RECEIVED-DOCKETING DIV

PUCO

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF 21400 -4 PM 3:53

11

City of Toledo, Case No. 14 / 9/// -EL-CSS Complainant, v. FirstEnergy Solutions, Corp., Respondent.

FILE

Complaint and Requests for Relief Including Relief from Termination of Electric Service

Pursuant to Sections 4905 et seq., and 4928 et seq. of the Revised Code, and Rule 4901-9-01(E) of the Ohio Administrative Code, the City of Toledo ("Toledo") hereby files this Complaint with the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio against FirstEnergy Solutions Corporation ("FES") and seeks the relief set forth herein.

In support of this Complaint, Toledo states as follows:

- 1. Toledo is a charter municipal corporation duly organized under the laws of the State of Ohio.
- 2. FES is an Ohio Corporation located at 341 White Pond Drive, Akron, Ohio 44320.
- 3. The Commission has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to R.C. 4905 et seq., and R.C. 4928 et seq.
- 4. Toledo has a contract ("Contract") to purchase electricity from FES (Exhibit 1).
- 5. Toledo was a customer of FES in January 2014.

1 4 - 1-

6. On or about March 14, 2014 FES sent Toledo letters indicating that due to January 2014 being an "extremely cold month" FES was faced with increased

. ...

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file iccunent delivered in the regular course of business Date Processed _ NOV 0 4 2014 SIL reetnician -

"ancillary costs" relative to the power it served Toledo (Exhibit 2 is one example).

- 7. These letters from FES stated that it would be charging Toledo 1% 3% of its annual electric generation expenditure for FES' increased ancillary expenses.
- 8. Toledo's Contract with FES is for fixed price power.
- 9. Toledo's Contract with FES includes a provision, Section 6, making ancillary services the sole responsibility of FES.
- 10. FES claims that it has the right to declare the polar vortex ancillary charge as a pass through event pursuant to Section 31 of its Contract with Toledo.
- 11. Toledo's Contract with FES contains at Sections 18 and 28, a dispute resolution provision whereby Toledo can dispute portions of any invoice.
- 12. On April 16, 2014 Toledo, in conjunction with its neighboring communities in the Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition ("NOAC"), sent to FES a letter disputing the polar vortex ancillary charge relative to NOAC's aggregation participants (Exhibit 3).
- 13. Toledo sent a protest letter to FES on April 23, 2014 disputing the validity of FES's polar vortex ancillary charge as to Toledo's municipal accounts (Exhibit 4).
- 14. Pursuant to the Commissions April 9, 2014 order seeking written comments on its Investigation into this polar vortex ancillary charge, Toledo, in conjunction with NOAC, submitted comments into docket Case no. 14-568-EL-COI.
- 15. On or about June 30 2014 FES sent to multiple Toledo electric accounts invoices for the polar vortex ancillary charge: the largest single amount owed (as is presently known) is for Toledo's water reclamation plant's account and said ancillary charge is \$20,448.80 (Exhibit 5).
- 16. On or about August 12, 2014 the law firm of Ulmer Berne LLP sent to an accounts clerk, not the undersigned, a response letter (Exhibit 6).
- 17. On August 23, 2014 Toledo sent to Ulmer Berne LLP a response reiterating that it, in good faith, disputed the polar vortex ancillary charge (Exhibit 7).

2

- 18. On September 30, 2014 Toledo sent to FES another dispute letter, indicating it disputed the polar vortex ancillary charge but it was paying the remaining, undisputed portion of the bill (Exhibit 8).
- 19. On or about October 6, 2014 FES sent Toledo a cancellation notice indicating that failure to pay the disputed \$20,448.80 within 30 days would result in FES cancelling Toledo's service (Exhibit 9).
- 20. Toledo has many accounts and many of these are in a similar status to Toledo's water reclamation plant but the volume of invoices, bills and notifications is very large and not attached to this complaint.

Allegations

- 21. Toledo incorporates paragraphs 1-20 as if rewritten herein.
- 22. Because FES is contractually required to cover Toledo's ancillary charges (Contract Section 6) it is without authority to pass those on to Toledo.
- 23. Increased ancillary expenses do not qualify as a regulatory pass-through event.
- 24. Pursuant to FirstEnergy's tariff CRES providers supplying SSO generation are responsible for providing all ancillary services (including costs and expenses related to the services) unless excepted.
- 25. The polar vortex ancillary charge is not excepted in the applicable tariff or SSO Supply Agreement.
- 26. FES discriminatorily waived residential and others' polar vortex ancillary charges while choosing to pursue them from certain business and municipal customers like Toledo.
- 27. FES has failed to arrange for Toledo's dispute to be resolved in violation of its Contract and basic principles of good faith and fair dealing.
- 28. FES' actions constitute unfair, misleading, deceptive or unconscionable acts in violation of various codes including but not limited to R.C. 4928.08 and OAC 4901:1-21 *et seq*.

Request for Relief

WHEREFORE, Toledo respectfully requests that the Commission:

- 29. Find that this Complaint sets forth reasonable grounds for complaint.
- 30. Issue an Order staying FES from terminating power to Toledo's accounts pursuant to OAC 4901-9-01(E).
- 31. Issue an Order staying collection of FES' polar vortex ancillary charge until such time Case No. 14-568-EL-COI is resolved.
- 32. Issue an Order declaring that FES' polar vortex ancillary charges are not qualifying pass through regulatory events.
- 33. Issue an Order declaring that FES is contractually estopped from seeking to make Toledo pay FES' increased ancillary charges.
- 34. For an Order seeking reimbursement of any polar vortex charges and late fees already paid on accident (for example, though automatic bank withdrawal or similar oversight).
- 35. Granting all other relief as may be just and proper.

Respectfully submitted, Adam W. Loukx, Director of Law

11

)

Leslie A. Kovacik (0070157) 420 Madison Ave., Fourth Floor Toledo, Ohio 43604 leslie.kovacik@toledo.oh.gov Ph: 4192451893 Fax: 4192451853

Counsel for the City of Toledo

.

