Public Utilities Commission of Ohio<br>Docket Office, $11^{\text {th }}$ Floor<br>180 East Broad Street<br>Columbus, OH 43215-3793

Case No. 12-1682-EL-AIR
As a business owner I wish to express my disagreement with this latest Duke Energy rate request.

I will attach a spreadsheet that illustrates Duke Energy's billing to my business since May 2006. It also uses 2012 electric usage to project the impact during 2013 if the rate is approved and my 2013 usage remains exactly the same as 2012.

As you can see, Distribution Charges have increased from $\$ 15$ per month as late as June 2009, to the current $\$ 40$ per month. The new request will take that amount to $\$ 49.51$ per month. While this may represent a $23.78 \%$ increase over the current rate, it represents a $230 \%$ increase during a less than 4 year period. I don't know of a single, unregulated business that has to compete for consumer or business customer's dollars that passed an increase of this percentage during this timeframe. In the economic environment these last 4 years, this would be unheard of!

My Delivery Charges have been relatively stable, with the exception of the Generation Riders which were passed starting January 2012. My total Distribution and Delivery Charges as a percentage of my total electric bill, including Generation Charges, were approximately 45\% of my total bill until 2012. Starting in 2012 these charges totaled approximately $70 \%$ of my total electric.

In reading PUCO's decision regarding AEP's Distribution Rate Case, under a heading "What are distribution rates?" it says: "Electric bills are comprised of two main parts-the cost of producing or purchasing electricity for customers and the cost of delivering electricity to

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered, in the regular course of business Technician De, Date Processed EFR \& 1205
customers' homes and businesses. The cost of producing or purchasing electricity, known as generation rates, makes up about 75 percent of an average electric bill."

In my particular case, the cost of Generation makes up approximately $30 \%$ of my bill. Distribution and delivery make up 70\%. This illustrates just how disproportionate the invoice from Duke Energy is compared to what an average electric bill is supposed to be.

I have reduced my kWh in an effort to reduce my total electric bill. Distribution and Delivery ran approximately $\$ .05$ per kWh from 2006 until 2012. They currently run approximately $\$ 14$. With the new rate proposed they will increase to approximately $\$ .15$ per kWh . Even focusing on becoming as efficient with electric use as possible, the cost of Distribution and Delivery will nearly triple in a less than 2 year period if this new request is approved.

A 23.78\% increase in both Distribution and Delivery rates is unreasonable and unjust in this economic environment. The increases already passed along by Duke Energy have forced not only my business, but many others to make major adjustments in businesses operations. Reducing electric use in my particular case means not running outdoor lighting at night, turning the thermostat up during the summer to a level where customers have complained, not running lights in the tunnel, and adjusting my equipment and turning off some pieces altogether.

I object to any increase in any rate from Duke Energy at this time as my monthly bill from Duke is already very disproportionate compared to what an "average" electric bill is supposed to be.


