacobs@ablelaw.org

Attorney for Edgemont Neighborhood Coalition

Amy B. Spiller

Jeanne W. Kingery

Elizabeth H. Watts

Duke-Energy Ohio, Inc.

139 East Fourth Street

1303-Main

Cincinnati, OH 45202

Email: amy.spiller@duke-energy.com jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com

elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com

Attorneys for Duke-Energy Ohio, Inc.

Evelyn R. Robinson 2750 Monroe Boulevard Audubon, PA 19403

Email: evelyn.robinson@pjm.com

Attorney for PJM Interconnection, L.L.C.

Richard L. Sites

Ohio Hospital Association

155 East Broad Street, 3rd Floor

Columbus, OH 43215-3620

Email: rick.sites@ohiohospitals.org

Matthew W. Warnock

Dylan F. Borchers

Bricker & Eckler LLP

100 South Third Street

Columbus, OH 43215-4291

Email: mwarnock@bricker.com

dborchers@bricker.com

Attorneys for The Ohio Hospital Association

Terrence N. O'Donnell

Raymond D. Seiler

Christine M. Pirik

William V. Vorys

Dickinson Wright PLLC

150 East Gay Street, Suite 2400

Columbus, OH 43215

Email: todollell@dickinsonwright.com

rseiler@dickinsonwright.com cpirik@dickinsonwright.com

wvorys@dickinsonwright.com

Attorneys for Mid-Atlantic Renewable Energy Coalition

Devin D. Parram
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215-4291
Email: dparram@bricker.com

Attorney for People Working Cooperatively, Inc.

Carl Tamm
President
Classic Connectors, Inc.
382 Park Avenue East
Mansfield, OH 44905
Email: crtamm@classicconnectors.com

John R. Doll
Matthew T. Crawford Doll, Jansen & Ford
111 West First Street, Suite 1100
Dayton, OH 45402-1156
Email: jdoll@djflawfirm.com
mcrawford@djflawfirm.com

Attorneys for Utility Workers of America Local 175

C. David Kelley Dana N. Whalen Adams County Prosecutor's Office 110 West Main Street West Union, OH 45693

Attorneys for Adams County, Monroe Township, Sprigg Township, Adams County Ohio Valley School District, and Manchester Local School District

/s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey
Jeffrey S. Sharkey

1146623.1

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on** 

1/30/2017 4:39:30 PM

in

Case No(s). 16-0395-EL-SSO, 16-0396-EL-ATA, 16-0397-EL-AAM

Summary: Motion Motion of The Dayton Power and Light Company to Adopt Stipulation and Recommendation and for Continuance electronically filed by Mr. Jeffrey S Sharkey on behalf of The Dayton Power and Light Company