## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

)
) Case Nos. 09-1947-EL-POR ) 09-1948-EL-POR ) 09-1949-EL-POR )
) Case Nos. 09-1942-EL-EEC ) 09-1943-EL-EEC ) 09-1944-EL-EEC )
) Case Nos. 09-580-EL-EEC ) 09-581-EL-EEC ) 09-582-EL-EEC )

MOTION OF OHIO EDISON COMPANY, THE CLEVELAND ELECTRIC ILLUMINATING COMPANY AND THE TOLEDO EDISON COMPANY TO VACATE THE ATTORNEY EXAMINER'S SEPTEMBER 23, 2011 ENTRY, AND RELATED MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

Pursuant to Ohio Administrative Code § 4901-1-12, and for the reasons more fully discussed in the attached Memorandum in Support, Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and The Toledo Edison Company (collectively "Companies") hereby move to vacate the Attorney Examiner's September 23, 2011 Entry in which a procedural schedule was established for a prehearing and hearing in the above referenced docket "for the purpose of hearing evidence on the street lighting program, the residential energy efficient

products program as it relates to water heaters for customers with access to natural gas, and the shared savings mechanism."

Respectfully submitted,

Kathy J. Kolich, Counsel of Record

Carrie M. Dunn

FIRSTENERGY SERVICE COMPANY

76 South Main Street Akron, OH 44308

T: (330) 384-4580

F: (330) 384-3875

kjkolich@firstenergycorp.com cmdunn@firstenergycorp.com

James F. Lang
Laura C. McBride
N. Trevor Alexander
Kevin P. Shannon
CALFEE, HALTER & GRISWOLD LLP
1400 KeyBank Center
800 Superior Ave.
Cleveland, OH 44114
T: (216) 622-8200
F: (216) 241-0816
jlang@calfee.com

Imcbride@calfee.com talexander@calfee.com kshannon@calfee.com

ATTORNEYS FOR APPLICANTS, OHIO EDISON COMPANY, THE CLEVELAND ELECTRIC ILLUMINATING COMPANY, AND THE TOLEDO EDISON COMPANY

## MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO VACATE ENTRY

In a September 23, 2011 Entry issued in the instant action, the Attorney Examiner established a procedural schedule "for the purpose of hearing evidence on the street lighting program, the residential energy efficient products program as it relates to water heaters for customers with access to natural gas, and the shared savings mechanism." As more fully explained below, Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and The Toledo Edison Company (collectively, "Companies") do not believe that such a hearing is necessary at this time because the Companies do not wish to pursue the aforesaid energy efficiency programs at this time and because there is no shared savings mechanism to evaluate.

In the Commission's March 23, 2011 Opinion and Order issued in this proceeding, the Commission gave the Companies' the option to pursue the street lighting and water heater programs, saying:

The Commission finds that the evidence in the record of this proceeding does not support approval of the street lighting program and the residential energy efficient products program as it relates to water heaters for customers who have access to natural gas as well as the shared savings mechanism discussed above. Therefore, further proceedings are necessary regarding the street lighting programs, the residential energy efficient products program as it relates to water heaters, and shared savings; and the Commission will direct the attorney examiner to schedule an additional hearing regarding these programs should the Companies wish to pursue them.<sup>2</sup>

In that same Opinion and Order, the Commission deferred ruling on the shared savings mechanism, directing the Staff to develop a strawman proposal for consideration by interested stakeholders:

[T]he Commission will defer ruling on the [Companies'] proposed shared savings mechanism until further proceedings regarding the Companies' portfolio programs; in the meantime, [the] Commission directs Staff to prepare a proposal for an incentive

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>This Docket, Entry, p. 2 (Sept. 23, 2011)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> This Docket, Opinion and Order, pp. 22-23 (Mar. 23, 2011) (italics added).

mechanism which addresses the issues raised by the Commission and to distribute such proposed incentive mechanism to a range of stakeholders.<sup>3</sup>

In light of the dates set forth in the procedural schedule, the fact that pro rata savings is based on the date on which the program measures are installed, and the anticipated timeline for a decision on the subject matter, the Companies have elected not to pursue either the street lighting program or the residential water heater program at this time. These programs will be reevaluated and vetted with the Companies' Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand Reduction Collaborative Group as part of the development of the Companies' next three year program portfolio, which is now underway. Moreover, because the Staff has yet to provide a strawman proposal for a shared savings mechanism, it is virtually impossible for the Companies to prepare a case for an evidentiary hearing on the subject.

Therefore, based upon the foregoing, the Companies respectfully request that the Attorney Examiner's September 23, 2011 Entry be vacated and the procedural schedule included therein either cancelled or suspended until a shared savings mechanism is proposed consistent with the Commission's directive and all interested parties have had the opportunity to evaluate it.

Respectfully submitted,

Kathy J. Kolich, Counsel of Record

Carrie M. Dunn

FIRSTENERGY SERVICE COMPANY

76 South Main Street Akron, OH 44308

(330) 384-4580

(330) 384-3875 (fax)

kjkolich@firstenergycorp.com cmdunn@firstenergycorp.com

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> This Docket, Opinion and Order (Mar. 23, 2011).

