### BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for Approval of Its Electric Security Plan.	:	Case No. 08-1094-EL-SSO
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for	:	Case No. 08-1095-EL-ATA
Approval of Revised Tariffs.	:	
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for	:	Case No. 08-1096-EL-AAM
Approval of Certain Accounting Authority Pursuant to Ohio Rev. Code §4905.13.	:	
In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company for	:	Case No. 08-1097-EL-UNC
Approval of Its Amended Corporate Separation Plan.	:	

## MOTION OF THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY TO IMPLEMENT PREVIOUSLY AUTHORIZED RATES

In view of the June 20, 2016 reversal by the Supreme Court of Ohio of this

Commission's September 4, 2013 Opinion and Order in Case No. 12-426-EL-SSO, The Dayton

Power and Light Company ("DP&L") moves to implement rates ("2013 Rates") that are

consistent with the rates that were in effect before the Commission's September 4, 2013 Opinion

and Order.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Charles J. Faruki Charles J. Faruki (0010417) (Counsel of Record) Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892) FARUKI IRELAND & COX P.L.L. 110 North Main Street, Suite 1600 Dayton, OH 45402 Telephone: (937) 227-3747 Telecopier: (937) 227-3717 Email: cfaruki@ficlaw.com jsharkey@ficlaw.com

Attorneys for The Dayton Power and Light Company

### MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF MOTION OF THE DAYTON POWER AND LIGHT COMPANY TO IMPLEMENT PREVIOUSLY AUTHORIZED RATES

The decision by the Supreme Court of Ohio in the In re Application of Dayton

Power & Light Co. case reversed in total the Commission's decision approving DP&L's ESP in

Case No. 12-426-EL-SSO, et al. In re Application of Dayton Power & Light Co., Case No.

2014-1505, Slip Op. No. 2016-Ohio-3490 (Sup. Ct. Ohio June 20, 2016), ¶ 1. That Supreme

Court decision thus reversed the Commission's decision approving all aspects of DP&L's 12-

426-EL-SSO ESP.

When the Supreme Court reverses a Commission decision:

"the statutes [of Title 49] make clear [1] that public utilities are required to charge the rates and fees stated in the schedules filed with the commission pursuant to the commission's orders; [2] that the schedule remains in effect until replaced by a further order of the commission; [3] that <u>this court's reversal and remand of an</u> <u>order of the commission does not change or replace the schedule as</u> <u>a matter of law</u>, but <u>is a mandate to the commission to issue a new</u> <u>order which replaces the reversed order</u>; and [4] that a rate schedule filed with the commission remains in effect until the commission executes this court's mandate by an appropriate order."

Cleveland Elec. Illuminating Co. v. Pub. Util. Comm., 46 Ohio St.2d 105, 116-17, 346 N.E.2d

778 (1976) (emphasis added). The Supreme Court also explained that its "task is not to set rates; it is only to assure that the rates are not unlawful and unreasonable, and that the rate-making process itself is lawfully carried out." <u>Cleveland Elec.</u>, 46 Ohio St.2d at 108.

Pursuant to Ohio Rev. Code § 4928.143(C)(2), concurrent with this filing, DP&L

has filed a motion to withdraw its application in this matter. Section 4928.143(C)(2)(b)

provides:

"(b) If the utility terminates an application pursuant to division (C)(2)(a) of this section or if the commission disapproves an application under division (C)(1) of this section, the commission shall issue such order as is necessary to continue the provisions, terms, and conditions of the utility's most recent standard service offer, along with any expected increases or decreases in fuel costs from those contained in that offer, until a subsequent offer is authorized pursuant to this section or section 4928.142 of the Revised Code, respectively." (Emphasis added.)

The Commission must therefore implement rates that are consistent with DP&L's 2013 Rates.

The Commission would be required to implement rates that are consistent with DP&L's 2013 Rates even if DP&L did not withdraw its Application in this matter. Specifically, Section 4928.141(A) states: "Only a standard service offer authorized in accordance with section <u>4928.142</u> or <u>4928.143</u> of the Revised Code, shall serve as the utility's standard service offer for the purpose of compliance with this section." Similarly, Section 4905.32 states: "No public utility shall charge, demand, exact, receive, or collect a different rate, rental, toll, or charge for any service rendered, or to be rendered, than that applicable to such service as specified in its schedule filed with the public utilities commission which is in effect at the time." As the Supreme Court of Ohio reversed in total the Commission's September 4, 2013 Opinion and Order in this case, those sections establish that the Commission must implement the immediately-prior SSO that the Commission authorized for DP&L, which was from DP&L's first ESP case. Rates that are consistent with DP&L's 2013 Rates therefore must be put back into effect until Commission approval of a new SSO.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Charles J. Faruki Charles J. Faruki (0010417) (Counsel of Record) Jeffrey S. Sharkey (0067892) FARUKI IRELAND & COX P.L.L. 110 North Main Street, Suite 1600 Dayton, OH 45402 Telephone: (937) 227-3747 Telecopier: (937) 227-3717 Email: cfaruki@ficlaw.com jsharkey@ficlaw.com

Attorneys for The Dayton Power and Light Company

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that a copy of the foregoing Motion of The Dayton Power and Light

Company to Implement Previously Authorized Rates has been served via electronic mail or U.S.

