



James M. McClain Attorney at Law

105 Court Street, Suite 321
Elyria, Ohio 44035
Telephone: (440) 322-0596
Facsimile: (440) 322-8005
E-mail: mcclain2@windstream.net

October 15, 2013

2013 OCT 17 PM 1:51

The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ATTN: Docketing Division 180 E. Broad Street

180 E. Broad Street Columbus, OH 43215

RE: American Wire and Cable Company

vs.

The Cleveland Electric and Illuminating Company

Case No. 13-1613-EL-CSS

Dear Clerk:

Enclosed please find the original and one copy of a Motion to Strike Respondent's Motion for Order Compelling Discovery or in the Alternative Brief in Opposition to Respondent's Motion to be filed with the Public Utilities Commission. Please file this Motion, time-stamp the copy and return it to me in the self-addressed, stamped envelope provided.

Cordially yours,

James M. McClain

JMM/vlm Enclosures

cc:

Denise M. Hasbrook, Esq.

Carrie M. Dunn, Esq.

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business.

Technician Date Processed OCT 1 7 2013



BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

)	Case No. 13-1613-El-CSS
)	
)	MOTION TO STRIKE RESPONDENT'S
, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	MOTION FOR ORDER COMPELLING
)	DISCOVERY OR IN THE
)	<u>ALTERNATIVE BRIEF IN</u>
)	OPPOSITION TO RESPONDENT'S
)	MOTION
)	
)	
))))))))))))))))))))

Respondent The Cleveland Electric and Illuminating Company has completely failed to comply with their obligations under Ohio Rule of Civil Procedure 37(E) prior to filing their Motion for Order Compelling Discovery ("Respondents Motion"). The Rule states:

Before filing a motion authorized by this rule, the party shall make a reasonable effort to resolve the matter through discussion with the attorney, unrepresented party, or person from whom discovery is sought. The motion shall be accompanied by a statement reciting the efforts made to resolve the matter in accordance with this section. (Emphasis added.)

Accordingly, pursuant to Civil Rule 37(E), Respondent was required, before filing a motion to compel, to make a reasonable effort to resolve any discovery issues with Complainant. In addition, pursuant to Civil Rule 37(E), Respondent's Motion must be accompanied by a

statement reciting the efforts made by counsel to resolve this matter. Respondent's Motion does not comply with either procedural requirement. Respondent has not made any effort to resolve this discovery dispute through discussion with Complainant. Respondent's Motion contains no statement regarding efforts purportedly made to resolve the matter and indeed, none have been made. On this basis alone, the Motion should be stricken as premature.

gradient de la 🍨

At a minium, Respondent's Motion should be denied. A number of Courts of Appeals have held that a trial court does not err in denying a motion to compel when the moving party has failed to comply with the requirements of Civil Rule 37(E). See, e.g. *Deutsch Bank Nat. Trust Co. v. Doucet* (Feb. 14, 2008), Tenth Dist. No. 07AP-453 (citing 513 East Rich Street Co. v. *McGreevy*, Franklin App. No. 02AP-1207, 2003-Ohio-2487, at §11 and *Briggs v. Glenbeigh Health Servs*. (Nov. 30, 2000), Cuyahoga App. No. 77395 (affirming denial of motion to compel where movant failed to informally resolve dispute)); *Maguire v. National City Bank* (August 28, 2009), Second Dist. No. 23140, 2009 WL 2675491 at §18.

Complainant admits that there has been delay in submitting answers to Respondent's discovery requests; however, Complainant has worked in due diligence in responding to various filings in responding to Respondent's requests. Complainant is currently in the process of answering and compiling documents for Respondent's discovery questions which will be provided as soon as possible.

For the foregoing reasons, Complainant requests that the Court deny Respondent's Motion.

Respectfully submitted,

James M. McClain, Sup. Ct. #0014011 Attorney for American Wire and Cable Co.

105 Court Street, Suite 321

Elyria, OH 44035 Phone: 440-322-0596 Facsimile: 440-322-8005

Email: mcclain2@windstream.net

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing Motion to Strike was sent by ordinary U.S. Mail, postage prepaid and via email, this _\(\begin{aligned} \frac{1}{2} \) day of October, 2013, to the following:

Denise M. Hasbrook, Esq. Emily Ciecka Wilcheck, Esq. Roetzel & Andress, LPA One SeaGate, Suite 1700 Toledo, OH 43604

Email: dhasbrook@ralaw.com
ewilcheck@ralaw.com

Carrie M. Dunn, Esq. First Energy Service Company 76 South Main Street Akron, OH 44308

Email: cdunn@firstenergycorp.com

James M. McClain, Sup. Ct. #0014011