James F. Lang
Laura C. McBride
N. Trevor Alexander
Kevin P. Shannon
CALFEE, HALTER & GRISWOLD LLP
1400 KeyBank Center
800 Superior Ave.
Cleveland, OH 44114
(216) 622-8200
(216) 241-0816 (fax)
jlang@calfee.com
lmcbride@calfee.com
talexander@calfee.com
kshannon@calfee.com

ATTORNEYS FOR OHIO EDISON COMPANY, THE CLEVELAND ELECTRIC ILLUMINATING COMPANY, AND THE TOLEDO EDISON COMPANY

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that this Motion to Vacate the Attorney Examiner's September 23, 2011 Entry and related Memorandum in Support was filed electronically this 30<sup>th</sup> day of September, 2011, with the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System. Notice of this filing will be sent via e-mail to the parties as set forth below.

Kathy J. Kolien, Esquire

Craig I. Smith Attorney at Law 2824 Coventry Road Cleveland, OH 44120 wis29@yahoo.com

Jeffrey L. Small (Counsel of Record)
Terry L. Etter
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, OH 43215-3485
small@occ.state.oh.us
etter@occ.state.oh.us

Samuel Randazzo (Counsel of Record) MCNEES WALLACE & NURICK LLC Fifth Third Center 21 East State Street, 17th Floor Columbus, OH 43215-4228 sam@mwncmh.com

David F. Boehm, Esq.
Michael L. Kurtz, Esq.
BOEHM, KURTZ & LOWRY
36 East Seventh Street
Suite 1510
Cincinnati, OH 45202
dboehm@bkllawfirm.com
mkurtz@bkllawfirm.com

Thomas J. O'Brien BRICKER & ECKLER LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 43215-4291 tobrien@bricker.com Thomas Lindgren
Attorney General's Office
Public Utilities Section
180 East Broad Street, 6<sup>h</sup> Floor
Columbus, OH 43215
thomas.lindgren@puc.state.oh.us

David C. Rinebolt
Colleen L. Mooney
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
P.O. Box 1793
Findlay, OH 45839-1793
drinebolt@aol.com
cmooney2@columbus.rr.com

Glenn S. Krassen BRICKER & ECKLER LLP 1001 Lakeside Avenue, East Suite 1350 Cleveland, OH 44114-1142 GKrassen@Bricker.com

Matthew W. Warnock BRICKER & ECKLER LLP 100 South Third Street Columbus, OH 43215 MWarnock@Bricker.com

Michael K. Lavanga
mkl@bbrslaw.com
Counsel of Record
Garrett A. Stone
gas@bbrslaw.com
Brickfield, Burchette, Ritts & Stone, P.C.
1025 Thomas Jefferson Street, N.W.

Richard L. Sites General Counsel & Sr. Director of Health Policy OHIO HOSPITAL ASSOCIATION 155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor Columbus, OH 43215-3620 ricks@ohanet.org

Nolan Moser Trent. A. Dougherty The Ohio Environmental Council 1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201 Columbus, OH 4321 nmoser@theOEC.org trent@theOEC.org

Joseph P. Meissner, Esq.
Matthew D. Vincel, Esq.
The Legal Aid Society of Cleveland
1223 W. 6th Street
Cleveland, OH 44113
jpmeissn@lasclev.org
mvincel@lasclev.org

Michael E Heintz Environmental Law & Policy Center 1207 Grandview Avenue, Suite 201 Columbus, OH 43204 mheintz@elpc.org

Robert Kelter Environmental Law & Policy Center 35 E. Wacker Drive Suite 1600 Chicago, IL 60601 rkelter@elpc.org 8<sup>th</sup> Floor, West Tower Washington, DC 20007

Henry W. Eckhart Rebecca Riley 50 West Broad Street, #2117 Columbus, OH 43215 henryeckhart @aol.com

Theodore J. Robinson 2121 Murray Avenue Pittsburgh, PA 15217 robinson@citizenpower.com

Christopher L. Miller Gregory H. Dunn Schottenstein Zox & Dunn Co. LPA 250 West Broad Street Columbus, OH 43215 cmiller@szd.com gdunn@szd.com

Robert J. Triozzi
Director of Law, City of Cleveland, Ohio
Steven Beeler
Assistant Director of Law, City of
Cleveland, Ohio
Cleveland City Hall
601 Lakeside Avenue, Room 106
Cleveland, OH 44114
RTriozzi@city.cleveland.oh.us
SBeeler@city.cleveland.oh.us

Nicolas C. Youk
Attorney for the Ohio Hospital Association
Tucker Ellis & West LLP
1225 Huntington Center
41 South High Street
Columbus, OH 43215-6197
nicholas.york@tuckerellis.com

This foregoing document was electronically filed with the Public Utilities

**Commission of Ohio Docketing Information System on** 

9/30/2011 5:23:48 PM

in

Case No(s). 09-1948-EL-POR, 09-1947-EL-POR, 09-1949-EL-POR, 09-1942-EL-EEC, 09-1944-EL-EEC

Summary: Motion to Vacate the Attorney Examiner's September 23, 2011 Entry electronically filed by Ms. Kathy J Kolich on behalf of Ohio Edison Company and The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and The Toledo Edison Company