

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of)	
The Dayton Power and Light Company)	Case No. 13-2420-EL-UNC
for Authority to Transfer or Sell)	
Generation Assets.)	

**MOTION TO INTERVENE,
MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF THE MOTION TO INTERVENE,
AND
COMMENTS ON THE SUPPLEMENTAL APPLICATION**

MOTION TO INTERVENE

Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy (“OPAE”) hereby respectfully moves for leave to intervene in the above-captioned matter pursuant to R.C. 4903.221 and Section 4901-1-11 of the Commission’s Code of Rules and Regulations with full powers and rights granted by the Commission specifically, by statute or by the provisions of the Commission’s Code of Rules and Regulations to intervening parties. The reasons for granting this motion are contained in the memorandum attached hereto and incorporated herein. Comments on the supplemental application are also including in this pleading.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/Colleen Mooney
Colleen L. Mooney
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
P.O. Box 1793
Findlay, OH 45839-1793
Telephone: (419) 425-8860
FAX: (419) 425-8862
e-mail: cmooney@ohiopartners.org

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of)	
The Dayton Power and Light Company)	Case No. 13-2420-EL-UNC
for Authority to Transfer or Sell)	
Generation Assets.)	

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO INTERVENE

Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy (“OPAE”) requests permission to intervene in this matter pursuant to Section 4903.22.1, Revised Code, and the Commission’s Rules and Regulation contained in Section 4901-01-11 of the Ohio Administrative Code. The Commission, in ruling upon a motion to intervene in its proceedings, shall consider the following criteria:

- (1) The nature and extent of the intervenor’s interest.
- (2) The legal position advanced by the prospective intervenor and its probable relationship to the merits of the case.
- (3) Whether the intervention by the prospective intervenor will unduly prolong or delay the proceeding.
- (4) Whether the prospective intervenor will significantly contribute to the full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues.

As an Ohio non-profit corporation with a stated purpose of “advocating for affordable energy policies for low and moderate income Ohioans”, OPAE has a real and substantial interest in this proceeding. Moreover, the membership of OPAE includes a number of nonprofit organizations with facilities receiving electric service from The Dayton Power and Light Company (“DP&L”).¹ Residential customers, including OPAE’s low-income bill payment assistance

¹ OPAE’s membership list can be found at: www.ohiopartners.org.

and weatherization clients, will be affected by DP&L's application. Non-residential customers, such as nonprofit organizations, will also be affected.

OPAEC was an intervenor in DP&L's Standard Service Offer ("SSO") proceedings, which gave rise to this application. Case No. 12-426-EL-SSO, et al. In those cases, the Commission required DP&L to file a plan for corporate separation by December 31, 2013. On December 30, 2013, DP&L filed an application to transfer or sell its generation assets. In its application, DP&L sought multiple waivers, including a waiver of any requirement that the Commission conduct a hearing in this matter and a waiver of the requirement to state the fair market value of the generation assets to be transferred.

The Commission called for comments on the application to be filed on February 4, 2014, and reply comments on February 19, 2014. The comments and reply comments generally objected to DP&L's requests to waive a hearing and to waive the requirement to state the fair market value of the assets to be sold or transferred. The comments stated that it was premature and unwarranted for the Commission to act upon the application given that there was no detailed plan to divest of the generation assets. Generally, the comments considered it impossible to address the merits of DP&L's plan until a supplemental application was filed.

On February 25, 2014, DP&L filed a supplemental application to transfer or sell its generation assets. On March 4, 2014, the Commission issued an Entry calling for comments on the supplemental application on March 25, 2014.

Attached to this memorandum in support of the motion to intervene, OPAE includes comments on the supplemental application.

OPAE's participation in this matter will not cause undue delay, will not unjustly prejudice any existing party, and will contribute to the just and expeditious resolution of the issues and concerns raised in this proceeding. Furthermore, other parties to the proceeding will not adequately represent the interests of OPAE. The extensive background of OPAE and its membership provides a unique and important viewpoint on matters at issue in this docket.

