

Chief of Docketing The Public Utilities Commission of Ohio 180 East Broad Street Columbus, Ohio 43215-3793

October 13, 2010

PUCO 2

SUBJECT: In Re Case No. 10-200-GA-ATA

Dear friends,

We are faxing our Motion to Intervene for the above case. We are also sending the requisite copies and the original by overnight express mail.

We are including an extra copy to be time-stamped and returned to us. We have also enclosed an envelope addressed back to us.

Thank you.

Venv ruly yours. MEISSNER, 0022366 **IOSEPH** ATTORNEY AT LAW Counsel for Citizens Goalition This is to certify that the images appearing are an accurate and complete repreduction of a case file document delivered in the regular course of Technician Date Processed

#### www.lasclev.org

#### Main Office

1223 West Sixth Street Cleveland, OH 44113

Phone: 216.687.1900 Fax: 216.687.0779 Ashtabula County

121 East Walnut Street Jefferson, OH 44047

Phone: 866.873.9665 Fax: 440.576.3021 Lake & Geauga

8 North State St - Ste 300 Painesville, OH 44077

Phone: 888.808.2800 Fax: 440.352.0015 Lorain County

538 West Broad St · Ste 300 Elyria, OH 44035

醖 LSC

Phone: 800.444.7348 Fax: 440.323.8526

## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

)

)

)

)

In the Matter of the Application of The East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion East Ohio to File Revised Tariffs Extending Its Low Income Pilot Program

Case No. 10-200-GA-ATA

# MOTION TO INTERVENE AND COMMENTS BY THE CITIZENS COALITION

MOTION TO INTERVENE FILED ON BEHALF OF THE NEIGHBORHOOD ENVIRONMENTAL COALITION THE EMPOWERMENT CENTER OF GREATER CLEVELAND, CLEVELAND HOUSING NETWORK UNITED CLEVELANDERS AGAINST POVERTY, AND THE CONSUMERS FOR FAIR UTILITY RATES MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT, AND COMMENTS

Now comes The Neighborhood Environmental Coalition (hereinafter "Coalition"), The Consumers for Fair Utility Rates (hereinafter "Consumers"), The Cleveland Housing Network (hereinafter "Network"), United Clevelanders against Poverty (hereinafter "Clevelanders"), and The Empowerment Center of Greater Cleveland (hereinafter "Center") who, through their counsel, hereby Move to Intervene in the above-captioned matters pursuant to Ohio Law, The Rules and Regulations pertaining to the Public Utilities Commission of Ohio, and the relevant case law. All five of the interveners are hereinafter referred to as "The Citizens Coalition." The Citizens Coalition specifically seeks the full powers and rights granted by the Commission specifically, by statute and by the provisions of the Ohio Administrative Code to intervening parties.

The reasons for granting this Motion are contained in the Memorandum in Support attached hereto and hereby incorporated herein.

The Citizens Coalition also is filing some Comments concerning this proceeding and the Pilot Program.

Respectfully submitted. Joseph P. **ssner** #002236 1ei Aid Society of Cleveland The Legal 1223 West 6 Street Cleveland, OH 44113 Telephone: (216).687.1900, Est. 56 Email: jpmeissn@laselev.org

Counsel for: Neighborhood Environmental Coalition, Consumers for Fair Utility Rates Cleveland Housing Network United Clevelanders Against Poverty and The Empowerment Center of Greater Cleveland

# BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF OHIO

)

)

)

)

In the Matter of the Application of The East Ohio Gas Company d/b/a Dominion East Ohio to File Revised Tariffs Extending Its Low Income Pilot Program

Case No. 10-200-GA-ATA

## MEMORANDUM IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO INTERVENE AND COMMENTS

All five of the groups in the Citizens Coalition should be permitted to intervene in these matters pursuant to CivR. 24 and Rule 4901-1-11 OHIO ADMINISTRATIVE CODE. All five groups specifically meet the criteria for intervention pursuant to OAC 4901-1-11(A)(2) and (B).

On October 15, 2008, the PUCO submitted its Opinion and Order in the Dominion Rate Case, Case No. 07-829-GA-AIR. The Citizens Coalition was extremely concerned about that Order and Opinion because, contrary to much relevant public testimony, the Commission imposed the Straight Fixed Variable ("SFV") rate design. The Coalition was concerned that this rate design with its very high customer charges would hurt low income families who are low users and seek to conserve. The Commission ordered DEO to establish a Pilot Program, lasting one year and directed toward assisting low-income, low-use customers pay their bills

Now the Pilot Program is to be evaluated. The Citizens Coalition which is especially concerned about low-income families and their ongoing hardships at paying burdensome DEO gas bills want to insure that a proper, comprehensive, and objective evaluation is conducted on this Pilot Program.

In support of its Motion to Intervene, the Citizens Coalition notes that they are citizens groups whose members and supporters are seriously affected by any PUCO decisions. Given the ongoing gravity of the current natural gas situation and the adverse consequences that increases have on poor as well as moderate income families, these groups want to insure that any program which could help these families receives a proper, comprehensive, and objective evaluation. It is therefore incumbent upon the PUCO to grant all five parties intervention in this matter.

All five groups in the Citizens Coalition have long and distinguished histories of PUCO involvement. They have always been concerned about any program and matter that affects low-income families which involves PUCO cases..

The Neighborhood Environmental Coalition's distinguished history of serving lowincome families warrants its involvement in this case. Coalition has been in existence for over twenty-five years, working especially in neighborhoods surrounding the industrial valley of Cuyahoga County. It is dedicated "to protecting the created environment." It is committed to helping low income families meet their energy and heating needs in ways that will not harm the environment. The Coalition especially wants the PUCO to carry out its mandate to provide for programs, including the Pilot Program and any extension of that program, that will help people conserve and will help protect our environment, including nonrenewable natural resources such as natural gas.

