

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Commission Review of the Capacity Charges of Ohio Power and Columbus Southern Power Company. Case No. 10-2929-EI Ohio Power Oh	L-UNC		
*			
DIRECT TESTIMONY	٧٠.	2012	NEC C
OF	סר	2 APR	EIVEC
MARK FRYE, PRESIDENT OF PALMER ENERGY	UCO	-4 PM 5: 0:	RECEIVED-POCKETING BI

ON BEHALF OF
BUCKEYE ASSOCIATION OF SCHOOL ADMINISTRATORS
(BASA)

OHIO ASSOCIATION OF SCHOOL BUSINESS OFFICIALS (OASBO)

OHIO SCHOOL BOARD ASSOCIATION (OSBA)

OHIO SCHOOLS COUNCIL (OSC)

April 4, 2012

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business.

Technician Date Processed APR 0 5 2012

1		DIRECT TESTIMONY OF MARK FRYE
2 3	Q.	Please state your name and business address.
4	A.	My name is Mark Frye. My business address is 241 N. Superior Street, Toledo, Ohio
5		43604.
6		
7	Q.	What is your occupation?
8	A.	I am an energy consultant and the President of Palmer Energy Company in Toledo,
9		Ohio.
10		
11	Q.	Please describe your educational background and work experience.
12	A.	I have worked in the energy field for 26 years and for clients in 20 states. I earned a
13		Bachelors of Science degree in Energy Technology from Pennsylvania State University's
14		Capitol College. I currently consult on energy procurement and utilization matters for
15		a number of industrial, commercial, educational, institutional and governmental clients.
16		
17	Q.	On whose behalf are you testifying?
18	A.	I am testifying on behalf of the following school organizations: Buckeye Association of
19		School Administrators ("BASA"), Ohio Association of School Business Officials
20		("OASBO"), Ohio School Boards Association ("OSBA") and Ohio Schools Council
21		("OSC"). The four organizations are collectively referred to as the "Schools" and are
22		intervenors in this case.

The Schools are non-profit groups of public school administrators who seek to share best practices and information concerning the operation of educational institutions. The Schools' members include all of Ohio's 612 public school districts, as well as 55 educational service centers and 49 career technical centers. Among their services, the Schools offer their members group purchasing programs for a host of goods and services, including an electricity purchasing program, which operates throughout the state, including Ohio Power Company's ("AEP-Ohio")¹ service territory.

BASA, OASBO and OSBA initiated an electricity purchasing program commonly referred to as "SchoolPool" that has had over 300 Ohio public school districts as participants at one point of time or another. Similarly, OSC has operated an electricity purchasing program since 1998 as a consortium of 161 school districts, educational service centers, joint vocational districts and boards of developmental disabilities in 28 northern Ohio counties.

The four organizations have combined their efforts to offer "Power4Schools" electricity purchasing programs to various school districts throughout Ohio, serving nearly 600,000 school children. The Power4Schools program is designed to reduce the Schools' cost of electricity. Electricity is purchased and delivery arranged through a third party

¹ Ohio Power Company and Columbus Southern Power Company merged effective December 31, 2011, with Ohio Power Company as the surviving entity, which will be referred to as AEP-Ohio in my testimony.

1 competitive retail electric supplier ("CRES") under a master contract and the savings 2 are passed through to school district participants. To date, the Schools' electricity 3 purchasing programs have saved participating schools an estimated \$20 million dollars 4 since initiating third party power supplies. 5 6 Have you ever testified before the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio? Q. 7 A. Yes. I have previously submitted direct testimony in several cases before the Public 8 Utilities Commission of Ohio ("Commission" or "PUCO"), including FirstEnergy's 9 Electric Security Plan ("ESP") Application [Case No. 08-935-EL-SSO], FirstEnergy's Rate 10 Stabilization Plan ("RSP") Application [Case No.03-2144-EL-ATA], American Electric 11 Power's ESP Application [Case No. 08-917-EL-SSO], American Electric Power's IGCC 12 Application [Case No.05-376-EL-ATA], Dayton Power and Light's ESP Application 13 [Case No. 08-1094-EL-SSO] and FirstEnergy's Second ESP Application [Case No. 09-14 906-EL-SSO]. 15 16 Q. What is the purpose of your testimony in this case? 17 A. My testimony addresses certain aspects of AEP-Ohio's proposal to change the pricing 18 mechanism for recovery of capacity charges from CRES, and how this change will 19 negatively impact Ohio's public schools. 20

customers?

21

22

Q.

What is your understanding of how AEP-Ohio provides capacity for its retail

A. AEP-Ohio is a member of the PJM Interconnection, LLC ("PJM") and provides capacity to its retail customers via the PJM Reliability Assurance Agreement ("RAA") using the Fixed Resource Requirement ("FRR") alternative.

4

- Q. What is the capacity pricing mechanism that a CRES traditionally has paid AEP-Ohio
 for a switching customer until December 31, 2011?
- 7 It is my understanding that when a customer switched in either Columbus Southern's A. 8 or Ohio Power's distribution service territory the CRES paid AEP-Ohio the applicable 9 Reliability Pricing Model ("RPM") price for capacity. As part of a stipulation approved 10 by the PUCO in this, and related, proceedings on December 14, 2011, the PUCO 11 approved a two-tiered capacity charge effective December 31, 2011. The first tier during 12 2012 consisted of the traditional RPM price and was available to the first 21% of each 13 customer class switching. The second tier was a negotiated charge of \$255 per MW-day 14 made applicable to remaining switching customers. The PUCO subsequently reversed 15 its order and rejected the stipulation on February 23, 2012. In a March 7, 2012 entry, the 16 PUCO approved the same two-tiered capacity charge on an interim basis, until May 31, 17 2012, at which time the charge would revert to the traditional RPM charge for all 18 capacity, absent other PUCO action.

19

Q. What is the current RPM price for capacity and the designated June 1, 2012 RPM price that will be effective when the PUCO's interim pricing expires?

