

## **Appendix I: Species Correspondence**

---

- Correspondence from the Ohio Department of Natural Resources dated 11/12/15
- Correspondence from the United States Department of Fish and Wildlife Services dated 11/24/15
- Correspondence from the Ohio Department of Natural Resources dated 12/24/15





# Ohio Department of Natural Resources

JOHN R. KASICH, GOVERNOR

JAMES ZEHRINGER, DIRECTOR

**Ohio Division of Wildlife**  
*Sue Howard, Acting Chief*  
2045 Morse Rd., Bldg. G  
Columbus, OH 43229-6693  
Phone: (614) 265-6300

November 12, 2015

Lynn Gresock  
South Field Energy LLC  
2 Lan Dr.  
Westford, MA 01886

Dear Ms. Gresock,

Per your request, I have e-mailed you a set of shapefiles with our Natural Heritage Program data for the South Field Energy Transmission Line Routes project, including a one mile radius, in Madison and Yellow Creek Townships, Columbiana County, Ohio. This data will not be published or distributed beyond the scope of the project description on the data request form.

Records included in the data layer may be for rare and endangered plants and animals, geologic features, high quality plant communities and animal assemblages. Fields included are scientific and common names, state and federal statuses, as well as managed area and date of the most recent observation. State and federal statuses are defined as: E = endangered, T = threatened, P = potentially threatened, SC = species of concern, SI = special interest, FE = federal endangered, FT = federal threatened and A = recently added to inventory, status not yet determined.

The managed areas layer includes state, federal and county lands, as well as areas owned by non-profits, museums and other entities. Managed areas are sites under formal protection for their natural resources. Please be aware that this layer may not be complete and we are continually updating it as new information becomes available to us.

Our inventory program has not completely surveyed Ohio and relies on information supplied by many individuals and organizations. Therefore, a lack of records for any particular area is not a statement that rare species or unique features are absent from that area. This letter only represents a review of rare species and natural features data within the Ohio Natural Heritage Database. It does not fulfill coordination under the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA) or the Fish and Wildlife Coordination Act (48 Stat. 401, as amended; 16 U.S. C. 661 et seq.) and does not supersede or replace the regulatory authority of any local, state or federal agency nor relieve the applicant of the obligation to comply with any local, state or federal laws or regulations.

Please contact me at 614-265-6818 if I can be of further assistance.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Debbie Woischke".

Debbie Woischke  
Ohio Natural Heritage Program



UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR  
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service  
Ecological Services Office  
4625 Morse Road, Suite 104  
Columbus, Ohio 43230  
(614) 416-8993 / Fax (614) 416-8994



Email dated November 24, 2015  
TAILS# 03E15000-2016-TA-0195

Dear Ms. Gresock,

We have received your recent correspondence requesting information about the subject proposal. There are no federal wilderness areas, wildlife refuges or designated critical habitat within the vicinity of the project area. The following comments and recommendations will assist you in fulfilling the requirements for consultation under section 7 of the Endangered Species Act of 1973, as amended (ESA).

The U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service (Service) recommends that proposed developments avoid and minimize water quality impacts and impacts to high quality fish and wildlife habitat (e.g., forests, streams, wetlands). Additionally, natural buffers around streams and wetlands should be preserved to enhance beneficial functions. If streams or wetlands will be impacted, the Corps of Engineers should be contacted to determine whether a Clean Water Act section 404 permit is required. Best management practices should be used to minimize erosion, especially on slopes. All disturbed areas should be mulched and revegetated with native plant species. Prevention of non-native, invasive plant establishment is critical in maintaining high quality habitats.

**FEDERALLY LISTED SPECIES COMMENTS:** All projects in the State of Ohio lie within the range of the federally endangered **Indiana bat** (*Myotis sodalis*) and the federally threatened **northern long-eared bat** (*Myotis septentrionalis*). In Ohio, presence of the Indiana bat and northern long-eared bat is assumed wherever suitable habitat occurs unless a presence/absence survey has been performed to document absence. Suitable summer habitat for Indiana bats and northern long-eared bats consists of a wide variety of forested/wooded habitats where they roost, forage, and travel and may also include some adjacent and interspersed non-forested habitats such as emergent wetlands and adjacent edges of agricultural fields, old fields and pastures. This includes forests and woodlots containing potential roosts (i.e., live trees and/or snags  $\geq 3$  inches diameter at breast height (dbh) that have any exfoliating bark, cracks, crevices, hollows and/or cavities), as well as linear features such as fencerows, riparian forests, and other wooded corridors. These wooded areas may be dense or loose aggregates of trees with variable amounts of canopy closure. Individual trees may be considered suitable habitat when they exhibit the characteristics of a potential roost tree and are located within 1,000 feet (305 meters) of other forested/wooded habitat. Northern long-eared bats have also been observed roosting in human-made

structures, such as buildings, barns, bridges, and bat houses; therefore, these structures should also be considered potential summer habitat. In the winter, Indiana bats and northern long-eared bats hibernate in caves and abandoned mines.

**The proposed project is in the vicinity of one or more confirmed records of northern long-eared bats.** Therefore, we recommend that trees  $\geq 3$  inches dbh be saved wherever possible. Because the project will result in a small amount of forest clearing relative to the available habitat in the immediately surrounding area, habitat removal is unlikely to result in significant impacts to Indiana bats or northern long-eared bats. Since northern long-eared bat presence in the vicinity of the project has been confirmed and presence of Indiana bats is assumed, clearing of trees during the summer roosting season may result in direct take of individuals. If any caves or abandoned mines may be disturbed, further coordination with this office is requested to determine if fall or spring portal surveys are warranted. If no caves or abandoned mines are present and tree removal is unavoidable, we recommend that removal of any trees  $\geq 3$  inches dbh only occur between October 1 and March 31. Following this seasonal tree clearing recommendation should ensure that any effects to Indiana bats and northern long-eared bats are insignificant or discountable. **Please note that, because northern long-eared bat presence has already been confirmed in the project vicinity, any additional summer surveys would not constitute presence/absence surveys for northern long-eared bats.**

If there is a federal nexus for the project (e.g., federal funding provided, federal permits required to construct), no tree clearing should occur on any portion of the project area until consultation under section 7 of the ESA, between the Service and the federal action agency, is completed. We recommend that the federal action agency submit a determination of effects to this office, relative to the Indiana bat and northern long-eared bat, for our review and concurrence.

Due to the project type, size, and location, we do not anticipate adverse effects to any other federally endangered, threatened, proposed, or candidate species. Should the project design change, or during the term of this action, additional information on listed or proposed species or their critical habitat become available, or if new information reveals effects of the action that were not previously considered, consultation with the Service should be initiated to assess any potential impacts.

These comments have been prepared under the authority of the Fish and Wildlife Coordination Act (48 Stat. 401, as amended; 16 U.S.C. 661 et seq.), the ESA, and are consistent with the intent of the National Environmental Policy Act of 1969 and the Service's Mitigation Policy. This letter provides technical assistance only and does not serve as a completed section 7 consultation document. We recommend that the project be coordinated with the Ohio Department of Natural Resources due to the potential for

the project to affect state listed species and/or state lands. Contact John Kessler, Environmental Services Administrator, at (614) 265-6621 or at [john.kessler@dnr.state.oh.us](mailto:john.kessler@dnr.state.oh.us).

If you have questions, or if we can be of further assistance in this matter, please contact our office at (614) 416-8993 or [ohio@fws.gov](mailto:ohio@fws.gov).

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Dan Everson". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Dan" being more prominent than the last name "Everson".

Dan Everson

Field Office Supervisor



# Ohio Department of Natural Resources

JOHN R. KASICH, GOVERNOR

JAMES ZEHRINGER, DIRECTOR

## Office of Real Estate

Paul R. Baldridge, Chief  
2045 Morse Road – Bldg. E-2  
Columbus, OH 43229  
Phone: (614) 265-6649  
Fax: (614) 267-4764

December 24, 2015

Lynn Gresock  
Tetra Tech Inc.  
238 Littleton Road, Ste. 201B  
Westford, MA 01886

**Re:** 15-717; Threatened and Endangered Species Review, Information Request, East Ohio Energy

**Project:** The proposed project involves the construction of a combined-cycle electric generating facility and a potential infrastructure corridor

**Location:** The project is located in Yellow Creek Township, Columbiana County, Ohio.

The Ohio Department of Natural Resources (ODNR) has completed a review of the above referenced project. These comments were generated by an inter-disciplinary review within the Department. These comments have been prepared under the authority of the Fish and Wildlife Coordination Act (48 Stat. 401, as amended; 16 U.S.C. 661 et seq.), the National Environmental Policy Act, the Coastal Zone Management Act, Ohio Revised Code and other applicable laws and regulations. These comments are also based on ODNR's experience as the state natural resource management agency and do not supersede or replace the regulatory authority of any local, state or federal agency nor relieve the applicant of the obligation to comply with any local, state or federal laws or regulations.

**Natural Heritage Database:** The Natural Heritage Database has the following data at or within a one mile radius of the project area:

Bowman's-root (*Porteranthus trifolius*), state threatened.

We are unaware of any unique ecological sites, geologic features, animal assemblages, scenic rivers, state wildlife areas, nature preserves, state or national parks, state or national forests, or national wildlife refuges within the project area. The review was performed on the project area you specified in your request as well as an additional one mile radius. Records searched date from 1980. This information is provided to inform you of features present within your project area and vicinity. Additional comments on some of the features may be found in pertinent sections below.

Please note that Ohio has not been completely surveyed and we rely on receiving information from many sources. Therefore, a lack of records for any particular area is not a statement that rare species or unique features are absent from that area. Although all types of plant communities have been surveyed, we only maintain records on the highest quality areas.

**Fish and Wildlife:** The Division of Wildlife (DOW) has the following comments.

The DOW recommends that impacts to wetlands and other water resources be avoided and minimized to the fullest extent possible, and that best management practices be utilized to minimize erosion and sedimentation.

The project is within the range of the Indiana bat (*Myotis sodalis*), a state endangered and federally endangered species. The following species of trees have relatively high value as potential Indiana bat roost trees to include: shagbark hickory (*Carya ovata*), shellbark hickory (*Carya laciniosa*), bitternut hickory (*Carya cordiformis*), black ash (*Fraxinus nigra*), green ash (*Fraxinus pennsylvanica*), white ash (*Fraxinus americana*), shingle oak (*Quercus imbricaria*), northern red oak (*Quercus rubra*), slippery elm (*Ulmus rubra*), American elm (*Ulmus americana*), eastern cottonwood (*Populus deltoides*), silver maple (*Acer saccharinum*), sassafras (*Sassafras albidum*), post oak (*Quercus stellata*), and white oak (*Quercus alba*). Indiana bat roost trees consists of trees that include dead and dying trees with exfoliating bark, crevices, or cavities in upland areas or riparian corridors and living trees with exfoliating bark, cavities, or hollow areas formed from broken branches or tops. However, Indiana bats are also dependent on the forest structure surrounding roost trees. If suitable habitat occurs within the project area, the DOW recommends trees be conserved. If suitable habitat occurs within the project area and trees must be cut, the DOW recommends cutting occur between October 1 and March 31. If suitable trees must be cut during the summer months, the DOW recommends a net survey be conducted between June 1 and August 15, prior any to cutting. Net surveys should incorporate either nine net nights per square 0.5 kilometer of project area, or four net nights per kilometer for linear projects. If no tree removal is proposed, this project is not likely to impact this species.

The project is within the range of the threehorn wartyback (*Obliquaria reflexa*), a state threatened mussel. Due to the location, and that there is no in-water work proposed in a perennial stream of sufficient size, this project is not likely to impact this species.

The project is within the range of the channel darter (*Percina copelandi*), a state threatened fish. The DOW recommends no in-water work in perennial streams from April 15 to June 30 to reduce impacts to indigenous aquatic species and their habitat. If no in-water work is proposed in a perennial stream, this project is not likely to impact this species.

The project is within the range of the eastern hellbender (*Cryptobranchus alleganiensis alleganiensis*), a state endangered species and a federal species of concern. Due to the location, and that there is no in-water work proposed in a perennial stream of sufficient size to provide suitable habitat, this project is not likely to impact this species.

The project is within the range of the eastern massasauga (*Sistrurus catenatus*), a state endangered and a federal candidate snake species. The eastern massasauga uses a range of habitats including wet prairies, fens, and other wetlands, as well as drier upland habitat. Due to the location, the type of habitat present at the project site and within the vicinity of the project area, this project is not likely to impact this species.

The project is within the range of the American bittern (*Botaurus lentiginosus*), a state endangered bird. Nesting bitterns prefer large undisturbed wetlands that have scattered small pools amongst dense vegetation. They occasionally occupy bogs, large wet meadows, and dense shrubby swamps. If this type of habitat will be impacted, construction should be avoided in this habitat during the species' nesting period of May 1 to July 31. If this type of habitat will not be impacted, this project is not likely to impact this species.



The project is within the range of the black bear (*Ursus americanus*), a state endangered species. Due to the mobility of this species, this project is not likely to impact this species.

Due to the potential of impacts to federally listed species, as well as to state listed species, we recommend that this project be coordinated with the U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service. ODNR appreciates the opportunity to provide these comments. Please contact John Kessler at (614) 265-6621 if you have questions about these comments or need additional information.

John Kessler  
ODNR Office of Real Estate  
2045 Morse Road, Building E-2  
Columbus, Ohio 43229-6693  
John.Kessler@dnr.state.oh.us

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**1/15/2016 2:43:59 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 15-1717-EL-BTX**

Summary: Application Appendix I - Species Correspondence electronically filed by Mr. Scott M Guttman on behalf of South Field Energy LLC