## BEFORE THE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Commission Review of	)	
he Capacity Charges of Ohio Power	)	Case No. 10-2929-EL-UNC
Company and Columbus Southern Power	)	
Company.	)	

# FIRSTENERGY SOLUTIONS CORP.'S MOTION TO EXTEND THE DEADLINE FOR TESTIMONY OR IN THE ALTERNATIVE FOR EXPEDITED DISCOVERY AND REQUEST FOR EXPEDITED RELIEF

On March 14, 2012, the Attorney Examiner issued a procedural entry (the "Entry") which permitted AEP Ohio to "revise or update [AEP Ohio's] testimony" and required AEP Ohio to file its testimony by March 23, 2012. The Entry also provided that intervenor testimony is due on March 30, 2012, seven days after AEP Ohio's testimony is due. This Entry also provided for a <u>ten-day</u> discovery response period, making it impossible to issue discovery in response to AEP Ohio's testimony and incorporate that discovery in intervenor testimony.

In order to develop a complete record in this case, FirstEnergy Solutions Corp. ("FES") requests that the procedural schedule for this case be changed in order to permit discovery in response to AEP Ohio's testimony. If the Commission retains the 10-day discovery response period, FES requests that intervenor testimony be filed by Monday, April 9, 2012. In the alternative, FES requests that the discovery response period be shortened to three days.

FES further requests, pursuant to Rule 4901-1-12 of the Ohio Administrative Code, that an expedited ruling be issued. A memorandum in support of this motion is attached hereto and incorporated herein.

### Respectfully submitted,

### s/ N. Trevor Alexander

Mark A. Hayden (0081077)
FIRSTENERGY SERVICE COMPANY
76 South Main Street
Akron, OH 44308
(330) 761-7735
(330) 384-3875 (fax)
haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

James F. Lang (0059668)
Laura C. McBride (0080059)
N. Trevor Alexander (0080713)
CALFEE, HALTER & GRISWOLD LLP
1400 KeyBank Center
800 Superior Ave.
Cleveland, OH 44114
(216) 622-8200
(216) 241-0816 (fax)
jlang@calfee.com
lmcbride@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com

David A. Kutik (0006418) JONES DAY 901 Lakeside Avenue Cleveland, OH 44114 (216) 586-3939 (216) 579-0212 (fax) dakutik@jonesday.com

Allison E. Haedt (0082243)
JONES DAY
P.O. Box 165017
Columbus, OH 43216-5017
(614) 469-3939
(614) 461-4198 (fax)
aehaedt@jonesday.com
Attorneys for FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.

## BEFORE THE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Commission Review of	)		
the Capacity Charges of Ohio Power	)	Case No. 10-2929-EL-UNC	
Company and Columbus Southern Power	)		
Company.	)		

MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF FIRSTENERGY SOLUTIONS CORP.'S MOTION TO EXTEND THE DEADLINE FOR TESTIMONY OR IN THE ALTERNATIVE FOR EXPEDITED DISCOVERY AND REQUEST FOR EXPEDITED RELIEF

In the March 14, 2012 Entry (the "Entry"), the Attorney Examiner set a procedural schedule relating to AEP Ohio's capacity charge application. In this Entry, the Attorney Examiner directed the parties to "develop an evidentiary record on the appropriate capacity cost pricing/recovery mechanism including, if necessary, the appropriate components of any proposed capacity cost recovery mechanism." In order to develop this evidentiary record, the Attorney Examiner permitted AEP Ohio to file new testimony by March 23, 2012, and ordered an expedited ten-day discovery response period. Unfortunately, the procedural schedule contained in the Entry does not permit <u>any</u> discovery in response to this new AEP Ohio testimony before intervenor testimony is due on March 30, 2012. This procedural schedule, if not modified, would significantly prejudice the intervenors contesting AEP Ohio's attempt to move away from market-based pricing in violation of due process.

