## SNR DENTON

 SNR Denton US LLP
 Emma F. Hand

 1301 K Street, NW
 Partner

 Suite 600, East Tower
 emma.hand@snrder

 Washington, DC 20005-3364 USA
 D +1 202 408 7094

Emma F. Hand Partner emma.hand@snrdenton.com D +1 202 408 7094 T +1 202 408 6400 F +1 202 408 6399 snrdenton.com

April 9, 2012

#### **BY FACSIMILE & FEDERAL EXPRESS**

Public Utilities Commission of Ohio Docketing Division 180 East Broad Street Columbus, Ohio 43215-3793 Fax: (614).466.0313 Case No. 11-346-EL-SSO Case No. 11-348-EL-SSO Case No. 11-349-EL-AAM Case No. 11-350-EL-AAM

RECEIVED-DOCKETING DIV 2012 APR 10 AM 9: 49

50

Re: In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to Section 4928.143, Revised Code, in the Form of an Electric Security Plan, Case Nos. 11-346-EL-SSO, 11-348-EL-SSO; and consolidated cases.

Dear Sir or Madam:

Enclosed please find an original and twenty (20) copies of the *Memorandum Contra of Ormet Primary Aluminum Corporation to Ohio Power Company's Motion for Amendment to the Procedural Schedule and Request for Expedited Treatment.* This document was originally filed by fax on April 9, 2012.

Two additional copies of each document are enclosed to be date-stamped and returned to me in the enclosed, self-addressed Federal Express envelope.

Thank you for your assistance in this matter. If you have any questions please contact me at the telephone number above.

Sincerely,

F. Aarl / Thom

Emma F. Hand Partner

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business. Technician <u>P</u> Date Processed <u>ADD 1 0 2012</u>

## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to Section 4928.143. Revised Code, in the Form of an Electric Security Plan.	) ) ) ) )	Case No. 11-346-EL-SSO Case No. 11-348-EL-SSO
In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company for Approval of Certain Accounting	) ) )	Case No. 11-349-EL-AAM Case No. 11-350-EL-AAM
Authority.	Ś	

### MEMORANDUM CONTRA OF ORMET PRIMARY ALUMINUM CORPORATION TO OHIO POWER COMPANY'S MOTION FOR AMENDMENT TO THE PROCEDURAL SCHEDULE AND REQUEST FOR EXPEDITED TREATMENT

The Commission should deny Ohio Power Company's ("AEP Ohio's")<sup>1</sup> motion to amend the procedural schedule to the extent that it accelerates the already aggressive deadline for the intervenors to submit testimony regarding AEP Ohio's over 620 page ESP application. AEP Ohio proposes to, among other changes, advance the current May 4, 2012 deadline for submission of intervenor testimony to May 1, 2012.<sup>2</sup> AEP Ohio argues that doing so would

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> AEP Ohio is a subsidiary of American Electric Power ("AEP"), a company that is publicly traded on the New York Stock Exchange.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> As an initial matter, AEP Ohio suggests that pursuant to Ohio Administrative Code section 4901-1-12(C), the Commission may rule on its motion without considering memoranda contra. That rule allows the Commission to issue an expedited ruling without waiting for memoranda contra where: a) the movant merely requests an extension of time of less than five days; or b) where the movant seeks something more than a mere less-than-five-day extension, asks the other parties' permission, and they do not object. AEP Ohio's motion does not fit within this rule. First, AEP Ohio's motion does not merely request an extension of time of five days or less;

further AEP Ohio's unique goal of reaching a Commission decision as close to June 1, 2012 as possible. The Commission should not grant AEP Ohio's motion in this respect for two reasons. First, AEP Ohio has failed to present the Commission with any credible reason to rush the already accelerated process. Contrary to its two claims allegedly justifying modification to the schedule, AEP Ohio is in a strong fiscal position, and the intervenors have had very little time to analyze the application. Second, the intervenors are already faced with significant time constraints to prepare their testimony and should not be further limited. Addressing each of these issues in turn, Ormet respectfully suggests that the Commission should deny AEP Ohio's motion to the extent it seeks to shorten the time intervenors have to prepare their testimony.

