

FILE

9

BakerHostetler

RECEIVED-DOCKETING DIV  
2015 MAR 19 AM 10:29

PUCO

Baker&Hostetler LLP

PNC Center  
1900 East 9th Street, Suite 3200  
Cleveland, OH 44114-3482

T 216.621.0200  
F 216.696.0740  
www.bakerlaw.com

March 18, 2015

VIA UPS

Gretchen L. Lange  
direct dial: 216.861.7688  
glange@bakerlaw.com

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
Docketing Division  
180 East Broad Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3793

Re: Case No. 12-0160-EL-GBN

Dear Sir or Madam:

In connection with Gamesa Wind US, LLC's ("Gamesa") Motion to Extend Protective Order filed electronically on March 17, 2015 (the "Motion"), and pursuant to Rule 4906:7-07(H)(4)(b), enclosed please find three copies of documents Gamesa seeks to protect pursuant to the Motion. As stated in the Motion, the information contained within these documents is sensitive and confidential trade secret information and should be protected from public disclosure. Accordingly, Gamesa requests that the enclosed documents be filed under seal and kept confidential.

Please let me know if you have any questions or need additional information.

Very truly yours,

  
Gretchen L. Lange

Enclosures

606046027.1

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business.  
Technician \_\_\_\_\_ Date Processed MAR 19 2015

Chicago Cincinnati Cleveland Columbus Costa Mesa  
Denver Houston Los Angeles New York Orlando Washington, DC

BEFORE THE OHIO POWER SITING BOARD

In the Matter of the Application of  
Champaign Wind LLC for a Certificate  
to Install Electricity Generating Wind  
Turbines in Champaign County

)  
) Case No. 12-0160-EL-BGN  
)  
)  
)  
)  
)

---

MOTION TO EXTEND PROTECTIVE ORDER FILED BY GAMESA WIND US, LLC

---

On May 28, 2013, the Ohio Power Siting Board (the "Board") granted the Motion for Protective Order filed by Gamesa Wind US, LLC ("Gamesa") on November 13, 2012 to keep certain documents, namely the Gamesa General Characteristics Manual for the G97 turbine model (the "Manual"), confidential (the "Order").

Gamesa, by and through its attorneys, and pursuant to Rule 4906-7-07(H) of the Ohio Administrative Code, now moves the Board to extend the Order and keep the documents confidential for an additional eighteen months for the reasons stated below and in the accompanying Memorandum in Support:

1. Gamesa competes with other wind turbine companies for contracts to supply turbines to wind energy projects, such as the Champaign Wind LLC project, throughout the world;
2. As this Board previously found, detailed information about Gamesa's G97 turbine in the Manual constitutes trade secret materials;

3. Gamesa does not share this information with the general public and requires confidentiality agreements from customers to which it supplies this information;
4. Gamesa is at a competitive disadvantage against its competitors and in the marketplace generally if this information becomes publically available;
5. Portions of the trade secret materials disclosed to the Board were only disclosed to the Board for the limited purpose of evaluating Gamesa's October 26, 2012 Motion for Protective Order, which the Board subsequently granted; and
6. Disclosure of the Manual could result in a misuse of this confidential, proprietary and trade secret information.

For these reasons, Gamesa moves the Board to grant its Motion to Extend Protective Order. Consistent with the requirements of Rule 4906-7-07(H)(4)(b) of the Ohio Administrative Code, and for the convenience of the Board, three (3) unredacted copies of the relevant documents are being submitted again under seal.

A memorandum in support of this Motion is filed herewith.