1	A.	According to the testimony of AEP-Ohio witness Pearce (Exhibit KDP-7), the current
2		Billed Capacity Rate is \$145.79 per MW-day, and on June 1, 2012, will drop to \$20.01 per
3		MW-day.
4		
5	Q.	Has AEP Ohio sought a change in that pricing mechanism?
6	A.	Yes.
7		
8	Q.	What capacity pricing mechanism and rate does AEP-Ohio propose in this
9		proceeding?
10	A.	AEP-Ohio proposes a rate of \$355.72 per MW-day for all capacity. AEP-Ohio proposes
11		to switch from the RPM pricing mechanism to a cost-based formulaic approach, which
12		AEP-Ohio claims is designed to recover the costs of its capacity assets.
13		
14	Q.	Have you reviewed AEP-Ohio's prefiled direct testimony in this proceeding?
15	A.	Yes.
16		
17	Q.	Based on your review of that testimony and your experience as an energy consultant,
18		do you have an opinion as to why AEP Ohio sought a change from the RPM pricing
19		mechanism?
20	A.	For many years AEP-Ohio's avoidable or bypassable prices were low enough that CRES
21		could not sell power to the vast majority of consumers at prices below those levels. As

power prices started to drop CRES saw the opportunity to sell at pricing below AEP-Ohio's current and anticipated future pricing.

This can be borne out by examining the PUCO's Market Monitoring Reports, available at http://www.puco.ohio.gov/puco/index.cfm/industry-information/statistical-reports/electric-customer-choice-switch-rates/ (see attached Exhibit MF-1). When I testified in September 2008 in AEP-Ohio's prior ESP case [PUCO Case No. 08-917-EL-SSO] only 408 meters had agreed to purchase electricity from a CRES for the quarter ending June 30, 2008. By December 31, 2010, shopping has risen only slightly as Columbus Southern had 3,616 customers purchasing from a CRES and Ohio Power had 91 for a total of just 3,707 customers shopping out of 1.42 million. During this period of minimal shopping AEP-Ohio was paid at the RPM pricing for capacity from the CRES at various rates. According to AEP-Ohio witness Pearson's Exhibit KDP-7 the Billed RPM Capacity Rate over the past few years were as follows:

4.0	PJM PY	Billed RPM Capacity Rate
16	2007/2008	\$46.73 per MW-day
17	2007/2000	\$10.75 pcf 11114-day
18	2008/2009	\$129.71 per MW-day
10	2009/2010	\$126.33 per MW-day
19	,	*
20	2010/2011	\$220.96 per MW-day
-	2011/2012	\$145.79 per MW-day
21		

According to AEP-Ohio witness Allen's testimony, just 14 months later (March 1, 2012)

over 26% of AEP-Ohio's annual use has switched and another 10% is either pending or

has provided notice of the intent to switch.

While these shopping levels have increased, the value AEP-Ohio can charge a CRES for RPM capacity will be declining significantly beginning in June 2012, when the Billed RPM Capacity Rate will drop from \$145.79 per MW-day currently to \$20.01 per MW-day. When shopping was quite modest AEP-Ohio did not ask for relief from the RPM Capacity Rate from the PUCO or FERC. Now after the coincident events of increased headroom between the bypassable costs and energy prices and the lower RPM reimbursement rates AEP-Ohio is seeking the change.

Q. What effect will this switch in pricing mechanism and rate have on Ohio's schools?

A. The effect could be devastating as to schools currently shopping and harmful to those contemplating shopping.

A.

Q. Explain the effect on schools currently shopping.

As stated previously, the Billed RPM Capacity Rate today is \$145.79 per MW-day and will drop to \$20.01 per MW-day June 1, 2012. While these capacity costs are often imbedded in a price billed to consumers in cents per kWh by a CRES, these costs are considered when a power supply agreement between a CRES and customer is executed. AEP-Ohio has asked that the capacity charge be increased to \$355.72, a difference of

\$209.93. The AEP-Ohio requested increase equals 8.7 mils per kWh for a customer with a

100% load factor [(\$209.93 per MW-day* 365 days per year) / (8760 hours per year *

1000 MW per kW)]. A large high school operating at a 60% load factor would

experience an increase of 14.6 mils or \$0.0146 per kWh. A smaller elementary school

operating at a 50% load factor would experience an increase of 17.5 mils or \$0.0175 per

kilowatt-hour given AEP-Ohio's request. These are large increases for customers.

The effect becomes even greater on June 1, 2012, when RPM capacity rates will fall to \$20.01. If AEP-Ohio is granted the requested \$355.72 per MW-day payment for capacity, then using the same methodology as above, the 60% load factor high school would see its costs rise by \$0.023 per kWh, and the 50% load factor elementary school would see its costs rise by \$0.028 per kWh.

- Q. How would a school that currently is shopping be affected by these higher prices considering the CRES pays AEP-Ohio for the capacity?
- A. For a number of years the CRES has paid AEP-Ohio for the capacity at RPM rates.

 When that CRES contracted with the consumer it would have anticipated an RPM cost for that customer's capacity. If the PUCO grants the cost-based formulaic approach to capacity reimbursement, the CRES could trigger a clause in their supply agreement that is commonly called the regulatory provision. In an event where a regulatory body makes such a change the supplier could pass through the incremental costs to the consumer.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

A.

- Q. All shopping customers could experience significant increases under AEP-Ohio's
 capacity application, are schools' circumstances any different?
 - It is difficult for all customers to absorb rate increases; however, schools are in a unique position. Unlike business enterprises, schools cannot voluntarily increase their price for services to pass through the rate increase to consumers. Instead, schools must rely on scarce taxpayer funds at the state and local levels for support. The massive \$780 million cuts in state funding to primary and secondary schools in this biennium has been widely reported by The Columbus Dispatch, a copy of which I offer as Exhibit MF-2. In addition, the passage of new operating levies at the local level has not fared well recently. A review of the Ohio Secretary of State's website of election results for the November 8, 2011, general election shows that 81 of the 108 local school issues seeking an increase in property or income taxes failed.² I offer a summary of those results, attached as Exhibit MF-3. The drastically increased capacity charges proposed by AEP-Ohio will only add to the Schools' plight caused by the lack of traditional revenue sources, likely leading to funding cuts affecting the levels of teachers, staff, materials and programs.