As was recognized in the Entry, AEP Ohio seeks to significantly change the state compensation mechanism for capacity pricing in Ohio. AEP Ohio's proposal is based on its purported costs associated with providing capacity, and its calculation of these purported costs is

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Entry, p. 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Id.

very much in dispute by various intervenors, including FES. Therefore, discovery in response to AEP Ohio's calculation of these purported costs is essential in this case.

In order to develop a complete record for the Commission's consideration, FES respectfully requests that intervenor testimony be due on or before April 9, 2012. Even assuming that intervenors issue their discovery requests on Monday, March 26, 2012 (the next business day after AEP Ohio's testimony is filed on Friday, March 23, 2012), this extension would provide intervenors with only one business day to incorporate AEP Ohio's discovery responses into the intervenor testimony.

In the alternative, FES respectfully requests that the discovery response period be changed to three days. Once again, even assuming that discovery requests on this new AEP Ohio testimony are issued the next business day after the testimony is received, this change to the discovery response period would provide intervenors with only one business day to incorporate AEP Ohio's discovery responses into the intervenor testimony due to be filed on March 30, 2012.

In this case AEP Ohio is attempting to change the landscape for customers and CRES providers by imposing massively above-market capacity charges. As recognized in the Entry, the parties have been charged with creating an evidentiary record which encompasses both: (1) the appropriate capacity pricing mechanism; and (2) the appropriate components of a capacity cost recovery mechanism. While the appropriate capacity pricing mechanism is clearly market-based RPM pricing, there is no way to provide intervenor testimony regarding the appropriate components of a cost-based pricing mechanism without knowing what components AEP Ohio seeks to include in this mechanism and how these purported costs have been calculated.

4

{01429135.DOC;1 }

In order to establish a valid evidentiary record, at minimum intervenors should have the opportunity to conduct discovery in response to AEP Ohio's testimony and to incorporate AEP Ohio's discovery responses into the intervenor's testimony. Therefore, FES respectfully requests that the due date for intervenor testimony be changed to April 9, 2012, or the response period for discovery be changed to three days.

### Respectfully submitted,

### s/ N. Trevor Alexander

Mark A. Hayden (0081077)
FIRSTENERGY SERVICE COMPANY
76 South Main Street
Akron, OH 44308
(330) 761-7735
(330) 384-3875 (fax)
haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

James F. Lang (0059668)
Laura C. McBride (0080059)
N. Trevor Alexander (0080713)
CALFEE, HALTER & GRISWOLD LLP
1400 KeyBank Center
800 Superior Ave.
Cleveland, OH 44114
(216) 622-8200
(216) 241-0816 (fax)
jlang@calfee.com
lmcbride@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com

David A. Kutik (0006418) JONES DAY 901 Lakeside Avenue Cleveland, OH 44114 (216) 586-3939 (216) 579-0212 (fax) dakutik@jonesday.com

Allison E. Haedt (0082243) JONES DAY P.O. Box 165017 Columbus, OH 43216-5017 (614) 469-3939 (614) 461-4198 (fax) aehaedt@jonesday.com

 ${\it Attorneys for First Energy Solutions Corp.}$ 

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing FIRSTENERGY SOLUTIONS CORP.'S MOTION TO EXTEND THE DEADLINE FOR TESTIMONY OR IN THE ALTERNATIVE FOR EXPEDITED DISCOVERY AND REQUEST FOR EXPEDITED RELIEF was served this 15th day of March, 2012, via e-mail upon the parties below.

### s/ N. Trevor Alexander

One of the Attorneys for FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.