۰ -

,

11



Solutions

341 White Pond Drive Akron, Ohio 44320

March 14, 2014

Re: RTO Expense Surcharge

Dear Loslio Kovacik:

Thank you for selecting FirstEnergy Solutions as your electric generation supplier. As you know, January was an extremely cold month with temperatures reaching record lows, which resulted in a significant increase in energy consumption. In fact, PJM Interconnection – the regional transmission organization that coordinates reliability and the movement of wholesale electricity in our region – initiated emergency operations throughout the month of January.

During these periods of time, PJM incurred extremely high ancillary costs to purchase additional reserve generation needed to keep the bulk electric system reliable throughout these extreme conditions. These costs and additional charges were, in turn, invoiced by PJM to all suppliers serving customers throughout the region.

Pursuant to your agreement with FirstEnergy Solutions, these additional costs and charges are deemed a "Pass-Through Event." As a result, the electric generation costs for the month of January for your accounts served by FirstEnergy Solutions will be adjusted through a charge which will appear as a separate line item on your bill but will not change your contract price. We anticipate the amount of the charge to be approximately 1-3 percent of your annual electric generation expenditure. If your electric generation supply charges are billed by your electric utility, the charge will be reflected in bills rendered after June 1, 2014. If your electric generation supply charges are billed directly by FirstEnergy Solutions, the charge will be reflected in bills rendered after April 15, 2014. The charge appearing in your bill will be based upon your actual usage for the month of January.

This letter does not require you to take any action. This is simply a notification of this Pass-Through Event and that the additional costs and charges will be reflected in future electric bills.

If you have any questions or concerns regarding your charges or this notice, please feel free to visit our website at www.fes.com/RTOexpenseCI. Thank you once again for selecting FirstEnergy Solutions. We appreciate your business and look forward to being your electric generation supplier in the years ahead.

Sincerely,

FirstEnergy Solutions Customer Care

¢

,

*1



JULIA R. BATES

LUCAS COUNTY PROSECUTING ATTORNEY

LUCAS COUNTY COURTHOUSE, 700 ADAMS STREET, SUITE 250, TOLEDO, OHIO 43604-5659 TELEPHONE (419) 213-4700 / FACSIMILE (419) 213-4695

Via Email or Facsimile and Regular Mail

April 16, 2014

Ben Rich Government Aggregation Coordinator FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. 341 White Pond Drive Akron, Ohio 44320 brich@firstenergycorp.com

First Energy Solutions Corp. Attention: Contracts Department 341 White Pond Akron, Ohio 44320 Facsimile: (330) 315-6913

Subject: Notice of a Material Breach of Aggregation Supply Contracts

Dear Mr. Rich and Contracts Administrator:

This Notice of Invoice Dispute is made on behalf of Lucas County, the City of Toledo, the Village of Ottawa Hills, Lake Township, the City of Perrysburg, the City of Sylvania, the City of Maumee, the Village of Waterville, the City of Northwood, Perrysburg Township, the City of Oregon and the Village of Holland. Our communities are all members of the Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition (NOAC).

Our communities each signed a separate but identical contract with FirstEnergy Solutions (FES) for it to provide electric service to its aggregation members. The contracts consist of the "Master Agreement to Provide Services to an Aggregated Group" and the "First Amendment to the Master Agreement to Provide Services to an Aggregation Group." These are called together, the "Aggregation Supply Contracts" or "contracts."

At its website, FES describes that PJM incurred high cost "to purchase generation" needed in the cold days of January 2014. PJM billed a proportionate share to FES as it does every month. FES unilaterally determined that it will "pass thru" these January 2014 generation costs as a Surcharge in to the member residents and small businesses in our aggregation programs. The Surcharge will be in their May, June and July bills. FES by phone confirmed this to our consultant Palmer Energy.

The RTO Expense Surcharge materially violates the fixed pricing term found at current Attachment A to the Aggregation Supply Contract. Our Members are to pay a fixed percent off of the Ohio Public Utilities Commission's "Price to Compare . . <u>for</u> transmission, <u>generation</u>, <u>and generation related charges</u>." The FES website states that that the RTO Expense Surcharge is a cost "to purchase generation." Thus FES is improperly trying to double bill in material breach of the Aggregation Supply Contracts.

)

Our contracts explicitly required FES to provide each NOAC community written notice and to engage in an agreed upon process to determine if this Surcharge was appropriate. These provisions are there to protect our people and our businesses from unwarranted charges automatically taken from their accounts or hidden deep in an electric bill. This process does not allow FES to unilaterally impose such a Surcharge. Thus FES actions materially breached Paragraphs 2.2 and 2.3 and other provisions of the Aggregation Supply Contract.

Pursuant to Paragraph 6.2 you are notified that FES is in material breach of the Aggregation Supply Contracts. Similarly, FES material breached the representations it made to our Member that they were getting a fixed percentage off the Price to Compare.

This action is necessary to protect the member homeowners, residents and small businesses in our aggregations. FES has determined wrongly and improperly to collect millions of dollars from them their electric bills through a RTO Expense Surcharge.

<u>Potential Cure</u>: FES may cure this Material Breach by providing adequate assurance to our communities that it will not seek any RTO Expense Surcharge from our Members and that it will abide by the Aggregation Supply Contract in the future. If FES does not cure, then we reserve the right to take all appropriate action to include termination of the Aggregation Supply Contracts and other remedies.

<u>Written Response Required</u>: Pursuant to Paragraph 6.2, FES has five days to respond in writing to this Notice. We await your required written response.