Q. Explain the effect approval of AEP-Ohio's application would have on non-shopping schools.

² http://www.sos.state.oh.us/sos/elections/Research/electResultsMain/2011results/20111108local.aspx

A. AEP-Ohio's proposed capacity cost increases to a CRES will increase the CRES's price of service and impair shopping. The inability to save money by buying power supplies from a CRES will impede schools' ability to control costs in these challenging times.

This will increase the likelihood of cost reductions in areas that directly impact the children's education, as stated previously.

A.

7 Q. What is your recommendation in this proceeding?

It is the policy of the State of Ohio that electricity be reasonably priced and to ensure a diversity of electric supplies and suppliers. See Ohio Revised Code section 4928.02. The magnitude of the proposed capacity charge increase makes the price of electricity unreasonable, particularly to schools in their precarious financial condition, and impedes shopping. For these reasons, I recommend that the PUCO reject AEP-Ohio's proposal and retain the traditional RPM pricing mechanism. Alternatively, if the PUCO approves a revised pricing mechanism for CRES capacity charges, such mechanism should require AEP-Ohio to sell a CRES supplying current and future shopping schools RPM capacity, given schools' unique circumstances discussed previously.

Q. Does this conclude your testimony?

20 A. Yes.

Summary of Switch Rates from EDUs to CRES Providers in Terms of Customers For the Month Ending June 30, 2008

Provider Name	EDU Service Area	Quarter Ending	Year	Residential Customers	Commercial Customers	Industrial Customers	Total Customers
Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company	CEI	30-Jun	2008	577198	70873	1827	656110
CRES Providers	CEI	30-Jun	2008	52880	6916	292	60088
Total Customers	CEI	30-Jun	2008	630078	77789	2119	716198
EDU Share	CEI	30-Jun	2008	91.61%	91.11%	86.22%	91.61%
Electric Choice Customer Switch Rates	CEI	30-Jun	2008	8.39%	8.89%	13.78%	8.39%
Liethic Globe Gustolier Switch Nates	CEI	30-3411	2000	0.33 /6	0.03 M	15.70%	0.3376
	EDU					•	
Provider Name	Service Area	Quarter Ending	Year	Residential Customers	Commercial Customers	Industrial Customers	Total Customers
Duke Energy Ohio	DUKE	30-Jun	2008	573131	66195	2165	646472
CRES Providers	DUKE	30-Jun	2008	9607	1003	18	10628
Total Customers	DUKE	30-Jun	2008	582738	67198	2183	657100
EDU Share	DUKE	30-Jun	2008	98.35%	98.51%	99.18%	98.38%
Electric Choice Customer Switch Rates	DUKE	30-Jun	2008	1.65%	1.49%	0.82%	1.62%
	EDU			B. 13. A.		1	-
Provider Name	Service Area	Quarter Ending	Year	Residential Customers	Commercial Customers	Industrial Customers	Total Customers
Columbus Southern Power Company	CSP	30-Jun	2008	637840	89198	3872	731219
CRES Providers	CSP	30-Jun	2008	0	408	0	408
Total Customers	CSP	30-Jun	2008	637840	89606	3872	731627
EDU Share	CSP	30-Jun	2008	100.00%	99.54%	100.00%	99.94%
Electric Choice Customer Switch Rates	CSP	30-Jun	2008	0.00%	0.46%	0.00%	0.06%
	EDU	Quarter		Residential	Commercial	Industrial	Total
Provider Name	Service Area	Ending	Year	Customers	Customers	Customers	
The Dayton Power and Light Company	DPL	30-Jun	2008	456308	49502	1599	513728
CRES Providers	DPL	30-Jun	2008	0	546	149	799
Total Customers	DPL	30-Jun	2008	456308	50048	1748	514527
EDU Share	DPL	30-Jun	2008	100.00%	98.91%	91.48%	99.84%
Electric Choice Customer Switch Rates	DPL.	30-Jun	2008	0.00%	1.09%	8.52%	0.16%

Source: PUCO, Division of Market Monitoring & Assessment.

Note1: Total customers includes residential, commercial, industrial and other customers.

Note2: The switch rate calculation is intended to present the broadest possible picture of the state of retail electric competition in Ohio.

Appropriate calculations made for other purposes may be based on different data, and may yield different results.

Appropriate calculations made for other purposes may be based on different data, and may yield different results.

Note3: American Electric Power, through its Columbus Southern Power subsidiary, purchased Monongahela Power Company's

Ohio transmission and distribution operations in January 2006. Monongahela Power is no longer an electric distribution utility in Ohio.

Previously reported Monongahela sales and customers are now being reported by CSP.

Note4: Duke Energy Ohio (formerly CG&E)

Summary of Switch Rates from EDUs to CRES Providers in Terms of Customers For the Month Ending June 30, 2008

