

FILE

RECEIVED-DOCKETING DIV

30Dec15

2016 JAN -4 PM 12: 57

Subject: 14-1693-EL-RDR, 14-1694-EL -AAM

PUCO

Dear Honorable Public Utility Commission of Ohio (OPUCO) members:

Based on the below Dispatch link in re: AEP's proposed commercial and solar and wind farms, why would the OPUCO allow AEP to install both commercial sized solar and wind plants which are more expensive than natural gas and then force the higher costs on to AEP's customers? After all, AEP has already begun converting Unit 1 of its Cardinal station in Bellaire to a far cheaper power and more reliable source: combined cycle, natural gas. As far as we know, AEP is funding this conversion themselves, not asking for an eight-year extension for the operation of existing coal-fired plants with a guaranteed 10% return. In the Settlement proposal, we don't even see any references to bringing more natural gas plants online.

<http://www.dispatch.com/content/stories/business/2015/12/16/fresh-power-up.html>

Following are comments and related questions which are copied from the above link

"The solar-energy industry is the fastest growing in the country, and it's being placed in the part of the state with the greatest economic decline,"

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business.
Technician JM Date Processed JAN 04 2016

said Dan Sawmiller, a staff member for the Sierra Club's "Beyond Coal" campaign, which has endorsed AEP's plan."

In the first place, the Wheeling Metropolitan Statistical Area (Belmont county, Ohio and Ohio and Marshall counties in West Virginia) is the fourth or fifth fastest growing MSA in the United States and the surrounding counties aren't doing too shabbily either.

Question- Why isn't the economic growth there which is attributable to gas, oil and coal production, not sun or wind being considered?

Question-Are Carroll, Harrison, Belmont, Noble, Washington, Guernsey and other nearby counties seeing economic decline? That's not what tax receipts from those counties are saying. They are seeing economic growth from the development of abundant, cheap and reliable "fossil" fuels from hydrocarbons, not from higher-cost wind and solar renewable energy sources.

How does the economic performance over the past five years of Ohio's southeastern counties compare with that of Van Wert and/or Paulding county in northwest Ohio where the bulk of Ohio's wind farms are located?

Question-Will the OPUCO consider the impact on Indiana bats and raptors and forest fragmentation ?

Question-Since the OPUCO's writ is to assure that ratepayers benefit from the lowest-cost and most-reliable electric power sources, not the highest-cost and least reliable sources, why allow AEP's proposed commercial sized solar and wind plants? At the very least, it seems to us, OPUCO should ask AEP to consider installing massive battery storage as Southern California Edison has done, successfully.

Following are commercial sized plant 2013 \$/Mwh electricity costs copied from the below EIA link:

Solar PV- 125.3

Wind- 73.6

Natural Gas Advanced Combined Cycle- 72.6

https://www.eia.gov/forecasts/aeo/electricity_generation.cfm

Which of the 30Sept15 OH SB 310 Final Report five recommendations are the OPUCO supporting? OH Senator Troy Balderson (R-20) authored OH SB 310 which Gov Kasich signed it into law in June, 2014 and freezes any additional commercial wind/ solar plants for two years. The five recommendations are found on pages 11/16 in the OH SB 310 Final Report –pls see the below link:

<http://emsc.legislature.ohio.gov/Assets/Reports/emsc-final-report-adoption.pdf>

Also please address the Ohio discussion and the potential impact on low income groups and minorities found on pages 65/67 in the below National Black Chamber of Commerce (NBCC) link

Thanks a lot

James FN Neuenschwander

30 Dec 15

James F Neuenschwander

Granville, OH

Tom Pendergast

Newark, OH

30 December 2015