

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

| | | |
|---|---|-------------------------|
| In the Matter of the Application of Duke |) | Case No. 14-0841-EL-SSO |
| Energy Ohio for Authority to Establish a |) | |
| Standard Service Offer Pursuant to §4928.143, |) | |
| Ohio Rev. Code, in the Form of an Electric |) | |
| Security Plan, Accounting Modifications and |) | |
| Tariffs for Generation Service. |) | |
| | | |
| In the Matter of the Application of Duke |) | |
| Energy for Authority to Amend its Certified |) | |
| Supplier Tariff, P.U.C.O No. 20. |) | Case No. 14-0842-EL-ATA |
| |) | |

**MOTION TO INTERVENE
BY THE
OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL**

Pursuant to Ohio Rev. Code § 4903.22.1 and Ohio Admin. Code § 4901-1-11, the Ohio Environmental Council (“OEC”), moves for leave to intervene in the above captioned proceeding, in which Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. (“Duke” or “the Company”) submits its Application for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to ORC §4928.143, in the Form of an Electric Security Plan (“Application”). As more fully discussed in the accompanying memorandum, OEC has a real and substantial interest in this proceeding. The interests of OEC are not represented by any existing party; participation in this proceeding will contribute to a just and expeditious resolution of the issues involved without unduly delaying the proceeding or unjustly prejudicing any existing party.

WHEREFORE, OEC respectfully request that the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio grant OEC's motion to intervene for these reasons and those set forth in the attached Memorandum in Support.

Respectfully submitted,

A handwritten signature in dark ink, reading "Trent A. Dougherty", is centered on a light yellow rectangular background.

Trent Dougherty, **Counsel of Record**
(0079817)
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449
(614) 487-7506 - Telephone
(614) 487-7510 - Fax
tdougherty@theOEC.org

**Counsel for the Ohio Environmental
Council**

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

| | | |
|---|---|-------------------------|
| In the Matter of the Application of Duke |) | Case No. 14-0841-EL-SSO |
| Energy Ohio for Authority to Establish a |) | |
| Standard Service Offer Pursuant to |) | |
| §4928.143, Ohio Rev. Code, in the Form of |) | |
| an Electric Security Plan, Accounting |) | |
| Modifications and Tariffs for Generation |) | |
| Service. |) | |
| |) | |
| In the Matter of the Application of Duke |) | |
| Energy for Authority to Amend its Certified |) | Case No. 14-0842-EL-ATA |
| Supplier Tariff, P.U.C.O No. 20. |) | |

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

Ohio Revised Code Section 4903.221 provides that any “person who may be adversely affected by a public utilities commission proceeding may intervene in such proceeding.”

The OEC is a non-profit, charitable organization comprised of a network of over 100 affiliated member groups whose mission is to secure healthy air, land, and water for all who call Ohio home. Throughout its 45-year history, OEC has been a leading advocate for fresh air, clean water, and sustainable energy use in Ohio. OEC was an active participant in the effort that led to the passage of S.B. 221, and has intervened in scores of cases before this Commission to secure proper implementation of Ohio’s clean energy law.

As discussed below, OEC has an interest in and may be adversely affected by the disposition of this case.

R.C. 4903.221(B) outlines four factors that the Commission shall consider when ruling on a motion to intervene in a proceeding. First, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(1), the Commission shall consider “the nature and extent of the prospective intervenor’s interest.” OEC has a real and substantial interest in the stability of retail electricity service and competitive energy markets, and the positive effect both have on the further deployment of cost-effective clean and efficient energy in Ohio. As an environmental advocacy organization, OEC has a special interest in the outcome of this case because of the direct impact that decisions on the Application and its included tariffs and riders will have on the current and future implementation and effectiveness of alternative energy resources, renewable energy generation, energy efficiency and demand response in the state, and the Application’s potential to proliferate fossil fuel generation. Accordingly, OEC’s interest in this proceeding arise from the direct and indirect impacts that the issues presented will have on the environment of the state of Ohio and the region, and the electricity costs of their members in the Duke service territory.

Second, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(2), the Commission shall consider “The legal position advanced by the prospective intervenor and its probable relation to the merits of the case.” Although OEC does not outline detailed legal arguments in this section, OEC maintains that Duke’s Application should be properly scrutinized by interested parties to ensure that it complies with the letter and intent of the state’s energy law and stated state energy policy.

Third, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(3), the Commission shall consider “Whether the intervention by the prospective intervenor will unduly prolong or delay the proceedings.” OEC has significant experience dealing with electric utilities questions before the Commission and will not seek to delay the proceeding. OEC has been consistently involved in the development and enactment of S.B. 221 and the associated rules, including as a party in numerous cases

before the Commission. Thus, intervention will not unduly prolong or delay these proceedings, but will add value to the development of this case.

