

**BEFORE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of	:	
Suburban Natural Gas Company for	:	Case No. 16-1212-GA-RDR
Approval of an Adjustment to the	:	
Infrastructure Replacement Program.	:	

---

**COMMENTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS**  
SUBMITTED ON BEHALF OF THE STAFF OF  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

---

**INTRODUCTION**

Suburban Natural Gas Company (Suburban or Company) is a public utility under Sections 4905.02 and 4905.03 of the Ohio Revised Code and, as such, is subject to the jurisdiction of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (Commission). On March 19, 2008, the Commission issued an Opinion and Order in Case No. 07-689-GA-AIR authorizing Suburban to establish an infrastructure replacement program rider (IRP Rider) and set the initial rider amount at zero. The Commission subsequently approved the Company's IRP plan on September 15, 2009 in Case No. 09-573-GA-RDR and authorized estimated rates that would be trued up annually. On October 28, 2015, in Case No. 15-1048-GA-RDR, the Commission approved a Stipulation between the Company and the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission (Staff) which extended, with modifications, the IRP Rider recovery mechanism.

On August 31, 2016, Suburban filed its Application in this case to adjust its IRP Rider for costs incurred from July 1, 2015 through June 30, 2016. Suburban proposes to decrease the monthly IRP Rider rate from \$0.26 to \$0.07 and that the new rate become effective on November 1, 2016.

## **BACKGROUND**

In the Opinion and Order in Case No. 15-1048-GA-RDR, the Commission approved a Stipulation between Staff and Suburban which acknowledged that all costs related to the replacement of prone-to-fail risers had been incurred and that as of June 30, 2015, any further repair or replacement of customer service lines would not be subject to recovery through the IRP Rider. The Commission also found that there was no need to implement an accelerated bare steel main replacement program. Pursuant to this Opinion and Order, the IRP Rider is to continue the collection of the remaining balance of the 50 percent portion of the capital investment by the Company associated with the previously completed riser replacement program and replacement of leaking customer service lines, which was excluded from plant accounts and subject to accelerated recovery, including the cost of debt, and amortized over four years. It also collects the revenues associated with the expense incurred for the 50 percent portion of the capital investment, including a return at the rate approved in the 2007 Rate Case<sup>1</sup>, associated with previously completed

---

<sup>1</sup> *In the Matter of the Application of Suburban Natural Gas Company for Authority to Increase its Rates and Charges in Certain Areas of its Service Territory*, Case No. 07-689-GA-AIR (Opinion and Order at 4) (Mar. 19, 2008).

replacement of prone-to-fail risers and leaking customer service lines, which was included in the appropriate plant accounts and not eligible for accelerated recovery. Lastly, the IRP Rider is to automatically terminate on October 31, 2020.

These Comments present a summary of the Staff's investigation of Suburban's Application as well as Staff's findings and recommendations.

### **SUBURBAN'S APPLICATION**

Suburban filed its Application in this case on August 31, 2016. Suburban proposes to decrease the IRP Rider rate from \$0.26 to \$0.07 and that the new rate become effective on November 1, 2016.

Suburban filed three schedules and the testimony of its outside consultant, Nichole Clement, in support of its Application. The three schedules detail the progress and costs associated with the IRP Program. Schedule 1 provides the overall program costs and cost recovery calculation. Schedule 2 details the cost of debt calculation used in the four-year recovery of 50 percent of the Program's cost. Schedule 3 provides the rate of return calculation that is used in the calculation for recovery of the remaining fifty percent of Program costs which will be recovered over a 45-year period. In accordance with the initial development of Suburban's IRP Program, the Application does not include a provision for recovery of costs associated with taxes.

## **STAFF'S INVESTIGATION SUMMARY AND COMMENTS**

The Staff's investigation was designed to determine if Suburban's Application and exhibits justify the requested IRP revenue requirement and support the proposed annual adjustment to the IRP Rider rate.

Staff began its investigation by reviewing the documentation supporting all costs included in Suburban's Rider IRP Application. Based on its examination of such documentation, Staff identified no inappropriate costs.

Staff then reviewed Suburban's 50-50 split of costs, including the cost of debt and overall rate of return used and any tax inclusions. In the Staff's opinion, Suburban properly excluded gross receipts tax and applied the correct cost of debt and rate of return to the costs of replacing prone-to-fail risers and the repair and replacement of customer service lines. Additionally, no expenses were included for testing service lines, as these expenses are already recovered through base rates. The Staff also confirmed that Suburban properly applied the 45-year depreciation life provided for in the Commission-approved IRP program.

## **STAFF CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

After a thorough review of Suburban's Application and supporting documentation, Staff has determined that Suburban included the appropriate costs and cost estimates for recovery through its IRP Rider and that it provided reliable data to support the proposal. As a result, the Staff believes that Suburban's Application will result in a just and reason-

able IRP Rider Rate and recommends that the monthly Rate of \$0.07 per bill be permitted to go into effect on November 1, 2016 and remain in effect until October 31, 2017.

Respectfully submitted,

**Michael DeWine**  
Ohio Attorney General

**William L. Wright**  
Section Chief

/s/ Robert A. Eubanks

**Robert A. Eubanks**  
**Thomas G. Lindgren**  
Assistant Attorney General  
Public Utilities Section  
30 East Broad Street, 16<sup>th</sup> Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215-3414  
614.466.4397 (telephone)  
614.644.8764 (fax)  
[robert.eubanks@ohioattorneygeneral.gov](mailto:robert.eubanks@ohioattorneygeneral.gov)  
[thomas.lindgren@ohioattorneygeneral.gov](mailto:thomas.lindgren@ohioattorneygeneral.gov)

## **PROOF OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing **Comments and Recommendations** submitted on behalf of the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio was served via electronic mail upon applicant's counsel, Christopher Allwein ([callwein@kelgerbrown.com](mailto:callwein@kelgerbrown.com)), this 27<sup>th</sup> day of September, 2016.

/s/ Robert A. Eubanks

**Robert A. Eubanks**  
Assistant Attorney General

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**9/27/2016 9:35:02 AM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 16-1212-GA-RDR**

Summary: Comments and Recommendations submitted by Assistant Attorney General Robert Eubanks on behalf of the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio. electronically filed by Kimberly L Keeton on behalf of Public Utilities Commission of Ohio