Provider Name	EDU Service Area	Quarter Ending	Year	Residential Customers	Commercial Customers	Industrial Customers	Total Customers
Monongahela Power Company	MON	30-Jun	2008	0	0	0	0
CRES Providers	MON	30-Jun	2008	0	0	0	0
Total Customers	MON	30-Jun	2008	0	. 0	0	0
EDU Share	MON	30-Jun	2008	0%	0%	0%	0%
Electric Choice Customer Switch Rates	MON	30-Jun	2008	0%	0%	0%	0%
	EDU						
Provider Name	Service	Quarter	Year	Residential	Commercial	Industrial	Total
	Area	Ending		Customers	Customers	Customers	Customers
Ohio Edison Company	OEC	30-Jun	2008	765534	87036	763	857628
CRES Providers	OEC	30-Jun	2008	157790	20767	144	178701
Total Customers	OEC	30-Jun	2008	923324	107803	907	1036329
EDU Share	OEC	30-Jun	2008	82.91%	80.74%	84.12%	82.76%
Electric Choice Customer Switch Rates	OEC	30-Jun	2008	17.09%	19.26%	15.88%	17.24%
Provider Name	EDU Service Area	Quarter Ending	Year ⁻	Residential Customers	Commercial Customers	Industrial Customers	Total Customers
Ohio Power Company	OP	30-Jun	2008	587104	107574	8528	705872
CRES Providers	OP	30-Jun	2008	0	0	0	0
Total Customers	OP	30-Jun	2008	587104	107574	8528	705872
EDU Share	OP	30-Jun	2008	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%	100.00%
Electric Choice Customer Switch Rates	OP	30-Jun	2008	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%
					•		
Provider Name	EDU Service Area	Quarter Ending	Year	Residential Customers	Commercial Customers	Industrial Customers	Total Customers
Toledo Edison Company	TE	30-Jun	2008	228859	18002	124	247592
CRES Providers	TE	30-Jun	2008	27869	17522	36	45427
Total Customers	TE	30-Jun	2008	256728	35524	160	293019
EDU Share	TE	30-Jun	2008	89.14%	50.68%	77.50%	84.50%
Electric Choice Customer Switch Rates	TE	30-Jun	2008	10.86%	49,32%	22.50%	15.50%
						=	

Source: PUCO, Division of Market Monitoring & Assessment.

Note1: Total customers includes residential, commercial, industrial and other customers.

Note2: The switch rate calculation is intended to present the broadest possible picture of the state of retail electric competition in Ohio.

Appropriate calculations made for other purposes may be based on different data, and may yield different results.

Note3: American Electric Power, through its Columbus Southern Power subsidiary, purchased Monongahela Power Company's Ohio transmission and distribution operations in January 2006. Monongahela Power is no longer an electric distribution utility in Ohio. Previously reported Monongahela sales and customers are now being reported by CSP.

Note4: Duke Energy Ohio (formerly CG&E)

Summary of Switch Rates from EDUs to CRES Providers in Terms of Customers For the Month Ending December 31, 2010

Provider Name Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company CRES Providers Total Customers EDU Share Electric Choice Customer Switch Rates	EDU Service Area CEI CEI CEI CEI	Quarter Ending 31-Dec 31-Dec 31-Dec 31-Dec	Year 2010 2010 2010 2010 2010	Residential Customers 184885 463752 648637 28.50% 71.50%	Commercial Customers 22740 58418 81158 28.02% 71.98%	Industrial Customers 364 850 1214 29.98% 70.02%	Total Customers 208331 523088 731419 28.48% 71.52%
Provider Name	EDU Service Area	Quarter Ending	Year	Residential Customers	Commercial Customers	industrial Customers	Total Customers
Duke Energy Ohio CRES Providers Total Customers EDU Share Electric Choice Customer Switch Rates	DUKE DUKE DUKE DUKE	31-Dec 31-Dec 31-Dec 31-Dec 31-Dec	2010 2010 2010 2010 2010	427699 158664 586363 72.94% 27.06%	42351 9113 51464 82.29% 17.71%	1010 339 1349 74.87% 25.13%	473065 168205 641270 73.77% 26.23%
Provider Name	EDU Service Area	Quarter Ending	Year	Residential Customers	Commercial Customers	Industrial Customers	Total Customers
Columbus Southern Power Company CRES Providers Total Customers EDU Share Electric Choice Customer Switch Rates	CSP CSP CSP CSP CSP	31-Dec 31-Dec 31-Dec 31-Dec 31-Dec	2010 2010 2010 2010 2010	633765 1 633766 100.00% 0.00%	85374 3555 88929 96.00% 4.00%	3346 60 3406 98.24% 1.76%	722789 3616 726405 99.50% 0.50%
Provider Name	EDU Service Area	Quarter Ending	Year	Residential Customers	Commercial Customers	Industrial Customers	Total Customers
The Dayton Power and Light Company CRES Providers Total Customers EDU Share Electric Choice Customer Switch Rates	DPL DPL DPL DPL DPL	31-Dec 31-Dec 31-Dec 31-Dec 31-Dec	2010 2010 2010 2010 2010	454304 32 454336 99.99% 0.01%	43953 7898 51851 84.77% 15,23%	1219 553 1772 68.79% 31.21%	505163 9862 515025 98.09% 1.91%

Source: PUCO, Division of Market Monitoring & Assessment.

Note1: Total customers includes residential, commercial, industrial and other customers.

Note2: The switch rate calculation is intended to present the broadest possible picture of the state of retail electric competition in Ohio. Appropriate calculations made for other purposes may be based on different data, and may yield different results.

^{*}Preliminary Data - will update upon receipt of additional CRES data

Summary of Switch Rates from EDUs to CRES Providers in Terms of Customers For the Month Ending December 31, 2010

Provider Name	EDU Service Area	Quarter Ending	Year	Residential Customers	Commercial Customers	Industrial Customers	Total Customers
Ohio Edison Company	OEC	31-Dec	2010	351458	37942	256	391571
CRES Providers	OEC	31-Dec	2010	530921	66765	540	598309
Total Customers	OEC	31-Dec	2010	882379	104707	796	989880
EDU Share	OEC	31-Dec	2010	39.83%	36.24%	32.16%	39.56%
Electric Choice Customer Switch Rates	OEC	31-Dec	2010	60.17%	63.76%	67.84%	60.44%
				÷	٠.		
Provider Name	EDU Service Area	Quarter Ending	Year	Residential Customers	Commercial Customers	Industrial Customers	Total Customers
Ohio Power Company	OP	31-Dec	2010	575964	108278	8239	695059
CRES Providers	OP	31-Dec	2010	0	91	0	91
Total Customers	OP	31-Dec	2010	575964	108369	8239	695150
EDU Share	OP	31-Dec	2010	100.00%	99.92%	100.00%	99.99%
Electric Choice Customer Switch Rates	OP	31-Dec	2010	0.00%	0.08%	0.00%	0.01%
Provider Name	EDU Service Area	Quarter Ending	Year	Residential Customers	Commercial Customers	Industrial Customers	Total Customers
Toledo Edison Company	TE	31-Dec	2010	98479	11719	42	111146
CRES Providers	TE	31-Dec	2010	155842	21695	149	177706
Total Customers	TE	31-Dec	2010	254321	33414	191	288852
EDU Share	TE	31-Dec	2010	38.72%	35.07%	21.99%	38.48%
Electric Choice Customer Switch Rates	TE	31-Dec	2010	61.28%	64.93%	78.01%	61.52%

Source: PUCO, Division of Market Monitoring & Assessment.

