BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

- - -

In the Matter of : Ronald J. Cummings Notice : Case No. of Apparent Violation and : 16-1219-TR-CVF Intent to Assess Forfeiture. :

- - -

PROCEEDINGS

Before Nick Walstra, Attorney Examiner, held at the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio, 180 East Broad Street, Hearing Room 11-D, Columbus, Ohio, on Tuesday, October 18, 2016, at 1:00 P.M.

- - -

Armstrong & Okey, Inc. 222 East Town Street, 2nd Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215 (614) 224-9481 - (800) 223-9481 Fax - (614) 224-5724

- - -

2

1	APPEARANCES:
2	
3	Mr. Robert Eubanks Assistant Attorney General 180 East Broad Street
4	16th Floor
5	Columbus, Ohio 43215
6	On behalf of the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio.
7	
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

Proceedings

1 INDEX TO EXHIBITS 2 3 STATE'S EXHIBITS MARKED ADT 4 1 Notice of Preliminary Determination 5 7 5 6 6 6 7 INDEX TO WITNESSES 8 DIRECT CROSS 9 STATE'S WITNESSES 10 Jonathan Frye 5 10 Jonathan Frye 5 1 12 1 13 1 1 14 1 1 1 15 1 1 16 1 1 17 1			3
3 STATE'S EXHIBITS MARKED ADT 4 1 Notice of Preliminary Determination 5 7 5 6 7 INDEX TO WITNESSES DIRECT CROSS 9 STATE'S WITNESSES 10 Jonathan Frye 5 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 21 22 23	1	INDEX TO EXHIBITS	
4 1 Notice of Preliminary Determination 5 7 5 7 6 7 7 INDEX TO WITNESSES 8 DIRECT CROSS 9 STATE'S WITNESSES 10 Jonathan Frye 5 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 12	2		
Determination 5 6 7 INDEX TO WITNESSES 8 DIRECT CROSS 9 STATE'S WITNESSES 10 Jonathan Frye 5 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	3	STATE'S EXHIBITS MARKED ADT	
5 6 7 INDEX TO WITNESSES 8 DIRECT CROSS 9 STATE'S WITNESSES 10 Jonathan Frye 5 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	4	1 Notice of Preliminary 5 7	
7 INDEX TO WITNESSES 8 DIRECT CROSS 9 STATE'S WITNESSES 10 Jonathan Frye 5 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	5		
8 DIRECT CROSS 9 STATE'S WITNESSES 10 Jonathan Frye 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	6		
9 STATE'S WITNESSES 10 Jonathan Frye 5 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	7	INDEX TO WITNESSES	
10 Jonathan Frye 5 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	8	DIRECT CROSS	
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	9	STATE'S WITNESSES	
12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	10	Jonathan Frye 5	
13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	11		
14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	12		
15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	13		
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	14		
17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	15		
18 19 20 21 22 23 24	16		
19 20 21 22 23 24	17		
20 21 22 23 24	18		
21 22 23 24	19		
22 23 24	20		
23 24	21		
24			
25			
	25		

4

1 Tuesday Afternoon, 2 October 18, 2016. 3 1:15 P.M. 4 5 ATTORNEY EXAMINER: The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio has called for 6 7 hearing at this time and place Case No. 8 16-1219-TR-CVF being in the Matter of Ronald J. 9 Cummings Notice of Apparent Violation and Intent 10 to Assess Forfeiture. 11 My name is Nick Walstra, I am the 12 Attorney Examiner assigned by the Commission to 13 hear this case. I will take the appearances of 14 the parties. 15 MR. EUBANKS: Robert Eubanks 16 representing the PUCO Staff. 17 ATTORNEY EXAMINER: I would note 18 for the record that it is 1:17 and no one else 19 is present at this time. 20 Anything else? 21 MR. EUBANKS: I would like to call 22 Jonathan Frye to the stand just to testify as to the Notice of Preliminary Determination. 23 24 ATTORNEY EXAMINER: Okay. 25 (WITNESS SWORN)

		5
1		
2	JONATHAN FRYE	
3	called as a witness, being first duly sworn,	
4	testified as follows:	
5	MR. EUBANKS: I am handing the	
6	witness what will be marked as Exhibit A.	
7	DIRECT EXAMINATION	
8	By Mr. Eubanks:	
9	Q. Will you state your name for the	
10	record?	
11	A. Jonathan Frye.	
12	Q. And what is your position with the	
13	PUCO Staff?	
14	A. I am Chief of the Compliance	
15	Division.	
16	Q. And what are your duties?	
17	A. To review the civil forfeitures that	
18	are assessed.	
19	Q. Do you have training in order to do	
20	this?	
21	A. Yes. I have gone through	
22	supervisory training, North American Out of	
23	Service training as well.	
24	Q. What did you get from that training	
25	that helps you in issuing Notices of Preliminary	

		6
1	Determination?	
2	A. It trains me in the Federal Motor	
3	Carrier Safety Administration violations. That	
4	is the North American that trained me in when a	
5	vehicle is placed out of service, who violations	
6	should be assessed against.	
7	Q. And for carriers as well?	
8	A. Yes.	
9	Q. And in this particular case did you	
10	handle the Notice of Preliminary Determination?	
11	A. Yes.	
12	Q. Could you identify the document in	
13	front of you?	
14	A. Yes. It's the Notice of Preliminary	
15	Determination letter that is sent to the	
16	Respondent when the Division is unable to reach	
17	a resolution. The letter will provide them with	
18	information on how to make payment as well as	
19	notice on how to request an administrative	
20	hearing.	
21	Q. Was that sent out to Ronald J.	
22	Cummings?	
23	A. Yes.	
24	MR. EUBANKS: Okay. I have no	
25	further questions.	

	7
1	ATTORNEY EXAMINER: Thank you. Do
2	you move your exhibit?
3	MR. EUBANKS: Yes. I would like to
4	move to have my exhibit admitted into evidence.
5	And I would also like to move to
6	request a default judgment due to the fact that
7	a Notice of Preliminary Determination was issued
8	and the Respondent didn't show up. And,
9	therefore, we are entitled to default judgment.
10	ATTORNEY EXAMINER: The Exhibit A
11	will be admitted.
12	(EXHIBIT HEREBY ADMITTED INTO
13	EVIDENCE)
14	ATTORNEY EXAMINER: And
15	the Commission will take your motion under
16	advisement.
17	Anything else?
18	MR. EUBANKS: No.
19	ATTORNEY EXAMINER: All right. We
20	are adjourned.
21	(At 1:20 P.M. the hearing was
22	concluded)
23	
24	
25	

		8
1	CERTIFICATE	
2		
3	I do hereby certify that the foregoing	
4	is a true and correct transcript of the	
5	proceedings taken by me in this matter on	
6	October 18, 2016, and carefully compared with my	
7	original stenographic notes.	
8		
9		
10		
11	Michael O. Spencer,	
12	Registered Professional	
13	Reporter.	
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

Γ

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

11/2/2016 1:47:55 PM

in

Case No(s). 16-1219-TR-CVF

Summary: Transcript in the matter of the Ronald J. Cummings hearing held on 10/18/16 electronically filed by Mr. Ken Spencer on behalf of Armstrong & Okey, Inc. and Spencer, Michael O. Mr.