| Month | Distribution | Deflvery | Generation Charges | kWh | Total Distriturtion/ Dellvery | $\begin{aligned} & \text { ped } \\ & \text { per } \\ & \text { kwhen } \end{aligned}$ | Constellation Newtnersy | rotal Electric | D\&D as\% of Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| May-06 | 15 | \$430.23 |  | 8340 | \$445.23 | \$0.05338 | \$587.98 | \$1,033.21 | 43.09\% |
| Jun.06 | 15 | \$437.44 |  | 9633 | 5452.44 | \$0.04697 | \$679.14 | \$1,131.58 | 39.98\% |
| 7/13/2006 | 15 | \$434.52 |  | 9432 | \$449.52 | \$0.04766 | \$664.97 | \$1,114.49 | .33\% |
| 8/11/2006 | 15 | \$424.79 |  | 8854 | \$439.79 | \$0.04962 | \$624.93 | \$1,064.72 | 31\% |
| 9/12/2006 | 15 | \$405.39 |  | 8781 | 5420.39 | S0.0478 | 5619.08 | \$1,039.4 | 40.44\% |
| 10/11/2006 | 15 | \$337.74 |  | 6250 | \$352.74 | S0.0564 | S440.64 | \$793.3 | 4.46\% |
| 11/9/2006 | 15 | \$417.53 |  | 7373 | 5432.53 | S0.0586 | 5519.8 | \$952.3 | 45.42\% |
| 12/12/2006 | 15 | \$483.85 |  | 10194 | \$498.85 | \$0.0489 | \$718.70 | \$1,217.5 | 40.97\% |
| 1/15/2007 | 15 | \$482.93 |  | 8216 | 5497.93 | 50.0606 | \$579 | \$1,077.17 | 46.23\% |
| 2/13/2007 | 15 | \$500.17 |  | 8696 | \$515 | S0.0592 | \$613. | \$1,128.25 | - 45.66\% |
| 3/13/2007 | 15 | \$457.46 |  | 8693 | \$472 | 50.0543 | \$612.8 | \$1,085.33 | -43.53\% |
| 4/13/2007 | 15 | \$389.24 |  | 7280 | \$404.24 | S0.05553 | 5513 | \$917.49 | 44.06\% |
| 5/14/2007 | 15 | \$467.40 |  | 668 | 5482.40 | \$0.05320 | \$639.31 | \$1,121.71 | 3.01\% |
| 6/13/2007 | 15 | \$421.38 |  | 9007 | 5436.38 | 50.04845 | \$635.01 | \$1,071.39 | 40.73\% |
| 7/13/2007 | 15 | \$385.5 |  | 7130 | \$400.57 | \$0.05618 | \$502.68 | \$903.25 | 44.35\% |
| 8/13/2007 | 15 | \$363.9 |  | 7336 | \$378.92 | \$0.05165 | \$517.20 | \$896.12 | 42.28\% |
| 9/12/2007 | 15 | \$395.61 |  | 7823 | \$410.61 | \$0.05249 | \$551.54 | \$962.15 | 42.68\% |
| 10/11/2007 | 15 | \$388.46 |  | 717 | \$403.46 | \$0.05622 | \$505.99 | \$909.45 | \% |
| 11/9/2007 | 15 | \$337.94 |  | 6211 | 5352.94 | \$0.05682 | \$437.89 | \$790.83 | \% |
| 12/12/2007 | 15 | \$334.56 |  | 6004 | \$349.56 | \$0.05822 | \$423.29 | \$772.85 | - 45.23\% |
| 1/15/2008 | 15 | \$426.26 |  | 7892 | 5441.26 | \$0.05591 | \$556.40 | \$997.66 | 4.23\% |
| 2/14/2008 | 15 | \$375.63 |  | 7406 | \$390.63 | \$0.05275 | \$522.14 | \$912.77 | 2.80\% |
| 3/14/2008 | 15 | \$435.78 |  | 6614 | S450.78 | S0.06816 | \$466.30 | \$917.08 | - 49.15\% |
| 4/15/2008 | 15 | \$301.43 | 567.76 | 637 | \$384.19 | \$0.06025 | \$449.59 | \$833.78 | 46.08\% |
| 5/13/2008 | 15 | \$276.05 | 569.48 | 6538 | 5360.53 | \$0.05514 | \$460.94 | \$821.47 | 43.89\% |
| 6/12/2008 | 15 | \$298.57 | \$73.98 | 6962 | \$387.5s | \$0.05567 | \$490.83 | \$878.38 | 44.12\% |
| 7/14/2008 | 15 | \$261.37 | \$79.22 | 7454 | \$355.59 | \$0.04770 | \$525.52 | \$881.11 | 40.36\% |
| 8/12/2008 | 15 | \$263.27 | \$83.36 | 7845 | \$361.63 | \$0.04610 | \$553.09 | \$914.72 | 39.53\% |
| 9/11/2008 | 15 | \$290.18 | \$75.53 | 7108 | \$380.71 | \$0.05356 | \$501.13 | \$881.84 | 43.17\% |
| 10/10/2008 | 15 | \$255.35 | \$66.00 | 6211 | \$336.35 | \$0.05415 | \$437.8 | \$774.24 | 43.44\% |