Note1: Total customers includes residential, commercial, industrial and other customers.

Note2: The switch rate calculation is intended to present the broadest possible picture of the state of retail electric competition in Ohio.

Appropriate calculations made for other purposes may be based on different data, and may yield different results.

^{*}Preliminary Data - will update upon receipt of additional CRES data

It's official: Schools lose \$780 million

17 central Ohio districts being cut at least 10% this year by new budget

By Jim Siegel

The Columbus Dispatch Tuesday July 12, 2011 7:08 AM

Comments: 0

Recommend

When the dust settled on the new state budget, operating funds for Ohio schools were cut nearly \$780 million for the next two years, with 17 central Ohio districts facing reductions that top 10 percent this school year.

Schools were among those cut as Gov. John

Kasich and GOP

Dublin, Olentangy, Upper Arlington, Westerville and Worthington districts all face double-digit percentage reductions in state aid this year. Columbus City Schools will see state funds drop by 8.5 percent.

lawmakers dealt with a significant budget shortfall resulting from the use of more than \$8 billion in one-time money to balance the previous twoyear budget, which ended June 30.

"I think schools did as well as they could have done," said David Varda, executive director of the Ohio Association of School Business Officials. "It may have been better than anyone expected."

Still, for many school districts, this budget means they will go four to eight straight years without even an inflationary increase in state operating funds.

State-only school aid actually increases in the budget, but it is more than offset by the decision not to replace \$450 million in federal stimulus money and to accelerate the phase-out of certain tax reimbursements for schools. Only 17 of Ohio's 612 districts will get more operating money in 2013 than in 2011.

"I think there will be some adjustment in staff sizes," Varda said. "And some are so tight that, even with layoffs, they're still going to need more money."

Some factors will soften the cuts.

Districts still have about \$290 million in unspent federal Education Jobs Fund money from last year that they can use to offset cuts. Also, about half of Ohio districts will qualify for

\$30 million in performance bonuses - \$17 per student for schools rated "excellent" or higher.

And while Senate Bill 5, the new law that significantly weakens collective bargaining for public workers, is on hold pending a challenge on the November ballot, Varda said it already appears to be pushing teachers unions to give up significant pay raises.

"It certainly has had an effect on the tone and economics in settlements," he said.

Merit pay could produce savings in the long term, depending on how it is structured. The budget requires about half of the districts in Ohio - those participating in the federal Race to the Top program - to develop a merit-pay system by 2013.

Ohio's current pay system awards automatic raises for many teachers based on years of experience or educational attainment, on top of negotiated base-salary increases.

"We're not so sure that in Ohio and across the country that the education system can sustain salary schedules the way they are," said Tom Ash of the Buckeye Association of School Administrators.

But Ash said a lot of work is still needed to develop the merit system. "I'm not sure we have adequate assessments for arts, social studies and a whole bunch of subjects."

The Kasich administration already has started the process of developing a new school-funding formula. Spokesman Rob Nichols said it will be "based on the governor's concern with the lack of money and lack of resources that get into the classroom for teacher instruction."