Date: March 17, 2015

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Gretchen L. Lange

Martin T. Booher (0090333)  
Gretchen L. Lange (0080857)  
Baker & Hostetler LLP  
3200 PNC Center  
1900 E. 9<sup>th</sup> St.  
Cleveland, Ohio 44114-3485  
(216) 861-6814  
[mbooher@bakerlaw.com](mailto:mbooher@bakerlaw.com)  
[glange@bakerlaw.com](mailto:glange@bakerlaw.com)

Counsel for Gamesa Wind US, LLC

BEFORE THE OHIO POWER SITING BOARD

In the Matter of the Application of  
Champaign Wind LLC for a Certificate  
to Install Electricity Generating Wind  
Turbines in Champaign County

)  
) Case No. 12-0160-EL-BGN  
)  
)  
)  
)  
)

---

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF GAMESA WIND US, LLC'S MOTION TO EXTEND  
PROTECTIVE ORDER

---

Gamesa Wind US LLC ("Gamesa") seeks an extension of the protective order entered by the Ohio Power Siting Board (the "Board") in the above-captioned case on May 28, 2013 (the "Order") pursuant to Ohio Administrative Code ("OAC") 4906-7-07(H)(4), which found certain documents produced by Gamesa, namely the Gamesa General Characteristics Manual for the G97 turbine model (the "Manual"), to contain confidential trade secret information.

**Introduction**

In the above-captioned proceeding, to which Gamesa is not a party, upon application by Intervenor Union Neighbors United, Inc., Julie Johnson, and Robert and Diane McConnell, Gamesa was served with a subpoena duces tecum (the "Subpoena") that requested Gamesa's trade secret information. Gamesa filed Motions for Protective Order before this Board to prevent public disclosure of trade secret information on October 26, 2012 and November 13, 2012. On May 28, 2013, the Board entered an

Order finding the Manual to contain trade secret information and granting Gamesa the protection it sought. Gamesa now seeks an extension of the protections ordered in the Board's Order to keep information within the Manual, which remains highly sensitive trade secret information, confidential.

### Argument

#### I. Standard of Law

The Manual should remain confidential and protected from public disclosure because, as this Board previously held, the Manual satisfies the requirements of Rule 4906-7-07(H)(4) and constitutes trade secrets under Ohio law.

Rule 4906-7-07(H)(4) provides that the Board may issue any order "necessary to protect the confidentiality of information contained in the document, to the extent that state or federal law prohibits release of the information." Rule 4906-7-07(H)(4) also states that such a standard is met when the information is deemed "to constitute a trade secret under Ohio law, and where non-disclosure of the information is not inconsistent with the purpose of Title 49 of the Revised Code."<sup>1</sup>

Section 1333.61(D) of the Revised Code defines "trade secret" as:

[I]nformation, including the whole or any portion or phase of any scientific or technical information, design, process, procedure, formula, pattern, compilation, program, device, method, technique, or improvement, or any business information or plans, financial information, or listing of names, addresses, or telephone numbers, that satisfies both of the following:

- (1) It derives independent economic value, actual or potential, from not being generally known to, and not being readily ascertainable by proper

---

<sup>1</sup> The requirement of Rule 4906-7-07(H)(2) that Gamesa must exhaust all other reasonable means of resolving any differences with the party seeking discovery is inapplicable. While Gamesa has been informed that a public records request has been received by the Board, Gamesa does not know the identity of the requesting party.

means by, other persons who can obtain economic value from its disclosure or use.

(2) It is the subject of efforts that are reasonable under the circumstances to maintain its secrecy.

R.C. 1333.61(D). The Ohio Supreme Court has also identified six factors to consider when determining if information constitutes trade secrets:

1. The extent to which the information is known outside the business;
2. The extent to which it is known to those inside the business, i.e., by the employees;
3. The precautions taken by the holder of the trade secret to guard the secrecy of the information;
4. The savings effected and the value to the holder in having the information as against competitors;
5. The amount of effort or money expended in obtaining and developing the information; and
6. The amount of time and expense it would take for others to acquire and duplicate the information.

*State ex rel. The Plain Dealer v. Ohio Dept. of Ins.*, 80 Ohio St.3d 513, 524-525 (1997).

