

SUTHERLAND ASBILL & BRENNAN LLP 600 Congress Ave., Suite 2000 Austin, TX 78701-3238 512.721.2700 Fax 512.721.2656 www.sutherland.com

SARAH MERRICK

**DIRECT LINE: 512.721.2715** 

E-mail: sarah.merrick@sutherland.com

April 22, 2013

2013 APR 23 PH 3: 17

### **VIA FEDERAL EXPRESS**

Ms. Barcy F. McNeal, Secretary Public Utilities Commission of Ohio 180 E. Broad St., 11th Floor Columbus, OH 43215-3793

Re: Champion Energy Services, LLC

Annual Alternative Energy Portfolio Status Report and Plan for Compliance with Future Annual Advanced and Renewable Energy Benchmarks – 2012

Dear Ms. McNeal:

Enclosed please find Champion Energy Services, LLC's ("Champion") Annual Alternative Energy Portfolio Status Report and Plan for Compliance with Future Annual Advanced and Renewable Energy Benchmarks for Calendar Year 2012. This report is redacted because it contains certain confidential and proprietary information. Pursuant to Rule 4901-1-24(D) of the Ohio Administrative Code, a motion for protective order and a memorandum in support of that motion is also enclosed. Additionally enclosed, under seal, are the original plus three copies of the confidential version of this report.

Also enclosed is one extra copy of each of the above-mentioned documents. Please file-stamp these extra copies and return them to me at your convenience in the enclosed Federal Express envelope.

If you have any questions regarding the enclosed, please feel free to contact me.

Respectfully submitted,

0 Sarah Merrick

20925096.1

ATLANTA

This is to certify that the images suppositing are an accurate Nand completent eproduction of a case file accurate Nand completent eproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular processed APR 2 3 2013

2

BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION OF OHIO

IN THE MATTER OF CHAMPION ENERGY SERVICES, LLC'S ANNUAL ALTERNATIVE ENERGY PORTFOLIO STATUS REPORT AND PLAN	)	Case No. 13-1017-EL-ACP	ם כ	13 APR 23 PM	
FOR COMPLIANCE WITH FUTURE ANNUAL ADVANCED AND RENEWABLE ENERGY BENCHMARKS	) ) )		ر.	<u>ઃ</u> ગઃ	

CHAMPION ENERGY SERVICES, LLC'S ANNUAL ALTERNATIVE ENERGY PORTFOLIO STATUS REPORT AND PLAN FOR COMPLIANCE WITH FUTURE ANNUAL ADVANCED AND RENEWABLE ENERGY BENCHMARKS

#### L INTRODUCTION

Champion Energy Services, LLC ("CES") is an electric services company as defined by Section 4928.01(A)(9), Revised Code, having been issued Certificate No. 09-166E by the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("Commission"). CES hereby submits its annual alternative energy portfolio status report for the 2012 calendar year, as required by Rule 4901:1-40-05, Ohio Administrative Code ("O.A.C."), and its plan for compliance with future annual advanced and renewable energy benchmarks, as required by Rule 4901:1-40-03(C), O.A.C.

### II. ANNUAL ALTERNATIVE ENERGY PORTFOLIO STATUS REPORT

Pursuant to Section 4928.64(B)(2), Revised Code, and Rule 4901:1-40-03(A)(2), O.A.C., for the year 2012, electric service companies must demonstrate that at least 1.5% of retail electricity supplied was derived from renewable energy resources, including 0.060% from solar energy resources. At least half of the renewable energy resources, including solar energy resources, used to meet these benchmarks must have been generated by facilities located in Ohio. The level of these benchmark requirements is determined by first calculating a baseline number of kilowatt-hours sold and then applying the benchmark percentages to that baseline.

#### A. Baseline Calculation

Ordinarily, an electric service company's baseline is to be computed by averaging the number of kilowatt hours sold during the three preceding calendar years. CES, however, did not have electric sales in Ohio during 2009, and had sales in only part of 2010. In such case, Rule 4901:1-40-03(B)(2)(a), O.A.C., provides that "the baseline shall be computed as an average of annual sales data for all calendar years during the three preceding years in which the electric services company was serving retail customers." As such, CES computes its baseline as an average of its 2011 annual sales during which it served Ohio retail electric customers, which is

Because of the growth in sales in 2012 as compared to previous years, and out of an abundance of caution, CES retired renewable energy credits ("RECs") based upon a higher baseline as calculated by averaging the annual sales data for 2010, 2011, and 2012 which is

Benchmarks based upon these two baseline figures are provided below.