Sincerely,

Kevin A. Pituch Assistant Lucas County Prosecuting Attorney

Cc: NOAC Member Communities M. Frye, Palmer Energy Thomas Hays

11

CITY OF TOLEDO

11



DEPARTMENT OF LAW

Adam W. Loukx Director of Law

<u>General Section</u> Paul Syring General Counsel Eileen Granata

Litigation Section Jeffrey B, Charles Chief of Litigation Merritt W. Green, III Ellen Grachek John T. Madigan Michael Kyser

<u>Taxation</u> John E, Bibish IV Chief of Collections Jeffrey S, Colturi Pamela K, Billmaier

Risk Management Merritt W. Green, III

<u>Utilities</u> Leslie A. Kovacik Joyce Anagnos

Prosecutors David L, Toska Chief Prosecutor Arturo M. Quintero Sharon D. Gaich Victoria L. Smith Joseph J. Howe Michelle S. Turvcy-Albert J. Scott Kunzler Jimmio Jones Christopher Lawrence Rebecca L. West-Esteli Henry J. Schaefer

<u>Clains Investigation</u> Lois Cannon, Claims Lt. Robert Hellom Civil Liability FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. Attn: Contracts Department VIA FACSIMILE: 3304361903

April 23, 2014

RE: NOTICE: RTO Expense Surcharge

Dear FirstEnergy Solutions Customer Care:

The City is in receipt of your letter dated March 14, 2014, where you state your intent to charge the City of Toledo a surcharge for the cold weather we experienced in January. While you call this surcharge a "Pass-Through-Event" Toledo does not believe it qualifies as such. We have been advised that PJM did not, in fact, charge FirstEnergy Solutions any RTO surcharge relative to the cold January. Accordingly, we dispute your claim to bill the City for 1-3% of our annual electric generation expenditure under section 31 of our contract, or any other provision of our contract.

The contract between our entities anticipates that we will attempt to resolve disputes in writing (and verbally) and in good faith. Therefore, the City, in good faith, disputes your ability to charge Toledo as you indicated. I would look forward to any information you have relative to the exact nature of the RTO surcharge your company received from PJM. Until and unless it can be clearly proven that the City has a duty to pay this charge, it will dispute such claim, and will withhold, in good faith, any amounts so claimed to be an RTO surcharge.

Sincerely l∕esli¢ A. Kovadik

cc: Robert R/Reinbolt, Chief of Staff Adam W. Loukx, Director of Law

420 Madison Ave., Fourth Floor Toledo, OH 43604 U.S.A. leslie.kovacik@toledo.oh.gov TRANSMISSION VERIFICATION REPORT

TIME NAME FAX TEL SER H •

04/23/2014 15:00 CITY OF TOLEDO DPU 4192451853 4192451235 BROM5J402075



04/23 15:00 913304351903 00:00:22 01 OK STANDARD ECM



DEPARTMENT OF LAW

Adam W. Lonkx Director of Law

General Section Paul Syring General Counsel Eilcen Granata

Lidgation Section Jeffrey B. Charles Chief of Litigation Moniti W. Green, III Elfon Grachek John T. Madigan Michael Kyser

Taxation John E. Bibish IV Chief of Collections Jeffrey S. Colturi Pamela K. Billmaicr

Risk Management Mortiff W. Green, III

Thilities Loslio A. Kovacik Joyce Anagnos

Prosecutors

David L. Toska Chief Prosecutor Arturo M. Quintero Sharon D. Galch Victoria L. Smith Joseph J. Howo . .. April 23, 2014

FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. Attn: Contracts Department VIA FACSIMILE: 3304361903

RE: NOTICE: RTO Expense Surcharge

Dear FirstEnergy Solutions Customer Care:

The City is in receipt of your letter dated March 14, 2014, where you state your intent to charge the City of Toledo a surcharge for the cold weather we experienced in January. While you call this surcharge a "Pass-Through-Event" Toledo does not believe it qualifies as such. We have been advised that PJM did not, in fact, charge FirstEnergy Solutions any RTO surcharge relative to the cold January, Accordingly, we dispute your claim to bill the City for 1-3% of our annual electric generation expenditure under section 31 of our contract, or any other provision of our contract.

The contract between our entities anticipates that we will altempt to resolve disputes in writing (and verbally) and in good faith. Therefore, the City, in good faith, disputes your ability to charge Toledo as you indicated. I would look forward to any information you have telative to the exact nature of the RTO surcharge your company received from PJM. Until and unless it can be clearly proven that the City has a duty to pay this charge, it will dispute such claim, and will withhold, in good faith, any amounts so claimed to be an RTO surcharge.

• •

11 .



You have made the right choice! We're glad you selected FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. and will

work hard to continue to earn your business.

If you have questions about

this energy bill, please call us at 888-254-6359 before the duo date. Our hours are Bain to Spm ET Monday through Friday. You may also write to us at 341 White Pand Drive Sm B2. Akron

Pond Drive, Rm B2, Akron,

subject to a late payment charge of 1.5% per month. To avoid late fees, payment of the TOTAL AMOUNT DUE must be received in full by

Past due balances are

Ohio 44320.

the due date.

Toledo, City of 3900 N Summit St c/o Mike Schreidah, PE, Project Manager Toledo, OH 43611-3042

Account no: Billing Date:

56758115 June 30, 2014 Page 1

ACCOUNT SUMMARY INFORMATION

Previous Balance \$93,977.85 \$-93,977.85 Payment Received \$20,648.80 Adjustments ** Total Balance Forward \$20,648.80 Current Usage Charges * \$122,021.98 \$122,021.98 **Total Current Charges** See "Your Energy Charges" section for details. ** See "Other Charges and Adjustments" sections for details. \$142,670.78 **Total Amount Due**

#122,021.98

\$20,648,80 RTO Expense Surcharge

Thanks for choosing FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. as your energy provider I

Detach here and return this portion with check or money order. Do not staple or fold.

....

FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. P.O. Box 3622 Akron, Ohio 44309-3622

Account Number Due Date **Total Due**

56758115 July 30, 2014 \$142,670.78

FESBLOIK

Amount Enclosed

\$ 122,021,92

Please write your account number on your check or money orde inade payable to FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.

FOR CHANGE OF ADDRESS: Please check here & complete form on reverse. Thank You.

Toledo, Cily of 3900 N SUMMIT ST C/O MIKE SCHREIDAH, PE, PROJECT MANAGER TOLEDO OH 43611-3042

ւթինքունալորիկորիիներիլիներիներությունները

10000000000056758115201407300014267078

310

Solutions

Account no: Billing Date:

)

56758115 June 30, 2014 Page 2

GENERAL INFORMATION

Generation Charge: Charges for the production of electricity. Generation prices and charges are set by the electric generation supplier (EGS) you have chosen.