AEP Ohio first seeks to justify accelerating the Commission's procedural schedule based on the false pretense of its financial hardship and need for new rates to be imposed by its July billing cycle.<sup>3</sup> In reality, no such hardship exists as AEP Ohio has enjoyed net income of over \$1 billion over the last two calendar years.<sup>4</sup> It also earned a Return on Equity ("ROE") of 12.06 percent in 2011,<sup>5</sup> a rate higher than any ROE approved for an electric utility in the country in

rather, it seeks to shorten the intervenors' time to prepare testimony. Second, AEP Ohio "fails to certify that no party has any objection, [so] any party may file a memorandum contra." O.A.C. § 4901-1-12(C). Third, Ormet never said it would not object to AEP Ohio's motion; in fact, it does. Fourth, the rule says only that the Commission "may" rule without receiving memoranda contra if the rule's requirements are satisfied, not that the Commission need not consider memoranda contra filed before the Commission rules.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> AEP Ohio Mem. in Support of Mot. for Amendment to the Procedural Schedule at pp. 4-5 (Apr. 4, 2012).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> See American Electric Power's Annual 10-K Report at p. 189 (Feb. 28, 2012), available at http://www.aep.com/investors/financialfilings and reports/edgar/filings.aspx?section=Ohio PowerFilings.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Direct Testimony of William A. Allen in Support of AEP Ohio's Modified Electric Security Plan at 14 (Mar. 30, 2012).

2011.<sup>6</sup> In fact, AEP's CEO recently addressed the impact of AEP Ohio having to continue its 2011 rates and effectively told AEP's shareholders that the company *does not* have a financial need to accelerate the schedule in this case. He said to a bank analyst, specifically with regard to the financial impact of the possibility that AEP Ohio would be forced to continue to operate under 2011 rates: "I don't think that would be a big issue at all if that's the way it ends up . . . we'll just continue on with where we are and that's not a bad news story for us at all."<sup>7</sup> AEP is now collecting rates that are even higher than it did in 2011. In light of AEP Ohio's industry-leading ROE, its billion dollar net income over two years, and the AEP CEO's representations that continuing the 2011 rates would not harm AEP, AEP Ohio's suggested need to implement changes by the July billing cycle strain credulity.

AEP Ohio also inaccurately claims that the intervenors have had months to prepare their testimony based on "the previous phases of this proceeding."<sup>8</sup> That is misleading. AEP Ohio itself admits that its newly proposed ESP presents an entirely different application since it expressly intends for the application to be considered as a "balanced package of terms."<sup>9</sup> In fact, AEP Ohio dedicates many pages of its application simply to summarize how the other sections of the application are different from its previous filings. For example, the stated purpose of Mr. Dias' testimony is to explain the "major differences between the original ESP II (filed January

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> See Exhibit A attached, *available at* http://www.fortnightly.com/exclusive.cfm?o\_id=70 by selecting "electric" as the utility type with a date range of all months in 2011 and sorting by "ROE Rate Newly Authorized."

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> AEP-Q2 2011 American Electric Power Earnings Conference Call, July 29, 2011, transcript available from SeekingAlpha, *available at* http://seekingalpha.com/article/283262-american-electric-power-s-ceo-discusses-q2-2011-results-earnings-call-transcript?part=qanda (last accessed Sept. 27, 2011).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> AEP Ohio Mem. in Support of Mot. for Amendment to the Procedural Schedule at 5 (Apr. 4, 2012).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Direct Testimony of Robert P. Powers in Support of AEP Ohio's Modified Electric Security Plan at 5:2-4 (Mar. 30, 2012).

2011)" and the current, "modified ESP II plan."<sup>10</sup> AEP Ohio stresses through Mr. Dias' testimony that this application is different because, among other things, it eliminates the Market Transition Rider and the Load Factor Rider while presenting entirely new riders.<sup>11</sup> That the application is a new package with "major" changes requires reviewing it anew to understand how all the pieces fit together. Furthermore, the Commission expressly allowed for new intervenors to join the case when it set the procedural schedule at issue.<sup>12</sup> Since then, several new parties have intervened, and they have not had months to prepare their testimony.<sup>13</sup> For AEP Ohio to now argue that the intervenors have had months to prepare testimony relevant to the current, "modified ESP II plan" is not accurate.

That AEP Ohio needed many pages simply to highlight the differences between this over 620 page application and its previous application highlights the extraordinary complexity of reaching just and reasonable rates in this case. It equally highlights the need for a full and complete record before the Commission. Accordingly, the Commission should reject AEP Ohio's invitation to rush to judgment.

