

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio)	
Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric)	Case Nos. 12-2190-EL-POR
Illuminating Company, and The Toledo)	12-2191-EL-POR
Edison Company For Approval of Their)	12-2192-EL-POR
Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand)	
Reduction Portfolio Plans for 2013 through)	
2015)	

**MOTION TO INTERVENE
BY THE
ADVANCED ENERGY ECONOMY OHIO**

For the reasons set forth in the accompanying Memorandum in Support, Advanced Energy Economy Ohio moves the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio for leave to intervene in the above-captioned case pursuant to Ohio Revised Code 4903.221 and Ohio Administrative Code 4901-1-11, and to grant to the Advanced Energy Economy Ohio the full powers and rights specifically authorized by statute or by the provisions of the Ohio Administrative Code.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Todd M. Williams
Todd M. Williams, Counsel of Record (0083647)
Williams Allwein and Moser, LLC
Two Maritime Plaza, Third Floor
Toledo, Ohio 43604
Telephone: (567) 225-3330
Fax: (567) 225-3329
E-mail: toddm@wamenergylaw.com

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio)	
Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric)	Case Nos. 12-2190-EL-POR
Illuminating Company, and The Toledo)	12-2191-EL-POR
Edison Company For Approval of Their)	12-2192-EL-POR
Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand)	
Reduction Portfolio Plans for 2013 through)	
2015)	

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO INTERVENE OF THE
ADVANCED ENERGY ECONOMY OHIO**

I. Introduction

The Advanced Energy Economy Ohio (AEE Ohio) seeks intervention in this proceeding where the Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, the Toledo Edison Company and the Ohio Edison Company (collectively “FirstEnergy” or “Companies”) have submitted energy efficiency program plans for implementation over the 2013-2015 period. AEE Ohio seeks to participate in this proceeding because AEE Ohio and its members may be adversely affected by the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“PUCO” or “Commission”) rulings in these matters. The portfolio plan and subsequent proceedings will present several issues regarding FirstEnergy’s interaction with customers and the provision to customers of energy efficiency services. These and other issues, which are a part of this proceeding, may directly impact the AEE Ohio’s interests in positioning Ohio as a world-leader in the development and manufacturing of clean energy and associated technologies, and the interests of Advanced Energy Economy Ohio’s members engaged in these industries. As such, AEE Ohio is entitled to intervene in this proceeding.

II. Legal Standard

Ohio law states that a party may intervene in a Commission proceeding if that party “may be adversely affected by a public utilities commission proceeding.”¹ In the determination of whether a party may be adversely affected for purposes of intervention, the Commission is required to evaluate:

- (1) The nature and extent of the prospective intervenor’s interest;
- (2) The legal position advanced by the prospective intervenor and its probable relation to the merits of the case;
- (3) Whether the intervention by the prospective intervenor will unduly prolong or delay the proceedings;
- (4) Whether the prospective intervenor will significantly contribute to full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues.²

The Commission’s rules similarly provide that any person may intervene where “[t]he person has a real and substantial interest in the proceeding.”³ The PUCO regulations set forth the same four standards that are established in Ohio Revised Code 4903.221(B) for determining whether a party may be “adversely affected,” and also purport to add a fifth factor regarding “the extent to which the person’s interest is represented by existing parties.”⁴

As the Ohio Supreme Court has held, intervention in Commission proceedings “ought to be liberally allowed so that the positions of all persons with a real and substantial interest in the proceedings can be considered by the [Commission].”⁵ The Commission has consistently maintained a policy to “encourage the broadest possible participation” in its proceedings, even

¹ R.C. 4903.221.

² R.C. 4903.221(B).

³ Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11(A)(2).

⁴ Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11(B).

⁵ *Ohio Consumers’ Counsel v. Pub. Util Comm’n of Ohio* (2006), 111 Ohio St. 3d 384, 388, 2006 Ohio 5853, 856 N.E.2d 940.

under extenuating circumstances.⁶ AEE Ohio satisfies these liberal intervention standards and respectfully requests that its intervention be granted in these cases.

III. AEE Ohio is entitled to intervene under §4903.221 because the organization and its members “may be adversely affected” by the outcome of this proceeding.

AEE Ohio is entitled to intervene in this proceeding because AEE Ohio satisfies each of the four statutory factors demonstrating that the organization and its members “may be adversely affected” by the outcome. First, the nature and extent of AEE Ohio’s interests in the proceeding is real and substantial,⁷ as the issues involved herein are directly related to AEE Ohio’s interests in promoting energy efficiency and will have direct economic impact on AEE Ohio’s members and mission in Ohio.

AEE Ohio is an Ohio-based organization representing a wide range of advanced energy businesses, with some members involved directly in renewable energy and related industries. AEE Ohio is the premier network of businesses and business leaders advancing renewable energy, energy efficiency and clean energy technology through effective communications, broad advocacy and business development.⁸ AEE Ohio’s members have a financial interest in the development and expansion of the technology and equipment employed in distributed generation.

This proceeding presents issues that are directly relevant to the interests of AEE Ohio and its members. For example, the Companies will be proposing a host of energy efficiency programs to be implemented over the next 3 years. Ensuring that FirstEnergy programs are soundly constructed and developed will have a direct impact on the amount and effectiveness of

⁶ See e.g. *In the Matter of the Application of The Dayton Power and Light Company*, 2009 WL 322883 at 1, Ohio PUC February 5, 2009 (Commission granted motion to intervene in light of policy to encourage participation, despite party’s failure to file within the deadline).

⁷ R.C. 4903.221(B)(1).

