

**BEFORE THE  
THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO**

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company and Columbus Southern Power Company for Authority to Merge and Related Approvals	) ) ) )	Case No. 10-2376-EL-UNC
In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company for Authority to Establish a Standard Service Offer Pursuant to §4928.143, Ohio Revs. Code, in the Form of an Electric Security Plan.	) ) ) ) ) )	Case No. 11-346-EL-SSO Case No. 11-348-EL-SSO
In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company for Approval of Certain Accounting Authority	) ) ) )	Case No. 11-349-EL-AAM Case No. 11-350-EL-AAM
In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company to Amend its Emergency Curtailment Service Riders	) ) ) )	Case No. 10-343-EL-ATA
In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company to Amend its Emergency Curtailment Service Riders	) ) ) )	Case No. 10-344-EL-ATA
In the Matter of the Commission Review of the Capacity Charges of Ohio Power Company and Columbus Southern Power Company.	) ) ) )	Case No. 10-2929-EL-UNC
In the Matter of the Application of Columbus Southern Power Company for Approval of a Mechanism to Recover Deferred Fuel Costs Ordered Under Ohio Revised Code 4928.144	) ) ) ) )	Case No. 11-4920-EL-RDR
In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company for Approval of a Mechanism to Recover Deferred Fuel Costs Ordered Under Ohio Revised Code 4928.144	) ) ) ) )	Case No. 11-4921-EL-RDR

---

**FIRSTENERGY SOLUTIONS CORP.'S MEMORANDUM CONTRA  
OHIO POWER COMPANY'S MOTION AND REQUEST FOR EXPEDITED RULING**

---

Ohio Power Company's Motion to ignore the Commission's orders in its January 23, 2011 Entry (the "January Entry") should be denied immediately. The Motion would allow Ohio Power Company ("AEP Ohio") to violate established Ohio law. It would also set a dangerous precedent whereby an applicant could implement unapproved (and unilateral) rates and terms of service pending an appeal. AEP Ohio's Motion is based solely on its complaints that it does not like the effect of the January Entry – or the Commission's underlying December 14, 2011 Order (the "Order") – and that it believes the January Entry would cause confusion. But, those complaints are more properly resolved through the appeal process. Until the resolution of any appeals, AEP Ohio should not be allowed to disregard the Commission's directives simply because it does not want to do what the Commission ordered it to do. Moreover, the Motion would increase the cost of capacity for customers who, but for AEP Ohio's proposed delay, would be entitled to lower cost capacity. For these reasons, the Motion should be denied.

## **I. ARGUMENT**

### **A. AEP Ohio must comply with the Commission's Entry clarifying its Order, which is immediately enforceable.**

AEP Ohio cites no law or authority in support of its request to ignore or "defer" the Commission's January Entry. There is none. To the contrary, Ohio law mandates that the Commission's Entry is effective immediately. Pursuant to R.C. § 4903.15, "[u]nless a different time is specified therein or by law, every order made by the public utilities commission shall become effective immediately upon entry thereof upon the journal of the public utilities commission." Here, the January Entry provided no "different time" and expressly "ordered" AEP Ohio to "revise the DIP [i.e., the Detailed Implementation Plan] filed December 29, 2011, to be consistent with this Entry" and to "file in final form four complete copies of the revised

DIP in Ohio Power's tariffs as clarified by this Entry."<sup>1</sup> Thus, by statute, AEP Ohio must do so "immediately." The January Entry is also immediately effective and enforceable given that its focus is on clarifying the Commission's Order. The January Entry only requires AEP Ohio to do what already was required of it by the Order.

Ohio law provides an avenue for a party to seek a stay of enforcement of a Commission order.<sup>2</sup> AEP Ohio has not sought such a remedy here. Thus, regardless of whether the January Entry is deemed a stand-alone order or a clarification and confirmation of the requirements set forth in the Order, AEP Ohio must immediately abide by its terms. There is no basis on which to delay AEP Ohio's compliance.