Transmission Charge: Charges for moving high voltage electricity from a generation facility to the distribution lines of an electric distribution company. The Federal Energy Regulatory Commission regulates transmission prices and services.

If you have problems with your energy service or need to report a problem, please contact your local utility company.

Toledo Edison 300 Madison Avenue Toledo, OH 436520001 Telephone: 1-800-447-3333

FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. does not handle service outages.

Mail notes and coorespondence in a separate envelope to:

FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. Customer Care A-SPSQ-B3 76 S Main Street Akron, OH 44308

Mail Payments to:

FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. P.O. Box 3622 Akron, OH 44309-3622

FESBLETK

Change of Address? Please fill out and check the box on the reverse side. Thank You.

New Address

City

State or Province

Zip

Work Phone ()

Home Phone ()

	-			
FirstEnerov				
Solutions		:	Account no Billing Date	. June 30, 2014
:	YOUR ENERGY CH	ARGES		Page 3
	3900 N SUMMIT ST, TO	LEDO OH	UTIL# 08007	884152250029571
	FirstEnergy Solutions (Electric Service	Corp.		•
	Min:#685834319 Service Period May 15, 20 Service Period May 15, 20	Toledo Edison 14 lo June 13, 2014. 14 lo June 13, 2014 - Derived from	Off Pealc n Interval usage.	1,566,417.6 kWh
	Capacity - 1.926797 MW @			\$63,465.03 \$53,258.20 \$2,083.04 \$3,216.71 \$122,021.96
	FirstEnergy Solutions Other Charges and A <u>RTO Expense Surcharge</u> Current Other			\$20,648.80 \$ 20,648.80
	TOTAL ENERGY CHAR	GES FOR UTIL#08007884	152250029571	\$ 142,670.78

•••

41

)

FESDLOTK

.

11

LAURA MCBRIDE

)

direct 216.583.7034 direct fax 216.583.7035 imcbride@ulmer.com

August 12, 2014

VIA EMAIL AND REGULAR MAIL

Justice Tsenuokpor Accounts Division City of Toledo 3900 N. Summit Street Toledo, Ohio 43611 Justice.Tsenuokpor@toledo.oh.gov

ulmer berne llp

Re: Dispute of RTO Expense Surcharge Notice

ATTORNEYS

Dear Mr. Tsenuokpor:

This firm has been retained to represent FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. ("FES") in connection with your e-mail on behalf of the City of Toledo ("Toledo") regarding its contract with FES (the "Agreement"). Please direct any future correspondence regarding this dispute to me.

The RTO Expense Surcharge relates to recent extraordinary weather conditions that caused severe strain on the grid. PJM Interconnection, LLC ("PJM"), among other things, declared eight Maximum Emergency Generation Alerts during January 2014, compared with zero alerts during the prior three winters. PJM's emergency actions caused ancillary charges to significantly exceed historical levels. For example, the total PJM charges for Operating Reserves, Synchronous Reserves, Day Ahead Scheduling Reserves and Regulation for January 2014 exceeded the total level of these PJM charges for all of 2013. As a result of these extraordinary conditions and charges, FES provided customers with notice that the RTO Expense Surcharge would be imposed in the next few months once final charges were determined.

Toledo must pay the RTO Expense Surcharge because it qualifies as a Pass-Through Event pursuant to paragraphs 6, 31, and 32 of the Agreement. Paragraph 6 of the Agreement makes clear that changes to charges relating to any existing Electric Supply components are addressed in and subject to paragraphs 31 and 32 of the Agreement. Paragraph 31 of the Agreement provides that a "Pass-Through Event" occurs when "any regional transmission organization" imposes on FES "new or additional charges or requirements." PJM is a regional transmission organization and the RTO Expense Surcharge is <u>in addition</u> to typical PJM charges and is directly applicable by load ratio to Toledo's electric usage. The extraordinary and unforeseeable PJM charges related to the unprecedented actions it took to

CLEVELAND	COLUMBUS	CINCINNAT		CHICAGO
1660 WEST 2ND STREET, SUITE 1 CLEVELAND, OHIO 44113-1448	100	firm 216.583.7000	fax 216.583,7001	internet www.uimer.com
SKYLIGHT OFFICE TOWER			r	1

ulmer berne llp

ATTORNEYS

J. Tsenuokpor August 12, 2014 Page 2

ŧ

. '

maintain reliability in the face of extreme cold clearly fit the criteria of a Pass-Through Event under the Agreement. Toledo and FES agreed that FES may pass through the additional cost of such Pass-Through Events.

Under paragraph 18 of the Agreement, Toledo is obligated to pay the undisputed portion of FES invoices in a timely manner. Moreover, invoice disputes under the Agreement must be in good faith. Given the plain meaning of paragraphs 6, 31, and 32 of the Agreement and the circumstances under which FES is exercising its rights under those provisions, Toledo's ability to dispute the RTO Expense Surcharge in good faith is questionable. FES reserves any and all available remedies if Toledo fails to pay the invoice in full in a timely manner.

If you have any further questions or concerns, please feel free to contact me.

Very truly yours,

Jama C. McBride

Laura McBride

cc: City of Toledo – attn: Chris Middlebrough 3900 N. Summit St. Toledo, OH 43611 Mark A. Hayden Brian Knipe Jacob McDermott Christine Weber

2104895.v1 29414.00058)

11

41

CITY OF TOLEDO



DEPARTMENT OF LAW

ADAM W. LOUKX, DIRECTOR

August 13, 2014

Laura McBride 1660 West 2nd Street, Suite 1100 Cleveland, Ohio 44113-1448 VIA EMAIL: lmcbride@ulmer.com

RE: Dispute of RTO Expense Surcharge

Dear Ms. McBride:

I received a copy of your letter dated August 12, 2014 to Toledo employee Justice Tsenuokpor. Toledo's Law Department was unaware Mr. Tsenuokpor sent any communication to FirstEnergy Solutions regarding the RTO expense but please know that all future correspondence on this matter should be directed to me.