⁸ For more information, please see the OBCCE website at: <http://ohiobusinesscouncil.com/>.

energy efficiency measures in FirstEnergy's service territory. As such, the interests of AEE Ohio in this proceeding stem from the direct and indirect impacts specific issue outcomes will have on the energy capacity of the State of Ohio and surrounding areas.

Second, the desire of AEE Ohio to promote energy efficiency in Ohio is directly related to the issues of this case. Specifically, this case directly involves energy efficiency program development over a period of three years. Such programming will impact AEE Ohio's members.

Third, AEE Ohio's intervention will not unduly prolong or delay the proceeding⁹ as this motion is being filed by the deadline set for intervention¹⁰ and AEE Ohio is able to comply with all case management deadlines established by the Commission and/or agreed to by the parties.

Fourth, intervention by AEE Ohio will significantly contribute to the full development of the record in this proceeding.¹¹ AEE Ohio will bring significant expertise to bear in this proceeding. AEE Ohio's members have extensive experience in all aspects of clean energy and renewable policy, energy efficiency, equipment and deployment. As such, AEE Ohio should be permitted to intervene pursuant to Ohio Revised Code §4903.221.

IV. AEE Ohio may intervene because AEE Ohio and its members have a “real and substantial interest” in the proceeding as presented in Ohio Administrative Code 4901-1-11(B).

AEE Ohio may also intervene in this proceeding because they satisfy each of the five factors listed in the PUCO rules demonstrating that they have a “real and substantial interest” in the proceeding.¹² The first four factors are identical to those set forth under §4903.221(B) and,

⁹ R.C. 4903.221(B)(3).

¹⁰ Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11(E).

¹¹ R.C. 4903.221(B)(4).

¹² Ohio Adm.Code 4901-1-11(B).

therefore, AEE Ohio should be permitted to intervene for the same reasons as set forth in Section III above.

As for the fifth factor, AEE Ohio's interests in this proceeding will not be fully represented by other parties¹³ because none of the other parties can adequately represent AEE Ohio's interests as an Ohio organization representing businesses involved in every aspect of the renewable and advanced energy industry. Therefore, AEE Ohio respectfully requests that its intervention and participation be granted in this case.

V. Conclusion

For the foregoing reasons, the Advanced Energy Economy Ohio respectfully request that their Motion to Intervene be granted, and AEE Ohio be authorized to participate as full parties to this proceeding.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Todd M. Williams
Todd M. Williams, Counsel of Record (0083647)
Williams Allwein and Moser, LLC
Two Maritime Plaza, Third Floor
Toledo, Ohio 43604
Telephone: (567) 225-3330
Fax: (567) 225-3329
E-mail: toddm@wamenergylaw.com

¹³ Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11(B)(5).

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true and accurate copy of the foregoing *Motion to Intervene and Memorandum in Support* has been filed with the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio and has been served upon the following parties via electronic mail on September 4, 2012.

/s/ Todd M. Williams
Todd M. Williams

Devin Parram
Attorney General's Office
Public Utilities Commission of
Ohio
180 East Broad St., 6th Fl.
Columbus, OH 43215
Devin.parram@puc.state.oh.us

Jody M. Kyler
David F. Boehm
Michael L. Kurtz
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, OH 45202
jkyler@bkllawfirm.com
dboehm@bkllawfirm.com
mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com
Attorneys for Ohio Energy Group

Christopher J. Allwein
Williams Allwein & Moser, LLC
1373 Grandview Ave., Suite 212
Columbus, OH 43212
callwein@wamenergylaw.com
Attorney for the Sierra Club

Cathryn N. Loucas
Trent Dougherty
The Ohio Environmental Council
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201
Columbus, OH 43212-3449
Cathy@theOEC.org
Trent@theOEC.org
Attorneys for the Ohio Environmental
Council

Colleen L. Mooney
Ohio Partners for Affordable
Energy
231 West Lima Street
Findlay, OH 45839-1793
cmooney2@columbus.rr.com

Robert Kelter
Justin M. Vickers
Environmental Law & Policy Center
35 East Wacker Drive, Suite 1600
Chicago, IL 60601
jvickers@elpc.org
rkelter@elpc.org
Attorneys for the Environmental Law
& Policy Center

Kathy J. Kolich
Carrie M. Dunn
FirstEnergy Service Company
76 South Main Street
Akron, OH 44308
kjkolich@firstenergycorp.com
cdunn@firstenergycorp.com
Attorneys for FirstEnergy Service
Company

Kyle L. Kern
Assistant Consumers' Counsel
Office of the Ohio Consumers'
Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, OH 43216
kern@occ.state.oh.us

Thomas J. O'Brien
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
tobrien@bricker.com
Attorney for Ohio Hospital
Association

Samuel C. Randazzo
Frank P. Darr
Joseph E. Olier
Matthew R. Pritchard
MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK
LLC
21 East State Street, 17TH Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
sam@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com
joliker@mwncmh.com
mpritchard@mwncmh.com
Attorneys for Industrial Energy
Users-Ohio

Richard L. Sites
General Counsel & Senior Director of
Healthy Policy
Ohio Hospital Association
155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
ricks@ohanet.org

Gregory Price
Mandy Willey
Attorney Examiners
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 East Broad Street
Columbus, OH 43215
gregory.price@puc.state.oh.us
mandy.willey@puc.state.oh.us

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

9/4/2012 4:05:21 PM

in

Case No(s). 12-2191-EL-POR, 12-2192-EL-POR, 12-2190-EL-POR

Summary: Motion Corrected Motion to Intervene on behalf of AEE Ohio electronically filed by Mr. Todd M Williams on behalf of Advanced Energy Economy Ohio