## II. Analysis

The Board reviewed Section 1333.61(D) and the *Plain Dealer* factors in its May 28, 2013 Order and found:

Applying the requirements that the information have independent economic value and be the subject of reasonable efforts to maintain its secrecy pursuant to Section 1333.61(D), Revised Code, as well as the six-factor test set forth by the Ohio Supreme Court, the Board finds that the redacted information contained in the Gamesa General Characteristics Manual for the G97 turbine model contains trade secret information. Its release is, therefore, prohibited under state law. The Board also finds that nondisclosure of this information is not inconsistent with the purposes of Title 49 of the Revised Code. Therefore, the Board finds that Gamesa's motion for protective order is reasonable with regard to the redacted information contained in the Gamesa General Characteristics Manual for the G97 turbine model and should be granted.

The status of the noise data within the Manual as trade secret information has not changed. Gamesa continues to take all reasonable precautions to guard the

information's secrecy. This information is not known outside of Gamesa's business, and is only provided to legitimate customers under the condition of confidentiality and is not provided to potential customers or any other party unless a confidentiality agreement containing appropriate terms has been executed. Further, employees of Gamesa are given access to this information only on a need-to-know basis.

Similarly, the value to Gamesa of keeping this information confidential, and the potential competitive advantage that Gamesa's competitors could obtain through this information, has not changed. Gamesa expended significant funds and resources to create the Manual, which is based on the noise data collected by Gamesa and the proprietary design and development of Gamesa's G97 turbines. Replicating the Manual's trade secret information would require Gamesa's competitors to spend extensive amounts of money and resources as doing so would require access to the G97 turbines, which Gamesa restricts. Public disclosure of the information in the Manual could be damaging Gamesa, as, for example, Gamesa's competitors could use it in their marketing efforts to Gamesa's disadvantage. For these reasons, Gamesa actively protects its trade secret information.

Finally, the protection of trade secret information from public disclosure is consistent with the purposes of R.C. Title 49 because the Board has access to the information, but at the same time the information is protected from other competitors. Thus the continued protection of Gamesa's trade secret information will not impair the Board's regulatory responsibilities.

For each of these reasons, Gamesa's information contained with the Manual remains a trade secret.

### Conclusion

Pursuant to Rule 4906-7-07(H)(4), Gamesa respectfully requests the Board to issue an order extending its May 28, 2013 Protective Order for an additional eighteen months.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Gretchen L. Lange

Martin T. Booher (0090333)  
Gretchen L. Lange (0080857)  
Baker & Hostettler LLP  
3200 PNC Center  
1900 E. 9<sup>th</sup> St.  
Cleveland, Ohio 44114-3485  
(216) 861-6814  
[mbooher@bakerlaw.com](mailto:mbooher@bakerlaw.com)  
[glange@bakerlaw.com](mailto:glange@bakerlaw.com)

Counsel for Gamesa Wind US, LLC



### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing document was filed electronically on March 17, 2015 and was served by operation of the PUCO's electronic filing system upon all consenting parties. The foregoing document was also served upon the following parties via U.S. Mail:

Chad A. Endsley  
Chief Legal Counsel  
Ohio Farm Bureau Federation  
280 North High Street  
PO Box 182383  
Columbus, Ohio 43218-2383

Kevin S. Talebi  
Champaign County Prosecuting Attorney's  
Office  
200 N. Main Street  
Urbana, Ohio 43078

EDP Renewables North America, LLC  
c/o CT Corporation System, Statutory  
Agent  
1300 East Ninth Street  
Cleveland, OH 44114

Breanne N. Parcels  
Kerry Brugger  
City of Urbana  
205 S. Main Street  
Urbana, Ohio 43078

Everpower Wind Holdings, Inc.  
24 W. 40<sup>th</sup> Street, 12<sup>th</sup> Floor  
New York, NY 10018-1094

/s/ Gretchen L. Lange  
Gretchen L. Lange  
Counsel for Gamesa Wind US, LLC

606036273.4