FirstEnergy Solutions' customer care center sent me a letter dated March 14 indicating its intent to charge the polar vortex charge to the City based on June's power usage. I responded to FirstEnergy Solutions' customer care center's letter on April 23, 2014. Additionally, the City of Toledo contested this charge to its aggregation participants along with the rest of the communities in the Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition on April 16, 2014. All are attached.

The City of Toledo has intervened in the Commission ordered investigation into the legality of your client's RTO charge, Case No. 14-568-EL-COI, and continues to maintain that there is no authority for said charge, nor is this a valid Pass-Through Event. Accordingly, Toledo will not, in good faith, be paying FirstEnergy Solutions' polar vortex charge.

Sincerely,

Leslie A. Kovack busice A. Kovack Unicon-Leslie A. Kovack u=Department of Law, email-leslie. Date: 2014.09.13 063328-04'00'

Leslie A. Kovacik

cc: Robert R. Reinbolt, Chief of Staff Adam W. Loukx, Director of Law

> CITY OF TOLEDO DEPARTMENT OF LAW 420 Madison Avenue, Fourth Floor Toledo, OH 43604 U.S.A. Phone: 419-245-1020 Fax: 419-245-1090 www.toledo.oh.gov



JULIA R. BATES

LUCAS COUNTY COURTHOUSE, 700 ADAMS STREET, SUITE 250, TOLEDO, OHIO 43604-5659 TELEPHONE (419) 213-4700 / FACSIMILE (419) 213-4695

Via Email or Facsimile and Regular Mail

April 16, 2014

Ben Rich Government Aggregation Coordinator FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. 341 White Pond Drive Akron, Ohio 44320 brich@firstenergycorp.com

First Energy Solutions Corp. Attention: Contracts Department 341 White Pond Akron, Ohio 44320 Facsimile: (330) 315-6913

Subject: Notice of a Material Breach of Aggregation Supply Contracts

Dear Mr. Rich and Contracts Administrator:

This Notice of Invoice Dispute is made on behalf of Lucas County, the City of Toledo, the Village of Ottawa Hills, Lake Township, the City of Perrysburg, the City of Sylvania, the City of Maumee, the Village of Waterville, the City of Northwood, Perrysburg Township, the City of Oregon and the Village of Holland. Our communities are all members of the Northwest Ohio Aggregation Coalition (NOAC).

Our communities each signed a separate but identical contract with FirstEnergy Solutions (FES) for it to provide electric service to its aggregation members. The contracts consist of the "Master Agreement to Provide Services to an Aggregated Group" and the "First Amendment to the Master Agreement to Provide Services to an Aggregation Group." These are called together, the "Aggregation Supply Contracts" or "contracts."

At its website, FES describes that PJM incurred high cost "to purchase generation" needed in the cold days of January 2014. PJM billed a proportionate share to FES as it does every month. FES unilaterally determined that it will "pass thru" these January 2014 generation costs as a Surcharge in to the member residents and small businesses in our aggregation programs. The Surcharge will be in their May, June and July bills. FES by phone confirmed this to our consultant Palmer Energy.

The RTO Expense Surcharge materially violates the fixed pricing term found at current Attachment A to the Aggregation Supply Contract. Our Members are to pay a fixed percent off of the Ohio Public Utilities Commission's "Price to Compare . . <u>for</u> transmission, <u>generation</u>, <u>and generation related charges</u>." The FES website states that that the RTO Expense Surcharge is a cost "to purchase generation." Thus FES is improperly trying to double bill in material breach of the Aggregation Supply Contracts.

Our contracts explicitly required FES to provide each NOAC community written notice and to engage in an agreed upon process to determine if this Surcharge was appropriate. These provisions are there to protect our people and our businesses from unwarranted charges automatically taken from their accounts or hidden deep in an electric bill. This process does not allow FES to unilaterally impose such a Surcharge. Thus FES actions materially breached Paragraphs 2.2 and 2.3 and other provisions of the Aggregation Supply Contract.

Pursuant to Paragraph 6.2 you are notified that FES is in material breach of the Aggregation Supply Contracts. Similarly, FES material breached the representations it made to our Member that they were getting a fixed percentage off the Price to Compare.

This action is necessary to protect the member homeowners, residents and small businesses in our aggregations. FES has determined wrongly and improperly to collect millions of dollars from them their electric bills through a RTO Expense Surcharge.

<u>Potential Cure</u>: FES may cure this Material Breach by providing adequate assurance to our communities that it will not seek any RTO Expense Surcharge from our Members and that it will abide by the Aggregation Supply Contract in the future. If FES does not cure, then we reserve the right to take all appropriate action to include termination of the Aggregation Supply Contracts and other remedies.

<u>Written Response Required</u>: Pursuant to Paragraph 6.2, FES has five days to respond in writing to this Notice. We await your required written response,

Sincerely,

PA ARH

Kevin A. Pituch Assistant Lucas County Prosecuting Attorney

Cc: NOAC Member Communities M. Frye, Palmer Energy Thomas Hays

CITY OF TOLEDO



DEPARTMENT OF LAW

Adam W. Loukx Director of Law

<u>General Section</u> Paul Syring General Counsel Eilcon Granata

Litigation Section Jeffrey B. Charles Chief of Litigation Merritt W. Green, III Bilen Grachek John T. Madigan Michael Kyser

Taxation

John E. Bibish IV Chief of Collections Jeffrey S. Colturi Pamela K. Billmaler

Risk Management Merritt W. Green, III

Utilities Leslie A. Kovacik

Joyce Anagnos

Prosecutors

David L. Toska Chief Prosecutor Arturo M. Quintero Sharon D. Gaich Victoria L. Smith Joseph J. Howe Michelle S. Turvey-Albert J. Scott Kunzler Jimmie Jones Christopher Lawrence Rebecca L. West-Estell Henry J. Schaefer

<u>Claims Investigation</u> Lois Cannon, Claims I.t. Robert Hellom Civil Liability April 23, 2014

FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. Attn: Contracts Department VIA FACSIMILE: 3304361903

RE: NOTICE: RTO Expense Surcharge

Dear FirstEnergy Solutions Customer Care:

The City is in receipt of your letter dated March 14, 2014, where you state your intent to charge the City of Toledo a surcharge for the cold weather we experienced in January. While you call this surcharge a "Pass-Through-Event" Toledo does not believe it qualifies as such. We have been advised that PJM did not, in fact, charge FirstEnergy Solutions any RTO surcharge relative to the cold January. Accordingly, we dispute your claim to bill the City for 1-3% of our annual electric generation expenditure under section 31 of our contract, or any other provision of our contract.