November 2011 Ohio School Issue Results: Results

Issue Type	County	School District	New or Renewal or Replacement?	Тах Туре	Result
Income Tax	Hardin	Ada Exempted Village	additional	income fax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Adams	Adams County/Ohio Valley	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Summit	Akron City	additional	property tax	Fail
Bond	Lorain	Avon Local	bond	property tax	Fail
Income Tax	Deflance	Ayersville Local	renewal	Income tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Summit	Baberton City	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Greene	Beavercreek City	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy Income Tax	Cuyahoga Belmont	Bedford City Bellake Local	additional	property tax	Fail Fail
Property Tax Levy	Ottawa	Benton-Carroll-Salem Local	additional additional	income tax property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Cuyahoga	Berea City	additional	property tax	Fail
Income Tax	Medina	Black River Local	additional	income tax (earned income)	Fall
Property Tax Levy	Medina	Black River Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Clinton	Blanchester Local	replacement	property tax	Fail
Bond	Williams	Bryan City	bond	property tax	Fail
Bond	Ashtabula	Buckeye Local	bond	property tax	Fall
Property Tax Levy	Medina	Buckeye Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Income Tax	Delaware	Buckeye Valley Local	additional	income tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Guernsey	Cambridge City	renewal and additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Mahoning	Canfield Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Geauga	Cardinal Local	additional	property täx	Fail
Combination	Warren	Carlisle Local	additional	Income tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Hamilton Medina	Cincinnati City	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy		Cloverleaf Local Clyde-Green Springs Exempted Village	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy Property Tax Levy	Sandusky Cuyahoga	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	additional additional	property tax	Fail Fail
Combination	Tuscawaras	Cuyahoga Heights Local Dover City	additional	property tax	Fail
Combination	Franklin	Dublin City	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Guernsey	East Guernsey Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Holmes	East Holmes Local	additional	property tax	Fait
Property Tax Levy	Knox	East Knox Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Jefferson	Edison Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Income Tax	Williams	Edon Northwest Local	additional	income tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Cuyahoga	Euclid City	additional	property tax	Fail
income Tax	Fulton	Evergreen Local	additional	income tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Portage	Field Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Fulton	Four County Joint Vocational	additional	property tax	Fall
Income Tax	Knox	Fredericktown Local	additional	income tax (earned income)	Fail
Income Tax	Washington	Frontier Local	additional	income tax (earned income)	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Cuyahoga	Garfield Heights City	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Ashtabula	Geneva Area City	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy Property Tax Levy	Ottawa Ashtabula	Genoa Area Local Grand Valley Local	replacement and increase	properfy tax	Fail
Income Tax	Greene	Grand Valley Local Greeneview Local	additional additional	property tax income tax	Fail Fail
Combination	Darke	Greenville City	additional	Income tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Franklin	Groveport Madison Local	renewal and additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Trumbull	Howland Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Montgomery	Huber Heights	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Jefferson	Jefferson County Joint Vocational	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Lake	Kirtland Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Combination	Stark	Lake Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Wood	Lake Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Butler	Lakota Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Combination	Fairfield	Lancaster City	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Madison	London City	additional	property tax	Fail
Income Tax	Lorain	Lorain City	additional	income tax (earned income)	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Lorain	Lorain County Joint Vocational	replacement and increase	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Montgomery Medina	Mad River Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Income Tax Property Tax Levy	Montgomery	Medina City Miami Valley Career Technology Center	additional	income tax (earned income)	Fail Fail
Income Tax	Williams	Montpeller Exempted Village	replacement replacement	property tax Income tax (earned income)	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Hamilton	Mt. Healthy City	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Licking	North Fork	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Lorain	North Ridgeville City	additional	property tax	Fall
Income Tax	Licking	Northridge Local	additional	income tax	Fail
Combination	Hamilton	Northwest Local	additional	property tax	Fail _
Property Tax Levy	Stark	Osnaburg Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Marion	River Valley Local	additional	property tax	Fail
ncome Tax	Hardin	Riverdale Local	additional	Income tax	Fall
Property Tax Levy	Lake	Riverside Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Cuyahoga	Strongsville City	renewal	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Williams	Stryker Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Monroe	Switzerland of Ohio Local	renewal	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Seneca	Tiffin City	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Marion	Tri Rivers Joint Vocational	additional	property tax	Fail

Property Tax Levy	Montgomery	Trotwood-Madison City	additional	property tax	Fail
Bond	Columbiana	United Local	bond	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Montgomery	Vandalia-Butler City	additional	property tax	Fall
3ond	Erie	Vermillion Local	bond	property tax	Fail
Combination	Washington	Warren Local	additional	property fax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Portage	Waterloo Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Combination	Trumbull	Weathersfield Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Montgomery	West Carrollton City	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Clermont	West Clermont Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Geauga	West Geauga Local	additional	property tax	Fail
ncome Tax	Franklin	Westerville City	additional	income tax (earned income)	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Lake	Willoughby-Eastlake City	additional	property tax	Fail
Combination	Sandusky	Woodmore Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Summit	Woodridge Local	additional	property tax	Fail
Combination	Crawford	Wynford Local	additional	property tax	Fail
roperty Tax Levy	Greene	Xenia Community City	additional	property tex	Fall
Property Tax Levy	Paulding	Antwerp Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Ashland	Ashland City	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Ashtabula	Ashtabula Area City	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Portage	Aurora City	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Allen	Bath Local	renewal	property tex	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Belmont	Bellaire Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Logan	Bellefontaine City	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Logan	Bellefontaine City	renewal	property tax	Pass
Combination	Sheiby	Botkins Local	additional	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Williams	Bryan City	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Franklin	Canal Winchester Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Stark	Canton City	additional	property tax	Pass
ncome Tax	Richland	Clear Fork Valley Local	additional	income tax (earned income)	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Lorain	Clearview Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Cuyahoga	Cleveland Heights-University Heights C	ity additional	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Preble	College Corner Local	replacement	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Summit	Copley-Fairlawn City	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Coshocton	Coshocton City	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Van Wert	Crestview Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Van Wert	Crestview Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Portage	Crestwood Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Cuyahoga	Cuyahoga Valley Career Center	renewal	properly tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Delaware	Delaware City	additional	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Marion	Elgin Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Butler	Fairfield City	additional	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Fairfield	Fairfield Union Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Lake	Fairport Harbor Exempted Village	additional	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Fulton	Fayette Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
Bond	Mercer	Fort Recovery Local	bond	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Brown	Georgetown Exempted Vilaige	renewai	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Greene	Greene County Vocational	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Ashland	Hillsdale Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Cuyahoga	Independence Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Montgomery	Jefferson Township Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
combination	Hardin	Kenton City	additional	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Montgomery	Kettering City	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Lake	Lake County Community College	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Trumbuli	Lakeview Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Warren	Lebanon City	additional	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Richland	Lexington Local	additional	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Warren	Little Miami Local	additional	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Richland	Lucas Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Hamilton	Madeira City	additional	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Portage	Maplewood Joint Vocational	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Marion	Marion City	renewal	property tax	Pass
	Lucas	Maumee City	additional	property tax	Pass
ncome Tax	Miami	Miami East Local	replacement	income tax (earned income)	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Miami	Milton-Union Exempted Village	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Stark	Minerva Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Auglaize	Minster Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Huron	Monroeville Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Knox	Mount Vernon City	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Tuscawaras	New Philadelphia City	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Geauga	Newbury Local	renewał	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Summit	Nordonia Hills City	additional	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Cuyahoga	North Royalton City	renewal	property tax	Pass
Combination	Montgomery	Northmont City	additional	property tax	Pass
	Montgomery	Northridge Local	additional	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Clark	Northwestern	renewal	property tax	Pass
	Summit	Narton City	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Huron	Norwalk City	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Lorain	Oberlin City	renewal	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Lorain	Oberlin City	additional	property tax	Pass
roperty Tax Levy	Seneca	Old Fort Local Pa	ge 2 et Aval	property tax	Pass
PUILS CHA LOVY			- I - I - I - I - I - I - I - I - I - I	Proporty tool	

