FILE

BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

SSION OF OHIO	70	N N	-03/
	<u>_</u>	22	000
Case No. 10-2376-E	L-UNC	PH	KETI
	U	1: 26	IN SIM

In the Matter of the Application of Ohio Power Company and Columbus Southern Power Company for Authority to Merge And Related Approvals.

THE OHIO CABLE TELECOMMUNICATIONS ASSOCIATION'S REPLY IN SUPPORT OF ITS MOTION TO INTERVENE

Columbus Southern Power Company and Ohio Power Company (collectively the "Companies") filed a Memorandum Contra to Ohio Cable Telecommunications Association's motion to intervene on June 15, 2011. The Companies misinterpret and misapply the statutory requirements for intervention in order to argue that the intervention of the Ohio Cable Telecommunications Association ("OCTA") should be denied as untimely. As shown in OCTA's motion to intervene, OCTA meets the statutory standards for intervention as the intervention is timely, will not delay the proceedings, and OCTA has a unique knowledge and experience to offer to the Commission's determination in this case that is not adequately represented by other parties.

A. OCTA's Motion to Intervene is Timely in Accordance with Rule 4901-1-11(E)

Ohio Administrative Code Rule 4901-1-11(E) provides that a motion to intervene will not be considered timely if (a) "it is filed later than five days prior to the scheduled date of hearing" or (2) later than "any specific deadline established by order of the commission for purposes of a particular proceeding." The Commission has not set a hearing date in this proceeding and the Commission has not set a specific deadline for motions to intervene. Thus, in accordance with the rule, OCTA's motion to intervene is timely.

The Companies assert that because OCTA has filed its motion to intervene after the Commission's deadline for initial comments, OCTA's motion is untimely, and thus may only be granted under extraordinary circumstances. The Companies incorrectly interpret Rule 4901-1-11(E) to state that motions filed after *any* deadline established by the Commission in the proceeding renders such a motion

This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete reproduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of business sechnician Date Processed (0/39/2)

untimely. This interpretation is an overly broad and prejudicial interpretation of the intervention statute that is inconsistent with prior Commission interpretations and the language of the rule.

The Commission has consistently interpreted the phrase "specific deadline" to refer to a specific intervention deadline, not any deadline established in the case. The Companies' proposed interpretation of the intervention standard may limit participation in Commission proceedings by foreclosing a party from participating because the party did not file an intervention before the date of any deadline set in the case. Such an interpretation would set a precedent restricting intervention and participation in future Commission proceedings. It also ignores the ongoing process in this proceeding that could include a hearing, stipulation or other orders that address issues in the merger that could affect OCTA and its members. Also significant is that the Companies' interpretation of Rule 4901-1-11 is directly contrary to the Ohio Supreme Court's mandate that the standard for intervention be "generally liberally construed in favor of intervention."

B. OCTA Meets the Remaining Standards for Intervention

Pole attachment rates are a significant issue in the cable telecommunications industry and are affected by the proposed merger. Although other existing intervenors may seek to ensure that the proposed merger is in the public interest and will not result in unreasonable rates, no other party in this case has intervened to protect the unique interests of companies providing communications services similar to those of OCTA. Thus, the interests of OCTA are not currently represented by any other party to the proceeding. As a result, OCTA's unique knowledge and expertise with regard to communications services will significantly contribute to the full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues

¹ In the Matter of the Petition of The Avon Lake Subscribers of The Century Telephone Company of Ohio, Case No. 93-911-TP-PEX, Entry, Feb. 17, 1995 ("Since there was no specific Commission order as to when intervention motions needed to be filed, the IXCs' motion should have been filed [five days before the hearing], in order to be found timely.") (emphasis added); In the Matter of the Continuation of the Rate Freeze and Extension of the Market Development Period for The Dayton Power and Light Company, Case No. 02-2779-EL-ATA, et al., Opinion and Order, Sept. 2, 2003 ("Ohio law provides that a motion to intervene will not be considered timely if it is filed later than either five days before the scheduled date of the hearing on the matter or the specific deadline established for intervention in the particular matter.") (emphasis added).