Steven T. Nourse
Matthew J. Satterwhite
Anne M. Vogel
American Electric Power Corp.
1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
stnourse@aep.com
mjsatterwhite@aep.com
amvogel@aep.com

Dorothy K. Corbett
Amy Spiller
Duke Energy Retail Sales
139 East Fourth Street
1303-Main
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
dorothy.corbett@duke-energy.com
amy.spiller@duke-energy.com

Daniel R. Conway Porter Wright Morris & Arthur 41 South High Street Columbus, Ohio 43215 dconway@porterwright.com David F. Boehm
Michael L. Kurtz
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry
36 East Seventh Street. Suite 1510
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
dboehm@bkllawfirm.com
mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com

Cynthia Fonner Brady
David I. Fein
550 W. Washington Street, Suite 300
Chicago, IL 60661
cynthia.a.fonner@constellation.com
david.fein@constellation.com

Terry L. Etter
Maureen R. Grady
Jeffrey L. Small
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485
etter@occ.state.oh.us
grady@occ.state.oh.us
small@occ.state.oh.us

Richard L. Sites Ohio Hospital Association 155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215-3620 ricks@ohanet.org Thomas J. O'Brien Bricker & Eckler 100 South Third Street Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291 tobrien@bricker.com Shannon Fisk 2 North Riverside Plaza, Suite 2250 Chicago, IL 60606 sfisk@nrdc.org

John W. Bentine
Mark S. Yurick
Zachary D. Kravitz
Chester Willcox & Saxbe, LLP
65 East State Street, Suite 1000
Columbus, Ohio 43215
jbentine@cwslaw.com
myurick@cwslaw.com
zkravitz@cwslaw.com

Terrence O'Donnell Christopher Montgomery Bricker & Eckler LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291 todonnell@bricker.com cmontgomcry@bricker.com

Jesse A. Rodriguez
Exelon Generation Company, LLC
300 Exelon Way
Kennett Square, Pennsylvania 19348
jesse.rodriguez@exeloncorp.com

Glen Thomas 1060 First Avenue, Ste. 400 King of Prussia, Pennsylvania 19406 gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

Henry W. Eckhart 2100 Chambers Road, Suite 106 Columbus, Ohio 43212 henryeckhart@aol.com Jay E. Jadwin American Electric Power Service Corporation 1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215 jejadwin@aep.com

Michael R. Smalz Joseph V. Maskovyak Ohio Poverty Law Center 555 Buttles Avenue Columbus, Ohio 43215 msmalz@ohiopovertylaw.org jmaskovyak@ohiopovertylaw.org

Lisa G. McAlister
Matthew W. Warnock
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291
lmcalister@bricker.com
mwarnock@bricker.com

William L. Massey
Covington & Burling, LLP
1201 Pennsylvania Ave., NW
Washington, DC 20004
wmassey@cov.com

Laura Chappelle 4218 Jacob Meadows Okemos, Michigan 48864 laurac@chappelleconsulting.net

Pamela A. Fox Law Director The City of Hilliard, Ohio pfox@hilliardohio.gov Christopher L. Miller
Gregory H. Dunn
Asim Z. Haque
Stephen J. Smith
Schottenstein Zox & Dunn Co., LPA
250 West Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
cmiller@szd.com
ahaque@szd.com
ssmith@szd.com
gdunn@szd.com

Sandy Grace
Exelon Business Services Company
101 Constitution Avenue N.W., Suite 400 East
Washington, DC 20001
sandy.grace@exeloncorp.com

Kenneth P. Kreider
David A. Meyer
Keating Muething & Klekamp PLL
One East Fourth Street, Suite 1400
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202
kpkreider@kmklaw.com
dmeyer@kmklaw.com

Holly Rachel Smith Holly Rachel Smith, PLLC Hitt Business Center 3803 Rectortown Road Marshall, Virginia 20115 holly@raysmithlaw.com

Gregory J. Poulos EnerNOC, Inc. 101 Federal Street, Suite 1100 Boston, MA 02110 gpoulos@enernoc.com M. Howard Petricoff
Stephen M. Howard
Michael J. Settineri
Lija Kaleps-Clark; Benita Kahn
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP
52 E. Gay Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
mhpetricoff@vorys.com
smhoward@vorys.com
mjsettineri@vorys.com
lkalepsclark@vorys.com
bakahn@vorys.com