Property Tax Levy	Cuyahoga	Olmsted Falls City	additional	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Cuyahoga	Orange City	additional	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Lucas	Ottawa Hills Local	replacement	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Allen	Perry Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Allen	Perry Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Fulton	Pike-Delta-York Local	additional	property tax	Pass
Combination	Miami	Piqua City	additional	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Marion	Ridgedale Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Guernsey	Rolling Hills Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Stark	Sandy Valley Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Allen	Shawnee Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Allen	Spencerville Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Summit	Stow-Munroe Falls City	additional	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Tuscawaras	Strasburg-Franklin Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Portage	Streetsboro City	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Clark	Tecumseh Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Hamilton	Three Rivers Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Mlami	Tipp City Exempted Village	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Marion	Trl Rivers Joint Vocational	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Preble	Tri-County North Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Preble	Tri-County North Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
Income Tax	Preble	Twin Valley Community Local	renewal	income tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Medina	Wadsworth City	additional	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Fairfield	Walnut Township Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Lucas	Washington Local	additional	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Mahoning	Western Reserve Local	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Lake	Wickliffe City	additional	property tax	Pass
Income Tax	Clinton	Wilmington City	renewal	income tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Franklin	Hilliard City	additional	property tax	Pass
Income Tax	Pickaway	Teays Valley Local	replacement	income tax (earned income)	Fall
Property Tax Levy	Richland	Shelby City	renewal	property tax	Pass
Property Tax Levy	Richland	Plymouth-Shiloh Local	renewal	property tax	Fail
Property Tax Levy	Henry	Patrick Henry Local	additional	property tax	Fail

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that a true copy of the foregoing Direct Testimony of Mark Frye was served by electronic mail this 4th day of April upon the following.

Steven T. Nourse, Counsel of Record Matthew J. Satterwhite American Electric Power Service Corporation 1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor Columbus, OH 43215 stnourse@aep.com misatterwhite@aep.com

Mark Hayden First Energy 76 South Main Street Akron, OH 44308 haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

David A. Kutik Jones Day 901 Lakeside Avenue Cleveland, OH 44144 dakutik@jonesday.com

James F. Lang Laura C. McBride N. Trevor Alexander Calfee, Halter & Griswold, LLP 1400 KeyBank Center 800 Superior Avenue Cleveland, OH 44114 ilang@calfee.com lmcbride@calfee.com talexander@calfee.com

Daniel R. Conway Porter Wright Morris & Arthur **Huntington Center** 41 South High Street Columbus, OH 43215 dconway@porterwright.com

Allison E. Haedt Jones Day 901 Lakeside Avenue Columbus, OH 43216 aehaedt@jonesday.com

Cynthia Fonner Brady David I. Fein 550 W. Washington St., Suite 300 Chicago, IL 60661 cynthia.a.fonner@constellation.com david.fein@constellation.com

Terry L. Etter Maureen R. Grady Jeffrey L. Small Office of the Ohio Consumer Counsel 10 West Broad St., Suite 1800 Columbus, OH 43215-3485 etter@occ.state.oh.us grady@occ.state.oh.us small@occ.state.oh.us

Dorothy K. Corbett
Amy Spiller
Jeanne W. Kingery
Duke Energy Retail Sales
Q39 East Fourth Street
1303-Main
Cincinnati, OH 45202
dorothy.corbett@duke-energy.com
amy.spiller@duke-energy.com

Richard L. Sites Ohio Hospital Association 155 East Broad St., 15th Floor Columbus, OH 43215 ricks@ohanet.org

Thomas J. O'Brien Bricker & Eckler 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 43215 tobrien@bricker.com

Jay E. Jadwin 155 West Nationwide Blvd., Suite 500 Columbus, OH 43215 jejadwin@aep.com

Terrance O'Donnell
Christopher Montgomery
Bricker & Eckler, LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, OH 43215
todonnell@bricker.com
cmontgomery@bricker.com

Lisa G. McAlister Matthew W. Warnock Bricker & Eckler, LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 43215 lmcalister@bricker.com mwarnock@bricker.com John W. Bentine
J. Bentine
Chester Wilcox & Saxbe, LLP
65 East State St., Suite 1000
Columbus, OH 43215
jbentine@cwslaw.com
jbentine@taftlaw.com

David F. Boehm
Michael L. Kurtz
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh St., Suite 1510
Cincinnati, OH 45202
dboehm@bkllawfirm.com
mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com

David M. Stahl Eimer Stahl Klevorn & Solberg, LLP 224 South Michigan Ave., Suite 1100 Chicago, IL 60604 dstahl@eimerstahl.com

Glen Thomas 1060 First Avenue, Suite 400 King of Prussia, PA 19406 gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

Michael R. Smalz
Joseph V. Maskovyak
Ohio Poverty Law Center
555 Buttles Avenue
Columbus, OH 43215
msmalz@ohiopovertylaw.org
jmaskovyak@ohiopovertylaw.org

Trent A. Dougherty
Nolan Moser
Ohio Environmental Council
1207 Grandview Ave., Suite 201
Columbus, OH 43212
trent@theoec.org
cathy@theoec.org

William L. Massey Covington & Burling, LLP 1201 Pennsylvania Ave., NW Washington, DC 20004 wmassey@cov.com

Mark A. Whitt
Whitt Sturtevant LLP
PNC Plaza, Suite 2020
155 East Broad Street
Columbus, OH 43215
whitt@whitt-sturtevant.com

Sandy Grace
Exelon Business Services Company
101 Constitution Avenue, NW
Suite 400 East
Washington, DC 20001
sandy.grace@exeloncorp.com

Gregory H. Dunn
Counsel of Record
Chrisopher L. Miller
Asim Z. Hague
Ice Miller LLP
250 West Street
Columbus, OH 43215
Gregory.dunn@icemiller.com
Christopher.miller@icemiller.com
Asim.hague@icemiller.com

Steve W. Chriss
Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.
2001 SE 10th Street
Bentonville, AR 72716
stephen.chriss@wal-mart.com

