# BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of Duke	)	
Energy Ohio, Inc. for the Establishment	)	Case No. 12-2400-EL-UNC
of a Charge Pursuant to Revised Code	)	
Section 4909.18.	)	
In the Matter of the Application of Duke	)	
Energy Ohio, Inc. for Approval to	)	<b>Case No. 12-2401-EL-AAM</b>
Change Accounting Methods.	)	
In the Matter of the Application of Duke	)	
Energy Ohio, Inc. for the Approval of a	)	<b>Case No. 12-2402-EL-ATA</b>
Tariff for a New Service.	)	

# MOTION TO INTERVENE OF AEP RETAIL ENERGY PARTNERS LLC

Pursuant to Ohio Revised Code § 4903.221 and Rule 4901-1-11, Ohio Admin. Code, AEP Retail Energy Partners LLC d/b/a AEP Energy, on behalf of itself and its affiliated competitive retail electric service provider, AEP Energy, Inc. (collectively, "AEP Energy") hereby moves to intervene in these proceedings. AEP Energy has a real and substantial interest in these proceedings that is not adequately represented by existing parties and is so situated that the disposition of these proceedings may impair or impede its ability to protect that interest. Accordingly, and as more fully explained in the accompanying memorandum in support, AEP Energy respectfully requests that the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("Commission") grant this timely request to intervene.

itespectary success,
/s/ Yazen Alami
Jay E. Jadwin
Yazen Alami

Respectfully submitted

American Electric Power Service Corporation 155 Nationwide Ave Columbus, Ohio 43215 Telephone: (614)-583-7634 Email: jejadwin@aep.com

yalami@aep.com

Counsel for AEP Energy

# BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of Duke	)	
Energy Ohio, Inc. for the Establishment	)	Case No. 12-2400-EL-UNC
of a Charge Pursuant to Revised Code	)	
Section 4909.18.	)	
In the Matter of the Application of Duke	)	
Energy Ohio, Inc. for Approval to	)	<b>Case No. 12-2401-EL-AAM</b>
Change Accounting Methods.	)	
In the Matter of the Application of Duke	)	
Energy Ohio, Inc. for the Approval of a	)	<b>Case No. 12-2402-EL-ATA</b>
Tariff for a New Service.	)	

## MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF THE MOTION TO INTERVENE OF AEP RETAIL ENERGY PARTNERS LLC

On August 29, 2012, Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. ("Duke") filed an application with the Commission seeking, among other things, an order from the Commission "establishing the amount of the cost-based charge, pursuant to Ohio's newly adopted state compensation mechanism, for the provision by Duke Energy Ohio of capacity services throughout its service territory. . . ." The disposition of this and other issues in these proceedings may adversely affect AEP Energy's ability as a competitive retail electric supplier to provide competitive retail electric services to consumers within Duke's service territory.

Revised Code § 4903.221 provides, in pertinent part, that any person "who may be adversely affected" by a Commission proceeding is entitled to seek intervention in that proceeding. Subsection (B) of R.C. §4903.221 requires the Commission to consider the following criteria in ruling on motions to intervene:

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> August 29, 2012 Duke Application at ¶ 2 (internal quotations omitted)

- 1. The nature and extent of the prospective intervenor's interest;
- 2. The legal position advanced by the prospective intervenor and its probable relation to the merits of the case;
- 3. Whether the intervention by the prospective intervenor will unduly prolong or delay the proceeding; and
- 4. Whether the prospective intervenor will significantly contribute to the full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues.<sup>2</sup>

In addition to requiring consideration of the above criteria, the Commission's rules also require consideration of "[t]he extent to which the person's interest is represented by existing parties" in deciding whether to permit intervention.<sup>3</sup> Further, the Supreme Court of Ohio has found that "intervention ought to be liberally allowed so that the positions of all persons with a real and substantial interest in the proceedings can be considered by the PUCO." In considering AEP Energy's prospective intervention in light of the above criteria and precedent, the Commission should find that AEP Energy's intervention in these proceedings is appropriate.

AEP Energy is a competitive retail electric service provider certified to provide retail generation, aggregation, power marketer, and power broker services within the state of Ohio. AEP Energy is currently providing retail electric services to customers within Duke's service territory. It is critical to the ongoing business of AEP Energy that it be able to compete successfully for business in this state and in Duke's service territory. The implementation, design, and structure of any cost-based capacity charge established by the Commission in these proceedings could adversely affect AEP Energy's ability to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Ohio Rev. Code Ann. § 4903.221(B)(1)-(4)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See O.A.C. 4901-1-11(B)(1)-(5).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Ohio Consumers' Counsel v. Pub. Util. Comm., 111 Ohio St. 3d 384, 387, 2006-Ohio-5853, ¶20 (2006).

provide competitive retail electric services to customers within Duke's service territory. As such, AEP Energy has a real and substantial interest in this proceeding and its interest cannot be represented by any other party to this proceeding. That AEP Energy has a unique, real and substantial interest in this proceeding is further supported by the fact that it was a signatory party to the Stipulation approved by the Commission in Duke's most recent ESP case, Case No. 11-3549-EL-SSO.<sup>5</sup> The disposition of these proceedings may alter the terms of that Stipulation and, as such, could disrupt the balance of the interests reflected in the Stipulation's package of terms as agreed to by AEP Energy and the other signatory parties. As an intervenor in these proceedings, AEP Energy would intend to advocate positions related to these interests.

