

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. for an Increase in its Electric Distribution Rates.)	Case No. 12-1682-EL-AIR
)	
)	
)	Case No. 12-1683-EL-ATA
In the Matter of the Application of Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. for Tariff Approval)	
)	
)	Case No. 12-1684-EL-AAM
In the Matter of the Application of Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. for Approval to Change Accounting Methods.)	
)	
)	

**MOTION TO INTERVENE
BY THE
OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL**

The Ohio Environmental Council (“OEC”) moves to intervene in the above captioned case, in which Duke Energy Ohio, Inc., (“Duke”) applies to the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio (“PUCO” or “Commission”) for an increase in electric distribution rates, for tariff approval, and to change accounting methods. As more fully discussed in the accompanying memorandum, the OEC has a real and substantial interest in this proceeding to ensure that energy efficiency resource, renewable and advanced energy resource, peak demand reduction projects and associated recovery riders are deployed in this state according to the clear requirements and timetables provided by Senate Bill 221 (“S.B. 221”) and to ensure that this Application is properly scrutinized in light of the letter and intent of S.B. 221. The interests of the OEC, Ohio’s largest non-profit environmental advocacy organization, are not represented by any existing party. The OEC’s participation in this proceeding will contribute to a just and expeditious

resolution of the issues involved without unduly delaying the proceeding or unjustly prejudicing any existing party.

Accordingly, the OEC hereby moves to intervene in this proceeding pursuant to R.C. 4903.221 and O.A.C. 4901-1-11.

WHEREFORE, the OEC respectfully requests that the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio grants the OEC's motion to intervene for these reasons and those set forth in the attached Memorandum in Support.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Trent A. Dougherty
Trent A. Dougherty, Counsel of Record
Cathryn N. Loucas
Ohio Environmental Council
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449
(614) 487-7506 – Telephone
(614) 487-7510 – Fax
trent@theoec.org
cathy@theoec.org

Attorneys for the OEC

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Duke)	Case No. 12-1682-EL-AIR
Energy Ohio, Inc. for an Increase in its)	
Electric Distribution Rates.)	
)	Case No. 12-1683-EL-ATA
In the Matter of the Application of Duke)	
Energy Ohio, Inc. for Tariff Approval)	
)	Case No. 12-1684-EL-AAM
In the Matter of the Application of Duke)	
Energy Ohio, Inc. for Approval to Change)	
Accounting Methods.)	

**MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF
MOTION TO INTERVENE
BY THE
OHIO ENVIRONMENTAL COUNCIL**

R.C. Section 4903.221 provides that any “person who may be adversely affected by a public utilities commission proceeding may intervene in such proceeding.” The OEC is a non-profit, charitable organization comprised of a network of over 100 affiliated member groups whose mission is to secure a healthier environment for all Ohioans. Throughout its 40-year history, the OEC has been a leading advocate for fresh air, clean water, and sustainable land and energy use. The OEC was an active participant in the effort that led to the passage of S.B. 221, including the inclusion of energy efficiency and AER benchmarks. The OEC has a real and substantial interest in Duke’s Application. A determination concerning the increase in distribution rates, approval of tariffs, and changes in accounting methods may impact the amount of energy efficiency and distributed generation that is deployed by Duke, which will directly

impact Ohio's air quality and environment. Therefore, the OEC has a substantial interest in assuring an effective assessment of Duke's Application.

R.C. 4903.221(B) outlines four factors that the Commission shall consider when ruling on a motion to intervene in a proceeding. First, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(1), the Commission shall consider "the nature and extent of the prospective intervenor's interest." The OEC has several distinct interests in the disposition of this case. Having been intricately involved in the passage of SB 221, the OEC is particularly interested in the achievement of maximum cost-effective energy efficiency and renewable energy implementation. The OEC's interest specifically is to review the increase in rates to determine whether there is any energy efficiency, distributed generation, or other alternatives to said rate increases or tariff increases. The OEC, as an environmental advocacy organization, has a special interest in the outcome of this case because the disposition of this case will influence Duke's pursuit of energy efficiency and alternative energy resources.

Second, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(2), the Commission shall consider "the legal position advanced by the prospective intervenor and its probable relation to the merits of the case." Although the OEC does not outline detailed legal arguments in this section, the OEC maintains that Duke's Application should be properly scrutinized by interested parties to ensure that it includes accurate assessments of Duke's proposed distribution rates and alternatives.

Third, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(3), the Commission shall consider "whether the intervention by the prospective intervenor will unduly prolong or delay the proceedings." The OEC has significant experience dealing with electric utilities questions before the Commission and will not seek to unduly delay the proceeding. The OEC has been consistently involved in the development and enactment of S.B. 221 and the associated rules, including as a party in

numerous cases before the Commission. The OEC's intervention will not unduly prolong or delay these proceedings; to the contrary, the OEC's expertise and unique interest will add value to the development of this case.

