## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of BidURenergy, Inc. for Renewal of its Certification as a Competitive Retail	)	Case No. 11-0017-GA-AGG
Natural Gas Broker/Aggregator	)	

## **Motion for Protective Order**

BidURenergy, Inc. hereby moves the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("Commission") for a protective Order granting confidentiality to the Amended Exhibit C-5 of BidURenergy's renewal application for certification as a Competitive Retail Natural Gas Broker/Aggregator. Amended Exhibit C-5 has been filed under seal contemporaneously with this motion.

As grounds for this motion, BidURenergy states that Amended Exhibit C-5 constitutes proprietary trade secrets and its release as a public record would unnecessarily and unreasonably harm BidURenergy. BidURenergy filed Exhibits C-3 and C-5 to its renewal application under seal, along with a motion for protective order, on the same grounds. That motion is pending. The Commission granted BidURenergy's motion for protective order as to the same exhibits to the company's initial application for certification filed under seal on January 3, 2011.

The rationale supporting this Motion is further set out in the attached Memorandum in Support, which is hereby incorporated into this Motion.

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business rechnician	
rechnician Date Processed FEB 15 703	Ì

Consistent with the Commission's rules, specifically Section 4901-1-24(D) of the Ohio Administrative Code, BidURenergy has filed under seal three unredacted copies of Amended Exhibit C-5 to its renewal application.

Respectfully submitted,

David N. Truman (0082347)

Attorney at Law Truman Law, LLC

6100 Oak Tree Blvd., Ste. 200

Independence, OH 44131

Phone: 216-539-7073 david@trumanlawllc.com Attorney for BidURenergy, Inc.

## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of BidURenergy, Inc.	)	Case No. 11-0017-GA-AGC
for Renewal of its Certification as a Competitive Retail	)	
Natural Gas Broker/Aggregator	)	

## Memorandum in Support

BidURenergy, Inc. was originally certified as a Competitive Retail Natural Gas Broker/Aggregator on February 3, 2011 (Certificate No. 11-209G(1)). When it filed its original application for certification, BidURenergy requested confidentiality with respect to its financial statements and projected financial statements. BidURenergy filed its application for renewal of its certification as a Competitive Retail Natural Gas Broker/Aggregator (the "Renewal Application") on January 28, 2013, along with a Motion for Protective Order. The Renewal Application also includes confidential information in Exhibit C-3 "Financial Statements" and Exhibit C-5 "Forecasted Financial Statements". BidURenergy inadvertently filed Exhibit C-5 with incorrect information. Despite the error, the information filed in Exhibit C-5 is proprietary and requires a protective order. The company's Motion for Protective Order as to the Renewal Application is pending.

BidUREnergy has now filed a Motion to Amend Exhibit C-5 and seeks a protective order for the Amended Exhibit C-5. BidURenergy has provided this sensitive information under seal pursuant to Section 4901-1-24(D) of the Ohio Administrative Code because its disclosure would place BidURenergy at a significant competitive disadvantage in a highly competitive market.

Section 4901-1-24(D) provides that the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("Commission") may, upon motion of a party, "issue any order which is necessary to protect the confidentiality of the information contained in [a] document" filed with the Commission's docketing division "to the extent that state or federal law prohibits release of the information, including where the information is deemed by the [C]ommission... to constitute a trade secret under Ohio law, and where nondisclosure of the information is not inconsistent with the purposes of Title 49 of the Revised Code."

The Supreme Court of Ohio has established a six-factor test for determining whether information constitutes a trade secret:

(1) The extent to which the information is known outside the business; (2) the extent to which it is known inside the business, *i.e.*, by the employees; (3) the precautions taken by the holder of the trade secret to guard the secrecy of the information; (4) the savings effected and the value to the holder in having the information as against competitors; (5) the amount of effort or money expended in obtaining and developing the information; and (6) the amount of time and expense it would take for others to acquire and duplicate the information.

Al Minor & Assoc., Inc. v. Martin (2008), 117 Ohio St. 3d 58, 61 (citing State ex rel. The Plain Dealer v. Ohio Dept. of Ins. (1997), 80 Ohio St.3d 513, 524). Based on the foregoing factors, the information in BidUREnergy's Amended Exhibit C-5 clearly constitutes trade secrets.

BidURenergy is a private corporation whose financial projections are not known outside the company and are shared only with select employees inside the company. BidURenergy has provided the information in Amended Exhibit C-5 to the Commission only under seal and with the expectation that its Motion for Protective Order will be granted. BidURenergy has consistently treated this information as trade secrets. Further, the financial forecast is critical to the company's planning and operations and exists as the result of a great deal of effort and expense. Finally, BidURenergy's financial forecast would be virtually impossible for

competitors or others to acquire or duplicate if the Commission grants this Motion.

In the normal course of BidURenergy's business, financial forecasts are treated as

proprietary and confidential and are not disclosed to anyone outside the company unless required

by law. BidURenergy is actively engaged in Ohio's competitive retail electric service and natural

gas markets. Disclosure of the company's financial forecast would harm BidURenergy's ability

to compete, especially against other aggregators and brokers who have been allowed by the

Commission to maintain confidentiality of their own financial statements and projections.

For all of the aforementioned reasons, BidURenergy respectfully requests that the

Commission maintain all of BidURenergy's financial statements and financial forecasts, marked

as Exhibits C-3 and C-5 and Amended Exhibit C-5, under seal and grant this Motion for

Protective Order.

Respectfully submitted,

David N. Truman (0082347)

Attorney at Law Truman Law, LLC

6100 Oak Tree Blvd., Ste. 200

Independence, OH 44131

Phone: 216-539-7073 david@trumanlawllc.com

Attorney for BidURenergy, Inc.

3