

9.7.3.4 The Billing Party has no liability to the Non-Paying Party or its End Users in the event of disconnection of service in compliance with Section 9.7.2. SBC-7STATE has no liability to CLEC or CLEC's End Users in the event of disconnection of service to CLEC and the transfer of any Resale End Users to SBC-7STATE local service in connection with such disconnection.

9.7.4 Within five (5) calendar days following the transfer, SBC-7STATE will notify each transferred Resale End User that because of CLEC's failure to pay SBC-7STATE, the End User's local service is now being provided by SBC-7STATE. This notice will also advise each transferred Resale End User that the End User has thirty (30) calendar days from the date of transfer to select a new Local Service Provider.

9.7.4.1 Notwithstanding any inconsistent provisions in this Agreement, notice of transfer to Missouri Resale End Users will comply with Missouri Public Service Commission Rule 4 CSR 240-32.120.

9.7.4.1.1 Notwithstanding any inconsistent provisions in this Agreement, notice of transfer to Kansas Resale End Users will comply with Kansas Corporation Commission Order No. 5 (dated March 25, 2002) in Docket 01-GIMT-649-GIT.

9.7.5 The transferred Resale End User shall be responsible for any and all charges incurred during the selection period other than those billed to CLEC under Section 9.7.3.3.

9.7.6 If any Resale End User transferred to SBC-7STATE's local service under Section 9.7.3 of this Agreement fails to select a new Local Service Provider within thirty (30) calendar days of the transfer, SBC-7STATE may terminate the transferred Resale End User's service.

9.7.6.1 SBC-7STATE will notify the Commission of the names of all transferred Resale End Users whose local service was terminated pursuant to Section 9.7.5.

9.7.6.2 Nothing in this Agreement shall be interpreted to obligate SBC-7STATE to continue to provide local service to any transferred Resale End User beyond the thirty (30) calendar day selection period. Nothing herein shall be interpreted to limit any and all disconnection rights SBC-7STATE has with regard to such transferred Resale End Users under Applicable Law; provided, however,

9.7.6.2.1 in SBC CALIFORNIA only, following expiration of the selection period and disconnection of such transferred Resale End Users, where facilities permit, SBC CALIFORNIA will furnish transferred and subsequently disconnected local residential End Users with "quick dial tone."

## 9.8 SBC SNET only

9.8.1 For nonpayment and procedures for disconnection for SBC SNET, see the applicable DPUC ordered tariff.

## 10. DISPUTE RESOLUTION

### 10.1 Finality of Disputes

10.1.1 Except as otherwise specifically provided for in this Agreement, no claim may be brought for any dispute arising from this Agreement more than twenty-four (24) months from the date the occurrence which gives rise to the dispute is discovered or reasonably should have been discovered with the exercise of due care and attention.

10.1.2 Notwithstanding anything contained in this Agreement to the contrary, a Party shall be entitled to dispute only those charges for which the Bill Due Date occurred within the twelve (12) months immediately preceding the date on which the other Party received notice of such Disputed Amounts.

10.2 Alternative to Litigation

10.2.1 The Parties desire to resolve disputes arising out of this Agreement without litigation. Accordingly, the Parties agree to use the following Dispute Resolution procedures with respect to any controversy or claim arising out of or relating to this Agreement or its breach.

10.3 Commencing Dispute Resolution

10.3.1 Dispute Resolution shall commence upon one Party's receipt of written notice of a controversy or claim arising out of or relating to this Agreement or its breach. No Party may pursue any claim unless such written notice has first been given to the other Party. There are three (3) separate Dispute Resolution methods:

10.3.1.1 Service Center (SBC MIDWEST REGION 5-STATE), LSC (SBC-7STATE) or LEC-C (SBC SNET);

10.3.1.2 Informal Dispute Resolution; and

10.3.1.3 Formal Dispute Resolution, each of which is described below.

10.4 LSC/Service Center/LEC-C Dispute Resolution -the following Dispute Resolution procedures will apply with respect to any billing dispute arising out of or relating to the Agreement.

10.4.1 If the written notice given pursuant to Section 10.3 discloses that a CLEC dispute relates to billing, then the procedures set forth in this Section 10.4 shall be used and the dispute shall first be referred to the appropriate service center [SBC MIDWEST REGION 5-STATE Service Center; SBC-7STATE Local Service Center (LSC); SBC SNET Local Exchange Carrier Center (LEC-C)] for resolution. In order to resolve a billing dispute, CLEC shall furnish SBC-13STATE written notice of (i) the date of the bill in question, (ii) CBA/ESBA/ASBS or BAN number of the bill in question, (iii) telephone number, circuit ID number or trunk number in question, (iv) any USOC information relating to the item questioned, (v) amount billed and (vi) amount in question and (vii) the reason that CLEC disputes the billed amount. To be deemed a "dispute" under this Section 10.4, CLEC must provide evidence that it has either paid the disputed amount or established an interest bearing escrow account that complies with the requirements set forth in Section 8.4 of this Agreement and deposited all Unpaid Charges relating to Resale Services and Network Elements into that escrow account. Failure to provide the information and evidence required by this Section 10.4.1 not later than twenty-nine (29) calendar days following the Bill Due Date shall constitute CLEC's irrevocable and full waiver of its right to dispute the subject charges.

