

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Complaint of)	
Mark Elvey,)	
Complainant,)	
v.)	Case No. 14-2301-GA-CSS
)	
Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc.,)	
Respondent.)	

ANSWER OF COLUMBIA GAS OF OHIO, INC.

Pursuant to Ohio Adm. Code 4901-9-01(D), the Respondent, Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc. ("Columbia"), files its Answer to the Complaint of Mark Elvey ("Complainant") filed herein on December 22, 2014:

1. Columbia admits that the Complainant is the customer of record for a natural gas service account at 2845 York Street, Toledo, Ohio 43605 (the "Premises"). Columbia admits that the natural gas service account number for the Premises ends with the last four digits of 0006.

2. Columbia is without sufficient knowledge or information to either admit or deny the allegation regarding the Complainant as the owner of a small business since 1987.

3. Columbia admits that the Complainant's Infrastructure Replacement Program Rider ("Rider IRP") charge increased from \$5.71 to \$42.18 with the Complainant's October 24, 2014 Billing Statement. Columbia further admits that the increase in Rider IRP was due to the Complainant's 12-month consumption exceeding 3000 Ccf or 300 Mcf. Columbia avers that, pursuant to Section VII, Tenth Revised Sheet No. 29, Page 2 of 11 of its tariff, Rider IRP is billed based on the customer rate schedule: \$5.71 per month for Full Requirements Small General Transportation Service ("FRSGTS"), \$42.18 for Full Requirements General Transportation Service ("FRGTS"), and \$781.93 for Full Requirements Large General Transportation Service. Columbia further avers that, pursuant to Section VII, Sixth Revised Sheet No. 25, Page 2 of 3 of its tariff, FRSGTS customers must consume less than 300 Mcf of natural gas between

September 1 and August 31. Columbia further avers that pursuant to Section VII, Sixth Revised Sheet No. 25, Page 2 of 3 of its tariff, Columbia is required to review each customer's 12-month consumption on August 31 to determine continued eligibility for the FRSCTS rate schedule. Columbia further avers that as of August 31, 2014, the Complainant was an FRSCTS customer. Columbia further avers that between September 2013 and August 2014, the Complainant consumed approximately 3,331 Ccf or 333.1 Mcf of natural gas. Columbia further avers that because the Complainant's 12-month consumption was greater than 300 Mcf, the Complainant was no longer eligible to receive gas service at the FRSCTS rate schedule. Columbia further avers that it billed the Complainant at the FRGTS rate schedule, including the Rider IRP charge, beginning with the October 24, 2014 Billing Statement.

4. Columbia admits that, pursuant to Section VII, Sixth Revised Sheet No. 27, Page 2 of 3 of its tariff, Columbia will review the Complainant's annual consumption between September 2014 and August 2015 to determine whether the Complainant remains eligible for the FRGTS rate schedule. Columbia avers that customers who consume at least 300 Mcf are eligible for the FRGTS rate schedule. Columbia further avers that if the Complainant does not consume at least 300 Mcf between September 2014 and August 2015, then the Complainant will no longer be eligible for the FRGTS rate schedule and will be billed at the FRSCTS rate schedule. Columbia further avers that any rate schedule changes, after the 12-month consumption is reviewed, are implemented beginning with the Unit 1 billing in October.

5. Columbia admits that the charges on the Complainant's November 24, 2014 Billing Statement for consuming 128 Ccf of natural gas included a Customer Charge of \$22.50, Rider IRP of \$42.18, a Delivery Charge of \$21.99, and a Usage-Based Charge of \$12.76. Columbia further avers that these charges are correct and accurately reflect the charges detailed in Section VII, Seven Revised Sheet No. 27, Page 2 of 3; Section VII, Tenth Revised Sheet No. 29, Page 2 of 11; Section VII, Seven Revised Sheet No. 27, Page 2 of 3; Section VII, Third Revised Sheet No. 27, Page 3 of 3 and all other applicable tariff sheets on file with the Commission.

6. Columbia admits that the arithmetical sum of the November 24, 2014 Billing Statement Customer Charge, Rider IRP, Delivery Charge, Usage-Based Charge and the Gross Receipts Tax (\$4.96) is \$104.39, and Columbia admits that the total SCO gas commodity supply cost including sales tax on the November 24, 2014 Billing Statement was \$70.23.

7. Columbia is without sufficient knowledge or information to either admit or deny the allegation regarding the Complainant being a Columbia customer for his home since 1977 and a small business customer since 1987.

8. Columbia admits that the Complainant is a good paying customer and is current on the natural gas account at the Premises.

9. Columbia denies generally any allegations not specifically denied in this Answer, pursuant to Ohio Adm. Code 4901-9-01(D).

AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES

10. Columbia avers that the Complainant has failed to state reasonable grounds for a complaint against Columbia, pursuant to R.C. 4905.26.

11. Columbia avers that it has complied with all applicable Ohio statutes; the Commission's rules, regulations and order; and Columbia's tariff. Columbia further avers that its compliance with statutes, rules, regulations, orders and its tariff provisions, including the rate schedules for FRSGTS and FRGTS customers, bar Complainant's claims.

12. Columbia reserves the right to raise other defenses as warranted by discovery in this matter.

WHEREFORE, Columbia respectfully requests an Order dismissing the Complaint and granting Columbia all other necessary and proper relief.

Respectfully submitted by,

COLUMBIA GAS OF OHIO, INC.

/s/ Melissa L. Thompson

Melissa L. Thompson, Trial Attorney

Stephen B. Seiple (0003809)

Melissa L. Thompson (0086367)

P.O. Box 117

290 W. Nationwide Blvd.

Columbus, Ohio 43216-0117
Telephone: (614) 460-4874
Facsimile: (614) 460-8403
E-mail: mlthompson@nisource.com
sseiple@nisource.com

**Attorneys for
COLUMBIA GAS OF OHIO, INC.**

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that I have served a copy of the foregoing Answer of Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc. by ordinary U.S. mail, postage prepaid, to the following this 12th day of January, 2015:

Mark Elvey
2845 York Street
Toledo, Ohio 43605

/s/ Melissa L. Thompson
Melissa L. Thompson

Attorney for
COLUMBIA GAS OF OHIO, INC.

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

1/12/2015 3:59:25 PM

in

Case No(s). 14-2301-GA-CSS

Summary: Answer of Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc. electronically filed by Ms. Melissa L. Thompson on behalf of Columbia Gas of Ohio, Inc.