| 11/10/2008 | 15 | \$257.29 | \$70.26 | 6611 | \$34255 | \$0.05182 | \$466.09 | \$808.64 | 42.36\% |
| 12/12/2008 | 15 | \$270.48 | \$62.25 | 5859 | \$347.73 | \$0.05935 | S413.07 | \$760.80 | 45.71\% |
| 1/15/2009 | 15 | \$317.00 | \$175.84 | 6446 | \$507.84 | \$0.07878 | \$454.45 | \$962.29 | 52.77\% |
| 2/13/2009 | 15 | \$388.53 |  | 6830 | \$403.53 | \$0.05908 | \$481.53 | \$885.06 | 45.59\% |
| 3/16/2009 | 15 | 5327.97 |  | 6204 | 5342.97 | \$0.05528 | \$437.39 | \$780.36 | 43.95\% |
| 4/15/2009 | 15 | \$308.99 |  | 5058 | \$323.99 | \$0.06405 | \$356.60 | \$680.59 | 7.60\% |
| 5/14/2009 | 15 | \$318.86 |  | 5654 | \$333.86 | \$0.05905 | \$398.62 | \$732.48 | 45.58\% |
| 6/15/2009 | 15 | \$329.51 |  | 6765 | \$344.51 | \$0.05093 | \$476.94 | \$821.45 | 41.94\% |
| 7/15/2009 | 16.68 | \$324.33 |  | 6245 | \$341.01 | \$0.05461 | \$440.28 | \$781.29 | 43.65\% |
| 8/13/2009 | 40 | \$355.68 |  | 5260 | \$395.68 | S0.07522 | \$370.84 | \$766.52 | 51.62\% |
| 9/14/2009 | 40 | \$382.27 |  | 6731 | 5422.27 | \$0.06274 | \$474.55 | \$896.82 | 47.09\% |
| 10/13/2009 | 40 | \$300.42 |  | 4231 | \$340.42 | \$0.08046 | \$298.29 | \$638.71 | 53.30\% |
| 11/11/2009 | 40 | \$312.90 |  | 4986 | 5352.90 | \$0.07078 | \$351.52 | \$704.42 | 0.10\% |
| 12/14/2009 | 40 | \$326.00 |  | 5454 | \$366.00 | \$0.06711 | \$384.52 | \$750.52 | 48.77\% |
| 1/15/2010 | 40 | \$374.39 |  | 5570 | 5414.39 | \$0.07440 | \$392.69 | \$807.08 | 1.34\% |
| 2/15/2010 | 40 | \$379.05 |  | 5388 | \$419.05 | \$0.0777 | \$379.86 | \$798.91 | 52.45\% |
| 3/16/2010 | 40 | \$400.56 |  | 5991 | S440.56 | \$0.07354 | \$422.3 | \$862.94 | -51.05\% |
| 4/15/2010 | 40 | \$353.75 |  | 5993 | \$393.75 | \$0.06570 | \$422.52 | \$816.27 | 48.24\% |
| 5/14/2010 | 40 | \$311.86 |  | 4782 | \$351.86 | \$0.07358 | \$337.14 | \$689.00 | 51.07\% |
| 6/15/2010 | 40 | \$361.83 |  | 6150 | \$401.83 | \$0.06534 | \$433.59 | \$835.42 | 48.10\% |
| 7/15/2010 | 40 | \$351.54 |  | 7070 | \$391.54 | \$0.05538 | \$498.45 | \$889.99 | 43.99\% |
| 8/13/2010 | 40 | \$350.47 |  | 6390 | \$990.47 | \$0.06111 | \$450.51 | \$840.98 | 46.43\% |
| 9/14/2010 | 40 | \$340.71 |  | 6721 | \$380.71 | \$0.05664 | \$473.84 | \$854.55 | 44.55\% |
| 10/13/2010 | 40 | \$365.79 |  | 5346 | \$405.79 | 50.07591 | \$376.90 | \$782.69 | 51.85\% |
| 11/11/2010 | 40 | \$317.21 |  | 4890 | \$357.21 | \$0.07305 | \$344.75 | \$701.96 | 50.89\% |
| 12/14/2010 | 40 | \$315.12 |  | 4972 | \$355.12 | \$0.07142 | \$350.53 | \$705.65 | 50.32\% |
| 1/17/2011 | 40 | \$310.04 |  | 6624 | \$350.04 | \$0.05284 | \$467.00 | \$817.04 | 42.84\% |
| 2/15/2011 | 40 | \$316.05 |  | 5250 | \$356.05 | \$0.06782 | \$370.13 | \$726.18 | 49.03\% |
| 3/16/2011 | 40 | \$304.23 |  | 4989 | \$344.23 | \$0.06900 | \$351.73 | \$695.96 | 49.46\% |
| 4/14/2011 | 40 | \$264.00 |  | 4639 | \$304.00 | \$0.06553 | \$327.06 | \$631.06 | 48.17\% |
| 5/16/2011 | 40 | \$289.39 |  | 4713 | \$329.39 | \$0.06989 | \$332.27 | \$661.66 | 49.78\% |
| 6/15/2011 | 40 | \$317.63 |  | 6638 | \$357.63 | \$0.05388 | S467.9 | \$825.62 | 43.32 |