Barth E. Royer Bell & Royer Co., LPA 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, OH 43215 barthroyer@aol.com Henry W. Eckhart 2100 Chambers Road, Suite 106 Columbus, OH 43212 henryeckhart@aol.com

Laura Chappell
4218 Jacob Meadows
Okemos, MI 48864
laurac@chappelleconsulting.net

Gary A. Jeffries
Dominion Resources Services, Inc.
501 Martindale Street, Suite 400
Pittsburgh, PA 15212
gary.a.jeffries@dom.com

M. Howard Petricoff
Stephen M. Howard
Michael J. Settineri
Lija Kaleps-Clark
Benita Kahn
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease, LLP
52 East Gay Street
Columbus, OH 43216
mhpetricoff@vorys.com
smhoward@vorys.com
mjsettineri@vorys.com
lkalepsclark@vorys.com
bakahn@vorys.com

Holly Rachel Smith Holly Rachel Smith, PLLC HITT Business Center 3803 Rectortown Road Marshall, VA 20115 holly@raysmithlaw.com

Gregory J. Poulos EnerNOC 101 Federal Street, Suite 1100 Boston, MA 02110 gpoulos@enernoc.com Kenneth P. Kreider
David A. Meyer
Keating Muething & Klekamp, PLL
One East Fourth Street, Suite 1400
Cincinnati, OH 45202
kpkreider@kmklaw.com
dmeyer@kmklaw.com

Emma F. Hand
Douglas G. Bonner
Keith C. Nusbaum
Clinton A. Vince
SNR Denton US, LLP
1301 K Street, NW, Suite 600, East Tower
Washington, DC 20005-3364
emma.hand@snrdenton.com
doug.bonner@snrdenton.com
clinton.vince@snrdenton.com

Samuel C. Randazzo
Joseph E. Oliker
Frank P. Darr
McNees Wallace & Nurick
21 East State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
sam@mwncmh.com
joliker@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com

John N. Estes III
Paul F. Wright
Skadden Arps Slate Meagher & Flom LLP
1440 New York Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20005
jestes@skadden.com
paul.wright@skadden.com

Werner L. Margard III
John H. Jones
William Wright
Stephen Beeler
Assistant Attorneys General
Public Utilities Section
180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
werner.margard@puc.state.oh.us
william.wright@puc.state.oh.us
John.Jones@puc.state.oh.us
steven.beeler@puc.state.oh.us

Philip B. Sineneng
Terrance A. Mebane
Carolyn S. Flahive
Thompson & Hine, LLP
41 S. High Street, Suite 1700
Columbus, OH 43215
philip.sineneng@thompsonhine.com
carolyn.flahive@thompsonhine.com
terrance.mebane@thompsonhine.com

Colleen L. Mooney
David C. Rinebolt
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street, PO Box 1793
Findlay, OH 45840
cmooney2@columbus.rr.com
drinebolt@ohiopartners.org

Tara C. Santarelli Environmental Law & Policy Center 1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201 Columbus, OH 43212 tsantarelli@elpc.org Joel Malina
Executive Director
COMPLETE Coalition
1317 F Street, NE, Suite 600
Washington, DC 20004
malina@wexlerwalker.com

Jay L. Kooper
Katherine Guerry
Hess Corporation
One Hess Plaza
Woodbridge, NJ 07095
jkooper@hess.com
kguerry@hess.com

Robert Korandovich KOREEnergy P.O. Box 148 Sunbury, OH 43074 korenergy@insight.rr.com

Jeanne W. Kingery
Associate General counsel
Amy B. Spiller
Deputy General Counsel
139 E. Fourth Street, 1303-Main
P.O. Box 961
Cincinnati, OH 45201-0960
Jeanne Kingery@duke-energy.com
Amy.Spiller@duke-energy.com

Roger P. Sugarman Kegler, Brown, Hill & Ritter 65 East State Street, Suite 1800 Columbus, OH 43215 rsugarman@keglerbrown.com Christopher J. Allwein Williams, Allwein and Moser, LLC 1373 Granview Avenue, Sutie 212 Columbus, OH 43212 callwein@wamenergylaw.com

Allen Freifeld
Samuel A. Wolfe
Viridity Energy, Inc.
100 West Elm Street, Suite 410
Conshohocken, PA 19428
afreifeld@viridityenergy.com
swolfe@viridityenergy.com

Chad A. Endsley
Chief Legal Counsel
Ohio Farm Bureau Federation
280 North High Street
P.O. Box 182383
Columbus, OH 43218-2383
cendsley@ofbf.org

Mark S. Yurick
Zachary D. Kravitz
Taft Stettinius & Hollister LLP
65 East State Street, Suite 1000
Columbus, OH 43215
myurick@taftlaw.com
zkravitz@taftlaw.com

Brian P. Barger Brady, Coyle & Schmidt, Ltd. 4052 Holland-Sylvania Road Toledo, OH 43623 bpbarger@bcslawyers.com

Additional Electronic Service

greta.see@puc.state.oh.us jeff.jones@puc.state.oh.us tammy.turkenton@puc.state.oh.us jonathan.tauber@puc.state.oh.us jodi.bair@puc.state.oh.us bob.fortney@puc.state.oh.us doris.mccarter@puc.state.oh.us stephen.reilly@puc.state.oh.us john.jones@puc.state.oh.us daniel.shields@puc.state.oh.us dclark1@aep.com grady@occ.state.oh.us keith.nusbaum@snrdenton.com ned.ford@fuse.net pfox@hilliardohio.gov ricks@ohanet.org joseph.dominquez@exeloncorp.com dsullivan@nrdc.org whitt@whitt-sturtevant.com thompson@whitt-sturtevant.com aaragona@eimerstahl.com ssolberg@eimerstahl.com callwein@wamenergylaw.com sasloan@aep.com Kim.Wissman@puc.state.oh.us Hisham.Choueiki@puc.state.oh.us Dan.Johnson@puc.state.oh.us