**B. To allow AEP Ohio to avoid the Commission's Entry would establish a dangerous and improper precedent.**

AEP Ohio's Motion essentially asks that AEP Ohio be allowed to disregard the fact that the January Entry ordered AEP Ohio to amend its DIP because the rates AEP Ohio seeks to charge under its "Compliance" DIP violate the Order.<sup>3</sup> In fact, AEP Ohio states that it *will* disregard the January Entry (and, thus, the Order) "[a]bsent further direction from the Attorney Examiners or the Commission."<sup>4</sup> If the Motion is granted (or even left pending for weeks), the door will be opened for any regulated entity to disregard a Commission order merely by filing a request for delay based solely on that entity's unhappiness. It would also allow a regulated entity

---

<sup>1</sup> January Entry, p. 9 (also noting that the Entry was entered into the journal on the same day, January 23, 2011).

<sup>2</sup> R.C. § 4903.16 (requiring an application to the Ohio Supreme Court and the posting of an appropriate bond); *see also In re Application of Columbus S. Power Co.*, 128 Ohio St.3d 512, 516 (2011), *quoting Keco Indus., Inc. v. Cincinnati & Suburban Bell Tel. Co.*, 166 Ohio St. 254, 257 (1957) ("This section makes 'clear that the General Assembly intended that a public utility shall collect the rates set by the commission's order, giving, however, to any person who feels aggrieved by such order a right to secure a stay of the collection of the new rates after posting a bond.'").

<sup>3</sup> For example, AEP Ohio's Motion asks that it be allowed to charge the \$255/MW-day capacity price to mercantile governmental aggregation customers even though the Order and the January Entry ordered AEP Ohio to provide RPM-priced capacity to such customers. *See, e.g.*, January Entry, p. 6.

<sup>4</sup> AEP Ohio Motion, p. 9.

to implement tariffs and procedures of its own design, even when those tariffs and procedures do not comply with the Commission's orders and, thus, were not approved by the Commission.

Such a precedent would undercut the Commission's authority as well as the well-established appeal process. Ohio law allows an aggrieved party (such as AEP Ohio here) to seek clarifications or changes to a Commission order through an application for rehearing and a subsequent appeal to the Ohio Supreme Court.<sup>5</sup> As AEP Ohio noted, "these matters can be sorted out on rehearing" and that is exactly the way the system is supposed to work. In the meantime, however, a Commission order must be followed. AEP Ohio should not be allowed to circumvent a Commission order simply because it does not like the effect of the order or because the order allegedly "involves significant financial cost to AEP Ohio" (an allegation for which AEP Ohio notably provides no support).<sup>6</sup> If customers must bear the cost when higher rates are later found to be unlawful,<sup>7</sup> so too must an EDU bear the cost if an order limiting its rates is later found to be unlawful.

**C. A delay in the enforcement of the Commission's Order would prejudice customers, hinder competition and not reduce confusion.**

AEP Ohio argues that requiring it to comply with the January Entry (and the Order) would create "the potential for confusion and uncertainty with regard to how the aggregation set-aside issues will be addressed."<sup>8</sup> But uncertainty is inherent in both the very process that AEP Ohio created, in addition to the appeal process as AEP Ohio would like it to unfold. None of the parties know how the Commission or the Ohio Supreme Court will resolve the myriad of issues raised by the parties' applications for rehearing. Ignoring the Commission's Order does not

---

<sup>5</sup> R.C. §§ 4903.10; 4903.13.

<sup>6</sup> AEP Ohio Motion, p. 4.

<sup>7</sup> See *In re Application of Columbus S. Power Co.*, 128 Ohio St.3d 512, 516 (2011) (holding that "the law does not allow refunds in appeals from commission orders" even where a rate increase is later found unlawful).

<sup>8</sup> AEP Ohio Motion, p. 8.

resolve that uncertainty. It would only allow AEP Ohio to implement unapproved rates and terms of service that prevent customers from accessing market-priced capacity.

