



April 14, 2012

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
Docketing Division
180 East Broad Street, 13th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3793

RE: Motion for Protective Order and Alternative Energy Resources Report for Calendar Year 2011 in
Case No. 12-1219-EL-ACP

To Whom It May Concern:

Please find enclosed the Motion for Protective Order and the Alternative Energy Resources Report for Calendar Year 2011 for Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC Case No. 12-1219-EL-ACP, with one (1) original and three (3) confidential copies filed under seal. Also included is one (1) redacted public version being filed through the OH DIS system.

If you have any questions, please contact me at (619) 684-8200 or via email at bwhite@noblesolutions.com.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads 'Bryan C. White'.

Bryan White
Regulatory Compliance Analyst

Enclosures

Proprietary and Confidential

COMPETITIVE RETAIL ELECTRIC SERVICE PROVIDER
ALTERNATIVE ENERGY RESOURCES REPORT FOR CALENDAR YEAR 2011

Case No. 12-1219-EL-ACP

Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC (hereinafter "CRES") in accordance with Sections 4928.64 and 4928.65, Revised Code and Commission Rules 4901:1-40-03 and 4901:1-40-05 hereby submits this Annual Alternative Energy Report ("AER") detailing compliance with the Ohio Alternative Energy Portfolio Standards.

I. Determination that an Alternative Energy Resource Report is Required (check one)

- ☒ During calendar year 2011 the CRES states that it conducted retail sales of generation to customers who utilized the generation in a load center located within the state of Ohio.
- ☐ During calendar year 2011 the CRES states that it did not conduct retail sales of generation to customers who utilized the generation in a load center located within the state of Ohio. (If this block is checked proceed to the signature line)

II. Determination of the sales baseline for 2011

- a. During the past three calendar years the CRES made retail sales of generation in the amounts shown below
- 2008 [REDACTED]
- 2009 [REDACTED]
- 2010 [REDACTED]
- b. The average annual sales of the active years listed above (sum of the active years' MWh / no. of active years) [REDACTED] (hereinafter "Baseline Sales").
- c. If conditions exist that merit an adjustment to the Baseline Sales please list the adjusted Baseline Sales on this line N/A and attach as an exhibit to this AER a full explanation of the reason(s) for the adjustment(s).
- d. If the CRES was not active during calendar years 2008, 2009, and 2010 but did make sales during calendar year 2011, please project the amount of retail electric generation sales anticipated for the whole of calendar year 2011 as would have been projected on the first day retail generation sales were made in Ohio.

CRES was active in 2009 and 2010.

Proprietary and Confidential

III. Determination of the number of Solar and Total Renewable Energy Credits (RECs) required and Statement of the Number of RECs Claimed

RENEWABLE ENERGY CREDITS REQUIRED AND OBTAINED FOR 2011

Types	No. of RECs Required (a)	No. of RECs Obtained (b)	Registry (c)	No. of RECs Sited in OH (d)
2011 Solar			GATS	
2010 Solar			GATS	
2009 Solar			GATS	
2011 Non Solar			GATS	
Total				

- a. Column a above lists the unadjusted number of Solar and Total RECs Required for the CRES in 2011. The determinations were calculated by multiplying the Baseline Sales¹ or Adjusted Baseline Sales or the Projected Sales (circle one) by 1 hundredths of one per cent (0.03%) for Solar RECs and ninety-seven hundredths of one percent (0.97%) for Non Solar RECS.

Also included is the 2009 Solar REC requirement postponed by the Commission in the Order in Case 10-428-EL-ACP, and the 2010 Solar REC requirement postponed by the Commission in the Order in Case 11-2384-EL-ACP. Total 2011 RECs, including both Solar and Non-Solar RECs and, excluding 2009 and 2011 Solar REC carryover, are one percent (1.0%) multiplied by Baseline Sales.

