BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY

ATTORNEYS AT LAW 36 EAST SEVENTH STREET SUITE 1510 CINCINNATI, OHIO 45202 TELEPHONE (513) 421-2255

TELECOPIER (513) 421-2764

Via E-FILE

July 15, 2016

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio PUCO Docketing 180 E. Broad Street, 10th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215

In re: <u>Case No. 14-1297-EL-SSO</u>

Dear Sir/Madam:

Please find attached the REBUTTAL TESTIMONY OF STEPHEN J. BARON on behalf of the OHIO ENERGY GROUP e-filed today in the above-referenced matters.

Copies have been served on all parties on the attached certificate of service. Please place this document of file.

Respectfully yours,

Michael L. Kutz, Esq. Kurt J. Boehm, Esq.

Jody Kyler Cohn, Esq.

BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY

MLKkew Encl.

Cc: Certificate of Service

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In The Matter Of The Application Of The : Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland :

Electric Illuminating Company, and The: Toledo Edison Company For Authority To:

Establish A Standard Service Offer:

Pursuant To R.C. § 4928.143 In The Form :

Of An Electric Security Plan.

Case No. 14-1297-EL-SSO

REBUTTAL TESTIMONY

OF

STEPHEN J. BARON

ON BEHALF OF

THE OHIO ENERGY GROUP

J. KENNEDY AND ASSOCIATES, INC. ROSWELL, GEORGIA

| 1 | | I. QUALIFICATIONS AND SUMMARY |
|-----|----|--|
| 2 | Q. | Please state your name and business address. |
| 3 | A. | My name is Stephen J. Baron. My business address is J. Kennedy and Associates, |
| 4 | | Inc. ("Kennedy and Associates"), 570 Colonial Park Drive, Suite 305, Roswell, |
| 5 | | Georgia 30075. |
| 6 | | |
| 7 | Q. | Have you previously submitted testimony in this proceeding? |
| 8 | A. | Yes. I submitted Supplemental Testimony on March 2, 2015 and Rehearing |
| 9 | | Testimony on June 22, 2016. |
| 10 | | |
| 11, | Q. | What is the purpose of your rebuttal testimony? |
| 12 | A. | I discuss the Distribution Modernization Rider ("DMR") proposed by Staff and |
| 13 | | recommend how the DMR costs should be allocated to and recovered from retail |
| 14 | | customers if approved. While Staff noted that the DMR costs would be allocated to |
| 15 | | retail customers, Staff did not provide a specific recommendation regarding the cost |
| 16 | | allocation methodology or rate design that should be used. |
| 17 | | |
| 18 | Q. | Please provide your understanding of Staff's proposed Distribution |
| 19 | | Modernization Rider. |
| 20 | A. | The proposed DMR is intended to assist The Cleveland Electric Illuminating |
| 21 | | Company, Ohio Edison Company, and The Toledo Edison Company (collectively, |
| 22 | | "the Companies") in receiving more favorable terms when accessing the capital |
| 23 | | market, which Staff believes will enable the Companies to procure funds to |
| | | |

jumpstart their distribution and grid modernization initiatives. Staff recommends

24

that FirstEnergy Corp. ("FE") keep its corporate headquarters and nexus of operations in Akron, Ohio for the term of the Companies' current Electric Security Plan or that the proposed DMR be subject to refund, which also gives the DMR an economic development component. Staff calculates that the Companies' proportionate share of FE's operating revenue necessitates an average annual DMR charge to customers of \$131 million.

Q. What is your position on Staff's proposed Distribution Modernization Rider?

A. I take no position with respect to whether the Commission should approve or disapprove the proposed DMR. If the DMR is ultimately approved, however, the Commission should require the Companies to allocate the DMR costs in a manner consistent with cost causation principles and Ohio's policy of encouraging economic development.

