BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of Application of Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. for Authority to))	EL		
Establish a Standard Service Offer)	Case No. 11-3549-SSO		
Pursuant to Section 4928.143, Revised)			R
Code, in the form of an Electric Security)			ECE 2011
Plan, Accounting Modifications and)		1.11 - 1.20 ¹⁷ - 2	IVED
Tariffs for Generation Service.	}		ب	RECEIVED-DOCKETING DIV 2011 SEP 28 PM 4: 30
				8 00
In the Matter of Application of Duke `)		$\tilde{\frown}$	PH A
Energy Ohio, Inc. for Authority to	}	Case No. 11-3550-EL-ATA	\sim	TING DI 4: 30
Amend its Certified Supplier Tariff)			30
PUCO No. 20.				ni j _{ene}
In the Matter of Application of Duke	·)			
Energy Ohio Inc. for Authority to)	Case No. 11-3551-EL-UNC		
Amend its Corporate Separation Plan.)			

REPLY OF THE SIERRA CLUB TO MEMORANDUM CONTRA SIERRA CLUB'S MOTION TO INTERVENE AND REQUEST FOR LEAVE TO FILE MOTION TO INTERVENE OUT OF TIME

The Sierra Club ("Sierra Club") filed its' Motion To Intervene and Request for Leave To File Motion To Intervene Out Of Time with the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio ("Commission") on September 20, 2011. Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. ("Duke") filed its' Memorandum Contra the Sierra Club Motion to Intervene And Request For Leave To File Motion Out of Time on September 26, 2011.

The Sierra Club believes that it should be granted its' Request For Leave To file its' Motion Out of Time and that its' Motion to Intervene should also be granted, for the following reasons:

- There are already approximately 30 parties which have been granted leave to intervene and the one additional party of the Sierra Club will not unduly prolong or delay the proceedings.
- 2. The current procedural schedule for the proceedings, as set out in the Entry of August 26 2011, does not even require the testimony of intervenors to be filed before October 5, 2011. The discovery requests, except for notices of depositions may be served by October 7, 2011. Testimony of the Commission Staff should be filed by October 13, 2011. And the evidentiary hearing shall only commence on October 20, 2011.
- 3. Duke was still issuing Amended notices to take depositions of numerous parties on September 12, 2011. The depositions being noticed are not even scheduled to take place until October 12-14, 2011
- 4. The Commission has always advocated a liberal policy on granting intervention.
- 5. The Sierra Club has already been granted Leave to Intervene in a companion Duke Case No. 11-4393-EL-RDR.
- 6. The Docket in these cases demonstrates that there is still a significant amount of discovery taking place among a number of the parties.
- 7. The Commission, in these very cases, previously granted Motions for Leave To File Motion to Intervene Out of Time on July 22, 2011 to Cincinnati Bell, Inc. and to Dominion Retail, Inc. The Commission has also granted a Motion for Leave to Intervene Out of Time to the Council of Smaller Enterprises by Entry dated July 29, 2011

- 8. The primary interest of the Sierra Club is in supporting Duke's enhanced cost recovery issue, and to participate in any settlement issues which may arise.
- 9. There will be no prejudice to any party by the Commission granting the Request For Leave To File Motion to Intervene Out of Time and by granting the Motion To Intervene.

SUMMARY

The Sierra Club therefore renews also its' request that the Commission entertain its Motion to intervene, notwithstanding that it is being filed after the specified due and grant the Motion to Intervene itself. If the motion to intervene is granted the Sierra Club will accept the record as it exists at that time.

Respectfully submitted

Henry W. Eckhart, Counsel of Record For the Sierra Club

1200 Chambers Road, Suite 106 Columbus OH 43212-1703 Phone: (614) 461-0984 Fax: (614) 485-9487 E-mail: <u>henryeckhart@aol.com</u>

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned hereby certifies that he has served a copy of the foregoing Reply upon the following listed parties by ordinary first class mail, postage prepaid or by electronic service this 28th day of September, 2011.

