



Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP  
Legal Counsel

52 East Gay Street  
P.O. Box 1008  
Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008

614.464.6400 | [www.vorys.com](http://www.vorys.com)

Founded 1909

M. Howard Petricoff  
Direct Dial (614) 464-5414  
Direct Fax (614) 719-4904  
Email [mhpetricoff@vorys.com](mailto:mhpetricoff@vorys.com)

November 14, 2013

Ms. Barcy F. McNeal, Secretary  
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio  
180 E. Broad St., 11th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215-3793

Re: Case No. 13-1909-EL-ACP  
Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC

Dear Ms. McNeal:

Pursuant to the October 29, 2013 Attorney Examiner Entry, I am submitting the public version of the average cost data for renewable energy credits that Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC has retired or will be retiring to demonstrate compliance with its 2012 Ohio AEPS obligations. Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC believes that its average renewable cost of data for the 2012 cost year should be protected from public disclosure as a trade secret. Pursuant to Rule 4901-1-24(D) of the Ohio Administrative Code and the October 29, 2013 Entry in this matter, Noble has filed a motion for protective order to keep this table (showing the average cost data for the renewable energy credits that it has retired, or will be retiring, to demonstrate compliance with its 2012 Ohio AEPS obligations) confidential and not part of the public record. Three copies of the confidential version are being submitted under seal.

Thank you for your attention to this matter.

Sincerely,

M. Howard Petricoff

MHP/glp

November 14, 2013  
Page 2

**PUBLIC VERSION**

Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC

**TABLE SHOWING THE AVERAGE COST DATA  
FOR THE RENEWABLE ENERGY CREDIT  
2012 OHIO AEPS OBLIGATIONS  
(Case No. 13-1909-EL-ACP)**

Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC, in accordance with the amendments to Section 4928.64, Ohio Revised Code, effective September 10, 2012, hereby submits this additional average cost data to the Alternative Energy Portfolio Standard Report detailing compliance with the Ohio Alternative Energy Portfolio Standards. This special filing is submitted pursuant to the Entry filed in the above-referenced docket on October 29, 2013.

| <b>Category</b> | <b>\$ / REC (average)</b> |
|-----------------|---------------------------|
| Ohio Solar      | \$                        |
| Other Solar     | \$                        |
| Ohio Non-Solar  | \$                        |
| Other Non-Solar | \$                        |

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**11/14/2013 4:07:43 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 13-1909-EL-ACP**

Summary: Correspondence regarding 2012 Ohio AEPS obligations electronically filed by M  
HOWARD PETRICOFF on behalf of Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC