BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Direct Energy	**)**	
Services, LLC Annual Alternative	**)**	**Case No. 13-0891-EL-ACP**
Energy Portfolio Status Report for 2012	**)**	

Findings and Recommendations of the PUCO Staff

I. Statutory Background

Senate Bill 221, with an effective date of July 31, 2008, established Ohio's alternative energy portfolio standard (AEPS) applicable to electric distribution utilities and electric service companies. The AEPS is addressed principally in sections 4928.64 and 4928.65, Ohio Revised Code (ORC), with relevant resource definitions contained within 4928.01(A), ORC.

According to 4928.64(B)(2), ORC, the specific compliance obligations for **2012** are as follows:

- Renewable Energy Resources = **1.50%** (includes solar requirement)
- Solar Energy Resources = **0.06%**

In addition, there is a requirement that at least half of the renewable energy resources, including the solar energy resources, shall be met through facilities located in this state.

The PUCO further developed rules to implement the Ohio AEPS, with those rules contained within Ohio Administrative Code (OAC) 4901:1-40.

4901:1-40-05(A), OAC:

> Unless otherwise ordered by the commission, each electric utility and electric services company shall file by April fifteenth of each year, on such forms as may be published by the commission, an annual alternative energy portfolio status report analyzing all activities undertaken in the previous calendar year to demonstrate how the applicable alternative energy portfolio benchmarks and planning requirements have or will be met. Staff shall conduct annual compliance reviews with regard to the benchmarks under the alternative energy portfolio standard.

4901:1-40-05(C), OAC:

> Staff shall review each electric utility's or electric services company's alternative energy portfolio status report and any timely filed comments, and file its findings and recommendations and any proposed modifications thereto.

The findings and recommendations in this document pertain to the company's compliance status. This document does not address such matters as cost recovery or status relative to the statutory 3% cost provision.

II. Company Filing Summarized

Direct Energy Services, LLC (DES or Company) filed its AEPS compliance status report for the 2012 compliance year on April 12, 2013. DES filed both a redacted and unredacted version of its status report, along with a motion for protective order. In its compliance filing, DES indicated that it had no retail electric sales in Ohio during 2009 or 2010. DES reported sales of 160,144 megawatt-hours (MWHs) for 2011, which the Company proposed as its compliance baseline for the 2012 compliance year.

Applying the statutory benchmarks to its proposed baseline, DES calculated its 2012 compliance obligations the details of which are included in the unredacted version of its filing. The Company indicated that it had obtained and retired the necessary renewable energy credits (RECs) and solar RECs (S-RECs) to satisfy its 2012 compliance obligations.

III. Filed Comments

No persons filed comments in this proceeding.

IV. Staff Findings

Following its review of the annual status report and any timely comments submitted in this proceeding, Staff makes the following findings:

(1) That DES is an electric services company in Ohio with retail electric sales in the state of Ohio, and therefore the Company had an AEPS obligation for 2012.

(2) That the baseline proposed by DES is reasonable, and the Company accurately computed its compliance obligations given its proposed baseline.

(3) That the Company has transferred RECs and S-RECs to its PJM EIS Generation Attributes Tracking System (GATS) reserve subaccount for Ohio compliance purposes.

(4) That following a review of the Company's reserve subaccount data on GATS, Staff confirmed that the Company satisfied its total non-solar[1] obligation, as well as the specific minimum in-state non-solar requirement, for 2012. The RECs that the Company transferred to its GATS reserve subaccount were sourced from generating facilities certified by the Commission and were appropriately associated with electricity generated between August 1, 2008, and December 31, 2012.

(5) That following a review of the Company's reserve subaccount data on GATS, Staff confirmed that the Company satisfied its total solar obligation, as well as the specific minimum in-state solar requirement, for 2012. The S-RECs that the Company transferred to its GATS reserve subaccount were sourced from generating facilities certified by the Commission and were appropriately associated with electricity generated between August 1, 2008, and December 31, 2012.

V. Staff Recommendations

Following its review of the information submitted in this proceeding and other relevant data, Staff recommends the following:

(1) That DES be found to have satisfied its 2012 AEPS compliance obligations.

(2) That for future compliance years in which the Company is utilizing GATS to demonstrate its Ohio compliance efforts, the Company initiates the transfer of the appropriate RECs and S-RECs to its GATS reserve subaccount between March 1st and April 15th so as to precede the filing of its Ohio annual compliance status report with the Commission.

[1] Staff uses "non-solar" in this context to refer to the total renewable requirement net of the specific solar carve-out. Staff acknowledges that there is not a specific "non-solar" requirement in the applicable statute.

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

2/12/2014 9:57:21 AM

in

Case No(s). 13-0891-EL-ACP

Summary: Staff Review and Recommendation electronically filed by Mr. Stuart M Siegfried on behalf of PUCO Staff