

In the Matter of the Procurement of :
Standard Service Offer Generation for : Case No. 11-6000-EL-UNC
Customers of Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. :

The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio Staff moves for an indefinite extension of the protective order the Commission issued in its Finding and Order herein dated November 16, 2012. Under the Finding and Order's terms, the protective order expires on May 16, 2014. The information it protects, however, remains sensitive and confidential and that information should remain indefinitely sealed until otherwise ordered by the Commission as discussed in the attached memorandum in support

Respectfully submitted,

Michael DeWine
Ohio Attorney General

William L. Wright
Section Chief

/s/ Steven L. Beeler

Steven L. Beeler
Assistant Attorney General
Public Utilities Section
180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3793
614.466.4397 (telephone)
614.644.8764 (fax)
steven.beeler@puc.state.oh.us

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

In the Commission's November 16, 2012 Finding and Order, the Commission found the information protected from disclosure, and which is the subject of Staff's motion, was "sensitive information which should be deemed confidential and remain under seal."¹ That finding is as true today as it was then. Nothing has diminished the sensitivity, confidentiality, and importance of the information remaining under seal.

Additionally, Staff believes that the continued success of the auctions depends on the protective order's continuation. Any information that could provide an indication of round-by-round bidder behavior or the benchmark pricing that is used for evaluating the outcome of the auction offers competitive advantages and threatens auction success. Such information would include, but not be limited to: the number of round one bidders or bidder/tranche ratios, initial eligibility (numbers of tranches or bidders) at the start of the auction or eligibility/tranche ratios, auction starting price(s), benchmark comparison price computation and range(s), all individual bidder actions during the auction, auction closing steps, near-competitive offer comparisons and discussions, round-by-round price decrements, round-by-round tranches bid, identifications of non-winning bidders, and all discussions of specifically identified individual bidder behaviors during or related to the auction. Release of this type of information could potentially be

¹

In the Matter of the Procurement of Standard Service Offer Generation for Customers of Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., Case No. 11-6000-EL-UNC (Finding and Order at ¶ 9) (November 16, 2012).

used by bidders for unfair advantage in future auctions, or possibly cause bidders not to participate in future auctions because of the knowledge that their bidding behavior would be made public. In the Notification of CBP Auction Results, such information includes all that remained redacted in the version docketed on December 7, 2012. In the Report of the Commission's Consultant Regarding Duke Energy Ohio's November 2012 Standard Service Auction, such information is interspersed throughout the report. The Consultant recommends the information be kept confidential and Staff believes that the best course of action is for the entire report to remain under seal indefinitely until otherwise ordered by the Commission.

For these reasons, Staff moves for the indefinite extension of the protective order until otherwise ordered by the Commission.

Respectfully submitted,

Michael DeWine
Ohio Attorney General

William L. Wright
Section Chief

/s/ Steven L. Beeler

Steven L. Beeler
Assistant Attorney General
Public Utilities Section
180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215-3793
614.466.4397 (telephone)
614.644.8764 (fax)
steven.beeler@puc.state.oh.us

PROOF OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing **Motion for an Indefinite Extension of the Protective Order Contained in the Commission's November 16, 2012 Finding and Order**, submitted on behalf of the Staff of the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio, was served via electronic mail upon the following Parties of Record, this 26th day of March, 2014.

/s/ Steven L. Beeler

Steven L. Beeler
Assistant Attorney General

Parties of Record:

amy.spiller@duke-energy.com
elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com
jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com
sam@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
joliker@mwncmh.com
tobrien@bricker.com
cmooney2@columbus.rr.com
trent@theoec.org
nolan@theoec.org
dhart@douglasshart.com
haydenm@firstenergycorp.com
dakutik@jonesday.com
aehaedt@jonesday.com
jlang@calfee.com
lmcbride@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com
mohler@carpenterlipps.com
mwarnock@bricker.com
jbentine@cwsllaw.com
smorrison@cwsllaw.com
myurick@taftlaw.com
zkravitz@taftlaw.com
barthroyer@aol.com
gary.a.jeffries@dom.com
aaragona@eimerstahl.com
dstahl@eimerstahl.com
mchristensen@columbuslaw.org

jouett.brenzel@cinbell.com
jkyler@BKLawfirm.com
dboehm@BKLawfirm.com
mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com
tsantarelli@elpc.org
mhpeticoff@vorys.com
mjsettineri@vorys.com
mjsatterwhite@aep.com
ecmillerl@aep.com
amvogel@aep.com
serio@occ.state.oh.us
gpoulos@enernoc.com
jmclark@vectren.com
smhoward@vorys.com
vparisi@igsenergy.com
mswhite@igsenergy.com
rdc_law@swbell.net
kosterkamp@ralaw.com
dane.stinson@BaileyCavalieri.com
asonderman@keglerbrown.com
mkimbrough@keglerbrown.com
wmassey@cov.com
callwein@wamenergy.com
asonderman@keglerbrown.com
mkimbrough@keglerbrown.com
wmassey@cov.com
ssolberg@eimerstahl.com
mcox@mcdonaldhopkins.com

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

3/26/2014 10:48:09 AM

in

Case No(s). 11-6000-EL-UNC

Summary: Motion Motion for Protective Order electronically filed by Mrs. Tonneta Y Scott on behalf of PUCO