

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Noble Americas)	
Energy Solutions, LLC 2015 Renewable)	Case No. 16-0785-EL-ACP
Portfolio Standard Status Report)	

Staff Findings and Recommendations

I. Statutory Background

Amended Substitute Senate Bill 221, of the 127th General Assembly (2008 Ohio Laws S221, effective July 31, 2008), established Ohio's renewable portfolio standard (RPS) applicable to electric distribution utilities and electric service companies. The RPS is addressed principally in Ohio Revised Code (R.C.) 4928.64, with relevant resource definitions also contained within R.C. 4928.01(A).

According to R.C. 4928.64(B)(2), the compliance obligations for **2015** are as follows:

- Renewable Energy Resources = **2.50%** (includes solar requirement)
- Solar Energy Resources = **0.12%**

The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (PUCO or Commission) further developed rules to implement the Ohio RPS, contained within Ohio Administrative Code (Ohio Adm.Code) 4901:1-40.

Ohio Adm.Code 4901:1-40-05(A), states:

Unless otherwise ordered by the commission, each electric utility and electric services company shall file by April fifteenth of each year, on such forms as may be published by the commission, an annual alternative energy portfolio status report analyzing all activities undertaken in the previous calendar year to demonstrate how the applicable alternative energy portfolio benchmarks and planning requirements have or will be met. Staff shall conduct annual compliance reviews with regard to the benchmarks under the alternative energy portfolio standard.

Ohio Adm.Code 4901:1-40-05(C), states:

Staff shall review each electric utility's or electric services company's alternative energy portfolio status report and any timely filed comments, and file its findings and recommendations and any proposed modifications thereto.

The findings and recommendations in this document pertain to the company's compliance status. This document does not address such matters as cost recovery or status relative to the statutory 3% cost provision.

II. Company Filing Summarized

Noble Americas Energy Solutions, LLC (Noble or Company) filed its RPS compliance status report for the 2015 compliance year on April 13, 2016. In its compliance filing, Noble proposed a baseline of 4,131,016 megawatt-hours (MWHs) which it asserted was its actual sales for 2015. Applying the statutory benchmarks to its proposed baseline, Noble calculated its 2015 compliance obligations to be as follows:

- 4,957 Solar MWHs
- 98,318 Non-Solar MWHs

The Company indicated that it had obtained the necessary renewable energy credits (RECs) and solar RECs (S-RECs), when combined with the application of previous over-compliance, to satisfy its 2015 compliance obligations.¹ The Company further indicated that it had transferred the necessary RECs and S-RECs to its PJM EIS Generation Attributes Tracking System (GATS) reserve subaccount for Ohio compliance purposes.

III. Filed Comments

No persons filed comments in this proceeding.

IV. Staff Findings

Following its review of the annual status report and any timely comments submitted in this proceeding, Staff makes the following findings:

- (1) Noble is an electric services company in Ohio with retail electric sales in the state of Ohio during 2015, and therefore the Company had an RPS obligation for 2015.²

¹ The Company indicated that it was applying 15 RECs and 1 S-REC resulting from over-compliance in previous compliance years, as directed in case no. 15-0711-EL-ACP.

² Noble Americas was certified to provide power marketer services in Ohio during 2015; see PUCO Case No. 00-2457-EL-CRS

- (2) The baseline proposed by Noble is reasonable, and given the proposed baseline and the 2015 statutory benchmarks, Noble accurately calculated its RPS compliance obligations. By applying its over-compliance from previous compliance years consistent with the direction provided in case no. 15-0711-EL-ACP, the Company's 2015 compliance obligations are reduced to 98,303 RECs and 4,956 S-RECs.
- (3) The Company has transferred 98,303 RECs and 4,956 S-RECs to its GATS reserve subaccount for 2015 Ohio compliance purposes.
- (4) Following a review of the Company's reserve subaccount data on GATS, Staff confirmed that the Company satisfied its non-solar³ obligation for 2015. The RECs that the Company transferred to its GATS reserve subaccount were sourced from generating facilities certified by the Commission and were appropriately associated with electricity generated between August 1, 2008, and December 31, 2015.
- (5) Following a review of the Company's reserve subaccount data on GATS, Staff confirmed that the Company satisfied its solar obligation for 2015. The S-RECs that the Company transferred to its GATS reserve subaccount were sourced from solar generating facilities certified by the Commission and were appropriately associated with electricity generated between August 1, 2008, and December 31, 2015.

V. Staff Recommendations

Following its review of the information submitted in this proceeding and other relevant data, Staff recommends the following:

- (1) Noble is found to have satisfied its 2015 RPS compliance obligations.
- (2) For future compliance years in which the Company is utilizing GATS to demonstrate its Ohio compliance efforts, the Company initiates the transfer of the appropriate RECs and S-RECs to its GATS reserve subaccount between March 1st and April 15th so as to precede the filing of their Ohio annual compliance status report with the Commission.

³ Staff uses "non-solar" in this context to refer to the total renewable requirement net of the specific solar carve-out. Staff acknowledges that there is not a specific "non-solar" requirement in the applicable statute.

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

7/15/2016 9:01:21 AM

in

Case No(s). 16-0785-EL-ACP

Summary: Staff Review and Recommendation electronically filed by Mr. Stuart M Siegfried on behalf of PUCO Staff