The contract between our entities anticipates that we will attempt to resolve disputes in writing (and verbally) and in good faith. Therefore, the City, in good faith, disputes your ability to charge Toledo as you indicated. I would look forward to any information you have relative to the exact nature of the RTO surcharge your company received from PJM. Until and unless it can be clearly proven that the City has a duty to pay this charge, it will dispute such claim, and will withhold, in good faith, any amounts so claimed to be an RTO surcharge.

Sincerely Leslie A. Kovadik

cc: Robert R/Reinbolt, Chief of Staff Adam W. Loukx, Director of Law

420 Madison Ave., Fourth Floor Toledo, OH 43604 U.S.A. leslie.kovacik@toledo.oh.gov TRANSMISSION VERIFICATION REPORT

TIME 1 NAME FAX TEL

04/23/2014 15:00 CITY OF TOLEDO DPU 4192451853 4192451235 SER.# : BROM5J402075

DATE, TIME FAX NO./NAME DURATION PAGE(S) RESULT MODE

04/23 15:00 913304361903 00:00:22 01 ΟK STANDARD ECM.





DEPARTMENT OF LAW

Adam W. Loukx Director of Law

General Section Paul Syring General Counsel Eileen Granata

Litigation Section leffrey B, Charles Chief of Litigation Monitt W. Green, III Ellen Grachek John T. Madigan Michael Kyser

Taxation

John E. Bibish IV Chief of Collections Jeffrey S. Colturi Pamela K. Billmaicr

Risk Management Merritt W, Green, III

Utilities Leslie A, Kovacik Joyce Anagaos

Prosecutors

David L. Toska Chief Prosecutor Arturo M. Quintero Sharon D. Gaich Victoria L. Smith Joseph J. Howe April 23, 2014

FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. Attn: Contracts Department VIA FACSIMILE: 3304361903

RE: NOTICE: RTO Expense Surcharge

Dear FirstEnergy Solutions Customer Care:

The City is in receipt of your letter dated March 14, 2014, where you state your intent to charge the City of Toledo a surcharge for the cold weather we experienced in January. While you call this surcharge a "Pass-Through-Event" Toledo does not believe it qualifies as such. We have been advised that PJM did not, in fact, charge FirstEnergy Solutions any RTO surcharge relative to the cold January. Accordingly, we dispute your claim to bill the City for 1-3% of our annual electric generation expenditure under section 31 of our contract, or any other provision of our contract.

The contract between our entities anticipates that we will attempt to resolve disputes in writing (and verbally) and in good faith. Therefore, the City, in good faith, disputes your ability to charge Toledo as you indicated. I would look forward to any information you have relative to the exact nature of the RTO surcharge your company received from PJM. Until and unless it can be clearly proven that the City has a duty to pay this charge, it will dispute such claim, and will withhold, in good faith, any amounts so claimed to be an RTO surcharge.



341 White Pond Drive Akron, Ohio 44320

March 14, 2014

11

Re: RTO Expense Surcharge

Dear Leslie Kovacik;

Thank you for selecting FirstEnergy Solutions as your electric generation supplier. As you know, January was an extremely cold month with temperatures reaching record lows, which resulted in a significant increase in energy consumption. In fact, PJM Interconnection – the regional transmission organization that coordinates reliability and the movement of wholesale electricity in our region – initiated emergency operations throughout the month of January.

During these periods of time, PJM incurred extremely high ancillary costs to purchase additional reserve generation needed to keep the bulk electric system reliable throughout these extreme conditions. These costs and additional charges were, in turn, invoiced by PJM to all suppliers serving customers throughout the region.

Pursuant to your agreement with FirstEnergy Solutions, these additional costs and charges are deemed a "Pass-Through Event." As a result, the electric generation costs for the month of January for your accounts served by FirstEnergy Solutions will be adjusted through a charge which will appear as a separate line item on your bill but will not change your contract price. We anticipate the amount of the charge to be approximately 1-3 percent of your annual electric generation expenditure. If your electric generation supply charges are billed by your electric utility, the charge will be reflected in bills rendered after June 1, 2014. If your electric generation supply charges are billed directly by FirstEnergy Solutions, the charge will be reflected in bills rendered after April 15, 2014. The charge appearing in your bill will be based upon your actual usage for the month of January.

This letter does not require you to take any action. This is simply a notification of this Pass-Through Event and that the additional costs and charges will be reflected in future electric bills.

If you have any questions or concerns regarding your charges or this notice, please feel free to visit our website at www.fes.com/RTOexpenseCI. Thank you once again for selecting FirstEnergy Solutions. We appreciate your business and look forward to being your electric generation supplier in the years ahead.

Sincerely,

FirstEnergy Solutions Customer Care

.

•

11

CITY OF TOLEDO

)



DEPARTMENT OF PUBLIC UTILITIES

September 30, 2014

FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. Customer Care A-SPSQ-B3 76 S. Main Street Akron, Ohio 44308

RE: Account # 56758115 RTO Expense Surcharge Dispute

Dear Sir/Madam:

As you will recall, FirstEnergy Solutions Inc., sent Toledo a letter on March 14, 2014 indicating it was going to be charging its customers for the polar vortex event this past January. The letter claimed this was a "Pass-Through-Event." The City responded on April 23, 2014 indicating it disputed the charge and that Toledo would not be paying said charge.

Please be advised that the City of Toledo received its June electric bill for the Division of Water Reclamation on July 3, 2014. It contained a line item for an RTO surcharge that the City disputes as a PUCO-approved charge. The City processed the June bill for a payment in the amount of \$122,021.98 for the above-referenced account. This amount represents the total bill minus the \$20,648.80 disputed "polar vortex" charge.

