

In the Matter of Border Energy Electric )  
 Services, Inc. Annual Alternative Energy ) Case No. 14 - 0606 - EL - ACP  
 Portfolio Status Report and Plan for Compliance )  
 with Future Renewable Energy Benchmarks )

Border Energy Electric Services, Inc. (“Border”) hereby submits its Annual Alternative Energy Portfolio Status Report for calendar year 2013 and its plan for compliance with future renewable energy benchmarks, pursuant to Ohio Adm.Code 4901:1-40-05(A) and 4901:1-40-03(C), respectively. As demonstrated herein, Border is in compliance with Ohio’s statutory solar and non-solar Alternative Energy Portfolio Standard Requirements for calendar year 2013.

Pursuant to Ohio Adm.Code 4901:1-40-05(A), each electric utility and electric services company must submit, by April fifteenth of each year, an annual alternative energy portfolio status report “analyzing all activities undertaken in the previous calendar year to demonstrate how the applicable alternative energy portfolio benchmarks and planning requirements have or will be met.” For calendar year 2013, electric services companies were required to supply two percent (2.0%) of their retail electricity sales from renewable energy resources, including 0.09% of their retail electricity sales from solar resources. Ohio Adm.Code 4901:1-40-03(A)(2). At least half of such renewable energy requirement and half of such solar energy requirement must be met through electricity generated by facilities located in Ohio. *Id.*

Border is an “electric services company” as defined in Ohio Adm.Code 4901:1-40-01(O), and is therefore subject to the renewable energy benchmarks and annual reporting requirement. To analyze compliance with the annual alternative energy benchmarks, an electric services

company must first establish its baseline electricity sales, to which baseline the applicable benchmark percentages are applied. Pursuant to Ohio Adm.Code 4901:1-40-03(B)(2), an electric services company's baseline for any calendar year is typically computed as the average of its total annual kilowatt-hours of electricity sold to retail consumers in Ohio during the three preceding calendar years.

Border commenced making retail electric sales in Ohio in June 2011. Accordingly, Border did not make any retail electric sales in Ohio during one of the three preceding calendar year (2010). Based on the calculation guidelines, Border has calculated its baseline as the average of its actual retail sales in Ohio during calendar years 2011 and 2012, *i.e.*, 366,053 MWh.

#### **B. Compliance with 2013 Benchmarks**

With a baseline of 366,053 MWh, Border calculates that it was required to obtain two (2.0%) of such baseline, *i.e.*, 7,321 MWh, from renewable energy resources, including solar resources, with 0.09% of such baseline, *i.e.*, 329 MWh, from solar resources. Half of such required amounts (*i.e.*, 3,661 MWh of total renewable energy resources, with 165 MWh of solar resources) were to be obtained from facilities located in Ohio.

Border met its 2013 renewable energy resource benchmarks by procuring a total of 7,321 renewable energy credits ("RECs"), of which 3,819 were sourced from Ohio facilities. Border met its solar resource benchmark by procuring 329 of such 7,321 total RECs from solar resources ("S-RECs"), of which 200 were sourced from Ohio facilities. Border maintains a PJM Interconnection, L.L.C. ("PJM") Generation Attribute Tracking System ("GATS") Account, and has retired all of the RECs and S-RECs used to meet its 2013 renewable energy resource benchmarks in the PJM Environmental Information Services ("EIS") system. Accordingly,

Border is in compliance with the 2013 renewable energy benchmark and the 2013 solar energy benchmark. Border's compliance strategy was to purchase RECs on the open market as its renewable energy resource obligations were incurred.

### **III. PLAN FOR COMPLIANCE WITH FUTURE ANNUAL ADVANCED RENEWABLE ENERGY BENCHMARKS**

Pursuant to Ohio Adm.Code 4901:1-40-03(C), each electric services company must file an annual plan for its compliance with future annual advanced and renewable energy benchmarks, including solar, with a ten-year planning horizon. The annual plan must include (1) the baseline for current and future calendar years; (2) a supply portfolio projection, including both generation fleet and power purchases; (3) a description of the methodology used by the company to evaluate its compliance options; and (4) a discussion of any perceived impediments to achieving compliance with required benchmarks, as well as suggestions for addressing any such impediments. Ohio Adm.Code 4901:1-40-03(C)(1)-(4).

As discussed above, Border did not commence retail electric supply in Ohio until June 2011. As a result of its abbreviated period of retail electric supply, Border cannot accurately project its baseline and its related compliance obligations for a period of ten years. Border can, however, reasonably project its forecasted sales volumes and corresponding alternative energy benchmarks for a period of three years, calendar years 2013 through 2015. These projections are set forth in Table 1 below:

<b>TABLE 1</b>					
Calendar Year	Projected Baseline	Renewable Energy Benchmark	Total Renewable Energy RECs Required	Solar Energy Benchmark	Solar RECs Required
2014	<b>Redacted</b>	2.5%	<b>Redacted</b>	0.12%	<b>Redacted</b>
2015	<b>Redacted</b>	3.5%	<b>Redacted</b>	0.15%	<b>Redacted</b>
2016	<b>Redacted</b>	4.5%	<b>Redacted</b>	0.18%	<b>Redacted</b>

Border does not own any generation facilities, but obtains all of the power needed to serve its customers pursuant to bilateral agreements and from the market, and plans to continue such approach. Border will continue to meet its alternative energy benchmark compliance obligations through the purchase of RECs on the open market. At this time, Border does not foresee any impediments to achieving compliance with the required alternative energy benchmarks.

#### **IV. CONCLUSION**

As demonstrated above, Border achieved full compliance with the 2013 alternative energy benchmarks.

Respectfully submitted,

**BORDER ENERGY ELECTRIC SERVICES, INC.**

By: /s/ Stephanie M. Chmiel  
Stephanie M. Chmiel (0087555)  
THOMPSON HINE LLP  
41 S. High Street, Suite 1700  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
Telephone: (614) 469-3200  
Facsimile: (614) 469-3361  
[Stephanie.Chmiel@ThompsonHine.com](mailto:Stephanie.Chmiel@ThompsonHine.com)  
*Its Counsel*

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**4/11/2014 2:00:29 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 14-0606-EL-ACP**

Summary: Report Redacted Version of Annual Alternative Energy Portfolio Status Report electronically filed by Ms. Stephanie M Chmiel on behalf of Border Energy Electric Services, Inc.