

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

- - -

In the Matter of the :  
Application of the Ohio :  
Development Services :  
Agency for an Order :  
Approving Adjustments to : Case No. 15-1046-EL-USF  
the Universal Service Fund:  
Riders of Jurisdictional :  
Ohio Electric Distribution:  
Utilities. :

- - -

PROCEEDINGS

before Ms. Greta See, Attorney Examiner, at the  
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio, 180 East Broad  
Street, Room 11-D, Columbus, Ohio, called at 10 a.m.  
on Tuesday, December 1, 2015.

- - -

ARMSTRONG & OKEY, INC.  
222 East Town Street, Second Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-5201  
(614) 224-9481 - (800) 223-9481  
Fax - (614) 224-5724

- - -

APPEARANCES:

Bricker & Eckler, LLP  
By Mr. Dane Stinson  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

On behalf of the Applicant.

FirstEnergy Corp.  
By Ms. Carrie M. Dunn  
76 South Main Street  
Akron, Ohio 44308

On behalf of The Cleveland Electric  
Illuminating Company, Toledo Edison  
Company, and Ohio Edison Company.

McNees, Wallace & Nurick LLC  
By Mr. Matthew Pritchard  
21 East State Street, Suite 910  
Columbus, Ohio 43215

On behalf of the IEU Ohio.

The Dayton Power and Light Company  
By Mr. Michael Schuler  
and Ms. Judi L. Sobecki  
1065 Woodman Avenue  
Dayton, Ohio 45432

On behalf of The Dayton Power and Light  
Company.

Bruce E. Weston,  
Ohio Consumers' Counsel  
By Mr. Ajay Kumar,  
Assistant Consumers' Counsel  
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485

On behalf of the Residential Consumers of  
Ohio.

- - -

1 APPEARANCES:

2 American Electric Power  
3 By Mr. Matthew J. Satterwhite  
4 1 Riverside Plaza  
5 Columbus, Ohio 43215

6 On behalf of the Ohio Power Company.

7 Mike DeWine, Ohio Attorney General  
8 By Mr. William Wright, Section Chief  
9 Mr. Thomas W. McNamee,  
10 Assistant Attorney General  
11 180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor  
12 Columbus, Ohio 43215

13 On behalf of the Staff of the PUCO.

14 - - -  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

INDEX

- - -

Witness	Page
Susan M. Moser	
Direct Testimony by Mr. Stinson	7

- - -

ODSA Exhibit	Identified	Admitted
1 Amended Application	8	13
2 Testimony of Randall Hunt	8	13
3 Supplemental Testimony of Susan M. Moser	8	13
4 Testimony in Support of Joint Stipulation by Susan M. Moser	10	13
5 Application	12	13

- - -

Joint Exhibit	Identified	Admitted
1 Joint Stipulation and Recommendation	9	13

- - -

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

Tuesday Morning Session,  
December 1, 2015.

- - -

EXAMINER SEE: Scheduled for hearing  
before the Commission today at this time is Case No.  
15-1046-EL-USF, being entitled In the Matter of the  
Application of the Ohio Development Services Agency  
for an Order Approving Adjustments to the Universal  
Service Riders of Jurisdictional Ohio Electric  
Distribution Utilities.

My name is Greta See, and I am the  
Attorney Examiner assigned to this case by the  
Commission.

At this time I would like to take  
appearances of the parties. On behalf of Ohio  
Development Services Agency.

MR. STINSON: Yes, your Honor. On behalf  
of the Ohio Development Services Agency, the law firm  
of Bricker & Eckler, LLP, Dane Stinson, 100 South  
Third Street, Columbus, Ohio 43215.

I've also been authorized to make an  
appearance on behalf of the FirstEnergy operating  
companies which would be The Cleveland Electric  
Illuminating Company, Toledo Edison Company, and Ohio  
Edison Company, Carrie Dunn, FirstEnergy Corporation,

1 76 South Main Street, Akron, Ohio 44308.

2 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. On behalf of Ohio  
3 Consumers' Counsel.

4 MR. KUMAR: On behalf of the Ohio  
5 Consumers' Counsel Bruce Weston and the Residential  
6 Consumers of Ohio, I'm Ajay Kumar.

7 EXAMINER SEE: On behalf of the  
8 Industrial Energy Users of Ohio.

9 MR. PRITCHARD: On behalf of IEU Ohio,  
10 Matt Pritchard with the law firm McNees, Wallace &  
11 Nurick, LLC, 21 East State Street, Columbus, Ohio  
12 43215.

13 EXAMINER SEE: On behalf of Ohio Partners  
14 for Affordable Energy.

15 On behalf of Ohio Power Company.

16 Let the record reflect that counsel for  
17 OP&E and Ohio Power are not present.

18 On behalf of Duke Energy.

19 On behalf of Dayton Power and Light  
20 Company.

21 MR. SCHULER: Good morning, your Honor.  
22 On behalf of the Dayton Power and Light Company,  
23 Michael Schuler and Judi Sobecki, 1065 Woodman Drive,  
24 Dayton, Ohio 45432.