In fact, the implementation of an unapproved DIP would heighten the inherent confusion surrounding AEP Ohio's RPM set-aside process – confusion that will hinder competition.<sup>9</sup> The delay requested by AEP Ohio will negatively impact the enrollment and allotment award process as it pertains to the pre-November governmental aggregation communities, to opt-in mercantile customers, and to those impacted by the pro rata allocation issue. Each day that AEP Ohio refuses to comply with the Commission's Order is an additional day that customers, who are eligible for RPM-priced capacity under the Order, are denied from accessing that capacity (and the benefits of competition) due to AEP Ohio's unapproved DIP. Delaying the enforcement of the January Entry and the Order simply provides AEP Ohio with yet another opportunity to unilaterally control the amount of shopping in its service territory while increasing confusion in the market. Thus, granting AEP Ohio's Motion (and, thereby allowing AEP Ohio to establish charges and terms of service that do not comply with the Commission's Order) is also inconsistent with the Commission's mission to facilitate competitive markets, which mission the Commission has repeatedly affirmed throughout this proceeding.

## **II. CONCLUSION**

For the reasons set forth above, FES respectfully requests that the Commission deny AEP Ohio's Motion.

---

<sup>9</sup> FES Post-hearing Brief, pp. 103-109; Direct Testimony of Tony C. Banks on behalf of FirstEnergy Solutions Corp., pp. 27-29.

Respectfully submitted,

s/ Laura C. McBride

---

Mark A. Hayden (0081077)  
FIRSTENERGY SERVICE COMPANY  
76 South Main Street  
Akron, OH 44308  
(330) 761-7735  
(330) 384-3875 (fax)  
haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

James F. Lang (0059668)  
Laura C. McBride (0080059)  
N. Trevor Alexander (0080713)  
CALFEE, HALTER & GRISWOLD LLP  
1400 KeyBank Center  
800 Superior Ave.  
Cleveland, OH 44114  
(216) 622-8200  
(216) 241-0816 (fax)  
jlang@calfee.com  
lmcbride@calfee.com  
talexander@calfee.com

David A. Kutik (0006418)  
JONES DAY  
901 Lakeside Avenue  
Cleveland, OH 44114  
(216) 586-3939  
(216) 579-0212 (fax)  
dakutik@jonesday.com

Allison E. Haedt (0082243)  
JONES DAY  
P.O. Box 165017  
Columbus, OH 43216-5017  
(614) 469-3939  
(614) 461-4198 (fax)  
aehaedt@jonesday.com

*Attorneys for FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.*

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of the foregoing *FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.'s Memorandum Contra AEP Ohio's Motion and Request for Expedited Ruling* was served this 27th day of January, 2012, via e-mail upon the parties below.

s/ Laura C. McBride

One of the Attorneys for FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.

Steven T. Nourse  
Matthew J. Satterwhite  
Anne M. Vogel  
American Electric Power Corp.  
1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
stnourse@aep.com  
mjsatterwhite@aep.com  
amvogel@aep.com

Dorothy K. Corbett  
Amy Spiller  
Duke Energy Retail Sales  
139 East Fourth Street  
1303-Main  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202  
dorothy.corbett@duke-energy.com  
amy.spiller@duke-energy.com

Daniel R. Conway  
Porter Wright Morris & Arthur  
41 South High Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
dconway@porterwright.com

David F. Boehm  
Michael L. Kurtz  
Boehm, Kurtz & Lowry  
36 East Seventh Street, Suite 1510  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202  
dboehm@bkllawfirm.com  
mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com

Cynthia Fonner Brady  
David I. Fein  
550 W. Washington Street, Suite 300  
Chicago, IL 60661  
cynthia.a.fonner@constellation.com  
david.fein@constellation.com

Terry L. Etter  
Maureen R. Grady  
Jeffrey L. Small  
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel  
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485  
etter@occ.state.oh.us  
grady@occ.state.oh.us  
small@occ.state.oh.us