Therefore, OPAE is entitled to intervene in this proceeding with the full powers and rights granted by the Commission specifically, by statute, and by the provisions of the Commission's Codes of Rules and Regulations, to intervening parties.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/Colleen Mooney

Colleen L. Mooney
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
P.O. Box 1793
Findlay, OH 45839-1793
Telephone: (419) 425-8860
FAX: (419) 425-8862
e-mail: cmooney@ohiopartners.org

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of)	
The Dayton Power and Light Company)	Case No. 13-2420-EL-UNC
for Authority to Transfer or Sell)	
Generation Assets.)	

COMMENTS ON THE SUPPLEMENTAL APPLICATION

The Supplemental Application intends to provide more detail on the transfer of DP&L's generation assets but fails to do so. DP&L seeks authority to transfer the generation assets to an unregulated affiliated generation company at fair market value on or before May 31, 2017. The fair market value will be determined approximately 90 days before the transfer date and the value will be stated no later than 75 days before the transfer. Supplemental Application at 10. In the Supplemental Application, DP&L states the net book value of the assets as of November 30, 2013, but does not state the fair market value or the terms and conditions of the sale or transfer as required by the administrative code rule. The terms under which the transfer of the assets will take place are still unknown.

DP&L also continues its request for a waiver of the hearing. Nothing provided in the Supplemental Application should convince the Commission to waive its rules with regard to a determination of the fair market value of the assets to be transferred, the terms and conditions of the transfer, or the need for a hearing. The waiver requests should be denied.

Rather than providing the necessary information, the Supplemental Application only serves to alarm OPAE with its requests regarding environmental

liabilities related to the rendering of service to standard service offer customers. After the transfer of the assets, DP&L proposes to retain responsibility for these environmental liabilities and to seek recovery for prudently incurred environmental clean-up costs for real property that **had been** used and useful for the production of electricity. Supplemental Application at 4; Emphasis Added. This proposal is simply unlawful. First, these are generation facilities that will no longer be owned by DP&L. They are not used and useful to DP&L, a distribution utility. There is no legal basis under which DP&L's current distribution customers should pay these costs.

DP&L claims that to the extent it finds itself under a legal mandate to perform environmental investigation and remediation activities for these generation facilities or sites, DP&L should be authorized to recover all prudently incurred costs associated with these clean-up activities. Supplemental Application at 4. There is no doubt that any legal mandate to clean up the sites will be reflected in their fair market value at the time of transfer; however, once the transfer has occurred, DP&L's distribution customers cannot be responsible for paying these costs.

DP&L also requests that the Commission grant accounting authority to permit DP&L to defer the costs associated with environmental clean-up incurred by DP&L because of its ownership or operation of the electric generation assets. DP&L would defer these expenses for future recovery from all [distribution] customers. DP&L would apply a carrying cost based on its most recently approved cost of debt. Supplemental Application at 5.

Again, the Commission has no statutory authority to grant a public utility distribution company such as DP&L deferral authority for costs that are associated with generation plant that will be transferred to an unregulated affiliate or a third party. Financial accounting standards only permit deferrals when it is reasonable that recovery will be authorized. As recovery of environmental remediation funds for generation plants no longer owned by a distribution utility is unlawful, the criteria for a deferral are not met. DP&L's request for accounting authority is beyond the scope of the Commission's regulatory authority.

OPAE strongly opposes DP&L's request to retain responsibility for environmental clean-up of generation plants that will be transferred to another entity. Likewise, OPAE opposes allowing DP&L to seek recovery from its current distribution ratepayers for environmental clean-up costs associated with the former-DP&L generation plants. OPAE also opposes granting DP&L accounting authority to defer environmental clean-up costs for future recovery and carrying charges on any unrecovered deferred amounts. The costs are generation costs and the Commission cannot grant accounting authority for such costs to a distribution utility.