25 EXAMINER SEE: Okay.

MR. McNAMEE: On behalf of the staff of the Public Utilities Commission, Thomas McNamee, Assistant Attorney General. The address is 180 East Broad Street, Columbus, Ohio.

EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Mr. Stinson.

MR. STINSON: Yes, your Honor. At this point we would call Susan M. Moser. And if I may approach, your Honor.

EXAMINER SEE: Yes.

(Witness sworn.)

EXAMINER SEE: Thank you. Have a seat.

- - -

SUSAN M. MOSER

being first duly sworn, as prescribed by law, was examined and testified as follows:

DIRECT EXAMINATION

By Mr. Stinson:

Q. Ms. Moser, would you please state your full name for the record.

A. Susan M. Dell Moser.

Q. And what is your business address?

A. It's 77 South High Street, Columbus, Ohio 43215.

Q. And by whom are you employed and in what capacity?

1           A.    I am employed by the Ohio Development  
2           Services Agency.  I am the section supervisor for  
3           E -- for the Electric Partnership Program and the  
4           PIPP Plus Program.

5           Q.    Ms. Moser, I placed before you what's  
6           been marked as ODSA Exhibit 1.  Could you identify  
7           that for the record, please.

8           A.    I can.  This is the amended application  
9           that we filed that updated numbers from the  
10          application that was filed in the end of October.

11          Q.    And is that a true and accurate copy of  
12          that amended application?

13          A.    It is.

14          Q.    You also have before you what's been  
15          marked as ODSA Exhibit No. 2.  And can you identify  
16          that for the record.

17          A.    Yes.  This is the testimony of Randall  
18          Hunt that was filed on October 30, 2015.

19          Q.    And is that a true and accurate copy of  
20          Mr. Hunt's testimony?

21          A.    It is.

22          Q.    And I've placed before you as well a copy  
23          of ODSA Exhibit No. 3.  Could you identify that.

24          A.    Yes.  This is my supplemental testimony  
25          on behalf of -- in conjunction with the amended



1 application and this was filed on November 27, 2015.

2 Q. And is that a true and accurate copy of  
3 your supplemental testimony?

4 A. It is.

5 Q. Do you have any additions or revisions or  
6 corrections to that testimony?

7 A. Yes, I do. There's a slight error on  
8 page 11. In the middle of the paragraph, it is line  
9 12, where we are stating that the DP&L rider rate  
10 will decrease, that is incorrect. The Duke rider  
11 rate will decrease.

12 Q. Thank you. If I were to ask you the same  
13 questions, would your answers as revised be the same  
14 ODSA Exhibit 3?

15 A. Yes.

16 Q. Thank you. You also have before you  
17 what's been marked as Joint Exhibit No. 1. Can you  
18 identify that, please.

19 A. Yes. This is the joint stipulation that  
20 was -- that we just did.

21 Q. And is that a true and accurate copy of  
22 the stipulation and recommendation in this  
23 proceeding?

24 A. It is.

25 Q. And, finally, I placed before you what's

1       been marked as ODSA Exhibit No. 4. Could you  
2       identify that, please.

3               A. Yes. That's my testimony in support of  
4       the joint stipulation.

5               Q. And is that a true and accurate copy of  
6       your testimony in support?

7               A. It is.

8               Q. And if I -- do you have any additions or  
9       corrections, deletions to that testimony?

10              A. I do not.

11              Q. If I were to ask you the same questions  
12       today, would your answers be the same?

13              A. Yes.

14              MR. STINSON: Thank you.

15              No further questions, your Honor. I move  
16       the admission of ODSA Exhibits 1 through 4 and Joint  
17       Exhibit 1, subject to cross-examination.

18              EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Any  
19       cross-examination for this witness, Mr. Schuler?

20              MR. SCHULER: No, your Honor.

21              EXAMINER SEE: Mr. Kumar?

22              MR. KUMAR: No, your Honor.

23              EXAMINER SEE: Mr. Pritchard?

24              MR. PRITCHARD: No, your Honor.

25              EXAMINER SEE: And, Mr. Satterwhite, I

1 need you to enter an appearance.

2 MR. SATTERWHITE: Yes. My apologies for  
3 my tardiness. Matthew Satterwhite on behalf of Ohio  
4 Power, 1 Riverside Plaza, Columbus, Ohio. I have no  
5 questions.

6 EXAMINER SEE: And staff.

7 MR. McNAMEE: Likewise staff has no  
8 questions.

9 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Are there any  
10 objections to the admission of ODSA Exhibit 1, ODSA  
11 Exhibit 2 -- I'm sorry. Exhibit 1 is the amended  
12 application; ODSA Exhibit 2 is the testimony of  
13 Randall Hunt; ODSA Exhibit 3, the supplemental  
14 testimony of Susan Moser; and Joint Exhibit 1. Are  
15 there any objections?