AEP Ohio fails to present any reason to grant its motion other than its claim of financial need, which contradicts many publicly available facts, and its false claim about how long the intervenors have had to consider AEP Ohio's application. Conversely, Ormet and the other intervenors present good reasons that they need all the time that was originally allotted to them to consider the new application before submitting testimony. AEP Ohio's application contains myriad assumptions and unexplained figures that are relied upon by AEP Ohio to justify its

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Direct Testimony of Selwyn J. Dias in Support of AEP Ohio's Modified Electric Security Plan at 3:9-14 (Mar. 30, 2012).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Id. at 9:1-2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Entry Ordering Procedural Schedule at ¶8(b) (April 2, 2012).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> See, e.g., Mot. to Intervene and Mem. in Supp. of Ohio Restaurant Ass'n (April 4, 2012); Mot. to Intervene and Mem. in Supp. of the Ohio Construction Materials Coalition (April 3, 2012).

claims. To properly analyze AEP Ohio's application requires understanding AEP Ohio's assertions and the reasonableness of the assumptions on which they are based. Doing so requires carefully deconstructing the application and analyzing it in its entirety. Conducting such a review takes time, but benefits every party involved, including AEP Ohio, and especially the Commission and the ratepayers of Ohio.

The rush to judgment that AEP Ohio requests would deprive the Commission of evidence and clarity that it needs to engage in meaningful review of AEP Ohio's application for its justness and reasonableness. Accordingly, for all the foregoing reasons, the Commission should consider Ormet's Memorandum Contra and deny AEP Ohio's motion to the extent it seeks to shorten the time allotted for the intervenors' preparation of testimony.

Respectfully submitted,

un 2. Slad

Emma F. Hand (PHV-1353-2012) Douglas G. Bonner (PHV-1363-2012) SNR Denton US LLP 1301 K Street, NW Suite 600, East Tower Washington, DC 20005 Tel: 202-408-6400 Fax: 202-408-6399 emma.hand@snrdenton.com douglas.bonner@snrdenton.com

Attorneys for Ormet Primary Aluminum Corporation

April 9, 2012

# **EXHIBIT A**

#### UTILITIES ROE SURVEY REPORT

State	Сопрану	Unity Type	Order Date	Previously Authorized ROE Rale	Newly Authorized ROE Rale	ROE Difference
	Lockher Fower Co	Exanc	8/15/2011	12	12	0.00
	Southern Catilonia Edison Co.	Electric	414/2011	11,6	115	-0 10
-	Pacific Gas & Electric Co.	Electric:	5/5/2011	11.35	11.35	0.00
	Municipal Light & Power	Electric	8/22/2011		10.53	
_	Montarra-Dakota Utäities Co.	Flector	6/8/2011	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	10.75	
	Otter Tait Power Co.	Electric	4/25/2011	10.43	10.74	0.31
	Continionwealth Edison Co.	Electric	5/24/2011	10.3	105	0.20
-	Southern Indiana Gas & Electric dba Vectren Delivery of Indiana	Electric	4/27/2011	10.3	10.4	0.00
_						
	Interstate Power & Light Co.	Electric	8/12/2011 1/12/2011	10.39	10.35	-0.04
	Madison Gas & Electric Co.	Electric		10.4	103	-0.10
	Northern States Power Co.	Electric	7/12/2011		103	
	Wesconsin Public Service Corp.	Electric	1/13/2011	10.9	10.3	-0.60
_	NorthWestern Energy	Electric	6/26/2011	10.25	10 25	0.00
_	Union Electric Co. dba Ameren Missouri	Electric	7/13/2011	10 1	10.2	0.10
_	Public Service Co. of Okiahoma	Electric	1/5/2011	10	10,15	6.15
	Texas New Mexico Power Co	Elecinc	1/27/2011	10.25	10 125	-0 13
	CenterParti Energy	Electric	5/12/2011		10	
_	Appalachian Power Co. & Wheeling Power Co. dba American Electric Power	Electric	3/30/2011	10.5	16	-0.50
_	Detmarva Power & Light Co.	Electric	8/9/2011	10	10	0.00
	Public Service Co. of New Mexico	Electric	7/28/2011		10	
	Interstate Power & Light Co	Electric	1/10/2011	10.5	10	-0.50
	KCP&L Greater Missouri Operations Co	Electric	5/4/2011		10	. <u></u>
	Kansas City Power & Light Co.	Electric	4/12/2011		10	
	Southwestern Public Service Co.	Electric	3/25/2011	10.25	10	-0.25
	Oklahoma Gas \$ Electric Co.	Electric	6/17/2011	10.25	9.95	-0.30
	PacifiCorp dba Rocky Mountain Power	Electric	2/23/2011	10.25	9.9	-0.35
	Ballimore Gas & Electric Co.	Electric	3/9/2011		9.65	
_	PacifiCorp dea Pacific Power & Light Co	Electric	3/25/2011	10,2	6.6	-0,40
Ţ	Unian Energy Systems	Electric	4/26/2011	9,67	9.67	0.00
Ņ	Western Massachusetts Electric Co	Electric	1/31/2011	10	96 .	-0.40
7	Central Vermont Public Service Co	Electric	4/26/2013	9 59	9.45	-0 14
K	Dolario Power Generation Inc	Electric	3/10/2011	\$.57	9.43	0.85
Ţ	Viagara Mohawk Power Corp	Electric	1/24/2011		9.3	
	Drange & Rockland Utifities, Inc.	Electric	6/17/2011	94	9.2	-0 20
F	Hohburg Gas & Electric Co.	Electric	8/1/2011	10	92	-0,80
1	Impire District Electric Co.	Electric	6/1/2011	108		
- 10	Deimarva Power & Light Co.	Electric	7/8/2011	10		
6	Otter Tail Power Co.	Electric	3/14/2011			
E	East Kentucky Power Co-op	Electric	1/14/2011			
N	Ild-Kansas Electric Co	Electric	E/30/2011			
v	Velisboro Electric Co.	Electric	1/13/2011			
6	Nizens Electra Co.	Electric	1/13/2011			
			7/26/2011	10:25		
				10.4	<u> </u>	

