FILE

## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO			D PH L		
In the Matter of the Energy Efficiency and Peak Demand Reduction Program	)		CO	1.15	
Portfolio of Ohio Edison Company,	)	Case No. 09-951-EL-EEC			
The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company, and The Toledo Edison	)	09-952-EL-EEC 09-953-EL-EEC		. <b>`</b>	
Company.	)				

# SUPPLEMENTAL MOTION FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER BY THE OFFICE OF THE OHIO CONSUMERS' COUNSEL AND THE NATURAL RESOURCES DEFENSE COUNCIL

The Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel ("OCC") and the Natural Resources

Defense Council ("NRDC") submit this Supplemental Motion for Protective Order.¹

Concurrently with this Supplemental Motion for Protective Order ("Supplemental

Motion"), the OCC and the NRDC file attachments that were inadvertently omitted from
the Second Motion for Hearing that was filed on January 6, 2011. A redacted version of
the attachments is being publicly filed and an unredacted (confidential) version of the
attachments is being filed under seal with this Supplemental Motion. While the OCC and
NRDC already filed a Motion for Protective Order on January 6, 2011, this Supplemental
Motion is submitted in order to protect information contained in attachments to the
Second Motion for Hearing that Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric
Illuminating Company and The Toledo Edison Company (collectively, "FirstEnergy

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-02(E), 4901-1-12, and 4901-1-24(D)(3).

The reasons supporting this Supplemental Motion are set forth in the attached Memorandum in Support.

Respectfully submitted,

JANINE L. MIGDEN-OSTRANDER

CONSUMERS' COUNSEL

Jeffrey L. Small, Counsel of Record

Terry L. Etter

Assistant Consumers' Counsel

Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800 Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485 Telephone: (614) 466-8574

small@occ.state.oh.us etter@occ.state.oh.us

Henry W. Eckhart
50 W. Broad St., #2117 for Short authorization
Columbus, OH 43215

Columbus, OH 43215

Phone: (614) 461-0984 Fax: (614) 221-7401 henryeckhart@aol.com

**Counsel for the NRDC** 

### BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

In the Matter of the Energy Efficiency	)	
and Peak Demand Reduction Program	)	
Portfolio of Ohio Edison Company,	)	Case No. 09-951-EL-EEC
The Cleveland Electric Illuminating	)	09-952-EL-EEC
Company, and The Toledo Edison	)	09-953-EL-EEC
Company.	)	

#### MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT

Concurrently with this Supplemental Motion, a letter of transmittal is filed along with attachments to a Second Motion for Hearing that was filed on January 6, 2011. The OCC and the NRDC submit both a redacted version for the public filing and an unredacted version under seal, consistent with the procedures stated in Ohio Adm. Code 4901-1-24(D)(1) and (2). The attachments to the Second Motion for Hearing contain some information that FirstEnergy EDUs assert to be confidential. Specifically, the attachments to the Second Motion for Hearing contain discovery responses alleged to be confidential information by the FirstEnergy EDUs that provide details regarding the transmission and distribution projects described in the Application.

The OCC and the NRDC might not agree with the FirstEnergy EDUs regarding the confidential nature of all of the protected information contained in the discovery responses, and makes no concession in that regard. Nevertheless, the OCC and the NRDC take this step to protect the information, consistent with the terms of its protective agreements with the FirstEnergy EDUs, to ensure that the information is protected under seal pursuant to the FirstEnergy EDUs' claim of confidentiality. The OCC and the

NRDC, however, reserve the right to challenge the confidentiality of any and all information that the FirstEnergy EDUs assert to be confidential.

Respectfully submitted,

JANINE L. MIGDEN-OSTRANDER CONSUMERS' COUNSEL

Jeffrey L. Small, Counsel of Record

Terry L. Etter

Assistant Consumers' Counsel

Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800 Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485 Telephone: (614) 466-8574

small@occ.state.oh.us etter@occ.state.oh.us

50 W. Broad St., #2117 M Jame authoryptin, Columbus, OH 43215
Phone: (614) 461-0004 Phone: (614) 461-0984

Fax: (614) 221-7401 henryeckhart@aol.com

Counsel for the NRDC

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of this Supplemental Motion for Protective Order was electronically served on the persons stated below this 10<sup>th</sup> day of January 2011. Parties were also served with a redacted public version of attachments that are the subject of this Supplemental Motion for Protective Order (and the FirstEnergy EDUs were served with an unredacted confidential version).

Jeffrey L/. mall

**Assistant Consumers' Counsel** 

#### **SERVICE LIST**

Kathy J. Kolich FirstEnergy Service Company 76 South Main Street Akron, OH 44308 kjkolich@firstenergycorp.com

Attorney for FirstEnergy

Henry W. Eckhart 50 West Broad Street, Suite 2117 Columbus, OH 43215 henryeckhart@aol.com

Attorney for the Natural Resources
Defense Council

Thomas McNamee
William Wright
Assistant Attorney General
Public Utilities Commission of Ohio
180 E. Broad St., 6<sup>th</sup> Fl.
Columbus, OH 43215
Thomas.mcnamee@puc.state.oh.us
William.wright@puc.state.oh.us

Will Reisinger
Nolan Moser
Trent Dougherty
The Ohio Environmental Council
1207 Grandview Ave. Suite 201
Columbus, OH 43212-3449
nmoser@theOEC.org
will@theOEC.org
trent@theOEC.org

Todd M. Williams P.O. Box 6885 Toledo, OH 43612 williams.toddm@gmail.com

Attorney for the Ohio Environmental Council

James F. Lang
Kevin P. Shannon
Calfee, Halter & Griswold LLP
1400 KeyBank Center
800 Superior Ave.
Cleveland, OH 44114
jlang@calfee.com
kshannon@calfee.com

Attorneys for Applicants, Ohio Edison Company, The Cleveland Electric Illuminating Company and The Toledo Edison Company David C. Rinebolt Colleen C. Mooney Ohio Partners for Affordable Energy P.O. Box 1793 Findlay, OH 45839-1793 cmooney2@columbus.rr.com drinebolt@aol.com

Theodore S. Robinson Staff Attorney Citizen Power 2121 Murray Avenue Pittsburgh, PA 15217 robinson@citizenpower.com

Attorney for Citizen Power