10.4.2 The Parties shall attempt to resolve Disputed Amounts appearing on SBC-13STATE's current billing statements thirty (30) to sixty (60) calendar days from the Bill Due Date (provided the CLEC furnishes all requisite information and evidence under Section 10.4.1 by the Bill Due Date). If not resolved within thirty (30) calendar days, upon request, SBC-13STATE will notify CLEC of the status of the dispute and the expected resolution date.

10.4.3 The Parties shall attempt to resolve Disputed Amounts appearing on statements prior to the current billing statement within thirty (30) to ninety (90) calendar days, but resolution may take longer depending on the complexity of the dispute. If not resolved within thirty (30) calendar days from the date notice of the Disputed Amounts was received (provided that CLEC furnishes all requisite information and evidence under Section 10.4.1), SBC-13STATE will notify CLEC of the status of the dispute and the expected resolution date.

10.4.4 Any notice of Disputed Amounts given by SBC-13STATE to CLEC pursuant to Section 10.3 shall furnish CLEC written notice of: (i) the date of the bill in question, (ii) the account number or other identification of the bill in question, (iii) any telephone number, circuit ID number or trunk number in question, (iv) any USOC (or other descriptive information) questioned, (v) the amount billed, (vi) the amount in question, and (vii) the reason that SBC-13STATE disputes the billed amount. The Parties shall attempt to resolve Disputed Amounts appearing on current billing statement(s) thirty (30) to sixty (60) calendar days from the Bill Due Date (provided SBC-13STATE furnishes all requisite

information by the Bill Due Date) and Disputed Amounts appearing on statements prior to the current billing statement within thirty (30) to ninety (90) calendar days, but resolution may take longer depending on the complexity of the dispute. If not resolved within thirty (30) calendar days, CLEC will notify SBC-13STATE of the status of the dispute and the expected resolution date.

10.4.5 If the Non-Paying Party is not satisfied by the resolution of the billing dispute under this Section 10.4, the Non-Paying Party may notify the Billing Party in writing that it wishes to invoke the Informal Resolution of Disputes afforded pursuant to Section 10.5 of this Agreement.

10.5 Informal Resolution of Disputes

10.5.1 Upon receipt by one Party of notice of a dispute by the other Party pursuant to Section 10.3 or Section 10.4.5, each Party will appoint a knowledgeable, responsible representative to meet and negotiate in good faith to resolve any dispute arising under this Agreement. The location, form, frequency, duration, and conclusion of these discussions will be left to the discretion of the representatives. Upon agreement, the representatives may utilize other alternative Dispute Resolution procedures such as mediation to assist in the negotiations. Discussions and the correspondence among the representatives for purposes of settlement are exempt from discovery and production and will not be admissible in the arbitration described below or in any lawsuit without the concurrence of both Parties. Documents identified in or provided with such communications that were not prepared for purposes of the negotiations are not so exempted, and, if otherwise admissible, may be admitted in evidence in the arbitration or lawsuit.

10.6 Formal Dispute Resolution

10.6.1 If the Parties are unable to resolve the dispute through the informal procedure described in Section 10.5, then either Party may invoke the formal Dispute Resolution procedures described in this Section 10.6. Unless agreed among all Parties, formal Dispute Resolution procedures, including arbitration or other procedures as appropriate, may be invoked not earlier than sixty (60) calendar days after receipt of the letter initiating Dispute Resolution under Section 10.3.

10.6.2 Claims Subject to Mandatory Arbitration. The following claims, if not settled through informal Dispute Resolution, will be subject to mandatory arbitration pursuant to Section 10.7 below:

10.6.2.1 Each unresolved billing dispute involving one percent (1%) or less of the amounts charged to the Disputing Party under this Agreement in the state in which the dispute arises during the twelve (12) months immediately preceding receipt of the letter initiating Dispute Resolution under Section 10.3. If the disputing Party has not been billed for a minimum of twelve (12) months immediately preceding receipt of the letter initiating Dispute Resolution under Section 10.3, the Parties will annualize the actual number of months billed.

10.6.3 Claims Subject to Elective Arbitration. Claims will be subject to elective arbitration pursuant to Section 10.7 if, and only if, the claim is not settled through informal Dispute Resolution and both Parties agree to arbitration. If both Parties do not agree to arbitration, then either Party may proceed with any remedy available to it pursuant to law, equity or agency mechanism.