Sincerely,

When pr Edward A.

Director

EAM/mjs

Enclosures: Copy of June Electric Bill FES Letter Dated 3/14/14 City Letter Dated 4/23/14

cc: Alan Ruffell, Plant Administrator Michael Schreidah, Project Manager Leslie Kovacik, Senior Attorney

(First Energy 093014 letter)



You have made the right choice! We're glad you

selected FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. and will work hard to continue to earn your business.

If you have questions about this energy bill, please call us at 888-254-6359 before

the due date. Our hours are 8am to 5pm ET Monday through Friday. You may also write to us at 341 White

Pond Drive, Rm B2, Akron, Ohio 44320.

subject to a fate payment charge of 1.5% per month. To avoid fate fees, payment of the TOTAL AMOUNT DUE must be received in full by

Past due balances are

the due date.

Toledó, Cítý of 3900 N Súmmit St c/o Mike Schreidah, PE, Project Manager Toledo, OH 43611-3042

Account no: Billing Date: 56758115 June 30, 2014 Page 1

ACCOUNT SUMMARY INFORMATION

\$93,977.85 **Previous Balance** \$-93,977.85 Payment Received Adjustments ** \$20,648.80 \$20,648.80 Total Balance Forward \$122,021.98 Current Usage Charges * Total Current Charges \$122,021.98 See "Your Energy Charges" section for details. ** See "Other Charges and Adjustments" sections for details. \$142,670.78 **Total Amount Due** +122,021.98

\$20,648,80 RTO Expense Surcharge

Thanks for choosing FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. as your energy provider I

Detach here and return this portion with check or money order. Do not staple or fold.

FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. P.O. Box 3622 Akron, Ohio 44309-3622 Account Number Due Date Total Due 56758115 July 30, 2014 \$142,670:78

FESELSTK

Amount Enclosed

\$ 122,021,98

Please write your account number on your check or money orde inade payable to FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.

> FOR CHANGE OF ADDRESS: Please check here & complete ferm on reverse. Thank You.

Toledo, City of 3900 N SUMMIT ST C/O MIKE SCHREIDAH, PE, PROJECT MANAGER TOLEDO OH 43611-3042

իկիներիրը հերենիներիներիներին հերերերին հերենեներին

10000000000056758115201407300014267078

Solutions

Account no: Billing Date: 56758115 June 30, 2014 Page 2

GENERAL INFORMATION

Generation Charge: Charges for the production of electricity. Generation prices and charges are set by the electric generation supplier (EGS) you have chosen.

11

Transmission Charge: Charges for moving high voltage electricity from a generation facility to the distribution lines of an electric distribution company. The Federal Energy Regulatory Commission regulates transmission prices and services.

If you have problems with your energy service or need to report a problem, please contact your local utility company.

Teledo Edison 300 Madison Avenue Toledo, OH 436520001 Telephone: 1-800-447-3333

FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. does not handle service outages,

Mail notes and coorespondence in a separate envelope to:

FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. Customer Care A-SPSQ-B3 76 S Main Street Akron, OH 44308

Mail Payments to:

FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. P.O. Box 3622 Akron, OH 44309-3622

FESBLOTK

Change of Address? Please fill out and check the box on the reverse side. Thank You.

New Address

City

State or Province

Zip

Work Phone ()

Home Phone ()

	•	1.			
))1551 n (1550)	• •	1.			
Firstenerov		1.			
Solutions		•		Account no:	
		ż		Biiling Date:	
:	YOUR ENERGY CH	ARGES			Page 3
	3900 N SUMMIT ST, TO	LEDO OH		UTIL# 080074	884152250029571
	FirstEnergy Solutions (Electric Service	Corp.			•
	Mir.#685834319 Service Period May 15, 20 Service Period May 15, 20	14 to June 13, 201		Off Peak sage.	1,566,417.6 kWh
	1,400,994 kWh On Peak@ 1,586,417.6 kWh Off Peak Capacity - 4.306926 MW @ Capacity - 1.926797 MW @ Current Actual	@\$0.034/kWh Ge § \$20.449935 per	neration day for 17 days		\$63,465.03 \$53,258.20 \$2,083,04 \$3,216.71 \$122,021.98
	FirstEnergy Solutions (Other Charges and A		,		
	RTO Expense Surcharge	Charges and Adju	stments		\$20,648.80 \$ 20,648.80
	TOTAL ENERGY CHAR	GES FOR UTI	L#080078841522500)29571	\$ 142,670.78
					\$ 142,670.78

•••

·.

....

11

)

FESBLOTK

CITY OF TOLEDO



DEPARTMENT OF LAW

Adam W. Loukx Director of Law

General Section Paul Syring General Counsel Eileen Granata

Litigation Section Jeffrey B. Charles Chief of Litigation Merritt W. Green, III Ellen Grachek John T. Madigan Michael Kyser

<u>Taxation</u>

John E. Bibish IV Chief of Collections Jeffrey S. Colturi Pamela K. Billmaier

Risk Management

Merritt W. Green, III

<u>Utilities</u>

Leslie A. Kovacik Joyce Anagnos

Prosecutors

David L. Toska Chief Prosecutor Arturo M. Quintero Sharon D. Gaich Victoria L. Smith Joseph J. Howe Michelle S. Turvey-Albert J. Scott Kunzler Jimmie Jones Christopher Lawrence Rebecca L. West-Estell Henry J. Schaefer

<u>Claims Investigation</u> Lois Cannon; Claims Lt. Robert Hellom Civil Liability April 23, 2014

FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. Attn: Contracts Department VIA FACSIMILE: 3304361903

RE: NOTICE: RTO Expense Surcharge

Dear FirstEnergy Solutions Customer Care:

The City is in receipt of your letter dated March 14, 2014, where you state your intent to charge the City of Toledo a surcharge for the cold weather we experienced in January. While you call this surcharge a "Pass-Through-Event" Toledo does not believe it qualifies as such. We have been advised that PJM did not, in fact, charge FirstEnergy Solutions any RTO surcharge relative to the cold January. Accordingly, we dispute your claim to bill the City for 1-3% of our annual electric generation expenditure under section 31 of our contract, or any other provision of our contract.