Regular Mail upon the following counsel of record, this 27th day of July, 2016:

Samuel C. Randazzo, Esq. Joseph E. Oliker, Esq. MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC 21 East State Street, 17th Floor Columbus, OH 43215-4228 same@mwncmh.com joliker@mwncmh.com

Attorneys for Industrial Energy Users-Ohio

Michael E. Idzkowski, Esq. OFFICE OF OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL 10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800 Columbus, OH 43215 idzkowski@occ.state.oh.us

David C. Rinebolt, Esq. OHIO PARTNERS FOR AFFORDABLE ENERGY 231 West Lima Street P.O. Box 1793 Findlay, OH 45839-1793 drinebolt@aol.com

Henry Eckhart, Esq. 50 West Broad Street, Suite 2117 Columbus, OH 43215-3301 henryeckhart@aol.com

Robert Ukeiley, Esq. LAW OFFICE OF ROBERT UKEILEY 435R Chestnut Street, Suite 1 Berea, KY 40403

Attorneys for Sierra Club Ohio Chapter

John W. Bentine, Esq. Mark S. Yurick, Esq. CHESTER WILLCOX & SAXBE LLP 65 East State Street, Suite 1000 Columbus, OH 43215 jbentine@cwslaw.com myurick@cwslaw.com

Attorneys for The Kroger Company

David Boehm, Esq. Michael L. Kurtz, Esq. BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY 36 East Seventh Street Suite 1510 Cincinnati, OH 45202-4454 dboehm@BLKlawfirm.com mkurtz@BLKlawfirm.com

Attorney for Ohio Energy Group, Inc. M. Howard Petricoff, Esq. Stephen M. Howard, Esq. VORYS, SATER, SEYMOUR AND PEASE LLP 52 East Gay Street P.O. Box 1008 Columbus, OH 43216-1008 mhpetricoff@vssp.com smhoward@vssp.com

Attorneys for Honda of America Mfg., Inc.

David I. Fein, Esq. Cynthia A. Fonner Brady, Esq. CONSTELLATION ENERGY GROUP INC. 550 West Washington Blvd., Suite 300 Chicago, IL 60661 david.fein@constellation.com cynthia.brady@constellation.com Richard L. Sites, Esq. General Counsel and Senior Director of Health Policy Ohio Hospital Association 155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor Columbus, OH 43215-3620 ricks@ohanet.org

Craig I. Smith, Esq. Attorney at Law 15700 Van Aken Blvd. Suite 26 Cleveland, OH 44120 wis29@yahoo.com

Attorney for Cargill, Incorporated

Thomas J. O'Brien, Esq. BRICKER & ECKLER LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 43215-4291 tobrien@bricker.com

Attorney for The Ohio Manufacturers' Association

Gary A. Jeffries, Esq. Dominion Resources Services, Inc. 501 Martindale Street, Suite 400 Pittsburgh, PA 15212-5817 Gary.A.Jeffries@dom.com

Barth E. Royer, Esq. BELL & ROYER CO., LPA 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, OH 43215-3927 BarthRoyer@aol.com

Todd Williams, Esq. 4534 Douglas Road Toledo, OH 43613 Williams.toddm@gmail.com Tasha Hamilton Manager, Energy Policy CONSTELLATION ENERGY GROUP, INC. 111 Market Place, Suite 600 Baltimore, MD 21202 tasha.hamilton@constellation.com

Larry Gearhardt, Esq. Chief Legal Counsel OHIO FARM BUREAU FEDERATION 280 North High Street P.O. Box 182383 Columbus, OH 43218-2383 lgearhardt@ofbf.org

Attorney for The Ohio Farm Bureau Federation

Attorneys for Dominion Retail, Inc. Christopher L. Miller, Esq. Gregory H. Dunn, Esq. Nell B. Chambers, Esq. SCHOTTENSTEIN ZOX & DUNN CO., LPA 250 West Street Columbus, OH 43215 cmiller@szd.com gdunn@szd.com aporter@szd.com

Attorneys for The City of Dayton

Ellis Jacobs Advocates for Basic Legal Equality, Inc. 333 West First Street, Suite 500B Dayton, OH 45402 ejacobs@ablelaw.org

Attorney for The Edgemont Neighborhood Coalition

Trent A. Dougherty, Esq. Nolan Moser, Esq. Air & Energy Program Manager The Ohio Environmental Council 1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201 Columbus, OH 43212-3449 nmoser@theOEC.org Trent@theOEC.org Thomas Lindgren, Esq. Thomas McNamee, Esq. Assistant Attorney General Public Utilities Section 180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor Columbus, OH 43215 Thomas.Lindgren@puc.state.oh.us Thomas.McNamee@puc.state.oh.us

Office of the Ohio Attorney General

Ned Ford 539 Plattner Trail Beavercreek, OH 45430

Evan Eschmeyer, Esq. Environmental Law Fellow Environmental Law & Policy Center 1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201 Columbus, OH 43212-3449

Attorneys for The Ohio Environmental Council

<u>/s/ Jeffrey S. Sharkey</u> Jeffrey S. Sharkey

1069686.1

# This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

7/27/2016 5:16:32 PM

in

## Case No(s). 08-1094-EL-SSO, 08-1096-EL-AAM, 08-1097-EL-UNC, 08-1095-EL-ATA

Summary: Motion Motion of The Dayton Power and Light Company to Implement Previously Authorized Rates electronically filed by Mr. Charles J. Faruki on behalf of The Dayton Power and Light Company