Gary A. Jeffries
Dominion Resources Services, Inc.
501 Martindale Street, Suite 400
Pittsburgh, PA 15212-5817
gary.a.jeffries@aol.com

Steve W. Chriss Wal-Mart Stores, Inc. 2001 SE 10th Street Bentonville, Arkansas 72716 stephen.chriss@wal-mart.com

Barth E. Royer Bell & Royer Co., LPA 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus, Ohio 43215-3927 barthroyer@aol.com

Werner L. Margard III
John H. Jones
William Wright
Thomas Lindgren
Assistant Attorneys General
Public Utilities Section
180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
werner.margard@puc.state.oh.us
john.jones@puc.state.oh.us
William.wright@puc.state.oh.us
Thomas.Lindgren@puc.state.oh.us

Philip B. Sineneng
Terrance A. Mebane
Carolyn S. Flahive
Thompson Hine LLP
41 S. High Street, Suite 1700
Columbus, Ohio 43215
philip.sineneng@thompsonhine.com
carolyn.flahive@thompsonhine.com
terrance.mebane@thompsonhine.com

Samuel C. Randazzo
Joseph E. Oliker
Frank P. Darr
McNees Wallace & Nurick
21 East State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
sam@mwncmh.com
joliker@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com

John N. Estes III
Paul F. Wight
Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom LLP
1440 New York Ave., N.W.
Washington, DC 20005
jestes@skadden.com
paul.wight@skadden.com

Tara C. Santarelli Environmental Law & Policy Center 1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201 Columbus, Ohio 43212 tsantarelli@elpc.org

Christopher J. Allwein Williams, Allwein and Moser, LLC 1373 Grandview Avenue, Suite 212 Columbus, Ohio 43212 callwein@williamsandmoser.com Emma F. Hand
Douglas G. Bonner
Keith C. Nusbaum
Clinton A. Vince
SNR Denton US LLP
1301 K Street, NW, Suite 600, East Tower
Washington, DC 20005-3364
emma.hand@snrdenton.com
doug.bonner@snrdenton.com
keith.nusbaum@snrdenton.com
Clinton.vince@snrdenton.com

Colleen L. Mooney
David C. Rinebolt
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
Findlay, Ohio 45840
cmooney2@columbus.rr.com
drinebolt@ohiopartners.org

Trent A. Dougherty
Cathryn Loucas (0073533)
Ohio Environmental Council
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449
trent@theoeg.org
cathy@theoec.org

Joel Malina
Executive Director
COMPLETE Coalition
1317 F Street, NW
Suite 600
Washington, DC 20004
malina@wexlerwalker.com

David M. Stahl
Arin C. Aragona
Scott C. Solberg
Eimer Stahl Klevorn & Solberg LLP
224 South Michigan Avenue, Suite 1100
Chicago, IL 60604
dstahl@eimerstahl.com
aaragona@eimerstahl.com
ssolberg@eimerstahl.com

Jay L. Kooper Katherine Guerry Hess Corporation One Hess Plaza Woodbridge, NJ 07095 jkooper@hess.com kguerry@hess.com

Robert Korandovich KOREnergy P. O. Box 148 Sunbury, OH 43074 korenergy@insight.rr.com Allen Freifeld
Samuel A. Wolfe
Viridity Energy, Inc.
100 West Elm Street, Suite 410
Conshohocken, PA 19428
afreifeld@viridityenergy.com
swolfe@viridityenergy.com

Mark A. Whitt Carpenter Lipps & Leland LLP 280 Plaza, Suite 1300 280 North High Street Columbus, Ohio 43215 whitt@carpenterlipps.com

11

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on** 

3/15/2012 5:13:19 PM

in

Case No(s). 10-2929-EL-UNC

Summary: Motion To Extend The Deadline For Testimony Or In The Alternative For Expedited Discovery And Request For Expedited Relief electronically filed by Mr. Nathaniel Trevor Alexander on behalf of FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.