ţ

Elizabeth A. Watts & Amy Spiller Duke Energy Ohio, Inc. 139 4th Street, 1300 Main P. O. Box 961 Cincinnati OH 45201 <u>Elizabeth.Watts@duke-energy.com</u>

Tara Santarelli Environmental law and Policy Center 1207 Grandview Avenue Columbus OH 43212 tsantarelli@elpc.org

Mary Christiansen 8760 Orion Place, Suite 300 Columbus OH 43240 <u>mchristiansen@columbuslaw.org</u>

Mary Yost & Joseph Serio Ohio Consumers' Counsel 10 West Broad Street, #1800 Columbus Oh 43215 <u>small@occ.state.oh.us</u> serio@occ.state.oh.us yost@occ.state.oh.us

Gregory J. Poulos Enernoc, Inc. 101 Federal Street #1100 Boston MA 02110 gpoulos@eneroc.com

Rick D. Chamberlain Behrens Wheeler & Chamberlain 6 N E 63rd Street Suite 400 Oklahoma City OK 73105

Erin C. Miller AEP Power Service Corp 1 Riverside Plaza 29th Flr Columbus OH 43215 Colleen Mooney Ohio Partners For Affordable Energy 231 West Lima Street Findlay OH 45840 cmooney2@columbus.rr.com

Joseph M Clark Vectren Source 6641 North High Street. Suite 200 Worthington OH 43085 jmclark@vectren.com

Christopher Allwein 1373 Grandview Avenue, Suite 212 Columbus OH 43212 <u>callwein@williamsandmoser.com</u>

David F. Boehm & Jody Kyler Ohio Energy Group, Inc. 36 E. Seventh Street, Suite 1510 Cincinnati OH 45202 <u>ikyler@bkllawfirm.com</u>

Trent A. Daugherty Ohio Environmental Council 1207 Grandview Avenue Columbus OH 43212 <u>trent@theoec.org</u>

Douglas E Hart 441 Vine Street, Suite 4192 Cincinnati OH 45202 dhart@douglasehart.com Jouett Brenzel 221 E Fourth St #103-1280 Cincinnati OH 45202 jourettbenzel@cinbell.com

Zachery Kravitz Chester Wilcox & Saxbe 65 East State St. Suite 1000 Columbus OH n43215 skravitz@cwslaw.com

William L Massey Covington & Burling 1201 Pennsylvania Ave, NW Washington DC 20004-2401 wmassey@cov.com

Barth E Royer Bell & Royer 33 South Grant Avenue Columbus OH 43215-3927 broyer@aol.com

M Howard Petricoff Vorys Sater 52 E Gay Street P O Box 1008 Columbus Oh 43216-1008 mkpetricoff@vorys.com

Joseph E Oliker & Sam Randazzo McNee Wallace 21 East State Street Columbus OH 43215 <u>sam@mwn@cmh.com</u> Thomas O'Brien Bricker & Eckler 100 South Third St Columbus OH 43215-4291 tobrien@bricker.com

Dane Stinson Bailey Cavalieri 10 West Broad Street #2100 Columbus OH 43215 Dane.simpson@baileycavalieri.com

Andrew J Sonderman Kegler Brown Hill 65 East State Street #1800 Columbus OH 43215 asonderman@keglerbrown.com

Allison E. Haedt Jones Day 325 John H McConnell Blvd #600 Columbus OH 43215-2673 <u>aheadt@jonesday.com</u>

Matthew S White IGS 6100 Emerald Parkway Dublin OH 43015

Michael L Kurtz 36 East State St #1510 Cincinnati OH 45202 mkurtz@BKLfirm.com Lisa McAlister Bricker & Eckler 100 South Third St. Columbus OH 43215-4291 Imcalister@bricker.com

Mark S Yurik & John Bentine 65 East State St #1000 Columbus OH 43215-4213 myurik@cwslaw.com Jbentine@cwslaw.com Stephen M. Howard Vorys Sater 52 East Gay St P O Box 1008 Columbus OH 43215-1008 <u>smhoward@vorys.com</u> <u>mhpetricoff@vorys.com</u>

Kevin J Osterkamp Roetzel & Andrews 155 East Broad Street 12th FIr Columbus OH 43215

ephai Henry W.

Henry W. Eckhaft (0020202) Counsel of Record for the Sierra Club 1200 Chambers Road, Suite 106 Phone: (614) 461-0984 Fax: (614) 485-9487 E-mail: henryeckhart@aol.com