FILE

Hunter, Donielle

(26)

From:

Patricia J Uyek <user@votervoice.net>

Sent:

Tuesday, February 23, 2016 7:46 AM

To: Subject: Johnson, Thomas Governor Kisch

Dear Commissioner Johnson,

New, clean, natural gas plants are providing alternatives to old, inefficient plants that AEP and FirstEnergy want consumers to subsidize with rate increases. The utility companies have threatened plant shut-downs and warned that consumers and businesses will no longer have a reliable power supply, if they don't get handouts paid for by consumers. But Ohio's power grid operator and multiple experts have said that Ohio has plenty of power generation for the future.

Don't fall for utility scare tactics! Please Tell the PUCO to say "no" to the utility handouts and "yes" to cheaper natural gas to fuel Ohio's future.

PUCO Case #s: 14-1297-EL-SSO; 14-1693; 14-1694

Sincerely,

Patricia J. Uyek 460 Allen Dr Kent, OH 44240 Patriciajuyek@aol.com 16 FEB 24 PM 2

).).

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business.

Technician Date Processed FER 2 4 2016

From:

David McKean <fightthehike@fotomotive.com>

Sent:

Monday, February 22, 2016 5:10 PM

To:

Johnson, Thomas

Subject:

Please use some common sense and ignore the utility companies' scare tactics!

Dear Commissioner Johnson,

New, clean, natural gas plants are providing alternatives to old, inefficient plants that AEP and FirstEnergy want consumers to subsidize with rate increases. The utility companies have threatened plant shut-downs and warned that consumers and businesses will no longer have a reliable power supply, if they don't get handouts paid for by consumers. But Ohio's power grid operator and multiple experts have said that Ohio has plenty of power generation for the future.

Don't fall for utility scare tactics! Please Tell the PUCO to say "no" to the utility handouts and "yes" to cheaper natural gas to fuel Ohio's future.

PUCO Case #s: 14-1297-EL-SSO; 14-1693; 14-1694

Sincerely,

David McKean 288 E Tulane Rd Columbus, OH 43202



Robert J. Wells Senior Vice President Corporate Communications and Public Affairs Phone: 216-566-2244 Fax: 216-566-2947 E-mail: rjwells@sherwin.com

February 22, 2016

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio 180 East Broad St. Columbus, OH 43215

RE: Opposition Comment to PPA Cases 14-1693-EL-RDR; 14-1297-EL-SSO

Dear PUCO:

I am writing to urge you to act to reject the negotiated settlements of FirstEnergy and AEP (and a small group of others who have negotiated certain benefits) that will enable the utilities to implement costly Power Purchase Agreement (PPA) riders and other cost-driving provisions.

Should the PUCO approve the deals, both utilities will be able to collect costs (via non-bypassable PPA riders) from all of their customers to subsidize their uneconomical generation assets, thus protecting the utilities from cost risk and guaranteeing their profits and cost recovery. And put it all on the backs of their customers for an eight-year term.

Ohio's Consumers' Counsel has estimated that the FirstEnergy settlement could cost consumers \$3.9 billion over the eight-year duration of the PPA, and the AEP settlement could cost consumers \$2 billion.

Our company consumes approximately 16,381,149 kWh/year with AEP and 50,223,474 kWh/year with FirstEnergy. We estimate the additional costs of this new rider to be \$734,301 with AEP and \$2,504,645 with FirstEnergy over the eight year term of the case. That is real money that could be used on more productive purposes. For example, it would fund the opening of 10 new Sherwin-Williams paint stores in Ohio, which translates to about 60 new jobs.

If approved by the full PUCO, these deals will put an unnecessary and anti-competitive layer of costs on consumers with no commensurate benefits, constrain competition, and dampen technological innovation in Ohio. In addition, both settlements contain other provisions that will increase costs to consumers.



Public Utilities Commission of Ohio February 22, 2016 Page 2

The markets for electricity in Ohio are working to the benefit of consumers. These deals are a massive setback to the consumer-friendly efficiency of those markets.

Please protect Ohio manufacturers and all consumers in FirstEnergy and AEP territories, the lion's share of the state in terms of utilities, from this substantial bailout/giveaway.