² Ohio Consumers' Counsel v. PUC, 111 Ohio St. 384, 386 (2006).

addressed in this merger. Further, only initial comments have been filed in this case, and no hearing date or further proceedings have been set. Thus, OCTA's intervention in this case will not cause delay to the proceedings.

For these reasons, OCTA respectfully requests that the Commission find that OCTA's motion to intervene be granted in accordance with Section 4903.221, Revised Code and Ohio Administrative Code Rule 4901-1-11.

Respectfully submitted,

Benita Kahn

(0018363)

Lija Kaleps-Clark (0086445)

The Houty Vorys, Sater, Seymour and Pease LLP 52 East Gay Street, P.O. Box 1008

Columbus, Ohio 43216-1008

Tel: (614) 464-6487 Fax: (614) 719-4792

E-mail: bakahn@vorys.com

Attorneys for The Ohio Cable Telecommunications Association

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that a true and accurate copy of the foregoing Motion to Intervene was served upon the following persons via email this 22nd day of June, 2011.

Lija Kaleps-Clark

John W. Bentine
Mark S. Yurick
Chester Willcox & Saxbe, LLP
65 East State Street, Suite 1000
Columbus, Ohio 43215
jbentine@cwslaw.com
myurick@cwslaw.com
zkravitz@cwslaw.com

William Wright Assistant Attorney General Chief, Public Utilities Section 180 E. Broad Street, 6th Fl. Columbus, OH 43215-3793

Cynthia Fonner Brady Senior Counsel Constellation Energy Resources, LLC 550 W. Washington St. Chicago, IL 60661

Dorothy K. Corbett Associate General Counsel Duke Energy Business Services, LLC P.O. Box 960 -139 E. Fourth St. Cincinnati, OH 45202 Michael R. Smalz
Joseph V. Maskovyak
Ohio Poverty Law Center
555 Buttles Avenue
Columbus, Ohio 43215
msmalz@ohiopovertylaw.org
jmaskovyak@ohiopovertylaw.org

Lisa G. McAlister
Thomas J. O'Brien
Bricker & Eckler LLP
100 South Third Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215-4291
lmcalister@bricker.com
tobrien@bricker.com

Richard L. Sites
Ohio Hospital Association
155 East Broad Street, 15th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3620
ricks@ohanet.org

Maureen R. Grady
Terry L. Etter
Jody Kyler
Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel
10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800
Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485
grady@occ.state.oh.us
idzkowski@occ.state.oh.us
reese@occ.state.oh.us

Samuel C. Randazzo
Joseph E. Oliker
Frank P. Darr
McNees Wallace & Nurick
21 East State Street, 17th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
sam@mwncmh.com
joliker@mwncmh.com
fdarr@mwncmh.com

David C. Rinebolt
Colleen L. Mooney
Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy
231 West Lima Street
Findlay, Ohio 45840
cmooney2@columbus.rr.com

Clinton A. Vince
Douglas G. Bonner
Daniel D. Bamowski
Emma F. Hand
Keith C. Nusbaum
SNR Denton US LLP
1301 K Street NW
Suite 600, East Tower
Washington, DC 20005
cvince@sonnenschein.com
dbonner@sonnenschein.com
dan.bamowski@snrdenton.com
ehand@sonnenschein.com
keith.nusbaum@snrdenton.com

David A. Kutik Jones Day North Point 901 Lakeside Ave. Cleveland, OH 44114

Grant W. Garber

hington, DC 20005

ce@sonnenschein.com
nner@sonnenschein.com
bamowski@snrdenton.com

d@sonnenschein.com

Mark A. Hayden
FirstEnergy Service Company
76 South Main Street
Akron. OH 44308
haydenm@firstenergycorp.com

Steven T. Nourse
Matthew J. Satterwhite
American Electric Power Corp.
1 Riverside Plaza, 29th Floor
Columbus, Ohio 43215
stnourse@aep.com
mjsatterwhite@aep.com