| $7 / 15 / 2011$ | 40 | $\$ 287.15$ |  | 6032 | $\$ 327.15$ | $\$ 0.05424$ | $\$ 425.27$ | $\$ 752.42$ | $43.48 \%$ |
| ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: | ---: |
| $8 / 15 / 2011$ | 40 | $\$ 281.19$ |  | 7529 | $\$ 321.19$ | $\$ 0.04266$ | $\$ 530.81$ | $\$ 852.00$ | $37.70 \%$ |
| $9 / 14 / 2011$ | 40 | $\$ 272.96$ |  | 5994 | $\$ 312.96$ | $\$ 0.05221$ | $\$ 422.59$ | $\$ 735.55$ | $42.55 \%$ |
| $10 / 14 / 2011$ | 40 | $\$ 261.44$ |  | 4918 | $\$ 301.44$ | $\$ 0.06129$ | $\$ 346.73$ | $\$ 648.17$ | $46.51 \%$ |
| $11 / 14 / 2011$ | 40 | $\$ 263.35$ |  | 5164 | $\$ 303.35$ | $\$ 0.05874$ | $\$ 364.07$ | $\$ 667.42$ | $45.45 \%$ |
| $12 / 15 / 2011$ | 40 | $\$ 256.78$ |  | 4296 | $\$ 296.78$ | $\$ 0.06908$ | $\$ 302.88$ | $\$ 599.66$ | $49.49 \%$ |
| $1 / 17 / 2012$ | 40 | $\$ 303.35$ | $\$ 155.05$ | 5022 | $\$ 498.40$ | $\$ 0.09924$ | $\$ 354.06$ | $\$ 852.46$ | $58.47 \%$ |
| $2 / 15 / 2012$ | 40 | $\$ 297.91$ | $\$ 353.73$ | 3662 | $\$ 691.64$ | $\$ 0.18887$ | $\$ 261.77$ | $\$ 953.41$ | $72.54 \%$ |
| $3 / 15 / 2012$ | 40 | $\$ 325.57$ | $\$ 365.21$ | 4750 | $\$ 730.78$ | $\$ 0.15385$ | $\$ 325.00$ | $\$ 1,055.78$ | $69.22 \%$ |
| $4 / 16 / 2012$ | 40 | $\$ 303.44$ | $\$ 323.71$ | 4982 | $\$ 667.15$ | $\$ 0.13391$ | $\$ 344.00$ | $\$ 1,011.15$ | $65.98 \%$ |
| $5 / 16 / 2012$ | 40 | $\$ 298.74$ | $\$ 336.44$ | 4296 | $\$ 675.18$ | $\$ 0.15716$ | $\$ 300.07$ | $\$ 975.25$ | $69.23 \%$ |
| $6 / 15 / 2012$ | 40 | $\$ 282.57$ | $\$ 285.76$ | 5159 | $\$ 608.33$ | $\$ 0.11792$ | $\$ 330.28$ | $\$ 938.61$ | $64.81 \%$ |
| $7 / 17 / 2012$ | 40 | $\$ 283.19$ | $\$ 267.21$ | 5739 | $\$ 590.40$ | $\$ 0.10288$ | $\$ 342.03$ | $\$ 932.43$ | $63.32 \%$ |
| $8 / 15 / 2012$ | 40 | $\$ 266.65$ | $\$ 272.51$ | 4674 | $\$ 579.16$ | $\$ 0.12391$ | $\$ 278.87$ | $\$ 858.03$ | $67.50 \%$ |
| $9 / 14 / 2012$ | 40 | $\$ 240.08$ | $\$ 231.15$ | 4664 | $\$ 511.23$ | $\$ 0.10961$ | $\$ 278.10$ | $\$ 789.33$ | $64.77 \%$ |