- b. The CRES states that it has obtained in accordance with the Commission's Rules the number of Solar and Non Solar RECs listed in column b above for 2011.
Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC has obtained the number of Solar and Non Solar RECs listed in column b above for 2011. Noble Solutions finds that it is short of the compliance quantity necessary for 2011, and it plans to meet the deficit by use of an Alternative Compliance Payment. Additionally, Noble Solutions has obtained sufficient Solar RECs for 2009 and 2010.

- c. Approved registry being used by the CRES. This could be GATS, M-RETS, or if the CRES has RECs with both registries GATS and M-RETS.
Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC used the PJM GATS Registry. Please see Exhibit A.

- d. The CRES states that of the RECs it has obtained for 2011 the number listed in column d represents the RECs with generation facilities sited within the state of Ohio.

¹Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC applied to, and received from, the Commission a postponement until the 2011 Compliance Year to fulfill the 2009 and 2010 in-state Solar RECs obligation. As such, for 2009 and for 2010 were retired in addition to the required amount for 2011 compliance.

Proprietary and Confidential

Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC states that the REC's in Column (d) in the above table represent the renewable REC's with generation facilities sited in the state of Ohio.

- e. CRES states that it has (circle one): a) received a *force majeure* determination for Solar REC's; b) sought but has yet to receive a ruling on a *force majeure* determination for Solar REC's; or c) did not seek or sought and did not receive a *force majeure* determination for Solar REC's.

IV. Compliance (check one)

- ☐ CRES states that it has obtained the required number of Solar REC's and Total REC's without adjustments permitted pursuant to Rule 4901:1-40-05(A)(3).
- ☐ CRES states that it has obtained the required number of Solar REC's and Total REC's after adjustments permitted pursuant to Rule 4901:1-40-05(A)(3). The type of adjustment, reason for the adjustment and merit for making the requested adjustment of the proposed adjustments are detailed in Exhibit A attached to this Report.
- ☒ CRES states that it is not in compliance with number of Solar REC's or Total REC's required for 2011. However, per rule 4901:1-40-08(A), CRES plans to make an alternative compliance payment based on the shortfall.

V. Ten Year Forecast

a. Ten Year Forecast of Solar and Non-Solar REC's

In accordance with Rule 4901:1-40-03(C) the CRES hereby provides a projection for the next 10 years for REC's and Solar REC's.

<u>Year</u>	<u>Est. Sales</u>	<u>Est. Solar</u>	<u>Est. Non-Solar</u>	<u>Est. Total REC's</u>
2012	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
2013	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
2014	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
2015	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
2016	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
2017	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
2018	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
2019	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
2020	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]
2021	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]

b. Supply Portfolio projection

Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC states that it intends to purchase all required REC's, both Solar REC's and Non-Solar REC's from suppliers who have received a renewable energy facility certificate from the Public Utilities

Proprietary and Confidential

Commission, have joined an approved REC registry and will transfer RECs from the generator's account to the CRES account.

c. **Methodology used to evaluate compliance**

Because the generation market is one of great volatility and because customers are free to contract with any CRES supplier, governmental aggregator or utilize a utility standard service offer, Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC has projected out sales to the end of the current Electric Security Plan period for each of the utility service areas in which it conducts sales based on its most current business plan available at the time of submission of this Report. Since the price to compare will change at the end of the Electric Security Plan, projecting the ability to maintain sales, let alone increase sales, is problematic at best. Thus, the CRES has assumed that load will remain constant, and the increase in total RECs comes from the increase in requirement percentages.

d. **Comments on any perceived impediment(s) to achieving compliance with the Solar and Non Solar REC requirements, as well as any discussion addressing such impediments.**

Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC has no comments at this time.

I, Greg Bass, am the duly authorized representative of Noble Americas Energy Solutions LLC. To the best of my knowledge all the information contained in the foregoing report including any exhibits and attachments are true, accurate and complete.


Signature

Exhibit A

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on

4/16/2012 1:32:55 PM

in

Case No(s). 12-1219-EL-ACP

Summary: Application In the matter of the alternative energy resource report for calendar year 2011 and motion for protective order for Noble Americas Energy solutions LLC. electronically filed by Mr. Bryan White on behalf of Bass, Greg Mr.