Copyright Public Utilities Reports Inc., Vienna, Va., 2008. All Rights Reserved. U.S. Tederal law prohibits unauthorized publication, excepting or distribution of this data. Contact Public Utilities Fortnightly (www.fort.glov.com) to request authorization.

http://databases.pur.com/reports/roe/report.aspx?UtilityType=Electric&StartDate=1/1/2011... 4/2/2012

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of the Memorandum Contra of Ormet Primary Aluminum Corporation to Ohio Power Company's Motion for Amendment to the Procedural Schedule and Request for Expedited Treatment was served by U.S. Mail and email upon counsel identified below for all parties of record this 9th day of April, 2012.

En 2. red

Emma F. Hand (PHV-1353-2012)

### SERVICE LIST

Steven T. Nourse Matthew J. Satterwhite American Electric Power Corp. 1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215 stnourse@aep.com mjsatterwhite@aep.com

Daniel R. Conway Porter Wright Morris & Arthur 41 South High Street Columbus, Ohio 43215 dconway@porterwright.com Dorothy K. Corbett Duke Energy Retail Sales 139 East Fourth Street 1303-Main Cincinnati, Ohio 45202 Dorothy.Corbett@duke-energy.com

David F. Boehm Kurt Boehm Michael L. Kurtz Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry 36 East Seventh Street. Suite 1510 Cincinnati, Ohio 45202 dboehm@bkllawfirm.com mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com Samuel C. Randazzo Joseph E. Oliker Frank P. Darr Vicki L. Leach-Payne Joseph M. Clark McNees Wallace & Nurick 21 East State Street, 17th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215 sam@mwncmh.com joliker@mwncmh.com fdarr@mwncmh.com

Richard L. Sites Ohio Hospital Association 155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215-3620 ricks@ohanet.org

Colleen L. Mooney Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy 231 West Lima Street Findlay, Ohio 45840 cmooney2@columbus.rr.com

John W. Bentine Mark S. Yurick Zachary D. Kravitz Matthew S. White Chester Willcox & Saxbe, LLP 65 East State Street, Suite 1000 Columbus, Ohio 43215 jbentine@cwslaw.com myurick@cwslaw.com zkravitz@cwslaw.com Terry L. Etter Maureen R. Grady Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel 10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800 Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485 etter@occ.state.oh.us grady@occ.state.oh.us

Thomas J. O'Brien Teresa Orahood Bricker & Eckler 100 South Third Street Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291 tobrien@bricker.com torahood@bricker.com

Jay E. Jadwin American Electric Power Service Corporation 1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215 jejadwin@aep.com