Richard L. Sites  
Ohio Hospital Association  
155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3620  
ricks@ohanet.org

Thomas J. O'Brien  
Bricker & Eckler  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291  
tobrien@bricker.com

Shannon Fisk  
2 North Riverside Plaza, Suite 2250  
Chicago, IL 60606  
sfisk@nrdc.org

John W. Bentine  
Mark S. Yurick  
Zachary D. Kravitz  
Chester Willcox & Saxbe, LLP  
65 East State Street, Suite 1000  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
jbentine@cwsllaw.com  
myurick@cwsllaw.com  
zkravitz@cwsllaw.com

Terrence O'Donnell  
Christopher Montgomery  
Bricker & Eckler LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291  
todonnell@bricker.com  
cmontgomery@bricker.com

Jesse A. Rodriguez  
Exelon Generation Company, LLC  
300 Exelon Way  
Kennett Square, Pennsylvania 19348  
jesse.rodriguez@exeloncorp.com

Glen Thomas  
1060 First Avenue, Ste. 400  
King of Prussia, Pennsylvania 19406  
gthomas@gtpowergroup.com

Henry W. Eckhart  
2100 Chambers Road, Suite 106  
Columbus, Ohio 43212  
henryeckhart@aol.com

Christopher L. Miller  
Gregory H. Dunn  
Asim Z. Haque  
Stephen J. Smith  
Schottenstein Zox & Dunn Co., LPA  
250 West Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
cmiller@szd.com  
ahaque@szd.com  
ssmith@szd.com  
gdunn@szd.com

Jay E. Jadwin  
American Electric Power Service Corporation  
1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
jejadwin@aep.com

Michael R. Smalz  
Joseph V. Maskovyak  
Ohio Poverty Law Center  
555 Buttles Avenue  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
msmalz@ohiopoveritylaw.org  
jmaskovyak@ohiopoveritylaw.org

Lisa G. McAlister  
Matthew W. Warnock  
Bricker & Eckler LLP  
100 South Third Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291  
lmcaster@bricker.com  
mwarnock@bricker.com

William L. Massey  
Covington & Burling, LLP  
1201 Pennsylvania Ave., NW  
Washington, DC 20004  
wmassey@cov.com

Laura Chappelle  
4218 Jacob Meadows  
Okemos, Michigan 48864  
laurac@chappelleconsulting.net

Pamela A. Fox  
Law Director  
The City of Hilliard, Ohio  
pfox@hilliardohio.gov

M. Howard Petricoff  
Stephen M. Howard  
Michael J. Settineri  
Lija Kaleps-Clark  
Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP  
52 E. Gay Street  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
mhpeticoff@vorys.com  
smhoward@vorys.com  
mjsettineri@vorys.com  
lkalepsclark@vorys.com



Sandy Grace  
Exelon Business Services Company  
101 Constitution Avenue N.W., Suite 400 East  
Washington, DC 20001  
sandy.grace@exeloncorp.com

Gregory J. Poulos  
EnerNOC, Inc.  
101 Federal Street, Suite 1100  
Boston, MA 02110  
gpoulos@enernoc.com

Steve W. Chriss  
Wal-Mart Stores, Inc.  
2001 SE 10th Street  
Bentonville, Arkansas 72716  
stephen.chriss@wal-mart.com

Kenneth P. Kreider  
David A. Meyer  
Keating Muething & Klekamp PLL  
One East Fourth Street, Suite 1400  
Cincinnati, Ohio 45202  
kpkreider@kmmklaw.com  
dmeyer@kmmklaw.com

Philip B. Sineneng  
Terrance A. Mebane  
Carolyn S. Flahive  
Thompson Hine LLP  
41 S. High Street, Suite 1700  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
philip.sineneng@thompsonhine.com  
carolyn.flahive@thompsonhine.com  
terrance.mebane@thompsonhine.com

Gary A. Jeffries  
Dominion Resources Services, Inc.  
501 Martindale Street, Suite 400  
Pittsburgh, PA 15212-5817  
gary.a.jeffries@aol.com