| $10 / 15 / 2012$ | 40 | $\$ 237.44$ | $\$ 237.26$ | 4335 | $\$ 514.70$ | $\$ 0.11873$ | $\$ 259.48$ | $\$ 774.18$ | $66.48 \%$ |
| $11 / 13 / 2012$ | 40 | $\$ 235.99$ | $\$ 251.47$ | 3760 | $\$ 527.46$ | $\$ 0.14028$ | $\$ 225.87$ | $\$ 753.33$ | $70.02 \%$ |
| $12 / 14 / 2012$ | 40 | $\$ 235.00$ | $\$ 244.24$ | 3959 | $\$ 519.24$ | $\$ 0.13115$ | $\$ 237.89$ | $\$ 757.13$ | $68.58 \%$ |
| $1 / 17 / 2013$ | 49.51 | $\$ 272.72$ | $\$ 298.83$ | 4426 | $\$ 667.94$ | $\$ 0.16151$ | $\$ 294.46$ | $\$ 962.40$ | $69.40 \%$ |
| $2 / 14 / 2013$ | 49.51 | $\$ 297.91$ | $\$ 353.73$ | 3662 | $\$ 753.04$ | $\$ 0.21981$ | $\$ 261.77$ | $\$ 1,014.81$ | $74.21 \%$ |
| $3 / 15 / 2013$ | 49.51 | $\$ 325.57$ | $\$ 365.21$ | 4750 | $\$ 796.08$ | $\$ 0.17934$ | $\$ 325.00$ | $\$ 1,121.08$ | $71.01 \%$ |
| $4 / 16 / 2013$ | 49.51 | $\$ 303.44$ | $\$ 323.71$ | 4982 | $\$ 727.87$ | $\$ 0.15638$ | $\$ 344.00$ | $\$ 1,071.87$ | $67.91 \%$ |
| $5 / 16 / 2013$ | 49.51 | $\$ 298.74$ | $\$ 336.44$ | 4296 | $\$ 735.90$ | $\$ 0.18322$ | $\$ 300.07$ | $\$ 1,035.97$ | $71.04 \%$ |
| $6 / 15 / 2013$ | 49.51 | $\$ 282.57$ | $\$ 285.76$ | 5159 | $\$ 664.79$ | $\$ 0.13796$ | $\$ 330.28$ | $\$ 995.07$ | $66.81 \%$ |
| $7 / 17 / 2013$ | 49.51 | $\$ 283.19$ | $\$ 267.21$ | 5739 | $\$ 645.90$ | $\$ 0.12056$ | $\$ 342.03$ | $\$ 987.93$ | $65.38 \%$ |
| $8 / 15 / 2013$ | 49.51 | $\$ 266.65$ | $\$ 272.51$ | 4674 | $\$ 632.88$ | $\$ 0.14486$ | $\$ 278.87$ | $\$ 911.75$ | $69.41 \%$ |
| $9 / 14 / 2013$ | 49.51 | $\$ 240.08$ | $\$ 231.15$ | 4664 | $\$ 559.84$ | $\$ 0.12842$ | $\$ 278.10$ | $\$ 837.94$ | $66.81 \%$ |
| $10 / 15 / 2013$ | 49.51 | $\$ 237.44$ | $\$ 237.26$ | 4335 | $\$ 563.31$ | $\$ 0.13896$ | $\$ 259.48$ | $\$ 822.79$ | $68.46 \%$ |
| $11 / 13 / 2013$ | 49.51 | $\$ 235.99$ | $\$ 251.47$ | 3760 | $\$ 576.50$ | $\$ 0.16384$ | $\$ 225.87$ | $\$ \$ 02.37$ | $71.85 \%$ |
| $12 / 14 / 2013$ | 49.51 | $\$ 235.00$ | $\$ 244.24$ | 3959 | $\$ 567.85$ | $\$ 0.15331$ | $\$ 237.89$ | $\$ 805.74$ | $70.48 \%$ |

