

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Portfolio Status)	
Report on the Status of the Company's)	Case No. 12-1533-EL-EEC
Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand)	
Reduction Results for the Year Ended)	
December 31, 2011 on Behalf of The)	
Ohio Edison Company.)	

In the Matter of the Portfolio Status)	Case No. 12-1534-EL-EEC
Report on the Status of the Company's)	
Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand)	
Reduction Results for the Year Ended)	
December 31, 2011 on Behalf of The)	
Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company.)	

In the Matter of the Portfolio Status)	Case No. 12-1535-EL-EEC
Report on the Status of the Company's)	
Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand)	
Reduction Results for the Year Ended)	
December 31, 2011 on Behalf of The)	
Toledo Edison Company.)	

**MOTION TO INTERVENE
BY
THE OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL**

The Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel ("OCC") moves to intervene in this case where the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("PUCO" of "Commission") will review the Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand Reduction Portfolio Status Reports ("Reports") of Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and The Toledo Edison Company (jointly, "Companies"), for the year ending December 31, 2011.¹ OCC is filing on behalf of the residential utility customers of the Companies. The reasons the Commission should grant OCC's Motion are further set forth in the attached Memorandum in Support.

¹ See R.C. Chapter 4911, R.C. 4903.221 and Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11.

Respectfully submitted,

BRUCE J. WESTON
CONSUMERS' COUNSEL

/s/ Kyle L. Kern

Kyle L. Kern, Counsel of Record

Melissa R. Yost

Assistant Consumers' Counsel

Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800

Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485

Telephone: Kern - (614) 466-9585

Telephone: Yost - (614) 466-1291

kern@occ.state.oh.us

yost@occ.state.oh.us

**BEFORE
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Portfolio Status)	
Report on the Status of the Company's)	Case No. 12-1533-EL-EEC
Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand)	
Reduction Results for the Year Ended)	
December 31, 2011 on Behalf of The)	
Ohio Edison Company.)	

In the Matter of the Portfolio Status)	Case No. 12-1534-EL-EEC
Report on the Status of the Company's)	
Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand)	
Reduction Results for the Year Ended)	
December 31, 2011 on Behalf of The)	
Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company.)	

In the Matter of the Portfolio Status)	Case No. 12-1535-EL-EEC
Report on the Status of the Company's)	
Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand)	
Reduction Results for the Year Ended)	
December 31, 2011 on Behalf of The)	
Toledo Edison Company.)	

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

In this proceeding, the Companies submitted their Portfolio Status Reports pursuant to Ohio Admin. Code 4901:1-39-05. These Reports address the Companies' compliance with the energy efficiency ("EE") and peak demand reduction ("PDR") benchmarks set forth in R.C. 4928.66, for the period January 1, 2011, through December 31, 2011. OCC has authority under law to represent the interests of all the residential utility customers of the Companies, pursuant to R.C. Chapter 4911.

R.C. 4903.221 provides, in part, that any person "who may be adversely affected" by a PUCO proceeding is entitled to seek intervention in that proceeding. The interests of Ohio's residential customers may be "adversely affected" by this case, especially where

the Companies submitted their EE/PDR Portfolio Status Reports for the Commission's review. Thus, this element of the intervention standard in R.C. 4903.221 is satisfied.

R.C. 4903.221(B) requires the Commission to consider the following criteria in ruling on motions to intervene:

- (1) The nature and extent of the prospective intervenor's interest;
- (2) The legal position advanced by the prospective intervenor and its probable relation to the merits of the case;
- (3) Whether the intervention by the prospective intervenor will unduly prolong or delay the proceeding; and
- (4) Whether the prospective intervenor will significantly contribute to the full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues.

First, the nature and extent of OCC's interest is representing the residential customers of the Companies in this case involving the Commission's review of the Companies' Reports, and the Companies' compliance with the EE/PDR benchmarks set forth in R.C. 4928.66. This interest is different than that of any other party and especially different than that of the utility whose advocacy includes the financial interest of stockholders.

Second, OCC's advocacy for residential customers will include advancing the position that the Companies' Reports should include the most accurate and up to date information as is reasonably possible, and should also establish compliance with the EE/PDR benchmarks set forth in R.C. 4928.66. OCC's position is therefore directly related to the merits of this case that is pending before the PUCO, the authority with regulatory control of public utilities' rates and service quality in Ohio.

Third, OCC's intervention will not unduly prolong or delay the proceedings. OCC, with its longstanding expertise and experience in PUCO proceedings, will duly allow for the efficient processing of the case with consideration of the public interest.

Fourth, OCC's intervention will significantly contribute to the full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues. OCC will obtain and develop information that the PUCO should consider for equitably and lawfully deciding the case in the public interest.

OCC also satisfies the intervention criteria in the Ohio Administrative Code (which are subordinate to the criteria that OCC satisfies in the Ohio Revised Code). To intervene, a party should have a "real and substantial interest" according to Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11(A)(2). As the advocate for residential utility customers, OCC has a very real and substantial interest in this case where the PUCO will be reviewing the Companies' Reports and compliance with the EE/PDR benchmarks.

In addition, OCC meets the criteria of Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11(B)(1)-(4). These criteria mirror the statutory criteria in R.C. 4903.221(B) that OCC already has addressed and that OCC satisfies.

Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11(B)(5) states that the Commission shall consider the "extent to which the person's interest is represented by existing parties." While OCC does not concede the lawfulness of this criterion, OCC satisfies this criterion in that it uniquely has been designated as the state representative of the interests of Ohio's residential utility customers. That interest is different from, and not represented by, any other entity in Ohio.

Moreover, the Supreme Court of Ohio confirmed OCC's right to intervene in PUCO proceedings, in deciding two appeals in which OCC claimed the PUCO erred by denying its interventions. The Court found that the PUCO abused its discretion in denying OCC's interventions and that OCC should have been granted intervention in both proceedings.²

OCC meets the criteria set forth in R.C. 4903.221, Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-11, and the precedent established by the Supreme Court of Ohio for intervention. On behalf of Ohio residential customers, the Commission should grant OCC's Motion to Intervene.

Respectfully submitted,

BRUCE J. WESTON
CONSUMERS' COUNSEL

/s/ Kyle L. Kern

Kyle L. Kern, Counsel of Record
Melissa R. Yost
Assistant Consumers' Counsel

Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485
Telephone: Kern - (614) 466-9585
Telephone: Yost - (614) 466-1291
kern@occ.state.oh.us
yost@occ.state.oh.us

² See *Ohio Consumers' Counsel v. Pub. Util. Comm.*, 111 Ohio St.3d 384, 2006-Ohio-5853, ¶¶13-20 (2006).

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of this *Motion to Intervene* was served on the persons stated below via electronic transmission, this 21st day of June 2012.

/s/ Kyle L. Kern
Kyle L. Kern
Assistant Consumers' Counsel

SERVICE LIST

William Wright
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 E. Broad St., 6th Fl.
Columbus, OH 43215
William.wright@puc.state.oh.us

Kathy J. Kolich
FirstEnergy Service Company
76 South Main Street
Akron, OH 44308
kjkolich@firstenergycorp.com

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

6/21/2012 4:36:36 PM

in

Case No(s). 12-1533-EL-EEC, 12-1534-EL-EEC, 12-1535-EL-EEC

Summary: Motion Motion to Intervene by the Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel electronically filed by Ms. Deb J. Bingham on behalf of Kern, Kyle L.