Fourth, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(4), the Commission shall consider “Whether the prospective intervenor will significantly contribute to full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues.” OEC has developed expertise that will contribute to the full development of the legal questions involved in this proceeding. Further, as Ohio’s leading environmental advocates, OEC will be able to assure that the environmental impacts of the Company’s proposal are fully developed.

OEC also satisfies the intervention requirements outlined in the Commission’s rules. The criteria for intervention established by O.A.C. 4901-1-11(A) are identical to those provided by R.C. 4903.221, with the exception that the rules add a fifth factor that the Commission shall consider when ruling on a motion to intervene. Pursuant to O.A.C. 4901-1-11(A)(5), the Commission shall consider “The extent to which the [intervenor’s] interest is represented by existing parties.” OEC’s interest is not fully represented by the existing parties.

Finally, we point out that it is the Commission’s stated policy “to encourage the broadest possible participation in its proceedings.”¹ The Commission should not apply its intervention criteria in a manner that would favor one environmental or consumer advocate to the exclusion of others.

OEC meets all the criteria established by R.C. 4903.221 and O.A.C. 4901-1-11(A)(5) and therefore should be granted intervenor status in this proceeding.

¹ *Cleveland Elec. Illum. Co.*, Case No. 85-675-EL-AIR, Entry dated January 14, 1986, at 2.

WHEREFORE, OEC respectfully requests that the Commission grant its motion to intervene in the above captioned matter.

Respectfully Submitted,

A handwritten signature in dark ink, reading "Trent A. Dougherty", is centered on a light yellow rectangular background. The signature is written in a cursive, flowing style.

Trent Dougherty, Counsel of Record
(0079817)
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449
(614) 487-7506 - Telephone
(614) 487-7510 - Fax
tdougherty@theOEC.org

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing has been served upon the following parties by electronic mail this 26th day of June, 2014.



Trent Dougherty

Amy B. Spiller
Rocco D'Ascenzo
Jeanne W. Kingery
Elizabeth Watts
Assistant General Counsel
Duke Energy Ohio, Inc.
155 East Broad Street, 21st Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
Amy.spiller@duke-energy.com
rocco.d'ascenzo@duke-energy.com
jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com
Elizabeth.Watts@duke-energy.com

Steven Beeler
Thomas Lindgren
Ryan O'Rourke
Assistant Attorney General
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
steven.beeler@puc.state.oh.us
Thomas.lindgren@puc.state.oh.us
ryan.orourke@puc.state.oh.us

Steven T. Nourse
Matthew J. Satterwhite
Yazen Alami
1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor
Columbus. OH 43215
stnourse@aep.com
msatterwhite@aep.com
yalami@aep.com

Samuel C. Randazzo
Frank P. Darr
Matthew R. Pritchard
McNees Wallace & Nurick LLC
21 East State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus. Ohio 43215
sam@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
mpritchard@mwncmh.com

Maureen R. Grady
Joseph Serio
Edmund "Tad" Berger
Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 W. Broad Street
Suite 1800
Columbus, OH 43215-3485
Maureen.grady@occ.ohio.gov
joseph.serio@occ.ohio.gov
Edmund.berger@occ.ohio.gov

Michael L. Kurtz
David F. Boehm
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com
dboehm@BKLawfirm.com

Colleen L. Mooney
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
Findlay, OH 45840
cmooney@ohiopartners.org

Mark Hayden
Jacob A. McDermott
Scott J. Casto
First Energy Service Corp.
76 South Main Street
Akron, OH 44308
haydenm@firstenergycorp.com
jmcdermott@firstenergycorp.com
scasto@firstenergycorp.com

Kimberly W. Bojko
Mallory Mohler
Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP
280 North High Street, Suite 1300
Columbus, OH 43215
Bojko@carpenterlipps.com
mohler@carpenterlipps.com

Judi L. Sobecki
The Dayton Power & Light Company
1065 Woodman Drive
Dayton, OH 45432
Judi.sobecki@aes.com

Kevin R. Schmidt
88 East Broad Street, Ste 1770
Columbus, OH 43215
Schmidt@sppgrp.com

Joseph Olikier
Matthew White
6100 Emerald Parkway
Dublin, OH 43016
joliker@igsenergy.com
mswhite@igsenergy.com

Joseph M. Clark
21 East State Street, 19th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
Joseph.clark@directenergy.com

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

6/26/2014 12:23:36 PM

in

Case No(s). 14-0841-EL-SSO, 14-0842-EL-ATA

Summary: Motion Motion to Intervene By the Ohio Environmental Council and Memorandum in Support electronically filed by Mr. Trent A Dougherty on behalf of Ohio Environmental Council