Sincerely

Robert J. Wells

RJW/klj

CC:

Governor John Kasich Representative Marcia Fudge

Senator Sherrod Brown

From:

Slaby, Lynn

Sent:

Monday, August 24, 2015 4:12 PM

To:

Ramsey, Nedra

Subject:

Fwd: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Nedra,

I am forwarding you a couple more e-mails.
I am trying to get IT to have these go direct to you.

Commissioner Slaby

Begin forwarded message:

From: christine bruce < OEC@theOEC.org >

Subject: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Date: August 24, 2015 at 1:58:44 PM EDT **To:** Lynn Slaby lynn.slaby@puc.state.oh.us>

Reply-To: christine bruce < christybspinall@yahoo.com

Aug 24, 2015

Commissioner Lynn Slaby

Dear Commissioner Slaby,

I urge you to reject First Energy's proposal to keep several old, dirty and uncompetitive power plants open. Their plan will not only burden customers with increased electric bills, but the plan is anti-competitive and will harm human health. Ratepayers should not have to pay for these old power plants just because these plants cannot compete with newer technologies like wind or solar power.

These coal power plants are pumping out thousands of tons of soot, carbon and mercury pollution every day, harming me and many other Ohioans in the process. Newer technologies like wind and solar do not cause the kind of damage these old power plants will.

Please do not approve FirstEnergy's plan to bail out First Energy's old, dirty power plants. Supporting FirstEnergy's plan will hurt Ohio in its path to build an energy future powered by clean energy.

Sincerely,

Ms. christine bruce 2019 Grafton Rd Elyria, OH 44035-8319 -- spinall@yahoo.com

From:

Slaby, Lynn

Sent:

Monday, August 24, 2015 4:13 PM

To:

Ramsey, Nedra

Subject:

Fwd: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Begin forwarded message:

From: Theresa Clark < OEC@theOEC.org >

Subject: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Date: August 24, 2015 at 11:58:34 AM EDT **To:** Lynn Slaby slaby@puc.state.oh.us **Reply-To:** Theresa Clark tkjuice@gmail.com

Aug 24, 2015

Commissioner Lynn Slaby

Dear Commissioner Slaby,

I urge you to reject First Energy's proposal to keep several old, dirty and uncompetitive power plants open. Their plan will not only burden customers with increased electric bills, but the plan is anti-competitive and will harm human health. Ratepayers should not have to pay for these old power plants just because these plants cannot compete with newer technologies like wind or solar power.

These coal power plants are pumping out thousands of tons of soot, carbon and mercury pollution every day, harming me and many other Ohioans in the process. Newer technologies like wind and solar do not cause the kind of damage these old power plants will.

Please do not approve FirstEnergy's plan to bail out First Energy's old, dirty power plants. Supporting FirstEnergy's plan will hurt Ohio in its path to build an energy future powered by clean energy.

Sincerely,

Mrs. Theresa Clark 15575 Twp. Rd. 453 Loudonville, OH 44842 tkjuice@gmail.com

From:

Slaby, Lynn

Sent:

Monday, August 24, 2015 4:14 PM

To:

Ramsey, Nedra

Subject:

Fwd: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Begin forwarded message:

From: Alisa Dunn < OEC@theOEC.org >

Subject: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Date: August 22, 2015 at 4:54:22 PM EDT **To:** Lynn Slaby <<u>lynn.slaby@puc.state.oh.us</u>> **Reply-To:** Alisa Dunn <<u>dunn_alisa@yahoo.com</u>>

Aug 22, 2015

Commissioner Lynn Slaby

Dear Commissioner Slaby,

I urge you to reject First Energy's proposal to keep several old, dirty and uncompetitive power plants open. Their plan will not only burden customers with increased electric bills, but the plan is anti-competitive and will harm human health. Ratepayers should not have to pay for these old power plants just because these plants cannot compete with newer technologies like wind or solar power.

These coal power plants are pumping out thousands of tons of soot, carbon and mercury pollution every day, harming me and many other Ohioans in the process. Newer technologies like wind and solar do not cause the kind of damage these old power plants will.