Fourth, pursuant to R.C. 4903.221(B)(4), the Commission shall consider "whether the prospective intervenor will significantly contribute to full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues." The OEC has actively participated in the implementation of the efficiency and renewable energy benchmarks established by S.B. 221 and in numerous other matters before the Commission. As an active participant in cases before the Commission, the OEC has developed expertise that will contribute to the full development of the legal questions involved in this proceeding. Finally, as Ohio's leading environmental advocate, the OEC will be able to assure that the environmental impacts of resource planning are fully developed.

The OEC also satisfies the intervention requirements outlined in the Commission's rules. The criteria for intervention established by O.A.C. 4901-1-11(A) are identical to those provided by R.C. 4903.221, with the exception that the rules add a fifth factor that the Commission shall consider when ruling on a motion to intervene. Pursuant to O.A.C. 4901-1-11(A)(5), the Commission shall consider "the extent to which the [intervenor's] interest is represented by existing parties." The OEC's interest is not fully represented by the existing parties. The OEC is the leading advocate for Ohio's environment. No other party to this proceeding has the mission of securing healthy air for all Ohioans, and no other party has been a continuous participant in cases before the Commission for the specific purpose of furthering this mission.

Finally, we point out that it is the Commission's stated policy "to encourage the broadest possible participation in its proceedings."¹ The Commission should not apply its intervention

¹ *Cleveland Elec. Illum. Co.*, Case No. 85-675-EL-AIR, Entry dated January 14, 1986, at 2.

criteria in a manner that would favor one environmental or consumer advocate to the exclusion of others.

The OEC meets all the criteria established by R.C. 4903.221 and O.A.C. 4901-1-11(A)(5) and therefore should be granted leave to intervene in this proceeding.

WHEREFORE, the OEC respectfully requests that the Commission grant its motion to intervene in the above captioned matter.

DATE: July 24, 2012

/s/ Trent A. Dougherty
Trent A. Dougherty, Counsel of Record
Cathryn N. Loucas
Ohio Environmental Council
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449
(614) 487-7506 – Telephone
(614) 487-7510 – Fax
trent@theoec.org
cathy@theoec.org

Attorneys for the OEC

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true copy of the foregoing has been served upon the following parties by electronic mail this 24rd day of July, 2012.

/s/ Trent A. Dougherty
Counsel for Ohio Environmental Council

William Wright
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 E. Broad St., 6th Fl.
Columbus, OH 43215
William.wright@puc.state.oh.us

Amy B. Spiller
Rocco O. D'Ascenzo
Jeanne W. Kingery
Elizabeth H. Watts
Duke Energy Ohio
139 East Fourth Street, 1303 Main
P.O. Box 961
Cincinnati, OH 45201-0960
Amy.Spiller@duke-energy.com
Rocco.dascenzo@duke-energy.com
Elizabeth.Watts@duke-energy.com

Thomas J. O'Brien
Bricker & Eckler, LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215-4291
tobrien@bricker.com

Terry L. Etter
Kyle L. Kern
Assistant Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, OH 43215-3485
etter@occ.state.oh.us
kern@occ.state.oh.us

Mark Yurick
Zachary D. Kravitz
Taft Stettinius & Hollister LLP
65 East State Street, Suite 1000
myurick@taftlaw.com
zkravitz@taftlaw.com

Colleen L. Mooney
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
Findlay, OH 45839-1793
Cmooney2@columbusrr.com

Mark A. Whitt
Andrew J. Campbell
Melissa L. Thompson
Whitt Sturtevant LLP
PNC Plaza, Suite 2020
155 East Broad Street
Columbus, OH 43215
whitt@whitt-sturtevant.com
Campbell@whitt-sturtevant.com
Thompson@whitt-sturtevant.com

Vincent Parisi
Matthew White
Interstate Gas Supply, Inc.
6100 Emerald Parkway
Dublin, OH 43016
vparisi@igsenergy.com
mwhite@igsenergy.com

David F. Boehm
Michael L. Kurtz
Jody M. Kyler

Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510
Cincinnati, OH 45202
dboehm@bkllawfirm.com
mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com
jkyler@bkllawfirm.com

Douglas E. Hart
441 Vine Street, Suite 4192
Cincinnati, OH 45202
dhart@douglasshart.com

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

7/26/2012 11:10:04 AM

in

Case No(s). 12-1683-EL-ATA, 12-1684-EL-AAM

Summary: Motion Motion to intervene and Memorandum in Support of the Ohio Environmental Council electronically filed by Mr. Trent A Dougherty on behalf of Ohio Environmental Council