Q. How do you recommend that the proposed Distribution Modernization Rider be allocated?

A. The most appropriate cost allocation for the proposed DMR would be an allocation based entirely upon distribution revenues. As its nomenclature suggests, the DMR is primarily a distribution-related rider since the revenues received by the Companies under that Rider are intended to incentivize increased investment in distribution modernization. Additionally, the Ohio Revised Code provision that Staff cites as legal authority for the proposed DMR is specifically related to distribution service.

That said, I recommend that the Commission take a somewhat different approach with respect to the proposed DMR cost allocation due to the unique nature of that Rider. Because the DMR is also intended to incentivize FE to remain headquartered in Ohio, there is an economic development component to the rider. Given that the rider has both distribution and economic development components, I recommend that the Commission take a hybrid approach to allocating proposed DMR costs. Under that approach, the Companies should allocate DMR costs to rate schedules 50 percent on the basis of distribution revenues and 50 percent on the basis of demand (4 Coincident Peak).

A.

Q. Should any of the proposed Distribution Modernization Rider costs be allocated on the basis of energy?

No. There is no nexus between the proposed DMR costs and the volume of energy used by a given customer. Recovery of any DMR costs on the basis of energy therefore would be inconsistent with principles of cost causation. Allocating the proposed DMR costs on the basis of energy would also harm economic development in Ohio, contrary to one of the primary goals of establishing the proposed DMR. Adopting an energy-based allocation for the DMR would force large energy-intensive customers, who must compete both nationally and internationally and who would derive little benefit from additional distribution infrastructure modernization, to pay a disproportionate amount of DMR costs. This outcome would be inconsistent with Ohio's policy of bolstering the State's effectiveness in the global economy.

| 1 | Q. | What is your recommendation with respect to the rate design of the proposed |
|---|----|---|
| 2 | | Distribution Modernization Rider? |
| 3 | A. | After the 50/50 cost allocation I recommend takes place, the Companies should |
| 4 | | collect the allocated DMR costs using a kWh charge calculated separately for each |
| 5 | | rate schedule for each Company. |
| 6 | | |
| 7 | O. | Does that complete your testimony? |

Yes.

A.

8

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

In accordance with Rule 4901-1-05, Ohio Administrative Code, the PUCO's e-filing system will electronically serve notice of the filing of this document on the parties referenced on the service list of the docket card who have electronically subscribed to this case. In addition, the undersigned certifies that a courtesy copy of the foregoing document is also being served (via electronic mail) on the 15th day of July, 2016 to the following:

Michael L. Kurtz, Esq. Kurt J. Boehm, Esq. Jody Kyler Cohn, Esq.

James W. Burk, Counsel of Record Carrie M. Dunn FIRSTENERGY SERVICE COMPANY 76 South Main Street Akron, Ohio 44308 burkj@firstenergycorp.com cdunn@firstenergycorp.com

James F. Lang
N. Trevor Alexander
CALFEE, HALTER & GRISWOLD LLP
The Calfee Building, 1405 East Sixth Street
Cleveland, Ohio 44114
jlang@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com

David A. Kutik JONES DAY 901 Lakeside Avenue Cleveland, Ohio 44114 dakutik@jonesday.com

COUNSEL FOR OHIO EDISON COMPANY, THE CLEVELAND ELECTRIC ILLUMINATING COMPANY THE TOLEDO EDISON COMPANY

Steven T. Nourse
Matthew J. Satterwhite
Yazen Alami
American Electric Power Service Corporation
1 Riverside Plaza 29th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
stnourse@aep.com
mjsatterwhite@aep.com
yalami@aep.com

COUNSEL FOR OHIO POWER COMPANY

Bruce J. Weston
Ohio Consumers' Counsel
Larry S. Sauer, Counsel of Record
Michael Schuler
Kevin F. Moore, Assistant Consumers' Counsel
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street – Suite 1800
Columbus, Ohio 43215
Larry.sauer@occ.ohio.gov
Michael.schuler@occ.ohio.gov
Kevin.moore@occ.ohio.gov