10.6.4 Claims Not Subject to Arbitration. If the following claims are not resolved through informal Dispute Resolution, they will not be subject to arbitration and must be resolved through any remedy available to a Party pursuant to law, equity or agency mechanism.

10.6.4.1 Actions seeking a temporary restraining order or an injunction related to the purposes of this Agreement.

10.6.4.2 Actions to compel compliance with the Dispute Resolution process.

10.6.4.3 All claims arising under federal or state statute(s), including antitrust claims.

10.7 Arbitration

10.7.1 Disputes subject to mandatory or elective arbitration under the provisions of this Agreement will be submitted to a single arbitrator pursuant to the Commercial Arbitration Rules of the American

Arbitration Association or pursuant to such other provider of arbitration services or rules as the Parties may agree. The arbitrator shall be knowledgeable of telecommunications issues. Each arbitration will be held in Dallas, Texas (SBC SOUTHWEST REGION 5-STATE); Chicago, Illinois (SBC MIDWEST REGION 5-STATE); San Francisco, California (SBC CALIFORNIA); Reno, SBC NEVADA (SBC NEVADA); or New Haven, Connecticut (SBC SNET), as appropriate, unless the Parties agree otherwise. The arbitration hearing will be requested to commence within sixty (60) calendar days of the demand for arbitration. The arbitrator will control the scheduling so as to process the matter expeditiously. The Parties may submit written briefs upon a schedule determined by the arbitrator. The Parties will request that the arbitrator rule on the dispute by issuing a written opinion within thirty (30) calendar days after the close of hearings. The Federal Arbitration Act, 9 U.S.C. Secs. 1-16, not state law, shall govern the arbitrability of all disputes. The arbitrator will have no authority to award punitive damages, exemplary damages, Consequential Damages, multiple damages, or any other damages not measured by the prevailing Party's actual damages, and may not, in any event, make any ruling, finding or award that does not conform to the terms and conditions of this Agreement. The times specified in this Section may be extended or shortened upon mutual agreement of the Parties or by the arbitrator upon a showing of good cause. Each Party will bear its own costs of these procedures, including attorneys' fees. The Parties will equally split the fees of the arbitration and the arbitrator. The arbitrator's award shall be final and binding and may be entered in any court having jurisdiction thereof. Judgment upon the award rendered by the arbitrator may be entered in any court having jurisdiction.

#### 11. AUDITS – Applicable In SBC-12STATE only

11.1 Subject to the restrictions set forth in Section 20 and except as may be otherwise expressly provided in this Agreement, a Party (the "**Auditing Party**") may audit the other Party's (the "**Audited Party**") books, records, data and other documents, as provided herein, once annually, with the audit period commencing not earlier than the date on which services were first supplied under this Agreement ("**service start date**") for the purpose of evaluating (i) the accuracy of Audited Party's billing and invoicing of the services provided hereunder and (ii) verification of compliance with any provision of this Agreement that affects the accuracy of Auditing Party's billing and invoicing of the services provided to Audited Party hereunder. Notwithstanding the foregoing, an Auditing Party may audit the Audited Party's books, records and documents more than once annually if the previous audit found (i) previously uncorrected net variances or errors in invoices in Audited Party's favor with an aggregate value of at least five percent (5%) of the amounts payable by Auditing Party for audited services provided during the period covered by the audit or (ii) non-compliance by Audited Party with any provision of this Agreement affecting Auditing Party's billing and invoicing of the services provided to Audited Party with an aggregate value of at least five percent (5%) of the amounts payable by Audited Party for audited services provided during the period covered by the audit.

11.1.1 The scope of the audit shall be limited to the period which is the shorter of (i) the period subsequent to the last day of the period covered by the audit which was last performed (or if no audit has been performed, the service start date and (ii) the twelve (12) month period immediately preceding the date the Audited Party received notice of such requested audit, but in any event not prior to the service start date. Such audit shall begin no fewer than thirty (30) calendar days after Audited Party receives a written notice requesting an audit and shall be completed no later than thirty (30) calendar days after the start of such audit.

11.1.2 Such audit shall be conducted either by the Auditing Party's employee(s) or an independent auditor acceptable to both Parties; provided, however, if the Audited Party requests that an independent auditor be engaged and the Auditing Party agrees, the Audited Party shall pay one-quarter (1/4) of the independent auditor's fees and expenses. If an independent auditor is to be engaged, the Parties shall select an auditor by the thirtieth day following Audited Party's receipt of a written audit notice. Auditing Party shall cause the independent auditor to execute a nondisclosure agreement in a form agreed upon by the Parties.

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**4/4/2012 11:01:42 AM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 12-0966-TP-CSS**

Summary: Exhibit - attachment to motion to dismiss or, in the alternative, motion to hold in abeyance and memorandum in support electronically filed by Jon F Kelly on behalf of AT&T Ohio