# B. 2012 Renewable and Solar Energy Resource Benchmarks

Using MWh as its 2012 baseline, CES's calculation of its benchmarks for electricity generated from renewable and solar energy resources for the year 2012 is as follows:

# 2012 Baseline

Total Renewable and Solar Requirement (1.50%) 2012 Renewable Requirement (Total Less Solar) 2012 Renewable Requirement by Jurisdiction (Total Less Solar)

Ohio 50%

Out-of-State 50%

2012 Solar Requirement

Ohio 50% Out-of-State 50%

Using as its 2012 baseline, CES's calculation of its benchmarks for electricity generated from renewable and solar energy resources for the year 2012 is as follows:

2012 Baseline

Total Renewable and Solar Requirement (1.50%)

2012 Renewable Requirement

(Total Less Solar)

2012 Renewable Requirement by Jurisdiction

(Total Less Solar)

Ohio 50%

Out-of-State 50%

2012 Solar Requirement

Ohio 50%

Out-of-State 50%



CES retired RECs based upon this higher baseline calculation.

### C. Demonstration of Compliance with 2012 Benchmarks

Pursuant to § Ohio Rev. Code 4928.65, electric service companies may meet their renewable energy benchmarks through the use of renewable energy credits ("RECs"). CES has successfully met its renewable energy benchmarks using RECs. To demonstrate compliance, CES is submitting as Exhibit A, a copy of its RPS Compliance from PJM.

#### 1. In-state, Non-Solar, Renewable Energy Credits

CES obtained sufficient non-solar, in-state RECs to fully satisfy its 2012 REC obligations. CES evaluated its compliance options on an economic basis. CES found that RECs were available for each tier at prices lower than the optional compliance payment.

### 2. Out-of-State, Non-Solar, Renewable Energy Credits

By means of economically sound purchasing, CES was able to obtain sufficient non-solar adjacent state RECs to fully satisfy its 2012 REC obligations.

### 3. Out-of-State and In-state Solar Renewable Energy Credits

Section 4901:1-40-03(A)(2) of the Ohio Admin Code requires that all electric utilities and affected electric services companies demonstrate that 0.06 percent of their retail electric sales are generated by solar energy resources by the end of 2012. CES obtained sufficient solar RECs ("SRECs") to fully satisfy its 2012 SREC obligations.

# III. PLAN FOR COMPLIANCE WITH FUTURE ANNUAL ADVANCED AND RENEWABLE ENERGY BENCHMARKS

Rule 4901:1-40-03(C), O.A.C., requires that each electric services company file an annual plan for compliance with future annual advanced and renewable energy benchmarks, including solar, utilizing at least a ten-year planning horizon. The plan shall include the following items: (1) baseline for current and future calendar years; (2) supply portfolio projection, including both generation fleet and power purchases; (3) description of the methodology used by the company to evaluate its compliance options; and (4) a discussion of any perceived impediments to achieving compliance with required benchmarks, as well as suggestions for addressing any such impediments.

### A. Baseline for Current and Future Calendar Years

In compliance with Section 4901:1-40-03(C) of the Ohio Admin Code, CES is submitting as Exhibit B its compliance plan using a ten-year planning horizon.

# B. Supply Portfolio Projection, Including Both Generation Fleet and Power Purchases

CES has no plan to construct or purchase any electric generation facilities. Therefore CES will continue to supply power to its customers by purchasing power through the wholesale market.

### C. Description of Methodology Used to Evaluate Compliance Options

As noted above, CES does not own or anticipate owning any generation facilities.

Therefore, CES will meet its alternative energy benchmarks through the purchasing of RECs and SRECs. See Exhibit B.

# D. Perceived Impediments to Achieving Compliance with Required Benchmarks

Aside from the potential for supply and pricing constraints in the market for RECs, CES does not anticipate significant impediments to achieving compliance with its required benchmarks.

### IV. CONCLUSION

CES respectfully requests that the Commission find that CES has complied with the applicable renewable energy resource benchmarks for 2012 and its associated reporting requirements.

# **PUBLIC VERSION**

#0080803

Respectfully submitted,

SWHERLAND ASBILL & BRENNAN LLP

700 Sixth Street, NW, Suite 700

Washington, DC 20001-3980

(202) 383-0892

(202) 637-3593 (Facsimile)

stephen.tsai@sutherland.com

Attorney for Champion Energy Services, LLC

April 22, 2013



# Champion Energy Marketing, LLC - My RPS Compliance - OH - Jan 2012-Dec 2012

Subaccount Name	Zone Name	GATS Load	RPS Load Total Go for Su	eneration Solar R baccount Ener	tenewable gy Source	Renewable Energy Source	S2 Classii Renewable	Total Certificates Used for RPS
OH - AEP	AEP		0	0	0	0	0	
OH - ATSI	ATSI		0	0	0	0	0	Q
OH - Day	DAY		0	0	0	0	0	0
Default	DEOK		0				0	
Reserve Subaccount		0	0	0	0	0	0	0
Total							0	

PUBLIC VERSION
Exhibit A

4/15/2013

# **PUBLIC VERSION**

# Exhibit B