Please do not approve FirstEnergy's plan to bail out First Energy's old, dirty power plants. Supporting FirstEnergy's plan will hurt Ohio in its path to build an energy future powered by clean energy.

Sincerely,

Ms. Alisa Dunn 1075 Fox Run Rd Milford, OH 45150-2382 dunn alisa@yahoo.com

From:

Slaby, Lynn

Sent:

Monday, August 24, 2015 4:23 PM

To:

Ramsey, Nedra

Subject:

Fwd: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Begin forwarded message:

From: Kenneth Adler < OEC@theOEC.org >

Subject: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Date: August 20, 2015 at 10:07:24 PM EDT To: Lynn Slaby <lynn.slaby@puc.state.oh.us Reply-To: Kenneth Adler khadler@aol.com

Aug 20, 2015

Commissioner Lynn Slaby

Dear Commissioner Slaby,

I urge you to reject First Energy's proposal to keep several old, dirty and uncompetitive power plants open. Their plan will not only burden customers with increased electric bills, but the plan is anti-competitive and will harm human health. Ratepayers should not have to pay for these old power plants just because these plants cannot compete with newer technologies like wind or solar power.

These coal power plants are pumping out thousands of tons of soot, carbon and mercury pollution every day, harming me and many other Ohioans in the process. Newer technologies like wind and solar do not cause the kind of damage these old power plants will.

Please do not approve FirstEnergy's plan to bail out First Energy's old, dirty power plants. Supporting FirstEnergy's plan will hurt Ohio in its path to build an energy future powered by clean energy.

Sincerely,

Dr. Kenneth Adler 4913 Harroun Rd Sylvania, OH 43560-2197 khadler@aol.com

From:

Slaby, Lynn

Sent:

Monday, August 24, 2015 4:24 PM

To:

Ramsey, Nedra

Subject:

Fwd: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Nadra,

I hope I have not doubled up on some of these being forward to you.

I try to delete them as I send them to you.

Begin forwarded message:

From: Catherine Murray <OEC@theOEC.org>

Subject: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Date: August 20, 2015 at 9:37:22 PM EDT **To:** Lynn Slaby lynn.slaby@puc.state.oh.us>

Reply-To: Catherine Murray < contact@photokitchen.net >

Aug 20, 2015

Commissioner Lynn Slaby

Dear Commissioner Slaby,

I urge you to reject First Energy's proposal to keep several old, dirty and uncompetitive power plants open. Their plan will not only burden customers with increased electric bills, but the plan is anti-competitive and will harm human health. Ratepayers should not have to pay for these old power plants just because these plants cannot compete with newer technologies like wind or solar power.

Now's the perfect time to use financial resources to build NEW and BETTER energy sources. As a consumer, I'd rather pay more every month towards building wind and solar resources than to save coal plants for the next 12 years. If not now, WHEN?

These coal power plants are pumping out thousands of tons of soot, carbon and mercury pollution every day, harming me and many other Ohioans in the process. Newer technologies like wind and solar do not cause the kind of damage these old power plants will.

Please do not approve FirstEnergy's plan to bail out First Energy's old, dirty power plants. Supporting FirstEnergy's plan will hurt Ohio in its path to build an energy future powered by clean energy.

Sincerely,

Miss Catherine Murray 3262 Valley Ln S Columbus, OH 43231-3117 contact@photokitchen.net

From:

Slaby, Lynn

Sent:

Monday, August 24, 2015 4:12 PM

To:

Ramsey, Nedra

Subject:

Fwd: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Nedra,

I am forwarding you a couple more e-mails. I am trying to get IT to have these go direct to you. Commissioner Slaby

Begin forwarded message:

From: christine bruce < OEC@theOEC.org>

Subject: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Date: August 24, 2015 at 1:58:44 PM EDT **To:** Lynn Slaby slaby@puc.state.oh.us>

Reply-To: christine bruce < christybspinall@yahoo.com

Aug 24, 2015

Commissioner Lynn Slaby

Dear Commissioner Slaby,

I urge you to reject First Energy's proposal to keep several old, dirty and uncompetitive power plants open. Their plan will not only burden customers with increased electric bills, but the plan is anti-competitive and will harm human health. Ratepayers should not have to pay for these old power plants just because these plants cannot compete with newer technologies like wind or solar power.

These coal power plants are pumping out thousands of tons of soot, carbon and mercury pollution every day, harming me and many other Ohioans in the process. Newer technologies like wind and solar do not cause the kind of damage these old power plants will.

Please do not approve FirstEnergy's plan to bail out First Energy's old, dirty power plants. Supporting FirstEnergy's plan will hurt Ohio in its path to build an energy future powered by clean energy.

Sincerely,

Ms. christine bruce 2019 Grafton Rd Elyria, OH 44035-8319 christybspinall@yahoo.com

From:

Slaby, Lynn

Sent:

Monday, August 24, 2015 4:13 PM

To:

Ramsey, Nedra

Subject:

Fwd: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Begin forwarded message:

From: Theresa Clark < OEC@theOEC.org >

Subject: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Date: August 24, 2015 at 11:58:34 AM EDT **To:** Lynn Slaby slaby@puc.state.oh.us **Reply-To:** Theresa Clark tkjuice@gmail.com

Aug 24, 2015

Commissioner Lynn Slaby

Dear Commissioner Slaby,

I urge you to reject First Energy's proposal to keep several old, dirty and uncompetitive power plants open. Their plan will not only burden customers with increased electric bills, but the plan is anti-competitive and will harm human health. Ratepayers should not have to pay for these old power plants just because these plants cannot compete with newer technologies like wind or solar power.

These coal power plants are pumping out thousands of tons of soot, carbon and mercury pollution every day, harming me and many other Ohioans in the process. Newer technologies like wind and solar do not cause the kind of damage these old power plants will.

Please do not approve FirstEnergy's plan to bail out First Energy's old, dirty power plants. Supporting FirstEnergy's plan will hurt Ohio in its path to build an energy future powered by clean energy.

Sincerely,

Mrs. Theresa Clark 15575 Twp. Rd. 453 Loudonville, OH 44842 tkjuice@gmail.com

From:

Slaby, Lynn

Sent:

Monday, August 24, 2015 4:14 PM

To:

Ramsey, Nedra

Subject:

Fwd: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Begin forwarded message:

From: Alisa Dunn < OEC@theOEC.org>

Subject: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Date: August 22, 2015 at 4:54:22 PM EDT **To:** Lynn Slaby lynn.slaby@puc.state.oh.us **Reply-To:** Alisa Dunn lynn.slaby@puc.state.oh.us **Reply-To:** Alisa Dunn lynn.slaby@puc.state.oh.us

Aug 22, 2015

Commissioner Lynn Slaby

Dear Commissioner Slaby,

I urge you to reject First Energy's proposal to keep several old, dirty and uncompetitive power plants open. Their plan will not only burden customers with increased electric bills, but the plan is anti-competitive and will harm human health. Ratepayers should not have to pay for these old power plants just because these plants cannot compete with newer technologies like wind or solar power.

These coal power plants are pumping out thousands of tons of soot, carbon and mercury pollution every day, harming me and many other Ohioans in the process. Newer technologies like wind and solar do not cause the kind of damage these old power plants will.

Please do not approve FirstEnergy's plan to bail out First Energy's old, dirty power plants. Supporting FirstEnergy's plan will hurt Ohio in its path to build an energy future powered by clean energy.

Sincerely,

Ms. Alisa Dunn 1075 Fox Run Rd Milford, OH 45150-2382 dunn alisa@yahoo.com

From:

Slaby, Lynn

Sent:

Monday, August 24, 2015 4:23 PM

To:

Ramsey, Nedra

Subject:

Fwd: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Begin forwarded message:

From: Kenneth Adler < OEC@theOEC.org >

Subject: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Date: August 20, 2015 at 10:07:24 PM EDT **To:** Lynn Slaby <<u>iynn.slaby@puc.state.oh.us</u>> **Reply-To:** Kenneth Adler <<u>khadler@aol.com</u>>

Aug 20, 2015

Commissioner Lynn Slaby

Dear Commissioner Slaby,

I urge you to reject First Energy's proposal to keep several old, dirty and uncompetitive power plants open. Their plan will not only burden customers with increased electric bills, but the plan is anti-competitive and will harm human health. Ratepayers should not have to pay for these old power plants just because these plants cannot compete with newer technologies like wind or solar power.

These coal power plants are pumping out thousands of tons of soot, carbon and mercury pollution every day, harming me and many other Ohioans in the process. Newer technologies like wind and solar do not cause the kind of damage these old power plants will.

Please do not approve FirstEnergy's plan to bail out First Energy's old, dirty power plants. Supporting FirstEnergy's plan will hurt Ohio in its path to build an energy future powered by clean energy.

Sincerely,

Dr. Kenneth Adler 4913 Harroun Rd Sylvania, OH 43560-2197 khadler@aol.com

From:

Slaby, Lynn

Sent:

Monday, August 24, 2015 4:24 PM

To:

Ramsey, Nedra

Subject:

Fwd: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Nadra,

I hope I have not doubled up on some of these being forward to you.

I try to delete them as I send them to you.

Begin forwarded message:

From: Catherine Murray < OEC@theOEC.org>

Subject: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Date: August 20, 2015 at 9:37:22 PM EDT **To:** Lynn Slaby slaby@puc.state.oh.us>

Reply-To: Catherine Murray < contact@photokitchen.net >

Aug 20, 2015

Commissioner Lynn Slaby

Dear Commissioner Slaby,

I urge you to reject First Energy's proposal to keep several old, dirty and uncompetitive power plants open. Their plan will not only burden customers with increased electric bills, but the plan is anti-competitive and will harm human health. Ratepayers should not have to pay for these old power plants just because these plants cannot compete with newer technologies like wind or solar power.

Now's the perfect time to use financial resources to build NEW and BETTER energy sources. As a consumer, I'd rather pay more every month towards building wind and solar resources than to save coal plants for the next 12 years. If not now, WHEN?

These coal power plants are pumping out thousands of tons of soot, carbon and mercury pollution every day, harming me and many other Ohioans in the process. Newer technologies like wind and solar do not cause the kind of damage these old power plants will.

Please do not approve FirstEnergy's plan to bail out First Energy's old, dirty power plants. Supporting FirstEnergy's plan will hurt Ohio in its path to build an energy future powered by clean energy.

Sincerely,

Miss Catherine Murray 3262 Valley Ln S Columbus, OH 43231-3117 contact@photokitchen.net

From:

Slaby, Lynn

Sent:

Monday, August 24, 2015 4:24 PM

To:

Ramsey, Nedra

Subject:

Fwd: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Nadra.

I hope I have not doubled up on some of these being forward to you.

I try to delete them as I send them to you.

Begin forwarded message:

From: Catherine Murray < OEC@theOEC.org >

Subject: Reject FirstEnergy's proposal to keep old coal plants running

Date: August 20, 2015 at 9:37:22 PM EDT **To:** Lynn Slaby <<u>lynn.slaby@puc.state.oh.us</u>>

Reply-To: Catherine Murray < contact@photokitchen.net >

Aug 20, 2015

Commissioner Lynn Slaby

Dear Commissioner Slaby,

I urge you to reject First Energy's proposal to keep several old, dirty and uncompetitive power plants open. Their plan will not only burden customers with increased electric bills, but the plan is anti-competitive and will harm human health. Ratepayers should not have to pay for these old power plants just because these plants cannot compete with newer technologies like wind or solar power.

Now's the perfect time to use financial resources to build NEW and BETTER energy sources. As a consumer, I'd rather pay more every month towards building wind and solar resources than to save coal plants for the next 12 years. If not now, WHEN?

These coal power plants are pumping out thousands of tons of soot, carbon and mercury pollution every day, harming me and many other Ohioans in the process. Newer technologies like wind and solar do not cause the kind of damage these old power plants will.

Please do not approve FirstEnergy's plan to bail out First Energy's old, dirty power plants. Supporting FirstEnergy's plan will hurt Ohio in its path to build an energy future powered by clean energy.

Sincerely,

Miss Catherine Murray 3262 Valley Ln S Columbus, OH 43231-3117 contact@photokitchen.net