The contract between our entities anticipates that we will attempt to resolve disputes in writing (and verbally) and in good faith. Therefore, the City, in good faith, disputes your ability to charge Toledo as you indicated. I would look forward to any information you have relative to the exact nature of the RTO surcharge your company received from PJM. Until and unless it can be clearly proven that the City has a duty to pay this charge, it will dispute such claim, and will withhold, in good faith, any amounts so claimed to be an RTO surcharge.

Sincerely Veslie A. Kovadik

cc: Robert R.^JReinbolt, Chief of Staff Adam W. Loukx, Director of Law

420 Madison Ave., Fourth Floor Toledo, OH 43604 U.S.A. leslie.kovacik@toledo.oh.gov



341 White Pond Drive Akron, Ohio 44320

March 14, 2014

Toledo, City of One Govt Ctr Ste 2120 348 S Erie St Toledo, OH 43604-8633

Re: RTO Expense Surcharge

Dear Leslie Kovacik:

Thank you for selecting FirstEnergy Solutions as your electric generation supplier. As you know, January was an extremely cold month with temperatures reaching record lows, which resulted in a significant increase in energy consumption. In fact, PJM Interconnection – the regional transmission organization that coordinates reliability and the movement of wholesale electricity in our region – initiated emergency operations throughout the month of January.

During these periods of time, PJM incurred extremely high ancillary costs to purchase additional reserve generation needed to keep the bulk electric system reliable throughout these extreme conditions. These costs and additional charges were, in turn, invoiced by PJM to all suppliers serving customers throughout the region.

Pursuant to your agreement with FirstEnergy Solutions, these additional costs and charges are deemed a "Pass-Through Event." As a result, the electric generation costs for the month of January for your accounts served by FirstEnergy Solutions will be adjusted through a charge which will appear as a separate line item on your bill but will not change your contract price. We anticipate the amount of the charge to be approximately 1-3 percent of your annual electric generation expenditure. If your electric generation supply charges are billed by your electric utility, the charge will be reflected in bills rendered after June 1, 2014. If your electric generation supply charges are billed directly by FirstEnergy Solutions, the charge will be reflected in bills rendered after April 15, 2014. The charge appearing in your bill will be based upon your actual usage for the month of January.

This letter does not require you to take any action. This is simply a notification of this Pass-Through Event and that the additional costs and charges will be reflected in future electric bills.

If you have any questions or concerns regarding your charges or this notice, please feel free to visit our website at www.fes.com/RTOexpenseCI. Thank you once again for selecting FirstEnergy Solutions. We appreciate your business and look forward to being your electric generation supplier in the years ahead.

Sincerely,

FirstEnergy Solutions Customer Care

11

Solutions

Solutions

341 White Pond Drive Akron, OH 44320 Billing Date
10/06/2014

Service Address 3900 N SUMMIT ST TOLEDO, OH 43611

Customer / Account No. 080078841522	5002957 [.]	Page 1 1 1 of 2
RTO Exp Surcharge	Invoice	
RTO Expense Surcharge \$ 20,648.80		Sales Tax \$ 0.00
; count's RTO Expense Surcha	rge, which is	6

RE: Customer / Account Number 08007884152250029571

Dear Customer,

The Past Due Amount shown above reflects charges for your account's RTO Expense Surcharge, which is authorized under the terms of your Agreement with FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. If you do not pay the past-due balance, you will be in breach of your Agreement for failure to pay amounts when due.

If full payment of the Past Due Amount is not received within 30 days, collections activity will be initiated. Per the Agreement, you will be obligated to pay all costs, including late charges, on the Past Due Amount as a result of your default.

In addition, if the account is active, your service with FirstEnergy Solutions will be cancelled – subject to the local distribution company rules and regulations – and returned to your utility's default service. You will continue to be responsible for paying for service delivered up to and including the effective termination date. You also will be obligated per the Agreement to pay all costs associated with early termination as a result of your default.

For more information about the RTO Expense Surcharge, you can visit fes.com/RTOexpenseCl or call FirstEnergy Solutions at 1-888-809-8436, weekdays between 8 a.m. and 5 p.m.

Detach and return bottom portion with payment.

First Energy PO BOX 3622 AKRON OH 44309-3622	Service Address 3900 N SUMMIT ST TOLEDO, OH 43611 Due Date	Customer / Account No. 08007884152250029571 ABP# 56758115 Billing Date Total Amount Due
	11/05/2014 \$	10/06/2014 \$ 20,648.80
III Y Y III Y IIII Y III Y IIII Y III Y II		unt number on your check or money FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.

:

10000000000056758115201410060002064880

		.)	
FirstEnergy	Billing Date 10/06/2014	Account No. 08007884152250029571	Page 2 of 2
Solutions		······································	
How to Reach us			
Office Hours			
Monday through Friday 8:00 a.m. EST – 5:00 p.m. EST			
For more information regarding the surcharge please visit www.fes.com/RTOexpenseCI. You may also-eall us at 1-888-809-8436 or write to us at: 341 White Pond Drive, Rm B2 Akron, Ohio 44320.		-	
	•		
		:	
		, ,	
		1	
	Detach and return bottom porti	ion with neumont	
Address Information Changes		PLACE THIS STUB SO THAT THE	
Effective Date:		REMIT TO ADDRESS SHOWS THROUGH THE WINDOW OF THE	
New Address:	-		
City:Stat		\sim	
Work Phone: ()			
Home Phone: ()		┑┫╍┺╫║║╫╫╫╫╫╢╢╢╢╢╢╎╢╢╎╢╢╎╝║╢╖╻╌ ╡╍┺╫║║╢╫╫╢╫╢╢╢╢╢╢╢╢╢╢╢╢╢╢╢╢╖╻╛╢╢	 1]
		FirstEnergy Solutions PO BOX 3622 AKRON OH 44309-3622	

11

ł