The Empowerment Center—formerly the Greater Cleveland Rights Organization—has participated in numerous PUCO proceedings over the past several decades on behalf of lowincome customers. The Center is especially concerned with any Pilot Program whose extension and/or revision could help low income families. Living on very limited budgets, low-income

4

families need help from any program, such as the Pilot Program, that could help them retain their gas service.

The Empowerment Center has participated in past PUCO cases for various utilities. The Center has contributed to the outcomes of these cases and achieved successes in helping lowincome families. It is crucial that the Center be allowed to participate in this current DEO case which includes an evaluation of the Pilot Program.

Citizens for Fair Utility Rates (CFFUR) has also been involved in PUCO proceedings for the last several years. Members of CFFUR have also been involved in PUCO proceedings dating back to the interventions by Low Income People Together (LIPT) in PUCO proceedings. CFFUR has contributed to the successful outcomes in PUCO matters and will insure that the perspectives and views of low-income customers are adequately presented in the current litigation.

Cleveland Housing Network has also participated in past PUCO proceedings. Through their efforts, funds have been obtained to help low-income families with weatherization and other energy efficiency measures. The Network also can provide much helpful testimony to the PUCO based upon their decades of experiences with low income families as well.

United Clevelanders Against Poverty, a fairly new group, is quite concerned about all aspects of utility regulation and programs as these impact the poor. They can be helpful in providing valuable insights on programs designed to assist low income families.

All five of these groups as part of the Citizens Coalition should be allowed to intervene in this proceeding. The Coalition is interested in a number of issues that seemingly are part of this case. See Comments below.

The foremost reason that has motivated Coalition, Center, Consumers, Poverty, and Network to seek intervention in this matter is their commitment to helping low-income families. They are the only parties in this matter that are exclusively devoted to representing the low income segment of the population. The Citizens Coalition is concerned with the fairness,

5

reasonableness, legality, and justice of DEO's Pilot Program, its implementation, its successes, and its failures.

The Citizens Coalition will follow all the administrative rulings in this proceeding and their intervention will not unreasonably delay these proceedings. Nor will their intervention unduly burden any other parties in this proceeding, or the Commission itself.

R.C. 4903.221(B) states what criteria the PUCO must consider in ruling on motions to intervene:

- (1) The nature and extent of the prospective intervener's interest;
- (2) The legal position advanced by the prospective intervener and its probable relation to the merits of the case;
- (3) Whether the intervention by the prospective intervener will unduly prolong or delay the proceeding; and
- (4) Whether the prospective intervener will significantly contribute to the full development and equitable resolution of the factual issues.

The Citizens Coalition satisfies all four of these criteria. They certainly on behalf of low income families have a substantial interest in these proceedings and the evaluation of the Pilot Program. Their legal position they are advancing is to insure a proper, comprehensive, and objective evaluation of the Pilot Program. The Coalition has never acted to delay any proceeding and has in fact promoted expeditious action in PUCO cases. These organizations and their supporters, with their backgrounds, are uniquely placed to contribute to the full development and equitable resolution of the issues in this proceeding.

Wherefore, Coalition, Consumers, Network, Clevelanders and Center (The Citizens Coalition) respectfully request that based on this Motion to Intervene, Coalition, Consumers, Network, Clevelanders should be recognized as a parties in this case.

#### **COMMENTS**

The Citizens Coalition does have some initial comments.

First, the Coalition wants to insure that a proper, comprehensive, and objective evaluation is conducted on the Pilot Project.

Second, the Coalition urges the Commission to employ outside objective evaluators who can assist in the evaluation of the project

Third, Coalition urges that any evaluation of the pilot project should analyze any connections, whether positive or negative, between the Pilot Project, customers involved in this, the PIPP Program, and the peculiar rate design ordered in this case with its astronomically high customer charges.

Fourth, the evaluation also should examine the Pilot Project and any impact on conservation by low income families and low user families.

Fifth, the Citizens Coalition wants to be involved in all aspects of this evaluation. The Coalition thus requests that the PUCO establish processes to insure that the Citizens Coalition can be so involved.

Respectfully submitted, asser Joseph P. Meissner #002236 The Legal Aid Society of Cleveland 1223 West 6th Street Cleveland, OH 44113 Telephone: (216).687.1900, Ext. 3672 Email: jpmejssn@lascley.org Counsel for: Neighborhood Environmental Coalition, Consumers for Fair Utility Rates, United Clevelanders Against Poverty **Cleveland Housing Network** and

The Empowerment Center of Greater Cleveland

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that a copy of this Motion to Intervene and Comments was served

on the persons stated below via first class U.S. Mail, postage prepaid, this 3 day of

October 2010.

lisser oseph Meissner Attorney at/Law <u>SERVICE LIST</u>

Mark Witt Carpenter, Lipps & Leland LLP 280 Plaza Suite 1300 280 North High Street Columbus, Ohio 43215

Duane Luckey Attorney General's Office **Public Utilities Section** 180 East Broad Street, 6th Floor Columbus, Ohio 43215

Larry S. Sauer, Counsel of Record Assistant Consumers' Counsel

#### Office of the Ohio Consumers' Counsel

10 West Broad Street, Suite 1800 Columbus, Ohio 43215-3485 (614) 466-8574 (Telephone) (614) 466-9475 (Facsimile) sauer@occ.state.oh.us