



March 20, 2015

Docketing Division  
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
180 Broad Street, 11th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215

**Re: Case No. 14-1297-EL-SSO: Correction to the Direct Testimony of Tyler Comings**

Dear Docketing Division Staff:

Enclosed please find corrections to the Direct Testimony of Tyler Comings, which was originally filed with the Commission on December 22, 2014. These changes correct a few typographic errors and inadvertent oversights on page 48 of Mr. Comings's testimony. These minor corrections do not substantively affect the conclusions and opinions provided in Mr. Comings's testimony and the accompanying exhibits.

Because these changes are being made to portions of testimony that have been designated confidential, we request that this corrected testimony be granted confidential treatment pursuant to the Motion for Protective Order that Sierra Club filed on December 22, 2014. We are filing both a clean and a redlined version of the corrected version of confidential page 48, as well as a redacted version of that page.

Please let us know if you have any questions or concerns.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "C. J. Allwein".

/s/ Christopher J. Allwein

Christopher J. Allwein, Counsel of Record  
(#0084914)

Williams Allwein and Moser, LLC

1500 West Third Ave, Suite 330

Columbus, Ohio 43212

Telephone: (614) 429-3092

Fax: (614) 670-8896

E-mail: callwein@wamenergylaw.com

Shannon Fisk

Earthjustice

1617 John F. Kennedy Blvd., Suite 1675

Philadelphia, PA 19103

Telephone: (215) 717-4522

E-mail: sfisk@earthjustice.org

Michael Soules  
Earthjustice  
1625 Massachusetts Ave. NW, Suite 702  
Washington, DC 20036  
Telephone: (202) 797-5237  
E-mail: msoules@earthjustice.org

Tony G. Mendoza  
Sierra Club  
85 Second Street, Second Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94105-3459  
Telephone: 415-977-5589  
Fax: (415) 977-5793  
Email: tony.mendoza@sierraclub.org

*Counsel for Sierra Club*

cc: All counsel for parties in PUCO Case No. 14-1297-EL-SSO

Clifty Creek. The Companies' valuation is shaded (in the upper left corner) of each table with changes to carbon costs across the columns and changes to fixed variables (capacity prices and SCR costs) across the rows.

As the results for Sammis show, the use of a [REDACTED] [REDACTED] and requirement of SCR systems on Sammis units 1 through 5 would render the entire plant [REDACTED] using the Companies' model—a [REDACTED] over the 15-year period. The use of the Companies' carbon price with [REDACTED] capacity prices and SCR costs, would [REDACTED] the market value to [REDACTED]

**COMPETITIVELY SENSITIVE** [REDACTED] **Table 7:**  
**Sammis Plant Market Value with Sensitivities**  
**(NPV, \$2015 mil)**

(S) [REDACTED] (U) [REDACTED]

As the results for the OVEC units show, the use of a [REDACTED] [REDACTED] and requirement of an SCR system on Clifty Creek unit 6 would [REDACTED] the valuation of the units from [REDACTED] to [REDACTED] over the 15-year period using the Companies' model. The use of the Companies' carbon price with [REDACTED] capacity prices and SCR costs, [REDACTED] the market value to

**COMPETITIVELY SENSITIVE** [REDACTED] **Table 8:**  
**OVEC Plants Market Value with Sensitivities**  
**(NPV, \$2015 mil)**



**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**3/20/2015 3:06:05 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 14-1297-EL-SSO**

Summary: Correspondence and Testimony Corrections for Tyler Comings (REDACTED)  
electronically filed by Mr. Christopher J. Allwein on behalf of SIERRA CLUB