AEP Energy's intervention will not unduly prolong or delay these proceedings. This motion to intervene is filed before the October 15, 2012, intervention deadline established by the attorney examiner's September 13, 2012, entry and is, therefore, timely. Moreover, no discovery deadline or hearing date has yet been set. Lastly, given its experience in the marketplace and understanding of the competitive issues these proceedings raise, AEP Energy will be able to significantly contribute to the full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues in these proceedings.

For the foregoing reasons, AEP Energy respectfully requests that the Commission grant this motion to intervene and that AEP Energy be made a party of record to these proceedings.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The Stipulation was signed on behalf of AEP Retail Energy Partners LLC.

# Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Yazen Alami\_ Jay E. Jadwin Yazen Alami American Electric Power Service Corporation 155 Nationwide Ave Columbus, Ohio 43215 Telephone: (614)-583-7634

Email:

Counsel for AEP Energy

### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a true and correct copy of the foregoing has been served upon the below-named counsel via electronic mail this 3rd day of October, 2012.

## /s/ Yazen Alami\_ Yazen Alami

Amy B. Spiller
Rocco D'Ascenzo
Jeanne Kingery
Elizabeth Watts
Duke Energy Business Services LLC
139 East Fourth Street
1303 Main
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
amy.spiller@duke-energy.com
rocco.dascenzo@duke-energy.com
jeanne.kingery@duke-energy.com
elizabeth.watts@duke-energy.com

Bruce J. Weston
Consumers' Counsel
Maureen R. Grady
Kyle L. Kern
Deb J. Bingham
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, Ohio 43215
grady@occ.state.oh.us
kern@occ.state.oh.us
bingham@occ.state.oh.us

Douglas E. Hart 411 Vine Street, Suite 4192 Cincinnati, Ohio 45202 dhart@douglasehart.com

Thomas J. O'Brien Bricker & Eckler LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, Ohio 43215 tobrien@bricker.com Colleen L. Mooney
David C. Rinebolt
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
Findlay, Ohio 45839-1793
Cmooney2@columbus.rr.com
drine@aol.com

David F. Boehm
Michael L. Kurtz
Jody M. Kyler
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
dboehm@bkllawfirm.com
mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com
jkyler@bkllawfirm.com

Kimberly W. Bojko Mallory M. Mohler Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP 280 North High Street Suite 1300 Columbus, Ohio 43215 bojko@carpenterlipps.com mohler@carpenterlipps.com

J. Thomas Siwo Matthew W. Warnock Bricker & Eckler, LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, Ohio 43215 tsiwo@bricker.com mwarnock@bricker.com Mark A. Hayden
FirstEnergy Service Company
76 South Main Street
Akron, Ohio 44308
haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

James F. Lang
Laura C. McBride
N. Trevor Alexander
Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP
1405 East Sixth Street
Cleveland, Ohio 44114
jlang@calfee.com
lmcbride@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com

Steven Beeler
John Jones
Assistant Attorney General
Ohio Attorney General's Office
Public Utilities Section
180 East Broad Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
steven.beeler@puc.state.oh.us
john.jones@puc.state.oh.us

Samuel C. Randazzo
Frank P. Darr
Joseph E. Oliker
Matthew R. Pritchard
Mcnees Wallace & Nurick LLC
21 East State Street, 17TH Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
Telephone: (614) 469-8000
Telecopier: (614) 469-4653
sam@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
joliker@mwncmh.com
mpritchard@mwncmh.com

Teresa Orahood Bricker & Eckler LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, Ohio 43215 torahood@bricker.com Sandra Coffey Public Utilities Commission of Ohio 180 E. Broad St. Columbus, Ohio 43215 sandra.coffey@puc.state.oh.us

Carys Cochern
Duke Energy
155 East Broad St
21st Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
carys.cochern@duke-energy.com

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on** 

10/3/2012 4:51:06 PM

in

Case No(s). 12-2400-EL-UNC, 12-2401-EL-AAM, 12-2402-EL-ATA

Summary: Motion AEP Retail Energy Partners LLC's Motion to Intervene and Memorandum in Support electronically filed by Mr. Yazen Alami on behalf of AEP Retail Energy Partners LLC d/b/a AEP Energy