16 MR. McNAMEE: No objections.

17 MR. PRITCHARD: No objections.

18 MR. SCHULER: No.

19 MR. STINSON: Your Honor, there is also  
20 ODSA Exhibit 4 which is in support of the  
21 stipulation.

22 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Any objection to  
23 the ODSA Exhibit 4?

24 MR. McNAMEE: No objection.

25 EXAMINER SEE: Mr. Stinson, were you

1 going to mark the original application?

2 MR. STINSON: I haven't in the past, but  
3 if your Honor wishes me to do so, we can submit that  
4 as ODSA Exhibit 5. I can provide that to the court  
5 reporter later.

6 EXAMINER SEE: Yes, because I believe  
7 there are a couple of issues covered in the original  
8 application that aren't addressed in the  
9 supplemental.

10 MR. STINSON: Okay. I will do that. We  
11 will mark that as ODSA Exhibit 5.

12 EXAMINER SEE: Are there any objections  
13 to the admission of ODSA Exhibit 5?

14 MR. McNAMEE: No.

15 MR. PRITCHARD: None, your Honor.

16 MR. SCHULER: No, your Honor.

17 EXAMINER SEE: Then ODSA Exhibits 1  
18 through 5 are admitted into the record as are Joint  
19 Exhibits 1 and 2.

20 MR. STINSON: Your Honor, there is only  
21 Joint Exhibit 1 which is the stipulation and  
22 recommendation.

23 EXAMINER SEE: Okay, okay. Joint Exhibit  
24 1 and then the supplemental -- the testimony in  
25 support of the stipulation is?

1 MR. STINSON: We marked that as ODSA  
2 Exhibit 4.

3 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Are there any  
4 objections by any party to any of these exhibits that  
5 have been marked?

6 MR. McNAMEE: No objection.

7 MR. SATTERWHITE: None.

8 MR. KUMAR: No, your Honor.

9 MR. SCHULER: No, your Honor.

10 EXAMINER SEE: Good answer. Okay. With  
11 that the exhibits are admitted into the record.

12 (EXHIBITS ADMITTED INTO EVIDENCE.)

13 EXAMINER SEE: Is there anything further?

14 MR. KUMAR: Your Honor.

15 EXAMINER SEE: Yes.

16 MR. KUMAR: I would just like to note for  
17 the record that OCC neither opposes nor supports the  
18 stipulation.

19 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Thank you.

20 Mr. McNamee.

21 MR. McNAMEE: Your Honor, you will notice  
22 on your review of the stipulation that the staff has  
23 not signed it. That should not be taken as  
24 opposition to the stipulation. As you are aware, the  
25 staff's role in this case is somewhat limited to

1 performing a mathematical review. That's been done.  
2 There were no problems indicated and so staff has no  
3 objection in this case.

4 EXAMINER SEE: Okay.

5 MR. SATTERWHITE: If I may, your Honor.

6 EXAMINER SEE: Yes.

7 MR. SATTERWHITE: Ohio Power didn't have  
8 the right people in place to review in time, but it's  
9 my expectation that we will sign a letter in support  
10 of the stipulation.

11 EXAMINER SEE: And, Mr. Satterwhite, when  
12 do you expect to be able to file that letter?

13 MR. SATTERWHITE: Hopefully tomorrow.  
14 This week. This month -- no.

15 EXAMINER SEE: Okay.

16 MR. SATTERWHITE: We certainly don't  
17 oppose. I am just trying to get the extra step so  
18 that we can file something in support.

19 EXAMINER SEE: Mr. Satterwhite, I will  
20 expect a letter from Ohio Power indicating whether it  
21 opposes or takes no position on the joint stipulation  
22 by the end of the week and that means by no later  
23 than 5:30 on Friday, December 4.

24 MR. SATTERWHITE: Thank you.

25 EXAMINER SEE: Okay. Is there anything

1 further?

2 MR. McNAMEE: Nothing.

3 EXAMINER SEE: If there is nothing  
4 further, the hearing is adjourned.

5 (Thereupon, the hearing was concluded at  
6 10:15 a.m.)

7 - - -

8 CERTIFICATE

9 I do hereby certify that the foregoing is  
10 a true and correct transcript of the proceedings  
11 taken by me in this matter on Tuesday, December 1,  
12 2015, and carefully compared with my original  
13 stenographic notes.

14  
15  
16 

---

Karen Sue Gibson, Registered  
17 Merit Reporter.

18 (KSG-6121)

19 - - -  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**12/8/2015 1:13:19 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 15-1046-EL-USF**

Summary: Transcript in the matter of the Ohio Development Services Agency hearing held on 12/01/15 electronically filed by Mr. Ken Spencer on behalf of Armstrong & Okey, Inc. and Gibson, Karen Sue Mrs.