COUNSEL FOR THE OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL

Christopher J. Allwein, Counsel of Record Nolan M. Moser Williams Allwein and Moser, LLC 1500 West Third Ave., Suite 330 Columbus, Ohio 43212 callwein@wamenergylaw.com nmoser@wamenergylaw.com

Michael Soules Earthjustice 1625 Massachusetts Ave. NW #702 Washington, DC 20036 msoules@earthjustice.org

Shannon Fisk Earthjustice 1617 John F. Kennedy Blvd., #1675 Philadelphia, PA 19103 sfisk@earthjustice.org

Tony G. Mendoza Sierra Club Environmental Law Program 85 Second Street, Second Floor San Francisco, CA 94105-3459 Tony.mendoza@sierraclub.org

COUNSEL FOR THE SIERRA CLUB

Barth E. Royer Bell & Royer Co., LPA 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, Ohio 43215-3927 barthroyer@aol.com

Adrian Thompson Taft Stettinius & Hollister LLP 200 Public Square, Suite 3500 Cleveland, Ohio 44114 athompson@taftlaw.com

COUNSEL FOR CLEVELAND MUNICIPAL SCHOOL DISTRICT

Joseph M. Clark, Counsel of Record Direct Energy 21 East State Street, 19th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215 Joseph.clark@directenergy.com

Gerit F. Hall Eckert Seamans Cherin & Mellott, LLC 1717 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W., 12th Fl. Washington, D.C. 20006 ghull@eckertseamans.com

COUNSEL FOR DIRECT ENERGY SERVICES, LLC, DIRECT ENERGY BUSINESS, LLC AND DIRECT ENERGY BUSINESS MARKETING, LLC

Colleen L. Mooney, Counsel of Record Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy 231 West Lima Street Findlay, Ohio 45839-1793 cmooney@ohiopartners.org

COUNSEL FOR OHIO PARTNERS FOR AFFORDABLE ENERGY

Joseph E. Oliker, Counsel of Record IGS Energy 6100 Emerald Parkway Dublin, Ohio 43016 joliker@igsenergy.com

COUNSEL FOR IGS ENERGY

Mark S. Yurick
Devin D. Parram
Taft Stettinius & Hollister LLP
65 East State Street, Suite 1000
Columbus, Ohio 43215
myurick@taftlaw.com
dparram@taftlaw.com

COUNSEL FOR THE KROGER CO.

Richard L. Sites Ohio Hospital Association 155 East Broad Street, 15th Columbus, Ohio 43215 ricks@ohanet.org

Thomas J. O'Brien Bricker & Eckler 100 South Third Street Columbus, Ohio 43215 tobrien@bricker.com

COUNSEL FOR OHIO HOSPITAL ASSOCIATION

Marilyn L. Widman Widman & Franklin, LLC 405 Madison Ave., Suite 1550 Toledo, Ohio 43604 Marilyn@wflawfirm.com

COUNSEL FOR IBEW LOCAL 245

Michael K. Lavanga
Garrett A. Stone
Owen J. Kopon
Brickfield, Burchette, Ritts & Stone, P.C.
1025 Thomas Jefferson Street, N.W.
8th Floor, West Tower
Washington, D.C. 20007
mkl@bbrslaw.com
gas@bbrslaw.com
ojk@bbrslaw.com

COUNSEL FOR NUCOR STEEL MARION, INC.

Barbara A. Langhenry
Harold A. Madorsky
Kate E. Ryan
City of Cleveland
601 Lakeside Avenue – Room 106
Cleveland, Ohio 44114
blanghenry@city.cleveland.oh.us
hmadorsky@city.cleveland.oh.us
kryan@city.cleveland.oh.us

COUNSEL FOR THE CITY OF CLEVELAND

Kimberly W. Bojko Jonathon A. Allison Rebecca Hussey Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP 280 Plaza, Suite 1300 280 North High Street Columbus, Ohio 43215 Bojko@carpenterlipps.com allison@carpenterlipps.com hussey@carpenterlipps.com

COUNSEL FOR OMAEG

Lisa M. Hawrot Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC Century Centre Building 1233 Main Street, Suite 4000 Wheeling, West Virginia 26003 lhawrot@spilmanlaw.com

Derrick Price Williamson Spilman Thomas & Battle, PLLC 1100 Bent Creek Blvd., Suite 101 Mechanicsburg, Pennsylvania 17050 dwilliamson@spilmanlaw.com

COUNSEL FOR WAL-MART STORES EAST, LP AND SAM'S EAST, INC.