Michael R. Smalz Ohio Poverty Law Center 555 Buttles Avenue Columbus, Ohio 43215 msmalz@ohiopovertylaw.org jmaskovyak@ohiopovertylaw.org Terrence O'Donnell Christopher Montgomery Bricker & Eckler LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291 todonnell@bricker.com cmontgomcry@bricker.com Jesse A. Rodriguez Exelon Generation Company, LLC 300 Exelon Way Kennett Square, Pennsylvania 19348 jesse.rodriguez@exeloncorp.com

Glen Thomas 1060 First Avenue, Ste. 400 King of Prussia, Pennsylvania 19406 gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

Henry W. Eckhart 2100 Chambers Road, Suite 106 Columbus, Ohio 43212 henryeckhart@aol.com

Christopher L. Miller Gregory H. Dunn Asim Z. Haque Stephen J. Smith C. Todd Jones Schottenstein Zox & Dunn Co., LPA 250 West Street Columbus, Ohio 43215 cmiller@szd.com gdunn@szd.com ahaque@szd.com Lisa G. McAlister Bricker & Eckler LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291 Imcalister@bricker.com mwarnock@bricker.com

William L. Massey Covington & Burling, LLP 1201 Pennsylvania Ave., NW Washington, DC 20004 wmassey@cov.com

Laura Chappelle 4218 Jacob Meadows Okemos, Michigan 48864 laurac@chappelleconsulting.net

Pamela A. Fox Law Director The City of Hilliard, Ohio pfox@hilliardohio.gov

United Way of Jefferson County 501 Washington Street P.O. Box 1463 Steubenville, OH 43952 Sandy I-ru Grace Marianne M. Alvarez Exelon Business Services Company 101 Constitution Avenue N.W., Suite 400 East Washington, DC 20001 sandy.grace@exeloncorp.com

Kenneth P. Kreider David A. Meyer Keating Muething & Klekamp PLL One East Fourth Street, Suite 1400 Cincinnati, Ohio 45202 kpkreider@kmklaw.com

Holly Rachel Smith Holly Rachel Smith, PLLC Hitt Business Center 3803 Rectortown Road Marshall, Virginia 20115 holly@raysmithlaw.com

John H. Jones Vern Margard Public Utilities Section Ohio Attorney General Mike DeWine 180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215 john.jones@puc.state.oh.us werner.margard@puc.state.oh.us Gary A. Jeffries Dominion Resources Services, Inc. 501 Martindale Street, Suite 400 Pittsburgh, PA 15212-5817 gary.a.jeffries@dom.com

Steve W. Chriss Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. 2001 SE 10th Street Bentonville, Arkansas 72716 stephen.chriss@wal-mart.com

Barth E. Royer Bell & Royer Co., LPA 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, Ohio 43215-3927 barthroyer@aol.com

Greg Poulos EnerNOC, Inc. 101 Federal St. Boston, Massachusetts 02110 gpoulos@enernoc.com

Carolyn S. Flahive Terrance A. Mebane Thompson Hine LLP 41 S. High Street, Suite 1700 Columbus, Ohio 43215 Carolyn.Flahive@ThompsonHine.com Terrance.Mebane@ThompsonHine.com Leo Antons 1237 Cisler Dr. Marietta, OH 45750 leoantons@suddenlink.net E. Camille Yancey Nolan Moser Trent A. Dougherty Ohio Environmental Council 1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201 Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449 camille@theoec.org nolan@theoec.org trent@theoec.org

Mark A. Hayden FirstEnergy Service Company 76 South Main Street Akron, OH 44308 haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

David A. Kutik Jones Day 901 Lakeside Avenue Cleveland, OH 44114 dakutik@jonesday.com

Christopher J. Allwein 1373 Grandview Ave. Suite 212 Columbus, OH 43212 wein@williamsandmoser.com Tara C. Santarelli Environmental Law & Policy Center 1207 Grandview Ave., Suite 201 Columbus, Ohio 43212 tsantarelli@elpc.org

James F. Lang Laura C. McBride N. Trevor Alexander Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP 1400 KeyBank Center 800 Superior Ave. Cleveland, OH 44114 jlang@calfee.com Imcbride@calfee.com talexander@calfee.com

Allison E. Haedt Grant W. Garber Jones Day P.O. Box 165017 325 John H. McConnell Boulevard Suite 600 Columbus, Ohio 43216-5017

J. Kennedy And Associates 570 Colonial Park Drive Suite 305 Roswell, GA 30075 Jennifer Duffer Armstrong & Okey, Inc. 222 East Town Street 2nd Floor Columbus, OH 43215 jduffer@ameritech.net

