RECEIVED

APR 2 5 1994

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

DOCKETING DIVISION PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF CHIC

IN THE MATTER OF THE	0 0
APPLICATION OF THE OHIO	:
BELL TELEPHONE COMPANY FOR	: Case No. 93-487-TP-ALT
APPROVAL OF AN ALTERNATIVE	:
FORM OF REGULATION	:
	:
IN THE MATTER OF THE	:
COMPLAINT OF THE OFFICE OF	: Case No. 93-576-TP-C55
THE CONSUMERS' COUNSEL,	:
	:
Complainant	:
	:
ν.	:
	:
OHIO BELL TELEPHONE COMPANY,	:
	:
Respondent.	•

THE OHIO DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES' OBJECTIONS AND COMMENTS TO STAFF REPORT

Now comes the Ohio Department of Administrative Services, an agency of the State of Ohio and a party to the above-captioned proceedings, and hereby submits its objections and comments (attached hereto) to the Staff Report issued by the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio.

Respectfully submitted,

LEE FISHER Attorney General

DANIEL A. MALKOFF Atty. Reg. No. 0029917 Assistant Attorney General 30 E. Broad Street, 26th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215-3428 (614) 466-2980

<u>MEMORANDUM OF OBJECTIONS AND COMMENTS</u> <u>BY THE OHIO DEPARTMENT OF ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES</u>

The Ohio Department of Administrative Services (ODAS) has reviewed the staff report recently issued by the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio, and is supportive of the staff report of investigation. ODAS believes that the staff has done a thorough analysis of the plan as submitted by the applicant.

However, the staff report raises several issues that ODAS wishes to comment on. The following comments deal with issues that ODAS believes are important and should be emphasized in the disposition of this case:

1. The Price Cap should not be approved unless the modifications are made in the areas of productivity offset, quality of service adjustments and exogenous events adjustments. ODAS agrees that the Productivity Offset should be higher than the 1.9 percent offered by the applicant. The rate of 3.3 percent established by the FCC should be the minimal acceptable.

Regarding quality of service, it has been the experience of ODAS that the quality of service provided since Ameritech centralized operational control in Chicago has been declining, and is currently not acceptable to ODAS. Decline in the quality of service has been costly to the State not only in dollars but also in lost productivity. Consequently ODAS strongly supports the position that rates should be adjusted downward as a penalty for poor performance, not be increased just because the applicant provides the minimal required level of service. In addition, it is becoming necessary to establish measurable standards for

performance of data services; e.g. installation interval, availability of data circuits, mean time to repair, etc.

· . · · .

Exogenous events adjustments should be determined by the Commission as an objective party, not by the applicant.

2. Regarding the assignment of services to the Cells, it is the position of ODAS that Digital Private Lines, which the State uses extensively, should not be assigned to Cell 4 because in ODAS' experience these services are not fully competitive. Assignment to Cell 2 is more appropriate.

3. Regarding the commitments offered by the applicant, ODAS submits that they are of little substance. Although ODAS supports the provision of fiber optic services to schools and other public buildings, without specific information about the rates and discounts at which this service will be offered and specifics regarding connectivity to other communication systems, it means little. Rates for the other public institutions, i.e. hospitals, libraries, county jails, and courts are, likewise, not mentioned. If these institutions are expected to pay the prevailing tariff for the service, there is no real "commitment" by Ameritech. Essentially, the provision by Ameritech to provide fiber to these

users should be considered an opportunity and may be a business imperative, not a concession to the public good.

Respectfully submitted,

LEE FISHER Attorney General

DANIEL A. MALKOFF

Atty. Reg. No. 0029917 Assistant Attorney General 30 E. Broad Street, 23rd Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215-3428 (614) 466-2980

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a true and accurate copy of the foregoing Objections and Comments to Staff Report has been served upon the parties identified on the attached list by regular U.S. mail this 25 day of April, 1994.

Michael T. Mulchay James C. Smith William H. Hunt Ohio Bell Telephone Co. 45 Erieview Plaza Cleveland, Ohio 44114

.

James B. Gainer Anne Henkener Public Utilities Commission . 180 East Broad Street Columbus, Ohio 43266-0573

Randy J. Hart Hahn, Loeser & Parks 3300 BP American Bldg. 200 Public Square Cleveland, Ohio 44114-2391 Robin P. Charleston AT&T Communications of Ohio, Inc. 227 West Monroe Street 6th Floor Chicago, Illinois 60606

Barry Cohen David C. Bergmann Ohio Consumers' Counsel 77 South High Street 15th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43266-0550

Gena Doyscher Enhanced Telemanagement 730 Second Avenue, South Suite 1200 Minneapolis, Minnesota 55402 Joseph Meissner Legal Aid Society of Cleveland 1223 West Sixth Street Cleveland, Ohio 44113

Kerry Bruce Utility Rate Coordinator Public Utilities Department Suite 1520 City of Toledo 1 Government Center Toledo, Ohio 43604

Sally W. Bloomfield Mary Christensen Bricker & Eckler 100 South Third Street Columbus, Ohio 43215

William Ondrey Gruber City of Cleveland Assistant Director of Law 601 Lakeside Avenue, N.W. Cleveland, Ohio 44114

Douglas Trabaris MCI Telecommunications Corp. 205 North Michigan Avenue Suite 3200 Chicago, Illinois 60601

Joseph M. Patchen Carlile Patchen & Murphy 366 East Broad Street Columbus, Ohio 43215

Gregory J. Dunn Crabbe, Brown, Jones, Potts & Schmidt 500 South Front Street Suite 1200 Columbus, Ohio 43215

William S. Newcomb, Jr. Stephen M. Howard Vorys, Sater, Seymour & Pease 52 East Gay Street P. O. Box 1008 Columbus, Ohio 43266-1008 Samuel C. Randazzo Emens, Kegler, Brown, Hill & Ritter 65 East State Street P.O. Box 1800 Columbus, Ohio 43215

Cecil O. Simpson, Jr. General Attorney Office of the Judge Advocate General Department of the Navy 901 North Stuart Street Arlington, VA 22203-1837

Bill Adams Arter & Hadden One Columbus 10 West Broad Street Columbus, Ohio 43215-3422

Ellis Jacobs The Legal Aid Society of Dayton 333 West First Street Suite 500 Dayton, Ohio 45402

Sheldon A. Taft Vorys, Sater, Seymour & Pease 52 East Gay Street P. O. Box 1008 Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008

Judith B. Sanders Barth Royer Bell, Royer & Sanders 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, Ohio 43215-3927

Mary Hill Sprint Communications 8140 Ward Parkway, 5E Kansas City, Mo 64114

Dennis K. Muncy Meyer, Capel, Hirschfeld, Muncy, Jahn & Aldenn Athenaeum Building 306 West Church Street P.O.Box 6750 Champaign, IL 61826-6750

Bruce Weston 169 West Hubbard Avenue Columbus, Ohio 43215-1439

Karin W. Rilley Assistant Attorney General Office of the Attorney General-Education Section 30 East Broad Street, 15th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215-3428

TCG America, Inc. Clyde Kurlander Law Offices Three First National Plaza Suite #4000 Chicago, Illinois 60602

DANIEL A. MALKOF

Assistant Attorney General