Joseph P. Meissner, Esq. 1223 W. 6th Street – 4th Floor Cleveland, Ohio 44113 meissnerjoseph@yahoo.com

COUNSEL FOR CITIZENS COALITION, CONSUMER PROTECTION ASSOCIATION, CLEVELAND HOUSING NETWORK, AND THE COUNCIL FOR ECONOMIC OPPORTUNITIES IN GREATER CLEVELAND

Thomas R. Hays 8355 Island Lane Maineville, Ohio 45039 trhayslaw@gmail.com

COUNSEL FOR LUCAS COUNTY

Leslie Kovacik Counsel for the City of Toledo 420 Madison Avenue Toledo, Ohio 43604 lesliekovacik@toledo.oh.gov

COUNSEL FOR THE CITY OF TOLEDO

Glenn S. Krassen, Counsel of Record Bricker & Eckler LLP 1001 Lakeside Ave., Suite 1350 Cleveland, Ohio 44114 gkrassen@bricker.com

Dane Stinson
Dylan Borchers
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
dstinson@bricker.com
dborchers@bricker.com

COUNSEL FOR NORTHEAST OHIO PUBLIC ENERGY COUNCIL; OHIO SCHOOLS COUNCIL; AND, POWER4SCHOOLS

Michael D. Dortch Richard R. Parsons Kravitz, Brown & Dortch, LLC 65 East State Street – Suite 200 Columbus, Ohio 43215 mdortch@kravitzllc.com rparsons@kravitzllc.com

COUNSEL FOR DYNEGY INC.

Matthew R. Cox Matthew Cox Law, Ltd. 88 East Broad Street, Suite 1560 Columbus, Ohio 43215 matt@matthewcoxlaw.com

COUNSEL FOR THE COUNCIL OF SMALLER ENTERPRISES

Trent Dougherty, Counsel of Record Madeline Fleisher 1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201 Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449 tdougherty@theOEC.org mfleisher@elpc.org

John Finnigan 128 Winding Brook Lane Terrace Park, Ohio 45174 jfinnigan@edf.org

COUNSEL FOR THE OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL AND ENVIRONMENTAL DEFENSE FUND

M. Howard Petricoff
Michael J. Settineri
Gretchen L. Petrucci
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 East Gay Street
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008
mhpetricoff@vorys.com
mjsettineri@vorys.com
glpetrucci@vorys.com

COUNSEL FOR EXELON GENERATION COMPANY, LLC AND CONSTELLATION NEWENERGY, INC.; PJM POWER PROVIDERS GROUP; THE ELECTRIC POWER SUPPLY ASSOCIATION; AND, RETAIL ENERGY SUPPLY ASSOCIATION

Cynthia Brady
Exelon Business Services
4300 Winfield Rd.
Warrenville, Illinois 60555
Cynthia.brady@exeloncorp.com

David I. Fein
Exelon Corporation
10 South Dearborn Street – 47th Fl.
Chicago, Illinois 60603
David.fein@exeloncorp.com

Lael E. Campbell
Constellation NewEnergy, Inc. and Exelon Corporation
101 Constitution Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20001
Lael.campbell@exeloncorp.com

ON BEHALF OF EXELON GENERATION COMPANY, LLC AND CONSTELLATION NEWENERGY, INC.