Holly Rachel Smith  
Holly Rachel Smith, PLLC  
Hitt Business Center  
3803 Rectortown Road  
Marshall, Virginia 20115  
holly@raysmithlaw.com

Barth E. Royer  
Bell & Royer Co., LPA  
33 South Grant Avenue  
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3927  
barthroyer@aol.com

Werner L. Margard III  
John H. Jones  
William Wright  
Thomas Lindgren  
Assistant Attorneys General  
Public Utilities Section  
180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor  
Columbus, OH 43215  
werner.margard@puc.state.oh.us  
john.jones@puc.state.oh.us  
William.wright@puc.state.oh.us  
Thomas.Lindgren@puc.state.oh.us

Emma F. Hand  
Douglas G. Bonner  
Keith C. Nusbaum  
Clinton A. Vince  
SNR Denton US LLP  
1301 K Street, NW, Suite 600, East Tower  
Washington, DC 20005-3364  
emma.hand@snrdenton.com  
doug.bonner@snrdenton.com  
keith.nusbaum@snrdenton.com  
Clinton.vince@snrdenton.com

Samuel C. Randazzo  
Joseph E. Olikier  
Frank P. Darr  
McNees Wallace & Nurick  
21 East State Street, 17th Floor  
Columbus, Ohio 43215  
sam@mwncmh.com  
joliker@mwncmh.com  
fdarr@mwncmh.com

John N. Estes III  
Paul F. Wight  
Skadden, Arps, Slate, Meagher & Flom LLP  
1440 New York Ave., N.W.  
Washington, DC 20005  
jestes@skadden.com  
paul.wight@skadden.com

Tara C. Santarelli  
Environmental Law & Policy Center  
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  
Columbus, Ohio 43212  
tsantarelli@elpc.org

Joel Malina  
Executive Director  
COMPLETE Coalition  
1317 F Street, NW  
Suite 600  
Washington, DC 20004  
malina@wexlerwalker.com

Jay L. Kooper  
Katherine Guerri  
Hess Corporation  
One Hess Plaza  
Woodbridge, NJ 07095  
jkooper@hess.com  
kguerri@hess.com

Robert Korandovich  
KOREnergy  
P.O. Box 148  
Sunbury, OH 43074  
korenergy@insight.rr.com

Colleen L. Mooney  
David C. Rinebolt  
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy  
231 West Lima Street  
Findlay, Ohio 45840  
cmooney2@columbus.rr.com  
drinebolt@ohiopartners.org

Trent A. Dougherty  
Cathryn Loucas (0073533)  
Ohio Environmental Council  
1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201  
Columbus, Ohio 43212-3449  
trent@theoeg.org  
cathy@theoec.org

Christopher J. Allwein  
Williams, Allwein and Moser, LLC  
1373 Grandview Avenue, Suite 212  
Columbus, Ohio 43212  
callwein@williamsandmoser.com

David M. Stahl  
Arin C. Aragona  
Scott C. Solberg  
Eimer Stahl Klevorn & Solberg LLP  
224 South Michigan Avenue, Suite 1100  
Chicago, IL 60604  
dstahl@eimerstahl.com  
aaragona@eimerstahl.com  
ssolberg@eimerstahl.com

Allen Freifeld  
Samuel A. Wolfe  
Viridity Energy, Inc.  
100 West Elm Street, Suite 410  
Conshohocken, PA 19428  
afreifeld@viridityenergy.com  
swolfe@viridityenergy.com

**This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities**

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on**

**1/27/2012 1:40:36 PM**

**in**

**Case No(s). 10-2376-EL-UNC, 11-0346-EL-SSO, 11-0348-EL-SSO, 11-0349-EL-AAM, 11-0350-EL-AAM**

Summary: Memorandum Contra AEP Ohio's Motion and Request for Expedited Ruling  
electronically filed by Ms. Laura C. McBride on behalf of FirstEnergy Solutions Corp.