Lija K. Kaieps-Clark M. Howard Petricoff Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease 52 E. Gay St. PO Box 1008 Columbus, OH 43216 Ikalepsclark@vorys.com mhpetricoff@vssp.com Shannon Fisk 2 North Riverside Plaza Suite 2250 Chicago, IL 60606 sfisk@nrdc.org

Canton Chamber Of Commerce 229 Wells Ave N.W. Canton, OH 44703-1044

Bill Dingus Lawrence Economic Development Corporation P.O. Box 488 South Point, OH 45680-0488

Amy Spiller Duke Energy Ohio 139 E. Fourth Street, 1303-Main P.O. Box 961 Cincinnati, OH 45201-0960 Amy.Spiller@Duke-Energy.com

Constellation NewEnergy Inc Cynthia Fonner Brady 550 W Washington Street Suite 300 Chicago, IL 60661 Cynthia.Brady@constellation.com

Denis George Kroger Company 1014 Vine Street-G07 Cincinnati, OH 45202-1100 FirstEnergy Solutions Corp Louis M. D'Alessandris 341 White Pond Drive Akron, OH 44320 Idalessandris@firstenergy.com

Ohio Partners For Affordable Energy David C. Rinebolt 231 West Lima St. P.O. Box 1793 Findlay, OH 45839-1793 drinelbolt@aol.com Steve Howard 52 East Gay St. P.O. Box 1008 Columbus, OH 43215 smhoward@.vorys.com

AEP Retail Energy Partners LLC Anne M. Vogel 1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor Columbus, OH 43215 amvogel@aep.com

Shawnee State University 940 Second Street Portsmouth, OH 45662

Mark A. Whitt Carpenter, Lipps & Leleand LLP 280 Plaza, Suite 1300 280 North High Street Columbus OH 43215

Jeffrey Small Jody M. Kyler Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel 10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800 Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485 small@occ.state.oh.us kyler@occ.state.oh.us

Jacqueline Lake Roberts EnerNOC, Inc. 13212 Haves Corner Road SW Pataskala OH 43062

Tracy Bradford City of Hilliard 3800 Municipal Way Hilliard OH 43026 The Sierra Club 50 West Broad Street #2117 Columbus, OH 43215

Meigs County Commissioners Michael Davenport, President 100 East Second Street Pomeroy, OH 45769

Tuscarawas County 330 University Drive NE New Philadelphia, OH 44663

Paul F. Wight Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom LLP 1440 New York Avenue, N.W. Washington, DC 20005

Deb J. Bingaham Patti Mallarnee Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel 10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800 Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485

Philip B. Sineneng
Thompson Hine LLP
41 S. High Street, Suite 1700
Columbus, Ohio 43215
Philip.Sineneng@ThompsonHine.com

Vincent Parisi Scott White Interstate Gas Supply Inc. 6100 Emerald Parkway Dublin OH 43016 Tiffany Chetock Madison Township Trustees 13174 St. Rt. 45 Lisbon OH 44432

Ohio Power Company Legal Department 1 Riverside Plaza Columbus OH 43215

Natural Resources Defense Council 50 W Broad Street, Suite 2117 Columbus, OH 453215

Teresa Ringenbach Direct Energy Business LLC Manager Government & Regulatory Affairs 9605 El Camino Plain City OH 43064

Marietta City Council Paul Bertram III 308 Putnam Street Marietta OH 45750

Columbus Southern Power Company Steven T. Nourse 1 Riverside Plaza Columbus OH 43215 Roger R. Geiger National Federation of Independent Business- Ohio 10 West Broad Street,Suite 2450 Columbus OH 43215

Van Wert County Commissioners 120 E. Main Street Van Wert OH 45891-1704

Chad A. Endsley Ohio Farm Bureau Federation 280 N. High Street Columbus OH 43218-2383 Ohio Construction Materials Coalition Attn: Brian Barger 4052 Holland-Sylvania Road Toledo, OH 43623 Ph: (419) 885-3000 Fx: (419) 885-1120 bpbarger@bcslawyers.com

Brakey Energy Matt Brakey P.O. Box 202720 Cleveland OH 44120-8128

Ohio Restaurant Association Diem N. Kaelber Robert Walter 10 West Broad Street, Suite 1300 Columbus, Ohio 43215 (614) 461-5600 (614) 461-5630 (fax) kaelber@buckleyking.com walter@buckleyking.com

25501236\V-2