Glen Thomas 1060 First Avenue, Suite 400 King of Prussia, Pennsylvania 19406 gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

Laura Chappelle 201 North Washington Square - #910 Lansing, Michigan 48933 laurac@chappeleconsulting.net

ON BEHALF OF PJM POWER PROVIDERS GROUP

Andrew J. Sonderman Kegler Brown Hill and Ritter LPA 65 East State Street – 1800 Columbus, Ohio 43215 asonderman@keglerbrown.com

COUNSEL FOR HARDIN WIND LLC, CHAMPAIGN WIND LLC AND BUCKEYE WIND LLC

Todd M. Williams Williams Allwein & Moser, LLC Two Maritime Plaza, 3rd Fl Toledo, Ohio 43604 toddm@wamenergylaw.com

Jeffrey W. Mayes Monitoring Analytics, LLC 2621 Van Buren Avenue, Suite 160 Valley Forge Corporate Center Eagleville, Pennsylvania 19403 Jeffrey.mayes@monitoringanalytics.com

COUNSEL FOR INDEPENDENT MARKET MONITOR FOR PJM

Sharon Theodore Electric Power Supply Association 1401 New York Ave. NW 11th fl. Washington, DC 20001 stheodore@epsa.org

ON BEHALF OF THE ELECTRIC POWER SUPPLY ASSOCIATION

F. Mitchell Dutton
NextEra Energy Power Marketing, LLC
700 Universe Blvd.
Juno Beach, Florida 33408-2657
Mitch.dutton@fpl.com

COUNSEL FOR NEXTERA ENERGY POWER MARKETING, LLC

Andrew J. Sonderman Kegler Brown Hill and Ritter LPA 65 East State Street – 1800 Columbus, Ohio 43215 asonderman@keglerbrown.com

COUNSEL FOR HARDIN WIND LLC, CHAMPAIGN WIND LLC AND BUCKEYE WIND LLC

Kevin R. Schmidt Energy Professionals of Ohio 88 East Broad Street, Suite 1770 Columbus, Ohio 43215 Schmidt@sppgrp.com

COUNSEL FOR THE ENERGY PROFESSIONALS OF OHIO

C. Todd Jones
Christopher L. Miller
Gregory H. Dunn
Jeremy M. Grayem
Ice Miller LLP
250 West Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
Christopher.miller@icemiller.com
Gregory.dunn@icemiller.com
Jeremy.grayem@icemiller.com

COUNSEL FOR THE ASSOCIATION OF INDEPENDENT COLLEGES AND UNIVERSITIES OF OHIO

Craig I. Smith
Material Sciences Corporation
15700 Van Aken Blvd. – Suite 26
Shaker Heights, Ohio 44120
wttpmlc@aol.com

COUNSEL FOR MATERIAL SCIENCES CORPORATION

Joel E. Sechler Carpenter Lipps & Leland 280 N. High Street, Suite 1300 Columbus, Ohio 43215 sechler@carpenterlipps.com

Gregory J. Poulos EnerNOC, Inc. 471 E. Broad Street – Suite 1520 Columbus, Ohio 43054 gpoulos@enernoc.com

COUNSEL FOR ENERNOC, INC.

Cheri B. Cunningham
Director of Law
161 South High Street, Suite 202
Akron, OH 44308
CCunningham@Akronohio.gov

COUNSEL FOR THE CITY OF AKRON

Thomas McNamee
Thomas Lindgren
Ryan O'Rourke
Attorney General's Office
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 E. Broad Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
thomas.mcnamee@ohioattorneygeneral.com
thomas.lindgren@ohioattorneygeneral.com
ryan.o'rourke@ohioattorneygeneral.com

COUNSEL FOR THE STAFF OF THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

Samuel C. Randazzo
Frank P. Darr (Reg. No. 0025469)
Matthew R. Pritchard (Reg. No. 0088070)
MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC
21 East State Street, 17TH Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
sam@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
mpritchard@mwncmh.com

COUNSEL FOR INDUSTRIAL ENERGY USERSOHIO

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

7/15/2016 3:57:20 PM

in

Case No(s). 14-1297-EL-SSO

Summary: Testimony Ohio Energy Group (OEG) Rebuttal Testimony of Stephen J. Baron electronically filed by Mr. Michael L. Kurtz on behalf of Ohio Energy Group