Conclusion

OPAE recommends that the Commission deny DP&L's waiver and accounting authority requests and set this matter for hearing.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/Colleen Mooney

Colleen L. Mooney

Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy

231 West Lima Street

P.O. Box 1793

Findlay, OH 45840

Telephone: (419) 425-8860

FAX: (419) 425-8862

e-mail: cmooney@ohiopartners.org

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing Motion to Intervene and Memorandum of Support and Comments on the Supplemental Application was served by electronic mail upon the persons identified below on this 25th day of March 2014.

/s/Colleen Mooney
Colleen L. Mooney

Judi L. Sobecki
Dayton Power and Light Company
1065 Woodman Drive
Dayton, Ohio 45432
judi.sobecki@dplinc.com

Charles J. Faruki
Jeffrey Sharkey
Faruki Ireland & Cox, P.L.L.
500 Courthouse Plaza, SW
Dayton, Ohio 45402
cfaruki@ficlaw.com
jsharkey@ficlaw.com

David F. Boehm
Michael L. Kurtz
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
dboehm@BKLawfirm.com
mkurtz@BKLawfirm.com
jkylercohn@BKLawfirm.com

Melissa R. Yost
Maureen R. Grady
Office of the Consumers' Counsel
10 W. Broad Street, 18th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485
yost@occ.state.oh.us
grady@occ.state.oh.us
berger@occ.state.oh.us

Samuel C. Randazzo
Frank P. Darr
Matthew R. Pritchard
Joseph E. Olikier
McNees Wallace & Nurick
Fifth Third Center, Suite 1700
21 East State Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4228
jolikder@mwncmh.com
sam@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
mpritchard@mwncmh.com

James F. Lang
N. Trevor Alexander
Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP
1400 Key Bank Center
800 Superior Avenue
Cleveland, Ohio 44104
jlang@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com

Amy B. Spiller
Jeanne Kingery
Duke Energy Retail
Duke Energy Commercial
Management
139 East Fourth Street 1303-Main
Cincinnati, Ohio 45201-0960
Amy.Spiller@duke-energy.com
Jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com

Elizabeth Watts
Rocco D'Ascenzo
Duke Energy Ohio
139 East Fourth Street 1303 Main
Cincinnati, Ohio 45201-0960
elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com
rocco.dascenzo@duke-energy.com

Mark Hayden
First Energy Corp.
76 South Main Street
Akron, Ohio 43308-1890
haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

Joseph M. Clark
Direct Energy Services LLC
21 East State Street, Suite 1900
Columbus, Ohio 43215
joseph.clark@directenergy.com

William Wright
Thomas McNamee
Devin Parram
Attorney General Public Utilities
180 E. Broad Street, 9th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3793
William.Wright@puc.state.oh.us
Thomas.McNamee@puc.state.oh.us
Devin.parram@puc.state.oh.us

Mark A. Whitt
Andrew J. Campbell
Gregory L. Williams
Whitt Sturtevant LLP
88 East Broad Street, Suite 1590
Columbus, Ohio 43215
whitt@whitt-sturtevant.com
campbell@whitt-sturtevant.com
Williams@whitt-sturtevant.com

Kimberly W. Boyko
Mallory M. Mohler
Carpenter Lipps & Leland
280 North High Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
boyko@carpenterlipps.com
mohler@carpenterlipps.com

Vincent Parisi
Matthew White
Lawrence Friedeman
Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.
6100 Emerald Parkway
Dublin, Ohio 43016
vparisi@igsenergy.com
mswhite@igsenergy.com
lfriedeman@igsenergy.com

Anne M. Vogel
American Electric Power
155 W. Nationwide Blvd. Suite 500
Columbus, Ohio 43215
amvogel@aep.com

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

3/25/2014 10:46:31 AM

in

Case No(s). 13-2420-EL-UNC

Summary: Motion to Intervene, Memorandum in Support, and Comments on the Supplemental Application electronically filed by Colleen L Mooney on behalf of Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy